



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Planning & Design Coordinator
Date: October 24, 2022 *Spaer*

Case No: 22-COA-0230
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1210 Everett Ave.

Applicant: Ajith Nair
ARN Holdings LLC
11303 Yandell Drive
Louisville, KY 40223
502-299-4004
502-299-4005
painstopshere@aol.com

Owner: same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: ~ TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant requests after-the-fact approval to replace approximately 20 historic wood windows, located throughout the building and on all façades, with new double-hung, R4600 Radiance Plus Series by Vinylmax vinyl replacement windows.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on September 19, 2022 after a stop work order was placed on the property on September 2, 2022. It was determined to need a Committee-level review and is scheduled to be heard by the Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on Wednesday November 2, 2022 at 4:30pm, in-person at 444 S. 5th Street, Room 101.

Findings

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Window**. The report of the Commission staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is included in this report.

Site Context/ Background

The R5B zoned property in the Traditional Neighborhood Form District is located on the south side of Everett Avenue, five lots east of its intersection with Patterson Ave. The circa 1910 post Victorian era duplex, is a two-and-a-half-story Revival style, painted masonry building with a limestone foundation. The surrounding buildings are predominately homes in the same style and time period.

Conclusions

Based on evidence supplied by the applicant, Staff is unable to determine if the historic wood windows that have been replaced would have met **W1 (severely deteriorated)**. W1 is a heavily weighted design guideline because preservation of old growth wood windows is key. Historic wood windows are made to be repaired and undergo routine maintenance. While the applicant has obtained a replacement window that generally mimics the configuration and size of the historic windows, they have used vinyl on the front façade. This does not meet **W6**, which states not to install a synthetic window on a primary façade.

To mitigate the loss of historic fabric and bring the property into compliance with the Design Guidelines, Staff recommends that the front facing windows be replaced with a wood or clad wood windows and the trim remain unwrapped.

Staff will continue to work with the applicant to evaluate the remaining 19 windows that have not yet been changed. They are not part of this application.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the applicant's request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to keep the vinyl windows be **denied**.

However, should the ARC and applicant agree on the recommended mitigation, then staff recommends a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved** with the following conditions:

1. **All front facing windows shall be replaced with a wood or clad wood window that fit the historic window openings. The trim shall remain unwrapped.**
2. **The applicant shall submit a window cut sheet to staff for review and approval prior to work taking place on the front façade.**
3. **The applicant shall apply separately for replacement of the remaining 19 windows that have not yet been changed, to allow staff an opportunity to evaluate them for Design Guideline compliance.**

4. Should the design or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.

Bradley Fister
Bradley Fister
Planning & Design Coordinator

10/24/2022
Date

WINDOW

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of vinyl- and aluminum-clad wood window systems on primary elevations may be permissible if the proportion and detail closely match the original.	-	The historic wood windows were not able to be evaluated prior to being replaced. Vinyl replacement windows have been installed on the primary elevation.
W2	Select windows that match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when repair of original windows is impossible.	+/-	Proposed replacement windows generally fit existing window openings and match the historic muntin configuration. However, vinyl windows do not have the same dimensions and reveal depths as historic windows.
W3	Evaluate the option of using appropriate salvage materials when replacing windows that are deteriorated beyond repair.	NA	
W4	Do not use replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock windows	+	Proposed windows generally appear to fit historic window openings.
W5	Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie windows in exterior window openings.	NA	
W6	Do not install synthetic replacement windows (vinyl, etc.) on primary facades.	-	Vinyl windows have been installed on the front façade.
W7	Install replacement windows that operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	+	The proposed replacement windows generally operate the same as the original historic windows would have.
W8	Do not replace multi-pane windows that have true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on primary façade elevations.	+	The proposed replacement windows are will have the same configuration as the existing.

W9	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	+	
W10	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	+	
W11	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	NA	
W12	Do not block-in or back-paint transoms or sidelights.	NA	
W13	Use surviving prototypes to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds. The reconstructed element should be constructed of materials for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if that is not possible.	NA	
W14	Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	+	
W15	Locate any new windows openings that may be required for a new use on a façade that cannot be seen from a public way. Newly-installed windows should be compatible with the overall design of the building.	NA	
W16	Do not obscure historic window trim with metal or siding material.	+	Window trim remains the same
W17	Do not install new floors or dropped ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W18	Install exterior storm windows that duplicate the shape of the original window. Storm windows should be painted to match the color of the window frame.	NA	
W19	Do not install exterior storm windows or screens that damage or obscure historic windows or frames. Mount storm windows on the blind stop within the window frame. Storm window or screen rails should always match the rails of the windows behind. They should have either wood or narrow, metal frames that are painted to match the color of the building trim.	NA	
W20	Do not install window air conditioning units on a primary façade if installation on a secondary façade can address the same need. If this is not an option, do not alter the window sash to accommodate the air-conditioning unit.	NA	
W21	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W22	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W23	Install awnings made of weather-proofed canvas of a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	
W24	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	
W25	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	

W26	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
W27	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7' above the sidewalk.	NA	
W28	Repair shutters with in-kind materials. If damage is so extensive that they cannot be repaired, replacement shutters should match the visual appearance of the originals.	NA	
W29	Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. Replacement shutters should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically-appropriate material. Solid shutters are appropriate for the ground floor, and solid or louvered shutters are appropriate for upper floors.	NA	
W30	Mount replacement shutters so that they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. This gives shutters the appearance that they are indeed operable, even if in truth they are not. Shutters should not be applied to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window.	NA	
W31	Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters.	NA	
W32	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	+	Photos submitted with application