



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer *CE*
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: February 21, 2020

Case No: 19-COA-0171
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 2530 Ransdell Ave.

Applicant: Lindsey Stoughton
LMS Design
816 Franklin St.
Louisville, KY 40206
(317) 345-4398
stoughton@LMSdesignLLC.com

Owner: Augusta B. Holland
C/O Wyatt, Tarrant & Combs, LLP
400 West Market St.
Suite 2000
Louisville, KY 40202
(502) 562-7505
tberry@wyattfirm.com

Estimated Project Cost: \$130,000.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant wishes to perform an extensive renovation to the exterior of the home to not only make it more functional for their lives, but to allow for more unity in the various architectural forms. The applicant is proposing two side additions, new windows, new

Case #: 19-COA-0171

Page 1 of 29

doors, new roofing, a carport, a fence/wall, and carriage house. The applicant would also like to demolish an existing non-historic garage addition.

South Façade

On the existing south facing (front) façade of the home, the applicant would like to replace four windows on the second floor of the home that appear to have been replaced approximately sometime between 1940 and 1950 based on the style of the sash. The decorative lead came window in the second floor bathroom, as well as the existing ganged fixed casement style windows located in the front gabled dormer. The applicant also intends to retain the existing expansive picture window located on the right side of the home, along with the bold Georgian inspired pediment above it. The applicant seeks approval to replace the existing two windows on the front left façade presumed to be original to the home based on the style and quality of glass. The applicant proposes to alter the window location and center them on either side of the fireplace on the interior of the home, as well as add a third window in the center of those two. The applicant also proposes to remove the existing front door, transom and sidelights, and replace them with a new wood door, and true divided light sidelights and transom assembly.

North Façade

On the existing north (rear) façade of the home, the applicant would like to remove a chimney that appears to have possibly vented a piece of equipment to the home that no longer exists. The applicant proposes to retain the existing two ganged 4-lite casement style windows in the hip roofed dormer. The existing replacement second floor window to the left of the rear façade will be replaced with a new wood double-hung one-over-one window. The applicant also wishes to add shutters to the second-floor, left existing window. On the first floor, left rear façade, the applicant intends to remove the existing windows as well as the arch that was filled in with a window at some point. The applicant then plans to add a set of three new wood double-hung one-over-one windows, centered on the existing window on the second floor.

Moving to the center of the existing north (rear) façade, the applicant intends to retain the existing Palladian window assembly at the stair landing, as well as the existing back door. The applicant wishes to extend the width of the rear porch several inches on either side, so it is affixed between the right and left side walls. The porch roof will be clad with copper. The applicant then will add 2 more columns, one at either end of the porch entablature to match the existing Doric columns. The right-side rear façade of the home is an existing addition to the home. The applicant wishes to replace the second floor, right side, triple ganged casement windows, with two-over-one true divided light double hung wood windows. On the first floor, right rear façade the applicant wishes to remove the three arched replacement windows which appear to have been added in the 1990's based on the style and materials of the assembly. The applicant then wishes to add a bay that will be clad in stucco to match the existing home and roofed with copper. The three windows in the bay will be centered slightly wider than the windows on the second floor above it. The windows in the bay are proposed to be two-over-one true divided light wood windows with

raised panels under each. The reason behind the applicant wishing to use a two-over-one muntin pattern for the windows on the addition is to delineate between the original portion of the home and the various later additions to the home.

East Façade

On the existing east façade, the applicant intends to retain the existing fixed 4 gang double casement windows in the hip roofed dormer. On the second floor of the east façade, the applicant intends to replace the existing replacement windows with one over one real wood replacement windows, and then add shutters to each of them. On the first floor east façade the applicant intends to keep the existing true divided light casement windows that are original to the home. The applicant would like to replace the existing French doors into the home from the side porch with new true divided light wood French doors. The applicant also intends to replace the wood screen door with one to match the existing. The applicant would also like to add stone steps ascending from the porch centered on the interior doors that will be stone to match the existing foundation wall.

On the existing west façade, the applicant intends to retain the existing fixed casement style windows in the hipped dormer. The applicant intends to remove the existing replacement windows to the left of the new addition with new wood one over one windows with shutters. To the right of the proposed new addition on the west façade, the applicant plans to replace the three double-hung replacement windows in the existing hipped dormer. These three dormer windows will be replaced with three, two-over-one true divided light wood replacement windows. On the first floor to the right of the proposed addition the applicant plans to remove the existing side window to the home and install a set of French doors with raised panels to match the doors on the east side of the home in order to access the west side patio from the living room space.

Additions

The applicant proposes two side additions to the home. To the east, the applicant plans to install a carport, and a one story addition at approximately 314 square feet. The addition will tie into the home in a way to delineate between what was existing to the home and what is new. This will be accomplished by setting the addition back approximately three feet from the existing corner of the home. The window facing north, as well as the window facing east will be true divided light two-over-one windows to further delineate between the historic and the new. The south facing façade of the east addition will have a set of 3 wood true divided light French doors. The height of the peak of the gabled roof of the east addition is 15' – 8". The east addition will be roofed with asphalt shingles, and will be clad in stucco to match the existing home, the rear portion of the addition facing north will have lattice installed over the stucco to allow for plants to envelop it and to delineate further between historic and new. The carport portion of the addition will be 35' extending from the new addition toward the north, and 24' wide centered on the north side of the addition façade. The pole construction of the carport will be copper with standing seam copper roofing to match the rear back porch roof, as well as the roofing on the proposed first floor, forth façade, bay. The carport will be approximately 624 square feet.

The proposed addition to the west side of the home will be two stories and constructed on the foundation of the existing non historic (approximately 1970-1980) garage that has been proposed to be demolished. The proposed addition will be set back approximately 2 feet from the existing addition to the home to delineate what is existing and what is new. The proposed addition will be clad in stucco to match the existing home. On the north, south and west façades of the addition lattice will be installed to the second-floor windows to further delineate new from existing. The addition is approximately 586 square feet on the first floor and 586 square feet on the second floor for a total west side addition of approximately 1,172 square feet. The addition is 28' – 8" high to its peak, and has a double gabled roof that will be clad in dimensional asphalt shingles to match the existing roof. All windows in the west addition will be two over one true divided light wood windows. The windows on the first floor of the addition will all have louvered shutters. The French doors on the south elevation of the addition will match the French doors to be installed on the east and west side of the existing home. They will be wood, true divided light, and with raised panels. The stone stairs leading from the French doors on the south façade as well as the foundation of the addition, will match the existing foundation stone.

Carriage House

The applicant also proposes to construct a two-story carriage house with a double hipped roof design, clad with stucco, and the foundation stone will match what is original to the home. The roofing material will be standing seam copper to match the proposed carport and bay window. The carriage house is approximately 28' – 4" in height. The garage doors will be on the west facing façade, and will be wood with true divided light windows at the tops of the doors. The carriage house is approximately 47' long north to south and 26' wide east to west for a total of 835 square foot. All the windows on the east and west facades of the carriage house will be two-over-two true divided light wood windows. The window in the gable of the south elevation is two-over-two. The large 16-pane true divided lite on the first level of the south side has true divided glass. The door on the south elevation will be wood 6 pane true divided light door with a raised panel at the base. The window on the second level of the north elevation is four-over-four with true divided lite wood window. The window on the first level of the north elevation are two-over-two. The shed roofed porch on the east elevation is roofed with asphalt singles to match the existing home. The eaves will be wood lap siding, and the columns will be Doric.

Site

The proposed landscape plan includes a large stone retaining wall on the front façade facing south. This wall will allow for a small portion of the front lawn to be terraced level with the grade of the home. This will allow for the construction of a terrace, a formal garden, a pool and other landscaping opportunities. The north facing plan is to remove the horseshoe driveway and construct a 42" wall that will be finished with stucco and with limestone piers and cap. This will allow for a pedestrian walking path to be added leading to the back door.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application:

The application was received on December 30, 2019. The application was classified as requiring Staff Review on January 6, 2020 and staff emailed applicant to advise them their application had been assigned to a case manager. Staff contacted the applicant via phone and email to request additional information to assist in their understanding of the project, as well as schedule a site visit. Applicant was aware that due to the extensive nature of the project, that it would require a committee level review. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on February 26th, 2020 at 4:30 pm, at 444 S. 5th Street, Conference Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Windows, Doors, Demolition, Addition, Garages, New Construction, Roof, and Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is included in this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

This one-and-a-half acre property known as 2530 Ransdell Ave. is three lots north of the intersection of Ray Ave. and Ransdell Ave. The property is in the Cherokee Triangle preservation district. The Olmsted plan for this development indicates that the historic front of the home faces Longest Ave. The house is sited approximately 246' from Longest Avenue. The rear of the home faces Ransdell Ave. and is located approximately 38' from the road. The property is zoned R2 in a Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The applicant is working with Planning and Design to obtain appropriate waivers and variances.

The home was constructed sometime after 1905, but before 1915 as seen from Sanborn maps of the era and written accounts of the development of the neighborhood. The home is an architectural eclectic experiment of styles ranging from strong Arts and Crafts forms, to Georgian, and Queen Anne elements. These are seen in an especially strong way through the variety of roof forms incorporated into the design of the home which include gable, hip and dormer forms. Over the home's approximately one-hundred and five year life span, it has undergone many design changes. Some by choice of the various owner's taste and style or the respective time periods, and others by unforeseen circumstances such as evidence seen during renovations of an extensive fire. The fire is presumed to have happened in the home approximately thirty years after it was built, this timeline is based on evidence of the replaced and repaired portions of the structure.

Conclusions

Windows

The application generally conforms to the Window Design Guidelines in terms of **W1** for replacing existing windows. A majority of the windows do not date to the original construction date and were likely installed after the fire. The applicant seeks approval to change the configuration of windows on south façade. This would involve altering the existing window openings which are generally not supported by design guideline **W14**. The applicant seeks approval to install shutters where shutters did not exist historically. Design guideline **W29** discourages conjectural elements. Shutters on the additions could be approved but not on the historic part of the house without documentary evidence that they existed previously.

Doors

The proposed door replacements conform to the Door Design Guidelines. The applicant does propose to remove the existing sidelight, transom, and door and replace with a standard 36" door that would require the opening to be filled in to fit. This work does not conform to **D1**, **D6**. The applicant wishes to change the sidelights and transom that are in the designation photo. Given that this is an intact historic element, it is not recommended to alter the sidelights and transom per **D3**.

Demolition

The application conforms to the Demolition Design Guidelines **DE1-6**. The applicant is not removing a contributing structure that could in some way cause harm to the historic structure or the surrounding area. The existing attached garage addition was added in the mid- to late-20th century and is deemed to be a non-contributing addition. The applicant will work to keep the jobsite secured to protect any exposed historic portions of the building. The applicant has a robust landscape plan. The applicant wishes to reestablish the street wall.

Addition

The application generally conforms to the Addition Design Guidelines. Given that the north side of the house serves as a street facing elevation, the additions are most appropriately located on the sides of the historic house. The new additions are generally in proportion to the home and the district (**A1**) and the use of materials work to delineate between historic and new construction. The two-story addition's roofline is lower than the historic house.

Carriage House (Garage and New Construction)

The location of the proposed carriage house what was historically the rear of the property and the openings are not facing any public right of way. The structure will have gutters and a copper standing seam roof. The carriage house will have two single garage door openings. The façade will have windows to break up any large expanses of stucco. The application design generally meets the guidelines for new construction (**NC1-38**) in the broadest sense. There is historic site context along Ransdell Avenue for the construction of garages and carriage houses in this location.

Roof

The application conforms to the Roof Design Guidelines. Roofing material will be asphalt shingles similar to the existing which meets **R1**. The roof of the carport, garage, back porch and bay window will be roofed in copper which conforms to **R2**.

Site

The proposed 42" masonry fence wall along Ransdell Avenue is considered to be on the rear elevation in terms of the Site Design Guidelines. Original plans indicate that Ransdell Avenue was intended to be an alley. There is still more detail needed for the potential height of retaining wall in the front (Longest Avenue) elevation which is a part of the terrace for front lawn. Design Guideline **ST8** states that front yard topography should not be altered by re-contouring. There is evidence, however, on this portion of the property that there was some type of a previous terrace. There is also a portion of a former retaining wall in a similar location on the property. With the proposed new terrace, the retaining wall would be setback a great distance from Longest Avenue.

Recommendation

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends that the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions:**

1. If the design or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.
2. Retaining wall on south elevation to be reviewed by ARC once final plans are completed.
3. Driveway and all new concrete walks shall be poured using historic concrete mix.
4. The sidelights and transom stay intact on the south façade.
5. The window configuration on the first floor south façade shall remain in the same location.
6. Shutters shall not be installed on the historic portion of the house.
7. Should the variance & waiver requests be denied or modified, applicant shall work with staff on the re-review of the proposed new construction.
8. The applicant shall obtain all necessary building permits.


Bradley Fister
Historic Preservation Specialist


Date

WINDOW

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of vinyl- and aluminum-clad wood window systems on primary elevations may be permissible if the proportion and detail closely match the original.	+/-	The applicant wishes to replace the windows that have already been replaced on the home, as well as replace several windows that are potentially original to the home.
W2	Select windows that match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when repair of original windows is impossible.	+	Proposed replacements meet the standard, for the sizes and configurations.
W3	Evaluate the option of using appropriate salvage materials when replacing windows that are deteriorated beyond repair.	NA	
W4	Do not use replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock windows	NA	
W5	Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie windows in exterior window openings.	NA	
W6	Do not install synthetic replacement windows (vinyl, etc.) on primary facades.	+	Applicant plans to replace with wood, true divided
W7	Install replacement windows that operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	+	All replacement windows will function as existing windows do.

W8	Do not replace multi-pane windows that have true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on primary façade elevations.	NA	
W9	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	NA	
W10	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	NA	
W11	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	NA	
W12	Do not block-in or back-paint transoms or sidelights.	NA	
W13	Use surviving prototypes to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds. The reconstructed element should be constructed of materials for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if that is not possible.	NA	
W14	Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	—	Applicant wishes to reconfigure windows on the south façade of the home.
W15	Locate any new windows openings that may be required for a new use on a façade that cannot be seen from a public way. Newly-installed windows should be compatible with the overall design of the building.	NA	
W16	Do not obscure historic window trim with metal or siding material.	NA	
W17	Do not install new floors or dropped ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W18	Install exterior storm windows that duplicate the shape of the original window. Storm windows should be painted to match the color of the window frame.	NA	
W19	Do not install exterior storm windows or screens that damage or obscure historic windows or frames. Mount storm windows on the blind stop within the window frame. Storm window or screen rails should always match the rails of the windows behind. They should have either wood or narrow, metal frames that are painted to match the color of the building trim.	NA	
W20	Do not install window air conditioning units on a primary façade if installation on a secondary façade can address the same need. If this is not an option, do not alter the window sash to accommodate the air-conditioning unit.	NA	

W21	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W22	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W23	Install awnings made of weather-proofed canvas of a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	
W24	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	
W25	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	
W26	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
W27	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7' above the sidewalk.	NA	
W28	Repair shutters with in-kind materials. If damage is so extensive that they cannot be repaired, replacement shutters should match the visual appearance of the originals.	NA	
W29	Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. Replacement shutters should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically-appropriate material. Solid shutters are appropriate for the ground floor, and solid or louvered shutters are appropriate for upper floors.	-/+	Applicant wishes to install shutters where no historic precedence stood in order to delineate between the old and new construction
W30	Mount replacement shutters so that they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. This gives shutters the appearance that they are indeed operable, even if in truth they are not. Shutters should not be applied to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window.	NA	
W31	Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters.	NA	
W32	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	+	Home is currently well documented

DOOR

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
D1	Do not alter the character of entrances by either removing historic elements or through the addition of elements for which there is no historic precedent.	-	Applicant wishes to remove the sidelights, transom, and door, and install a new 36" door.
D2	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric	+	Current building is well documented.
D3	Use historical, pictorial, and physical documentation when undertaking the reconstruction of a missing entrance or porch feature. If there is not sufficient information to determine the original design, a new design should be prepared that is compatible with the architectural character of the building and the district. Conjectural or falsely-historical designs are not appropriate.	NA	
D4	Use only those replacement doors that duplicate the design, proportion, and arrangement of paneling and glazing of the original.	-	The applicant wishes to use a smaller door and close in the opening that is existing to fit.
D5	Do not replace historic double leaf doors with a single door.	NA	
D6	Do not alter original openings to accommodate stock doors.	-	Applicant wishes to use a standard door size.
D7	Install only screen doors or storm doors that are simple with a narrow-frame design that enables the inner door to be seen. Metal screen and storm doors should be painted or finished to match the inner door.	+	Only installing a screen door where one already existed.
D8	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original doors or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grilles should retract out of sight during business hours and preferably be mounted inside the glass. Painting security bars an unobtrusive color is recommended.	NA	

D9	Differentiate between primary and secondary doors, using the detailing of the doors or the articulation of the frame.	+	Door choices chosen have a hierarchy
D10	Do not add vestibules to primary facades unless there is a historic precedent. Such additions alter the character, proportion, and massing of the façade.	NA	
D11	Do not create new entrances on facades that can be seen from a public way.	+	The new entrances to the existing structure cannot be seen from a public right of way.
D12	Replacement of non-original, non-historic doors with new doors that are appropriate to the period and style of the building and are the size of the original opening is recommended.	-	The applicant proposes using a smaller new door.

ADDITION

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
A1	Ensure that the design of any new addition is in proportion with the size and scale of the historic building and district.	+	Appropriate
A2	Design any addition so that it is subordinate to the original building. Generally, additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.	+	Appropriate
A3	Generally, additions should be attached to secondary elevations and should be set back from the front façade, so as not to damage or obscure character-defining features.	+	Situated appropriately
A4	Use materials that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+	Delineation is clear
A5	Respect original roof forms when designing an addition. Additions should complement existing forms, not overwhelm them.	+	Respect original design and mimic elements.
A6	Do not undertake any full-floor additions in residential preservation districts (adding an additional full floor on top of a building).	NA	
A7	Generally, the original orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade.	NA	
A8	Design any new addition so that the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	+	Meets guideline
A9	Design additions to have the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion.	+	The new mimics the old well without reproducing.

A10	Design additions so that there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration. This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion.	+	Delineation is clear.
A11	Set back additional stories from the historic wall plane of commercial or institutional structures when such an approach is required for a new use. The construction of additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible and not damage or destroy character-defining features.	+	Delineation is clear.
A12	Do not design additions to appear older than the original building.	+	Meets this design guideline
A13	Comply with the Kentucky building code in such a way that a historic building's character-defining features are preserved.	+	Preserves and amplifies what is original
A14	Do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features when adding a new code-required stairway or elevator. Any such addition should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	+	Meets design guidelines
A15	Install fire escapes only on secondary elevations. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. They should preferably be painted to match the color of the wall.	NA	
A16	Do not construct a deck on a front or side façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or finished with an opaque stain. Use the railing detail developed by the Landmarks Commission or other approved detail.	NA	
A17	Design rear decks so that they do not extend beyond the side walls of the house and are not visible from the street.	NA	
A18	Wood fire stairs should be painted or stained and should be kept to a minimum functional size.	NA	

DEMOLITION

Design Guideline Checklist

From Economic Hardship Exemption

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

Introduction

Unless the city has determined that it poses an imminent threat to life or property, do not demolish any historic structure or part of a historic structure that contributes to the integrity of any historic district, or any individual landmark or part of an individual landmark.

Demolition by Neglect

The deteriorated condition of a historic building attributable to the owner's failure to provide proper maintenance over an extended period of time will not be considered a mitigating circumstance in evaluations of economic hardship. Hardship that is attributable to a building's being allowed to deteriorate will be considered self-imposed; restoration costs incurred to remediate such neglect will not be considered.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
DE1	Do not demolish existing non-contributing buildings and additions in a manner that will threaten the integrity of existing contributing structures.	+	Will not harm existing structure
DE2	Do take steps to assure the integrity of a wall exposed to the elements by the removal of a non-historic addition.	+	Applicant will take appropriate measures to seal the property while under construction when possible.

DE3	Do remove non-historic interior finishes such as plaster, drywall, or paneling that may be exposed as a result of the removal of non-historic additions.	+	Applicant will take appropriate measures
DE4	Do infill non-historic openings in historic walls, exposed as a result of the removal of the non-historic finishes.	+	New addition will meet where old was.
DE5	Do landscape areas that are left vacant as the result of removals of non-contributing buildings and additions. Topography should be made consistent with that of adjacent properties. The slope and grades of land left vacant after demolition should continue and be consistent with those features on adjacent properties.	+	Extensive landscape plan
DE6	Do take measures to reestablish the street wall after demolition through the use of low fences, walls, and/or vegetation.	+	Extensive landscape plan

GARAGE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

Design Element	Building Feature		Approved	Comments
Location		+	Rear-yard location	
		+	Align with adjacent secondary structures	
		-	Use to define and enclose rear yard	Will not enclose the back yard
		+	Minimize paving	Removing some pavement from rear lawn
Materials	Walls	NA	Horizontal wood siding (3" or 4" exposure)	Corner boards and trim around openings.
		NA	Board and batten siding	
		NA	Brick	
		+	Stucco over frame or concrete block	Will be stucco to match existing
		NA	Cast stone, molded concrete block	
		NA	Aluminum and vinyl siding (3" or 4" exposure)	
		NA	No painted concrete block.	
		NA	No un-painted concrete block.	

		NA	No T-111 plywood.	
	Roof	-	Asphalt, fiberglass, wood, vinyl, or slate shingles.	Plan to use standing seam copper roofing
		+	Metal roofing	Plan to use standing seam copper roofing
		+	Half-round or Ogee gutters	Gutters will be installed
		+	Approved Gable-end element	Meets design guidelines
		NA	No membrane roofing on sloped roofs.	
Building Forms	Main Block	+	Simple, rectangular, prismatic volumes	Meets design guidelines
		NA	Ell-shaped buildings	
		NA	Slightly-projecting bays	
		NA	Cantilevered, second floors	
		NA	No overly-elaborate volumes	
	Roof	+	Simple gable roofs (6-in-12 minimum slope)	Gable end vent
		NA	Hipped, shed, and flat roofs with parapets	
		+	Intersecting gables	Double gables
		+	Overhanging eaves	Soffit open
		+	Half-round gutters	Ogee gutters are acceptable
		NA	No low-pitched gable roofs (less than 6-in-12 slope)	
		NA	No flush eaves	
		NA	No roofs without gutters	
Openings	Garage	+	Single-car openings	
	Doors	+	Surface area of door broken up by articulated panels or stiles and rails to reduce scale	
		+	No double and triple doors	
		+	No flush garage doors (they accentuate the large size of the openings)	
	Windows	+	Use window openings to break up wall surface	
		NA	Security grills installed on the inside face of the windows	

NEW CONSTRUCTION

RESIDENTIAL DESIGN GUIDELINES

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NC1	Make sure that new designs conform to all other municipal regulations, including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
NC2	Do not demolish contributing structures in a historic district to make way for new or large-scale construction. Non-contributing buildings are identified in each of the district or individual landmark designations or National Register nominations.	NA	
NC3	Design new construction so that the building height, directional emphasis, scale, massing, and volume reflect the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
NC4	Make sure that the scale of new construction does not conflict with the historic character of the neighborhood.	+	Fits the existing setting
NC5	Incorporate materials and design elements that complement the color, size, texture, and level of craftsmanship seen in surrounding buildings.	+	Mimic existing materials in use
NC6	Do not use materials in new construction that are visually incompatible with surrounding historic buildings within the district. Materials to be avoided include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, chain-link fencing, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unpainted wood, and asphalt siding.	NA	
NC7	Design new construction to reinforce the human scale of historic districts where this is a character-defining feature.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation

NC8	Design new construction in such a way that it does not disrupt important public views and vistas.	+	Meets this standard
NC9	Reinforce existing patterns of open space and enclosure, created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, in designs for new construction.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
NC10	Design infill construction that reinforces the spatial organization established by surrounding buildings. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly-designed facades.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
NC11	Design infill construction in such a way that the façade's organization closely relates to surrounding buildings. Window and door openings should be similar in size to their historic counterparts, as should the proportion of window to wall space. Cornice lines, columns, and storefronts are other important character-defining facade elements.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
NC12	Design new construction so that the building mass has a similar sense of lightness or weight as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solids (walls) to voids (window and door openings). Historic window proportions are generally two-and-one-half (height) by one (width).	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
NC13	Develop designs for new construction using windows that are sympathetic to the window patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportions, and muntin configurations is encouraged.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
NC14	Develop designs for new construction using front doors that are sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
NC15	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main entrance is the same as the majority of other buildings on the street	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
NC16	Incorporate paved walks between sidewalks and the front entrances for new construction located on streets where this is a character-defining feature.	+	Extensive landscape plan
NC17	Retain the character-defining features of a historic building when undertaking accessibility code-required work.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
NC18	Investigate removable or portable ramps as options to providing barrier-free access.	NA	
NC19	Locate handicapped access ramps on secondary elevations wherever possible. If locating a ramp on the primary façade is required, it should be installed in a manner that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible.	NA	

NC20	Design infill construction so that it is compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
NC21	Design new construction to have a floor-to-floor height that is within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the floor-to-floor height is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
NC22	Maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape. The space between new construction and existing structures should fall within 20 percent of the average spacing for the block.	+	Will add to the existing
NC23	Maintain historic setback patterns. In order to maintain the continuity of the streetscape, setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
NC24	Ensure that the roofs of new buildings relate to those of neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
NC25	Follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings when designing rooflines for infill construction. Where the predominant form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
NC26	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main roof form is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street, where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC27	Design new construction to emphasize the existing cornice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
NC28	Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
NC29	Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction.	NA	
NC30	Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings. While use of wood siding is preferred, vinyl siding may be used for new construction, but only in areas where the predominate historic construction material is wood.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
NC31	Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction. Red brick is the most common masonry material found throughout the city's historic districts.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation

NC32	Incorporate stone or cast-stone sills and lintels into new construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-defining features.	+	Foundation and stairs
NC33	Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction.	NA	
NC34	Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
NC35	Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
NC36	Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
NC37	Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of adjacent secondary structures.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
NC38	Site new garages adjacent to alleys where present. Review the garage prototype insert that identifies styles appropriate to preservation districts when planning a garage construction project.	NA	
NC39	Where no alleys exist, garages should be sited at the rear of the property behind the main house. Garage doors should not face the street, and access should be along the side yard. Landscape screening along the driveway is encouraged.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
NC40	Use of smaller, single garage doors rather than expansive double or triple doors is preferred.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
NC41	Orient the roofline of a new garage so that it is parallel with the main house or follow the predominant pattern of existing secondary structures where such a pattern exists.	NA	
NC42	Roof pitch should be no less than one in six. Where the roof form of the main house is character-defining, owners are encouraged to echo the form of the main house.	NA	
NC43	Design new construction so that access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	NA	

NC44	Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	NA	
-------------	--	-----------	--

ROOF

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
R1	Use only replacement materials that closely match the original roofing material in color, texture, and profile. Possible substitute materials include asphalt shingles, dimensional shingles, or cement tiles.	+	Planning to match the existing material
R2	Use copper, lead-coated copper, terne-coated stainless steel, or terne metal when replacing a historic metal roof with in-kind materials. While copper roofs may be left unpainted, terne-metal roofs should be painted either muted red or green, traditional roof colors. Replacement with in-kind materials is recommended in order to preserve the visual appearance of the original.	+	Planning to use copper on roof of garage, back porch, bay window
R3	Make sure that the proportion of the seams and trim on replacement metal roofing matches that of the original. Commercial-grade architectural metal roofing systems should not be used on residential architecture, because the scale is inappropriate.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
R4	Retain ridge and hip tiles on historic tile roofs. Field tiles may be replaced with a compatible substitute material, such as a dimensional shingle in a color approximating the original. Ridge and hip tiles, however, should be reinstalled to maintain the roof's historic profile. Reinstallation of sound roof tiles and slates on smaller, secondary roof forms (porches, bay windows, etc.) is encouraged wherever possible.	NA	

R5	Remove existing roofing material when replacing non-repairable or non-historic roofing. Removing these underlying layers will prolong the life of the roof and help restore the original profile of the roof edge.	+	Current 4 layers will be removed
R6	Do not apply asphalt shingles over wood shingles. This will trap moisture and cause deterioration of the roof structure.	NA	
R7	Base the reconstruction of any missing roof feature on historical, pictorial, and physical evidence. If such evidence is insufficient, the feature should be of a compatible new design rather than a falsely-historical or conjectural reconstruction.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
R8	New roof designs for additions or new construction should be compatible in size, scale, material, and color with the historic building and district.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
R9	Use the form and detailing of severely deteriorated roof features, such as cupolas and dormers, or chimneys, to create appropriate replicas.	NA	
R10	Avoid having extensive areas of flashing visible. In some cases, portions of metal flashing may be covered by mortar or stucco.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
R11	Do not destroy historic detail when installing replacement gutters. If synthetic materials are used, they should be painted to match the trim color.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
R12	Half-round replacement gutters that are of a simple design and do not alter the character of the trim, or in limited cases ogee profile gutters, are preferred. Synthetic materials painted to match the trim color are acceptable.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
R13	Do not use unpainted galvanized steel gutters or downspouts, which rust and stain adjacent materials. These gutters should be painted after a period of weathering. Vinyl gutters and downspouts should be avoided due to their short life expectancy.	NA	
R14	Leave historically-exposed rafter ends and eaves open and uncovered.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
R15	Make sure that any new roof-top additions do not compromise the structural integrity of the building.	NA	
R16	Install any new roof-top mechanical or service equipment in such a way that historic fabric is not damaged.	NA	
R17	Do not attach antennae, satellite transmitters, skylights, vents, air conditioning units, decks, terraces, dormers, or solar panels that can be seen from a building's primary elevation. Skylights should be flush (not the "bubble" type) with curbs painted to match the color of the roof material. Consolidate antennae wherever possible.	NA	
R18	Do not introduce mechanical equipment or systems that may overload and compromise a historic building's existing structural system.	NA	

R19	Paint all roof vent assemblies to match the color of the roofing material.	+	Applicant will paint to match
R20	Do not install ridge vents on historic structures. They are non-historic approaches to attic ventilation.	+	Applicant shall follow this guideline
R21	Replace historic roof details, such as decorative cresting and finials and metal ridge caps on slate roofs with in-kind materials or materials that are visually compatible.	NA	

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	+	Existing property lines remain
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	+/-	Unsure of exact materials at this time
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	+	If new curb cut is necessary preserve the old historic curb
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+	Proposed drive in rear of property

ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	+/-	Asking to terrace lawn a portion of the front lawn. The setback from Longest is a considerable distance on a steep slope. The terrace will be adjacent to the existing house. There is physical evidence of some type of previous terracing in this location.
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	+	Request to install a wall at back of property line which will serve as a fence. It will screen the parking areas in this location.
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	+/-	Asking to install a front retaining wall
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	+	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	+	Asking to construct a 42" tall masonry wall at street
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NA	

ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	+	Meet design guidelines for historic preservation
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	

