



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Planning & Design Coordinator
Date: November 15, 2022 *S.Darr*

Case No: 22-COA-0192
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1311 Everett Ave

Owner: Yousef Abukwaik
1311 Everett Ave.
Louisville, KY 40204
abukwaik.yousef@gmail.com

Applicant: same as owner

Estimated Project Cost: \$40,000.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to construct an approximately 1,200 SF two-story carriage house. The building will be approximately 20' W x 30' D x 23' H and have a two-car garage on the first level with an accessory apartment on the second level. The second floor living space will be approximately 600 SF and have one bedroom, one bathroom, and a small balcony facing the alley. The gable roof will be clad with asphalt shingles to match the roof of the primary structure. There will be one garage door facing the alley and a person door to the rear yard.

The front elevation facing the rear yard (south elevation) will have one person door at the west corner and one double-hung, one-over-one window at the east corner. There is an asymmetrically placed staircase with stoop running diagonally from the west side first level, to the east side second level where there is a six-panel person door under a small gabled portico that accesses the living space. To the left of the door is a horizontal oriented, full lite, casement style window. The shed style dormer side will be clad with shake shingles, while the rest of the façade will be clad with smooth cementitious lap siding to match the reveal of that on the primary structure. If the cementitious siding is unavailable, it will be substituted with smooth vinyl lap siding with the same reveal.

The side elevation facing the alley (west elevation) will have three shuttered faux window openings, evenly spaced on the first level. In line with the openings on the first level are two double-hung, one-

over-one windows on either side of a shuttered, faux window opening on the second level. This elevation will be clad with cementitious lap siding to match the reveal of that on the primary structure. If the cementitious siding is unavailable, it will be substituted for smooth vinyl lap siding with the same reveal.

The side elevation facing the neighboring property (east elevation) will mirror that of the alley side elevation (west elevation).

The rear elevation facing the alley (north elevation) will have one, double garage door on the first level, along with a small balcony and door centered in the gable on the second floor. The sides of the shed style dormer are clad with shake shingles.... The rest of this elevation is clad with cementitious lap siding to match the reveal of that on the primary structure. If the cementitious siding is unavailable, it will be substituted for smooth vinyl lap siding with the same reveal

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on August 5, 2022 and Staff contacted the applicant for more information. Staff conducted a site visit on October 18, 2022 with the applicant, and following that staff broke apart the original application into staff level approvable items and committee level review. Staff worked with the applicant to schedule the ARC around their travel schedule. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on November 30, 2022 at 4:30 pm, in-person at 444 S. 5th Street, Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **New Construction Residential, Garage, and Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The R5B zoned property in the Traditional Neighborhood Form District is located on the north side of Everett Avenue, five lots west of its intersection with Cherokee Parkway. The post Victorian era home is a two-and-a-half-story Arts & Craft Style, wood clad building with a limestone foundation. The surrounding buildings are predominately homes in the same style and time period.

In 2013, staff approved a COA (13COA1116) to replace a number of windows. In 2014, a COA (14COA1204) was approved at staff level for the replacement of the roof. In 2022, staff approved a COA (22-COA-0289) for the replacement of 6 windows, 4 of which are front facing.

Conclusions

The proposed carriage house generally meets the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District design guidelines for **New Construction Residential, Garage, and Site**. The proposed building is subordinate in size to the main home as it is generally lower in overall height and has approximately a 600 square feet garage, with an additional 600 square feet of living space above it. The applicant has provided a site plan

and has said the new carriage house will comply with all LDC requirements, be set back from the existing alley 5', and be in line with the neighboring structures. The proposed exterior cladding is cementitious lap siding to match the reveal of that on the primary structure. If the cementitious siding is unavailable, it will be substituted for smooth vinyl lap siding with the same reveal. Both of these materials meet the new construction residential design guidelines and will be used in a way that compliments the original house and nearby structures yet stands on its own. The drawings do not appear to callout gutters or downspouts, both of which are required. The proposed alley side double garage door, however, does not meet the design guidelines, which call for single-car openings. Most of the nearby alley-facing garage doors appear to be double-car carriage style doors. The subject alley also is rather narrow, and located at the corner which may make it difficult to pull into a single-car opening. Therefore, staff recommends the proposed double garage door be approved with conditions.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions:**

1. The applicant shall submit a scaled site plan with setbacks prior to applying for building permits.
2. All wood shall be painted or opaque stained within 12 months of construction.
3. The double garage door shall be articulated as two single carriage style garage doors.
4. All grade level concrete shall be of historic concrete mix.
5. The applicant shall take appropriate measures to maintain and preserve the historic brick alley, as well as any limestone/granite curbing.
6. The applicant shall submit cut sheets to staff prior to installation for all exterior lighting fixtures, windows, doors, roofing, and all exterior cladding (shake shingles, cementitious siding, vinyl siding).
7. Gutters and downspouts shall be installed.
8. Trash receptacles shall be screened and stored off the alley.
9. Storm-water management provisions shall be incorporated into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.
10. If the design or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.

Bradley Fister

Bradley Fister
Planning & Design Coordinator

11-15-2022

Date

NEW CONSTRUCTION

RESIDENTIAL DESIGN GUIDELINES

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NC1	Make sure that new designs conform to all other municipal regulations, including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations.	+	Proposed new carriage house appears to meet all LDC requirements.
NC2	Do not demolish contributing structures in a historic district to make way for new or large-scale construction. Non-contributing buildings are identified in each of the district or individual landmark designations or National Register nominations.	NA	There is not currently a building on the site.
NC3	Design new construction so that the building height, directional emphasis, scale, massing, and volume reflect the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+	The proposed design generally is complementary to both the primary and neighboring structures.
NC4	Make sure that the scale of new construction does not conflict with the historic character of the neighborhood.	+	The scale of the proposed carriage house generally reflects the character of the primary structure, and the neighborhood as a whole.
NC5	Incorporate materials and design elements that complement the color, size, texture, and level of craftsmanship seen in surrounding buildings.	+	Reflects the Arts and Crafts style of main home and neighborhood; material not yet specified.
NC6	Do not use materials in new construction that are visually incompatible with surrounding historic buildings within the district. Materials to be avoided include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, chain-link fencing, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unpainted wood, and asphalt siding.	+	Both the proposed cementitious siding, and shake shingles are seen throughout the district in new construction projects.
NC7	Design new construction to reinforce the human scale of historic districts where this is a character-defining feature.	+	Design generally reinforces human scale with the size and number of fenestrations, and material choices
NC8	Design new construction in such a way that it does not disrupt important public views and vistas.	+	
NC9	Reinforce existing patterns of open space and enclosure, created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, in designs for new construction.	+	The infill of the carriage house will help to reinforce the existing patterns along the alley way.
NC10	Design infill construction that reinforces the spatial organization established by surrounding buildings. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly-designed facades.	NA	Spatial organization of the proposed carriage house will provide visual continuity.

NC11	Design infill construction in such a way that the façade's organization closely relates to surrounding buildings. Window and door openings should be similar in size to their historic counterparts, as should the proportion of window to wall space. Cornice lines, columns, and storefronts are other important character-defining facade elements.	NA	
NC12	Design new construction so that the building mass has a similar sense of lightness or weight as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solids (walls) to voids (window and door openings). Historic window proportions are generally two-and-one-half (height) by one (width).	+	Generally, has the same sense of massing as seen of other buildings.
NC13	Develop designs for new construction using windows that are sympathetic to the window patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportions, and muntin configurations is encouraged.	+	Generally proposed window pattern is sympathetic
NC14	Develop designs for new construction using front doors that are sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.	NA	
NC15	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main entrance is the same as the majority of other buildings on the street	+	Main entry is off the alley
NC16	Incorporate paved walks between sidewalks and the front entrances for new construction located on streets where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC17	Retain the character-defining features of a historic building when undertaking accessibility code-required work.	NA	
NC18	Investigate removable or portable ramps as options to providing barrier-free access.	NA	
NC19	Locate handicapped access ramps on secondary elevations wherever possible. If locating a ramp on the primary façade is required, it should be installed in a manner that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible.	NA	
NC20	Design infill construction so that it is compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings.	NA	
NC21	Design new construction to have a floor-to-floor height that is within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the floor-to-floor height is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	+	
NC22	Maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape. The space between new construction and existing structures should fall within 20 percent of the average spacing for the block.	NA	
NC23	Maintain historic setback patterns. In order to maintain the continuity of the streetscape, setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.	+	Proposed structure generally will align with other secondary structures along the alley.
NC24	Ensure that the roofs of new buildings relate to those of neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+	Generally mimics what is seen along the alley
NC25	Follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings when designing rooflines for infill construction. Where the predominant form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated.	NA	

NC26	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main roof form is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street, where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC27	Design new construction to emphasize the existing cornice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC28	Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered.	+	See conditions of approval.
NC29	Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction.	+	See conditions of approval.
NC30	Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings. While use of wood siding is preferred, vinyl siding may be used for new construction, but only in areas where the predominate historic construction material is wood.	+	Proposed use of lap siding is complimentary to the primary and adjacent secondary buildings.
NC31	Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction. Red brick is the most common masonry material found throughout the city's historic districts.	NA	
NC32	Incorporate stone or cast-stone sills and lintels into new construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-defining features.	NA	
NC33	Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction.	NA	
NC34	Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance.	+	Foundation is proposed to be poured concrete.
NC35	Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof.	NA	
NC36	Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head.	+	
NC37	Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of adjacent secondary structures.	+	The proposed design is generally complementary.
NC38	Site new garages adjacent to alleys where present. Review the garage prototype insert that identifies styles appropriate to preservation districts when planning a garage construction project.	+	Garage will be located and facing rear alley.
NC39	Where no alleys exist, garages should be sited at the rear of the property behind the main house. Garage doors should not face the street, and access should be along the side yard. Landscape screening along the driveway is encouraged.	NA	
NC40	Use of smaller, single garage doors rather than expansive double or triple doors is preferred.	+/-	Double garage door is proposed on alley side. Most of the nearby alley-facing garage doors appear to be double-car carriage style doors. The subject alley also is rather narrow, which may make it difficult to pull into a single-car opening.

NC41	Orient the roofline of a new garage so that it is parallel with the main house or follow the predominant pattern of existing secondary structures where such a pattern exists.	+	Generally follows existing patterns along the alley
NC42	Roof pitch should be no less than one in six. Where the roof form of the main house is character-defining, owners are encouraged to echo the form of the main house.	NA	The pitch of the roof is greater than one in 6.
NC43	Design new construction so that access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	+	Proposed carriage house is located off the alley.
NC44	Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	+	See conditions of approval.

GARAGE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

Design Element	Building Feature		Approved	Comments
Location		+	Rear-yard location	
		+	Align with adjacent secondary structures	
		+	Use to define and enclose rear yard	
		+	Minimize paving	
Materials	Walls	+/-	Horizontal wood siding (3" or 4" exposure)	Smooth cementitious lap siding to match the reveal of the primary structure.
		NA	Board and batten siding	
		NA	Brick	
		NA	Stucco over frame or concrete block	
		NA	Cast stone, molded concrete block	
		+/-	Aluminum and vinyl siding (3" or 4" exposure)	Smooth vinyl lap siding to match the reveal of the primary structure will be used if the applicant is unable to source cementitious siding.
		NA	No painted concrete block.	
		NA	No un-painted concrete block.	
		NA	No T-111 plywood.	
	Roof	+	Asphalt, fiberglass, wood, vinyl, or slate shingles.	Asphalt shingles
		NA	Metal roofing	
		NSI	Half-round or Ogee gutters	See conditions of approval

		NA	Approved Gable-end element	
		NA	No membrane roofing on sloped roofs.	
Building Forms	Main Block	+	Simple, rectangular, prismatic volumes	
		NA	Ell-shaped buildings	
		NA	Slightly-projecting bays	
		NA	Cantilevered, second floors	
		NA	No overly elaborate volumes	
	Roof	+	Simple gable roofs (6-in-12 minimum slope)	
		NA	Hipped, shed, and flat roofs with parapets	Shed roof dormer
		NA	Intersecting gables	
		+	Overhanging eaves	
		NSI	Half-round gutters	See conditions of approval
		+	No low-pitched gable roofs (less than 6-in-12 slope)	
		NA	No flush eaves	
		+	No roofs without gutters	See conditions of approval
Openings	Garage	+/-	Single-car openings	Two-car opening on alley side.
	Doors	+	Surface area of door broken up by articulated panels or stiles and rails to reduce scale	
		+/-	No double and triple doors	Double garage door on alley-facing side. However, this is appropriate on this alley.
		NA	No flush garage doors (they accentuate the large size of the openings)	
	Windows	+	Use window openings to break up wall surface	
		NA	Security grills installed on the inside face of the windows	

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

+ Meets Guidelines

- Does Not Meet Guidelines

+/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted

NA Not Applicable

NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+	
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any re-platting should be consistent with original development patterns.	NA	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	+/-	See conditions of approval
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	+/-	See conditions of approval

ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+	
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	NA	
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	NA	
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NSI	See conditions of approval
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NA	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NSI	See conditions of approval

ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	