



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Kathy Bundy, Project Management & Design
Thru: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Planning & Design Coordinator
Date: September 5, 2022 *S.D.*

Case No: 22-COA-0221
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1300 East Washington Street

Applicant: Kathy Bundy,
Project Management & Design
PO Box 20548
Louisville, KY 40250
502.727.7445
502.931.7004
projectmanage23@gmail.com

Owner: Jack Howell,
1300 E. Washington LLC
6404 Mistflower
Louisville, KY 40059
502.639.0781
jacksonhowell@gmail.com

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks after-the-fact approval to remove the vinyl siding on the exterior of all elevations and replace it with 4" reveal cementitious siding.

The applicant also seeks after-the-fact approval to construct an approximately 24' wide x 30' deep two-story carriage house on a poured concrete foundation. The carriage house will provide a two-bedroom unit on the first level with approximately 720 sq.ft., and a two-bedroom unit on the second level with

approximately 720 sq.ft. for a total of approximately 1440 sq.ft.. The gabled roof will be clad with asphalt shingles to match the adjacent roofs. The exterior will be clad with 4" cementitious lap siding to match that of the main house. There will be two faux carriage style garage doors facing the alley. The gutter system will run horizontally along the side elevations with downspouts located at the two corners facing the alley.

The side elevation facing Cabel Street (west elevation on drawings) will have two one-over-one double hung windows on the second level.

The alley side elevation (south elevation on drawings) will have two faux single-car carriage style doors on the first level. The second level will have two approximately 20" high x 4' wide horizontal oriented, casement style windows to mirror those used on the first level. A vertically oriented rectangular attic vent is proposed for the center of the front facing gable.

The rear yard elevation (north elevation on drawings) will have two one-over-one double hung windows on the first level and two one-over-one double hung windows stacked above those on the second level. A vertically oriented rectangular attic vent is proposed for the center of the front facing gable.

The side elevation facing the neighboring property (east elevation on drawings) will have a one hour fire rating on the wall. There is proposed to be one fire rated casement style window on the first level and one fire rated casement style window stacked above it on the second level. Two fire rated doors will be located on the first level, one leading to the enclosed stairs to the second level, and one leading to the first floor unit.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on September 7, 2022. The application was determined to be complete and classified as requiring Committee Review on September 7, 2022. This review is expedited as the applicant has an issued building permit (RES-NEW-21-02157) and construction is under way.

The case is scheduled to be heard by the Butchertown Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on Wednesday, September 14, 2022 at 4:30 PM in Rm 101 of the Metro Development Building located at 444 S. 5th St.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Butchertown Preservation District are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **New Construction Residential, Garage, and Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The subject property is zoned R-6 within a Traditional Neighborhood Form District. It is located on the southeast corner of E. Washington and Cabel Streets. The main house is a two-story, Victorian era frame house with Queen Anne details. It is surrounded by 1- to 1½-story shotgun and camelback structures and some two-story wood frame and masonry structures, as well as, commercial/industrial sites.

In 2019, staff approved a COA (case # 19-COA-0037) for the construction of a rear addition. The carriage house was also initially on that application, but it was removed from the application as the property's zoning at the time did not allow for that many units. In 2020, the property went through a zoning change (case # 20-ZONE-0017) and was approved for the proposed rental units in the carriage house. Binding element #2 on the zoning case required a COA prior to construction. On February 7, 2022, the building permit (RES-NEW-21-02157) was approved without a COA.

Conclusions

The proposed carriage house generally meets the design guidelines for **New Construction Residential, Garage, and Site**. The proposed design of the building is subordinate in size to the main house. The proposed structure also complies with the applicable Land Development Code and zoning requirements. The new carriage house will be set back from the existing alley and adjacent to a variety of existing garages and structures. The proposed cementitious siding is an appropriate material as it mimics siding used on the main house and nearby structures. The use of two single car garage doors on the first level further help the building to blend in with the neighboring garages. While the carriage house is currently under construction, the building meets the approved permit designs, which also meet the design guidelines.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved** with the following conditions:

1. The applicant shall integrate mechanical systems into the new construction in such a way that the rooftop remains uncluttered.
2. All wood shall be painted or opaque stained within 12 months of construction.
3. The applicant shall take precautions to preserve the brick and limestone curbing along the alley, and all new grade level concrete shall be of historic concrete mix.
4. The applicant shall submit lighting cut sheets to staff for approval prior to installing any type of exterior lighting. Light should be directed down and away from neighbors.
5. The applicant shall submit window and door cutsheets to staff for approval prior to ordering and installation. All glass shall be clear.
6. Half-round or Ogee gutters shall be installed per provided drawings.
7. Applicant shall screen for trash receptacles off the alley.

8. Storm-water management provisions shall be incorporated into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.
9. If the design or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.

Bradley Fister

Bradley Fister
Planning & Design Coordinator

September 5, 2022

Date

NEW CONSTRUCTION

RESIDENTIAL DESIGN GUIDELINES

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NC1	Make sure that new designs conform to all other municipal regulations, including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations.	+	See conditions of approval
NC2	Do not demolish contributing structures in a historic district to make way for new or large-scale construction. Non-contributing buildings are identified in each of the district or individual landmark designations or National Register nominations.	NA	
NC3	Design new construction so that the building height, directional emphasis, scale, massing, and volume reflect the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+	The proposed new construction generally reflects the architectural context along the alley, where other two-story carriage houses exist.
NC4	Make sure that the scale of new construction does not conflict with the historic character of the neighborhood.	+	The scale of the proposed design is generally in keeping with the district, as well as the neighboring structures.
NC5	Incorporate materials and design elements that complement the color, size, texture, and level of craftsmanship seen in surrounding buildings.	+	The proposed materials match those used on the primary structure.
NC6	Do not use materials in new construction that are visually incompatible with surrounding historic buildings within the district. Materials to be avoided include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, chain-link fencing, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unpainted wood, and asphalt siding.	NA	
NC7	Design new construction to reinforce the human scale of historic districts where this is a character-defining feature.	+	The proposed design generally reinforces the human scale seen along the alley.

NC8	Design new construction in such a way that it does not disrupt important public views and vistas.	+	Being located along the alley at the rear of the property generally prevents it from blocking important public views.
NC9	Reinforce existing patterns of open space and enclosure, created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, in designs for new construction.	+	The proposed construction along the alley is in keeping with the circulation routes for other carriage houses along the street.
NC10	Design infill construction that reinforces the spatial organization established by surrounding buildings. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly-designed facades.	+	Proposed design helps create continued visual continuity along that portion of the alley way.
NC11	Design infill construction in such a way that the façade's organization closely relates to surrounding buildings. Window and door openings should be similar in size to their historic counterparts, as should the proportion of window to wall space. Cornice lines, columns, and storefronts are other important character-defining facade elements.	+	The use of materials, replication of window patterns, and roof pitch help to create a sense of continuity with the primary structure.
NC12	Design new construction so that the building mass has a similar sense of lightness or weight as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solids (walls) to voids (window and door openings). Historic window proportions are generally two-and-one-half (height) by one (width).	+	The proposed building mass is similar to that of the primary structure.
NC13	Develop designs for new construction using windows that are sympathetic to the window patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportions, and muntin configurations is encouraged.	+	Window design mimics those seen on the primary structure.
NC14	Develop designs for new construction using front doors that are sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.	NA	
NC15	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main entrance is the same as the majority of other buildings on the street	+	The primary entrance will be along the side off the alley like the majority of the other carriage houses along the alley.
NC16	Incorporate paved walks between sidewalks and the front entrances for new construction located on streets where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC17	Retain the character-defining features of a historic building when undertaking accessibility code-required work.	NA	
NC18	Investigate removable or portable ramps as options to providing barrier-free access.	NA	
NC19	Locate handicapped access ramps on secondary elevations wherever possible. If locating a ramp on the primary façade is required, it should be installed in a manner that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible.	NA	
NC20	Design infill construction so that it is compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings.	+	The proposed height of the new construction is generally in keeping with other carriage houses along the alley.
NC21	Design new construction to have a floor-to-floor height that is within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the floor-to-floor height is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	+	Floor to ceiling height is generally in keeping with the adjacent structures.

NC22	Maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape. The space between new construction and existing structures should fall within 20 percent of the average spacing for the block.	+	Proposed carriage house compliments the historic rhythm of carriage houses and garages along the alley.
NC23	Maintain historic setback patterns. In order to maintain the continuity of the streetscape, setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.	+	Proposed carriage house generally matches the setback pattern seen along the alley.
NC24	Ensure that the roofs of new buildings relate to those of neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+	The proposed front facing gabled roof is in keeping with the primary structure.
NC25	Follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings when designing rooflines for infill construction. Where the predominant form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated.	+	The proposed front facing gabled roof is in keeping with the primary structure.
NC26	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main roof form is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street, where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.	+	The proposed front facing gabled roof is in keeping with the primary structure.
NC27	Design new construction to emphasize the existing cornice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	Located along alley.
NC28	Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered.	+	See conditions of approval
NC29	Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction.	+	See conditions of approval
NC30	Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings. While use of wood siding is preferred, vinyl siding may be used for new construction, but only in areas where the predominate historic construction material is wood.	+	Cementitious lap siding is proposed to match that of the primary structure.
NC31	Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction. Red brick is the most common masonry material found throughout the city's historic districts.	NA	
NC32	Incorporate stone or cast-stone sills and lintels into new construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-defining features.	NA	
NC33	Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction.	NA	
NC34	Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance.	+	
NC35	Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof.	NA	

NC36	Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head.	NA	
NC37	Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of adjacent secondary structures.	+	Proposed design is generally in keeping with that of the primary structure in scale, form and materials.
NC38	Site new garages adjacent to alleys where present. Review the garage prototype insert that identifies styles appropriate to preservation districts when planning a garage construction project.	+	Proposed carriage house is located along the alley.
NC39	Where no alleys exist, garages should be sited at the rear of the property behind the main house. Garage doors should not face the street, and access should be along the side yard. Landscape screening along the driveway is encouraged.	+	Proposed carriage house is located at the rear of the property behind the main house.
NC40	Use of smaller, single garage doors rather than expansive double or triple doors is preferred.	+	Proposed design incorporates two single garage doors.
NC41	Orient the roofline of a new garage so that it is parallel with the main house or follow the predominant pattern of existing secondary structures where such a pattern exists.	+	Proposed roof form generally compliments that of the main house.
NC42	Roof pitch should be no less than one in six. Where the roof form of the main house is character-defining, owners are encouraged to echo the form of the main house.	+	
NC43	Design new construction so that access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	NA	
NC44	Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	+	See conditions of approval

GARAGE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

Design Element	Building Feature		Approved	Comments
Location		+	Rear-yard location	
		+	Align with adjacent secondary structures	
		+	Use to define and enclose rear yard	
		+	Minimize paving	
Materials	Walls	+	Horizontal wood siding (3" or 4" exposure)	Corner boards and trim around openings.
		NA	Board and batten siding	
		NA	Brick	
		NA	Stucco over frame or concrete block	
		NA	Cast stone, molded concrete block	
		NA	Aluminum and vinyl siding (3" or 4" exposure)	
		NA	No painted concrete block.	
		NA	No un-painted concrete block.	
		NA	No T-111 plywood.	
	Roof	+	Asphalt, fiberglass, wood, vinyl, or slate shingles.	
		NA	Metal roofing	
		+	Half-round or Ogee gutters	
		NA	Approved Gable-end element	
		NA	No membrane roofing on sloped roofs.	
Building Forms	Main Block	+	Simple, rectangular, prismatic volumes	
		NA	Ell-shaped buildings	
		NA	Slightly-projecting bays	
		NA	Cantilevered, second floors	
		+	No overly-elaborate volumes	
	Roof	+	Simple gable roofs (6-in-12 minimum slope)	Gable end vent
		NA	Hipped, shed, and flat roofs with parapets	
		NA	Intersecting gables	
		+	Overhanging eaves	
		+	Half-round gutters	Ogee gutters are acceptable
		NA	No low-pitched gable roofs (less than 6-in-12 slope)	

		NA	No flush eaves	
		NA	No roofs without gutters	
Openings	Garage	+	Single-car openings	
	Doors	+	Surface area of door broken up by articulated panels or stiles and rails to reduce scale	
		NA	No double and triple doors	
		+	No flush garage doors (they accentuate the large size of the openings)	
	Windows	+	Use window openings to break up wall surface	
		NA	Security grills installed on the inside face of the windows	

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+	
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	NA	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	+/-	See conditions of approval
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	+/-	See conditions of approval
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+	
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	NA	

ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	NA	
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NSI	See conditions of approval
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NA	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NSI	See conditions of approval
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	