



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

UPDATED Report to the Committee

To: Limerick Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Planning & Design Coordinator
Date: July 6, 2022 **Updated September 7, 2022** *SDarr*

Case No: 22-COA-0161
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 937 S. 7th Street

Applicant: Bertil Axelsson
Berali LLC
6230 Maravian Dr.
Louisville, KY 40258
925-594-0053
aaxelsson@sbcglobal.net

Owner: Berali LLC
6121 Greenwood Rd.
Louisville, KY 40268
925-727-8792
925-594-0053
baxelsson@sbcglobal.net

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant requests after-the-fact approval for the replacement of 4 front façade historic wood windows with vinyl replacement windows. The two windows on the primary front façade were previously one-over-one double-hung wood windows. They are now one-over-one single hung windows with transoms and have been wrapped with aluminum. The two second story front facing windows were previously two-over-two wood windows and are now one-over-one single hung vinyl windows with small transoms.

The applicant also seeks after-the-fact approval for the replacement of five side and five rear two-over-two double hung wood windows, with vinyl one-over-one single hung windows with small transoms, and wood trim wrapped with aluminum.

Update: September 7, 2022

After-the-fact approval for unpainted stone foundation. See photos below.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on July 7, 2022 following a zoning enforcement case (ENF-ZON-22-000697) opened on June 13, 2022. A notice of violation was issued the same day. Staff spoke to the applicant and performed a second site visit on June 22, 2022. The applicant was made aware that they had not followed the conditions of approval listed in the original COA (22-COA-0090) approved on April 27, 2022, or what staff had discussed with them during the first site visit on April 22, 2022.

Updated: September 7, 2022

The case was originally heard by the Limerick Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on Wednesday, July 13, 2022 at 5:30 PM in Room 302 of the Metro Development Building located at 444 S. 5th Street. The committee continued the case to allow the applicant time to research the replacement of all front facing windows with windows that meet the design guidelines.

The case will now be heard on Wednesday, September 14, 2022 at 5:30 PM in Room 101 of the Metro Development Building located at 444 S. 5th Street.

FINDINGS**Guidelines**

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Limerick Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Window, Masonry, and Paint**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report. The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The site, zoned TNZD, is located on the east side of S. 7th Street in the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The site is situated midblock between W. Breckinridge Street and W. Kentucky Street. The single-family house is a brick camelback shotgun style house. This block has at least five almost identical shotgun style houses matching this one.

Case # 22-COA-0090, which was approved by staff, allowed for three rear windows, one of which was missing, to be replaced with new vinyl windows that fit the historic window openings. The COA document clearly states that the applicant will be repairing the remaining windows. It also states that the applicant shall contact staff for any changes.

Updated September 7, 2022

Staff received a complaint that the previously unpainted limestone foundation had been painted white.

Conclusions

This project generally does not meet the Limerick Design Guidelines for **Window**. As a whole, the window replacement on all elevations does not meet W1, W2, W4, and W16. The new vinyl replacement windows are located on all elevations and do not fit the historic window openings as transom windows were installed to make them fit. Transom windows were not historically present on this building. Furthermore, some of the historic windows were 1/1 in configuration and some were 2/2. They are all 1/1 now. All of the wood window trim has been wrapped with aluminum, which also does not meet the Window guidelines. Vinyl replacement windows can be approved on side and rear elevations as long as they meet other guidelines. The installed replacement windows do not meet those guidelines.

The vinyl replacement windows on the front façade do not meet W6, which states not to use synthetic windows on primary facades, or W1, which states the replacement windows should convey the same visual appearance. The windows now are all one-over-one windows with transoms above them. W1 also calls for wood replacement windows on the front elevation, which the replacement windows are not.

Updated September 7, 2022

The after-the-fact painting of the stone foundation does not meet the Limerick Design Guidelines for **Masonry** and **Paint**. The painting of unpainted masonry, specifically limestone, can cause irreputable harm to the stone, and over time contribute the failure of the foundation as it does not allow the stone to properly breath. Staff recommends the applicant attempt to remove the paint from the stone using appropriate and staff approved removal methods to not cause further harm to the stone.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant and the design guidelines, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **denied**.

07-6-22
Date

Bradley Fister
Bradley Fister
Planning & Design Coordinator

WINDOW

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of vinyl- and aluminum-clad wood window systems on primary elevations may be permissible if the proportion and detail closely match the original.	-	The rear windows were severely deteriorated, one was even missing. However, the applicant said they intended to repair not replace the windows other than the rear 3 which were previously approved with 22-COA-0090. The front windows were replaced with vinyl windows and transoms.
W2	Select windows that match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when repair of original windows is impossible.	-	The replacement windows do not have the same configuration. They are a smaller size to fit the opening and have a transom above. Also, some 2/2 windows were changed to 1/1.
W3	Evaluate the option of using appropriate salvage materials when replacing windows that are deteriorated beyond repair.	NSI	
W4	Do not use replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock windows	-	The replacement windows do not fit the historic openings, and transoms were used to make them fit.
W5	Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie windows in exterior window openings.	NA	
W6	Do not install synthetic replacement windows (vinyl, etc.) on primary facades.	-	The windows are vinyl and are on the front façade.
W7	Install replacement windows that operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	+/-	The windows were double hung and are now single hung
W8	Do not replace multi-pane windows that have true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on primary façade elevations.	NA	
W9	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	+	Windows appear not to have a reflective or insulating film.
W10	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	+	Windows appear to be clear glass
W11	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	NA	

W12	Do not block-in or back-paint transoms or sidelights.	NA	
W13	Use surviving prototypes to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds. The reconstructed element should be constructed of materials for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if that is not possible.	NA	
W14	Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	-	The shape of the original front façade windows has been altered by the installation of a transom window above all of the windows.
W15	Locate any new windows openings that may be required for a new use on a façade that cannot be seen from a public way. Newly-installed windows should be compatible with the overall design of the building.	NA	
W16	Do not obscure historic window trim with metal or siding material.	-	All wood window trim has been wrapped with aluminum trim.
W17	Do not install new floors or dropped ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W18	Install exterior storm windows that duplicate the shape of the original window. Storm windows should be painted to match the color of the window frame.	NA	
W19	Do not install exterior storm windows or screens that damage or obscure historic windows or frames. Mount storm windows on the blind stop within the window frame. Storm window or screen rails should always match the rails of the windows behind. They should have either wood or narrow, metal frames that are painted to match the color of the building trim.	NA	
W20	Do not install window air conditioning units on a primary façade if installation on a secondary façade can address the same need. If this is not an option, do not alter the window sash to accommodate the air-conditioning unit.	NA	
W21	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W22	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W23	Install awnings made of weather-proofed canvas of a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	
W24	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	
W25	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	
W26	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
W27	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7' above the sidewalk.	NA	
W28	Repair shutters with in-kind materials. If damage is so extensive that they cannot be repaired, replacement shutters should match the visual appearance of the originals.	NA	

W29	Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. Replacement shutters should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically-appropriate material. Solid shutters are appropriate for the ground floor, and solid or louvered shutters are appropriate for upper floors.	NA	
W30	Mount replacement shutters so that they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. This gives shutters the appearance that they are indeed operable, even if in truth they are not. Shutters should not be applied to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window.	NA	
W31	Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters.	NA	
W32	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	-	Images of previous windows were not submitted as the windows were not supposed to be replaced—only three on the rear were previously approved.

MASONRY

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
M1	Do not construct new masonry features that are either falsely historical (characteristic of periods prior to the building's actual construction) or are incompatible with the building or historic district in terms of size, scale, material, or color.	NA	
M2	Do not cut new openings into exterior walls on elevations that can be seen from a public way. Creating an opening for the installation of an air conditioning unit, for example, is not appropriate for a façade that is visible from a public way.	NA	
M3	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	NA	
M4	Match the existing bonding pattern, coursing, color, size, strength, and pointing mortar of masonry when replacing a section of brick wall. Bricks should always be toothed-in to historic brickwork, to disguise the joint between new and old.	NA	
M5	Do not remove or rebuild substantial portions of exterior walls if such an action would adversely impact a structure's historic integrity.	NA	
M6	Make sure that any exterior replacement bricks are suited for exterior use.	NA	
M7	Do not replace sections of historic brick with brick that is substantially stronger.	NA	
M8	Repoint only those joints that are no longer sound. Do not remove all joints, sound and unsound, in an effort to achieve a uniform appearance when repointing. Large-scale removal of mortar joints often results in damage to historic masonry.	NA	

M9	Remove unsound mortar joints carefully with hand tools that are narrower than the mortar joint. Power tools should not be used, because they have the potential to scar adjacent masonry.	NA	
M10	Remove unsound mortar to a depth of two-and-one-half the times the width of the joint or to sound mortar, whichever is greater.	NA	
M11	Match historic mortar joints in color, texture, joint size, and tooling when repointing.	NA	
M12	Use a mortar mix that is compatible with historic masonry. Repointing mortar should be equivalent to or softer than the original mortar. When repointing mortar is harder than the surrounding masonry, as is the case with many modern mixtures, moisture cannot escape through the joints. Trapped moisture will crystallize within the walls and fragment surrounding brick and stone.	NA	
M13	If possible, have your mortar analyzed. In order to determine an appropriate mortar mix for individual historic structures, it is recommended that property owners have a sample of the original mortar sent to a lab for analysis. If this is not feasible, a high lime and low Portland cement content mortar mix (1 part cement, 1 part lime, and 6 parts sand) is frequently acceptable.	NA	
M14	Do not attempt to remove joints that have been repointed using a very hard mortar or in an unworkmanlike manner until natural weathering has begun to weaken and crack them. Removal prior to that time would likely damage the masonry units	NA	
M15	Do not use synthetic caulking to repoint historic masonry.	NA	
M16	Have realistic expectations of how the cleaned masonry surface will appear. Remember, it is better to underclean than overclean. A "like new" appearance is rarely desirable.	NA	
M17	Make sure that your contractor has a clear understanding of the physical and chemical properties of your masonry before proposing or testing any chemical cleaning treatments. Such treatments, if improperly applied, can result in permanent damage that significantly outweighs any benefits of cleaning.	NA	
M18	Test proposed cleaning treatments in an inconspicuous area of the building to evaluate potential adverse effects to the masonry. Observation over a complete seasonal cycle is preferable, so that long-term effects may be ascertained. If chemical treatments are found to be acceptable, be sure that those applying the treatment follow all manufacturers' instructions.	NA	
M19	Do not use sandblasting or high-pressure water to clean historic masonry. The process of sandblasting or cleaning buildings using water pressure greater than 300 psi removes the tough, outer-protective surface of the brick and loosens mortar joints, accelerating deterioration.	NA	
M20	Do not clean masonry on buildings with deteriorated mortar joints. Such masonry should be properly repointed prior to cleaning to ensure that water does not penetrate the wall during the cleaning process.	NA	
M21	Do not use any type of water- or chemical-based cleaning systems when a possibility for freezing temperatures exists. Masonry cleaning should not be undertaken until the temperature will remain above 50 degrees for 72 hours after cleaning.	+	
M22	Remove graffiti as soon as possible, beginning with the gentlest means possible and taking care not to inadvertently etch an outline of the graffiti onto the wall.	NA	
M23	Use solvent-based chemical strippers to remove paint from previously-painted masonry only after testing its effectiveness and evaluating its potential to damage brickwork. Testing should be carried out in an inconspicuous location.	NA	

M24	Do not paint masonry or stucco that has never been painted. While one layer of paint may not affect the appearance of the masonry or stucco, accumulated layers will eventually obscure decorative detail.	-	Stone foundation did not appear to have been previously painted per photographs
M25	Paint previously-painted masonry a color that is close to its existing color, approximates a natural masonry color as approved, or is recommended by staff. Staff is available to consult with you on appropriate colors.	-	White is not a color that is close to limestone
M26	Use a "breathable" masonry paint that is compatible with and can create a strong bond with existing paint.	NSI	Applicant did not seek approval prior to painting
M27	Make sure that areas of patched stucco match the strength, composition, color, and texture of the original to the greatest degree possible.	NA	
M28	When patching stucco, cut back the successive layers to provide a key for the new layers to prevent new cracking.	NA	
M29	Carry out stucco repairs so that the dimension between the surface of the stucco and adjacent finishes remains unchanged.	NA	
M30	Do not install stucco, Dryvit, or permastone-type cladding over historic masonry or wood siding.	NA	
M31	Do not resurface historic masonry with exterior insulation.	NA	
M32	Use a masonry or terra cotta chimney cap if needed. Metal chimney caps are not historically appropriate.	NA	

PAINT

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
P1	Painting masonry or stucco that has never been painted is not recommended. Paint is difficult to remove, accumulated layers will obscure decorative detail, and paint coatings (even "breathable" paints) will affect the wall's vapor transmission performance. The presence of a lead oxide wash does not constitute a precedent for painting a building.	-	Masonry does not appear to have been painted previously
P2	When removing paint from previously-painted masonry, use gentle treatments that have been previously tested in an inconspicuous location. Do not sandblast or use acid-based cleaners.	NA	
P3	Use a "breathable" masonry paint that is compatible with and can create a strong bond with existing paint, only on previously-painted masonry.	NSI	
P4	If painting previously-painted masonry, select a color that matches the existing color, approximates a natural masonry color as approved, or is recommended by the staff. Staff is available to consult with you on appropriate colors.	-	White is not a color that is close to limestone

P5	Have paint samples analyzed when possible. Paint seriation studies can determine historic pigments and appropriate colors for repainting, by analyzing a paint sample under special lighting conditions to ascertain specific color, hue, and value of paint layers.	NA	
P6	Do not expose metal types that require protection from the elements or apply paint or other coatings to metals that were historically meant to be exposed, such as copper, bronze, or stainless steel.	NA	
P7	Paint replacement gutters, downspouts, metal frame screen and storm windows, roof-vent assemblies, and fire escapes to match wall, trim, cornice, or roof color of the house, whichever is most effective in reducing the visibility of these elements.	NA	
P8	Be aware that historic structures often contain hazardous substances, such as lead paint and asbestos. Contact the Board of Health regarding proper methods of removal and disposal.	NA	