Captioning Transcript of Community Affairs, Housing, Health and Education Committee Meeting - November 16, 2022 "Chair Shanklin" We'll be starting in about 1 minute. Good afternoon. This is the regular community of 1st house in health and education committee meeting of November, 16th, 2022. Come to order Madame clerk. Will you please read the meeting? Notice? "Olivia Bennett" This meeting is being held pursuant to Kara 61.826 in council rule. 5 8. "Chair Shanklin" Thank you I am the chair councilman, Barbara Shanklin and joining me virtually or. Uh, um. Cassie Armstrong chambers or did I get back with Cassie? Chambers? Armstrong? I always get them sees mixed up. "Olivia Bennett" Excuse me me I'm sorry this is Olivia in chambers. Is there any way that we can have? All the council members? Show their cameras please. "Chair Shanklin" There isn't any, I don't see any that didn't hear the camera. I don't see you, man. Oh, man. Was on. Okay, I can see it. Let me see. Oh, maybe I didn't push. I can see myself, "Olivia Bennett" I'm telling you now, you know, we're all good. Thank you. "Chair Shanklin" Okay. And I did not see Kevin, uh, calcium triplet because my, uh, video thing was over top of he is and I could see myself, but I couldn't see here apologize for there. Uh, with me, today is also councilman Kevin triplet. Are there any members present in the chambers, "Olivia Bennett" uh, chair we have councilman Hollander and chambers.

"Chair Shanklin" Okay, thank you. Um. Will you please read item number 1? Oh, I have to say, let me see am I missing somebody too expensive? Marilyn Parker cows a woman he should Darcy or any of them down there no, ma'am. Okay, they may come invite. Okay. Could you repeat please re, item number 1 place? "Olivia Bennett" Yes, ma'am. Item number 1 is oh, Dash 3 to 5. that's 22 an ordinance amending chapter 39 of the local metro code of ordinances recognizing June 19th as juneteenth, national Freedom day. Right? In full. in full Thank you motion to move triplet. Thank you. Staying in the morning. "Olivia Bennett" Chambers to speak on it. Um, I'm sorry, we missed. Do we didn't get a 2nd okay. We have a Armstrong. Thank you. Bye. Bye. Uh, it's this 1 there yes, ma'am. Um, she is as well as Mr Michael Meeks. "Chair Shanklin" Thanks Okay, well, I think this 1 is going to be speaking on this at my right? "Wanda Mitchell Smith" Shanklin, thank you so much wanted me to Smith on behalf of the administration. I'm going to yield to chief Meeks since juneteenth is going to be coming up under the office of equity, and since he is chief of equity, but he will speak to the, uh, the resolution and then I will follow Thank you so much. Thank you. "Chief Michael Meeks" Michael makes chief equity officer. Um, thank you. I'd like to voice my support for this proposal by simply paraphrasing the sentiments of the ordinance. But 1st, I'd like to. Ask you to take a moment to take a deep breath. Pause and clear your mind. I'd like for you to to listen to the eloquent significance. Of this ordinance, June 18th is the oldest known holiday. Commemorating the final communication of the abolition of slavery in the United States. With overwhelming, bipartisan support, the United States Congress passed a measure designating June 19th as the United States federal holiday. To be known as juncteenth, national independence day.

The Kentucky general assembly also recognized the significance of June 18th. By declaring June 19th as June teeth, national Freedom day in Kentucky. Mayer Fisher by executive order, established the June Commission, creating a series. Of events to celebrate June 10th and to educate. Residents regarding the significance of June 10th. This legislative body collect in its collective wisdom, enacted in ordinance, establishing a permanent jrv jubilee commission. And by executive order, June 10th was declared a permanent. Holiday for metro employees. With all the benefits to all metro employees as other holidays. All of these are courageous steps on the path toward racial healing. From the moral stain of slavery. In our nation here this afternoon, we simply asked that you allow residents to properly celebrate this day by making the decision to designate. juneteenth national Freedom day. June 19th. As a permanent holiday for all. Metro employees in Louisville, Metro, thank you.

"Wanda Mitchell Smith"

Thank you Mr. in addition we just want to be able to make sure that as we are leaving this administration is leaving that this will be quantified. So that whoever comes in afterwards, this cannot be stricken from the record and this will be an official holiday. So, doing it by executive order is 1 thing, but having it putting into law is something completely different. And so. We just asked everyone to support this measure in speaking with Council woman, Paula she would like to be added as a sponsor, but I don't know if she would need to share that information with you all as well but would just ask for your support on the measure. She was at it. Okay. Thank you so much.

"Hollie Hopkins"

Um, excuse me, this is how it happens with the county Attorney's office and Dr Shanklin. Oh. Nevermind, and James is now with us, I believe he has an amendment by substitution that he would like to put in front of the committee. I was going to recognize, uh, president James, and also councilman Maryland park. 63 "James, David" (1754861056) 00:11:13.859 --> 00:11:28.739 Catherine James? Yep, thank you. Madam chair. Um, I want to think everybody that's helped to put together this legislation and and further working working on it. We have a committee substitute. 64 "James, David" (1754861056) 00:11:28.739 --> 00:11:35.009 Uh, we'd like to re, to put in and if I could get a member of the. 65 "James, David" (1754861056) 00:11:35.009 --> 00:11:39.269 Committee to make a motion for that place so we could discuss it.

"President James" Thank you so, we made some changes to the, uh, what was originally on the agenda and what we actually did was to make sure that we said that it's actually a holiday, uh, counted as a holiday for, uh, the employees of metro Louisville and so that is the. Basic contacts are the change, um, on on the, uh, on the ordinance. "Hollie Hopkins" Excuse me Holly Hopkins again present James you may have missed the introduction by the administration and they explained that. Is the purpose of the Thank you thank you. "Chief Shanklin" Thank you. Are there any questions that are concerns? Oh, I'm sorry. "Committee Member Triplett" Counseling Kevin triplets, thank you, Madam chair. So just to be clear. The, the admitted best substitution is not needed. The amended by substitution. "Wanda Mitchell Smith" Excuse me? I thought was already loaded into. "Committee Member Triplett" Okay so that okay just to be clear. Um, just quickly I would like to be at "Wanda Mitchell Smith" the close office is giving a now. "Olivia Bennett" Yes, it is added into the system. It's a proposed cabs. It's for today's date. "Committee Member Triplett" Very well, very well. Just just to be clear. I would like to probably be honored. Uh, being a sponsor of this. Also too, um, um. We're not replacing that. We are adding another holiday for our metro employees and but I know that sometimes in the past, we have, uh, a new holiday was established and sometimes. 1 would go away we're not doing that here. Correct?

"Wanda Mitchell Smith" That's correct, sir. We are adding it for its existence. 8, period. "Committee Member Triplett" Very good, uh, outstanding piece. I'm, I'm proud to be a sponsor. Thank you. "Chair Shanklin" Thank you does any other questions are concerned. We're ready to go. This is. I hear someone say something. "Olivia Bennett" All we have to take a voice vote on the amendment and then do a role. "Chair Shanklin" Okay, I thought the amendment was already in there. "Olivia Bennett" You're doing a voice vote on the amendment. "Olivia Bennett" Right, what I'm saying is about the amendment was already in the ordinance. "Olivia Bennett" Yes. It's in the system, but we have to do a voice vote for the amendment, and then vote on the entire ordinance as a row. "Chair Shanklin" Okay, I'll do that, but I thought it was no need for the amendment. I'm sorry. Okay. We have a, um. Okay, all in favor of women I. I give me a 2nd. Okay, so now we're ready to vote. This is the ordinance. Corner the roll call vote can you please open the voting for the ones in the chambers? "Olivia Bennett" [Roll Call Vote Taken.] Oh, votes and 1 not voting. Thank you.

"Shanklin"

And I also want to recognize counselors to advance and I did not recognize you a while ago. Okay, this will go to all this. We wanted to go the old business are. Do you want me to go to consent?

"Wanda Mitchell Smith"

It can, it could go to consent here. Okay.

"Hollie Hopkins"

Counseling? Dr. Shanklin. This is Holly Hopkins again. I believe because of the amendment. It would need to go to old business, but I defer to the clerk's office on that.

"Olivia Bennett"

That is correct. Ma'am.

"Chair Shanklin"

Okay. And I guess I'm still confused when they said there was not a was no need for them because he was already there.

"Sonya Harward"

And I'm sorry this is Sonia. I'm sorry Shanklin. It was just a confusion. Whenever it was stated the proposed amendment. Is loaded in the system so that people can see it, but it was has never been offered up as an amendment to, you know, until today.

"Chair Shanklin"

Okay all right. Clark item to please

"Olivia Bennett"

item number 2 is our dash 179 dollars 22 a resolution designating certain census blocks located in council districts. 12345610121521and24aspriorityprojectareastobe included in the tax delinquency diversion program meaningful. ten twelve fifteen twenty one and twenty four as priority project areas to be included in the tax delinquency diversion program meaningful

"Chair Shanklin"

Thank you gotta have a triplet. 2nd, we have a more. This item has been properly moved this 2nd. I think council money calendar is going to be speaking on in my calendar. No, ma'am I'm going to be speaking on item 3. you all 3? Oh, it's. Here, I believe, yes. "Laura Grabowski" Hello everybody good afternoon Laurie director of the office of housing and community development. I'm here to speak on this resolution. I did send over a brief presentation. I'm happy to give that or I'm happy to just explain. The resolution and, um, and and take any questions. "Chair Shanklin" It doesn't matter uh, did you already have your presentation loaded into the system? "Laura Grabowski" I believe so. Yeah, just wanted to make sure that that was okay, I'll go over to the desk once the presentation's up. Here we go again. Okay, Laura Grabowski director of the office of housing and community development. Let's try this again. So I'm hoping that you can see the presentation just have a few slides. Sometimes this text delinguency. Diversion program gets a little complicated. So. Some of you may remember that we last talked about this particular program in 2007 at the front door. The the state pass, some legislation that allowed that enabled metro counsel to pass legislation and essentially designate areas of town in which the certificates of tax delinquency would not be sold. I think everybody understands that. The city, the taxing entities offers the certificates of tax delinquency up for, uh, for sale every year. It helps with revenue, but for vacant and abandoned property work, it, it causes some issues. And of course, it also can cause issues for home owners. So we. We came back in 2017, Metro Council. Designated some priority project areas at that point, and they are getting ready to expire at the end of this year. But there is nothing in the statute preventing those areas from being designated for another 5 years. So I just as a reminder to. Everyone these, this is a map of the priority project areas. You can see that the criteria here that they're essentially the statute sets up that we call it the. And the priority project areas as an area that has a significant amount of blended properties, but that the area is also favorable for redevelopment. So you can see our Western neighborhoods. Some of our southern neighborhoods, the newburg areas. Motown and Shelby park. We're all included in those priority project areas and have been since 2017. thousand and seventeen So, this recommendation today is to essentially put the, the same areas back into the priority project areas so that they are so that there won't be any, any.

So that it will continue and when you look down in the details of the areas, the only changes that are made, have to do with the fact that the 2020 census. Made some changes at the block level, the statute requires census blocks to be. Named in as the project priority areas, and sometimes when the census comes out, the population changes, and so there are a few of the revisions. So when you're seeing. A few of these blue areas, a little bigger or smaller. That that's the main reason for that. So, again, here are criteria for the project priority project areas, significant amount of blended properties and we've just put, I've just put a couple of a couple of notes on here. The areas in here do have higher vacant and abandoned property concentrations and the remainder of the county and the vast majority of codes and regs annual cut list properties are in those areas. We do know that there are a decent amount of investments planned, especially in our Western neighborhoods and in looking at the data, we are seeing across the county increasing property sales and in. Vastly increasing median home prices. The city does have existing resources needed for urban redevelopment and not only not only Metro, but private and non nonprofit development communities. We're seeing. Those resources available as well, and we do know that. The existing characteristics of all of these areas can be promoted as a part of a campaign to retain existing residents and attract new residents to the areas. These are solid, stable, residential neighborhoods with a lot of housing, stock and density and they're. In, uh, great areas with parks and schools and churches and historic attributes. So. Today, I just wanted to talk a little bit about the difference between 2017 and today, and why this is necessary to continue in 2017. when we came we figured this was going to be a good, good. going to be a good good Tool for our vacant and abandoned property work, and it would also help homeowners who had delinquent taxes. But 1 thing that we were seeing at that time was that the sales of the delinquent tax certificates in those areas were actually declining. Um, so. We weren't sure, you know, we assume that the 3rd party tackling companies that were purchasing the tax. Leads were noticing that they are, they are in business to make money so they were, they were purchasing. Those certificates less as it got up to 2017 likely because of the. Possibility that they would then turn around and be worth a lot of money at some point. Um. The median home prices were stable, but they were low compared to the rest of the county and there was a lot of talk at that time about plans for development with some development happening. But but not as much as when we look at today. So, 1st. We have been able to initiate around 800 foreclosures since 2017.

And we've also the States also enacted a conservatorship law, which gives us another bacon and abandoned property tool. We know that these areas are seeing high amounts of public and private investments. And we also know that out of town companies are currently purchasing batches of properties off of the private market. So we can assume that if the tax bill started. To be sold again, either of those same companies or or similar companies would be interested in purchasing those, those tax lanes. We're seeing media and home sales. Prices dramatically increased. I think that we looked at 1 zip code and it was up. 170% in the last 5 years, and most of that was in the last couple of years and then we also saw, especially in the middle of this 2017 to 2022, period Commissioner's sales, steadily increased, including those. thousand and twenty two period commissioner's sales steadily increased including those That were the foreclosures that were initiated by the 3rd party tax link companies. So these are important. Points to note that I may make an argument that it's more important now to pass this than it even was in 2017. the. The risk to not only homeowners, but. To Metro, and its vacant property work is pretty high in a lot of these areas because the demand is has gone up and the development. The development is there. So that is brief presentation and a brief overview. Absolutely. Take questions. Just wanted to mention 1 other piece of information that. It has to do with the need for some sort of technical amendment, the resolution that was uploaded. Has a time frame listed, so that should the council passed. Designate these priority project areas. The current resolution on file is 1 year, the administration is recommending 5 that's the statutory limit on there. So, I just wanted to make a note of that before taking any questions. "Chair Shanklin" He's not. Morning James James. "President James" Yes, can you hear me? Yeah. Can you hear me. Thank you thank you Madam chair. Um, I just wanted to, uh. Encourage everyone to, um, to pass this particular resolution, I think would help a lot of people and it would push back, um, some of the, the private entities that are buying these properties up and are reducing our, our housing stock. Um, and I would like to ask a member of the committee if they would, uh, make the motion to amend the, um, ordinance to say, 5 years instead of 1 year. If that was possible. Please. "Committee Member Triplett"

Madam chair, I'll make that motion motion's been made and we have.

"Committee Member Bowens" 2nd, 3rd. "Chair Shanklin" So, the motion's been made in 2nd all in favor. Uh, I, uh, so we vote on the motion on the amendment. 1st. All in favor vote on the amendment. Oh, I see. 1. Awesome and James, did you not have someone, uh, Jeff or brand come to speak or laura's in place? Uh, Jeff brand. "President James" Um, I thought Jeff was coming to speak, but I'm guessing Laura is, uh, is speaking for him today. Okay thanks. I just didn't want to overlook. Yeah. "Chair Shanklin" So, okay, uh, so we now ready to spoke on that, uh. To vote on the resolution, this is a resolution so all in now, since it's been amended, we've got to do a roll call what we get more, right? Or no, no, you can do a voice vote. Okay, all in favor, say, God. In your polls, so this will go to the old. All business also. Okay Thank you. We have item number 3. Better clerk, we can read item number 3 "Olivia Bennett" number 3 is oh, Dash 344 dash 22 an ordinance amending local Jefferson County, Metro code of ordinances chapter 92 regarding unlawful practices in connection with housing to include the prohibition of certain economic discrimination. Thank you. Do we have a motion motion to move. motion motion to move "Committee Member Benson" 2nd "Chair Shanklin" Think councilman Hollander does here to speak on that item. Am I right? "Olivia Bennett" Yes, ma'am. Thank you. Madam chair Thank you. "Council Member Hollander" This is, um, this is a pretty simple, um, amendment related to the source of income protection, which we passed in 2021.

And it really just codifies what the Oval apartment association has agreed is the law, but we don't know that everybody is following it. And we want to make it clear that, that this is the law. So I put into the system and you can see attached to this item a memorandum from the local apartment association dated July, 12 2021. thousand and twenty one And basically what this gets to is when people are running. A properties to residential properties, they often look at an income to to rent ratio. Uh, and as the apartment association has said, landlord's often require that applicants, make 3 times the amount of monthly rent. Here's Here's what this says, and this is the underline section of this memo for an applicant using a voucher. This requirement should only be applied to their portion of rent, not covered by the voucher. In order to calculate the rent to income ratio of a perspective. Voucher tenant. A landlord should only consider the portion of the rent that the applicant would actually be slowly responsible to pay. And it goes on to say that otherwise this would be discriminatory. So that's, we're essentially codifying not. Essentially. That's all we're doing really is codifying that statement of what what the law should be it is but to make clear that everyone would follow it. So, we're adding just 1 section to the fair housing law saying. That is illegal to use a financial or income standard for the rental of housing that fails to account for the rental payments that are paid by other people. Just as the apartment association said in July 2021. thousand and twenty one I'll be happy to take any questions. If not, I'm not a member of the committee, but I, I would urge your approval. "Chair Shanklin" Sorry, uh, this is an amendment. Vote all in favor Ah, "Chair Hollander" this is an ordinance. It's not the original ordinance here. "Chair Shanklin" Oh, I thought it was amended. I'm looking at it. Okay. It's the original ordinance. So, we have long list before us all in favor. No, ma'am. Yes, ma'am though. There anyone I'm getting more confused about a minute. Uh, is there anyone in the chambers, or you can call or hidden card? What

role.

"Olivia Bennett" [Roll Call Vote was taken] Madame cherry, you have 6 years felt and 1 not voting. "Chair Shanklin" We will send this to do you want me to go to all business? "Committee Member Hollander" I believe it can be on consent. That's it. "Chair Shanklin" Okay. We'll send it to the same calendar. All right. Thank you. Thank you, uh, the next person we have on the agenda is, uh. Christine craney, this is a special discussion I should be talking about the law trust 1 today. So, is she in the chambers? I think I see your coming mental Clark is she in the chambers? Cause? I can't tell you. "Olivia Bennett" Yes, ma'am she is. Oh, okay. Thanks. "Chair Shanklin" Let us know. Okay. I got it. I'm sorry. I looked like it was on. I'm sorry. Okay. Just identify yourself for the list. "Christie McCravey" Yes, and thank you. My name is Christina. Crazy. And I am the executive director of the local, affordable housing trust fund. Thank you for the opportunity to speak to the committee this afternoon to give a report. Um, just kind of give you an update on where the trust fund is what's been going on and how the investments that local Metro has made, have been put to use. So, I know I don't really need to read this slide, but you know who we are and what we do and we, thank you once again for everything you have done for working with us. And for your opportunity to support us, and our families in Louisville. We stand on the statement of everyone deserves a safe, decent, affordable place to call home. So, while I'm in the chambers as executive director, I would also like to. Let, you know that my board chair Chris Harrigan is also in the chambers. Along with 2 of our staff persons, Tanya, Montgomery and Linda GIBSON. And we have worked hard to make sure that each person that is benefiting from funds that funnel through the trust fund, have a safe, decent, affordable place to call. I'm just going to start with some facts. About at this time, so.

Every year of course, it comes out with new. Area median income guidelines, and for this particular fiscal year. Those numbers increased substantially fiscal year median income for 2022. it's 84,700. So, that kind of gives us a different look at how our families are lining up. So, we are able to serve. Persons that have incomes under that 80%. Level, so, from a person that makes 47,450 of 1 person household. Most commonly for person household that makes up to 67, 750. And on and on, some of the things that you heard is about the 30%. Am I category extremely low income? So you're talking about in that category, a person that makes 17,000. 800 dollars a year, or for a person of 4 you can imagine having gross income of 27,750 dollars. So, this gives a an overview of the. Depth of the issues when you see our rents. In the Louisville area, so when we talk about the statistical metropolitan statistical area, of course, we're talking about 11 counties bullet, Henry Jefferson. Meat Shelby and Trimble and Indiana. Clark Floyd, Harrison and Washington. So has put together the. Statistical area, including all of these counties, but we know that. Out of these counties, Jefferson has the lion's share of poverty, so. Given the numbers that I showed you a little bit ago, the census says that in Jefferson County, that median income drops to 55,000. From that 84,700 number. Fair market rents. This is the amount of money that someone can. Expect to pay when they use a voucher. So, in 2022 those numbers. Increased and efficiency is 690 dollars a month. 1 bedroom, 800 dollars a month. 2 bedrooms, 960 on and the more common. 3 bedroom is 1279 dollars a month so when we talk about unaffordable rents. In Jefferson County, this is what we're dealing with. These are the fair market rents these are the rents that landlords are looking. To pay, or to have as income when they are calculating spreadsheets. And what have you in order to get funds from, say. Funding sources like banks and Kentucky housing corporation and all of those. Funders that are looking to see how much income someone can generate when they are developing housing. So this is an overview of what. You all have done and I want to say, thank you. So, since 2016, our fiscal year, 2017 you see that you have each year. Allocate it funding to the trust fund. Uh, the last 3 years, it's been that 10Million dollar level. We only had. 5Million in 1 year and that was the year that the budget was. Strained substantially with the pension problems, but we have consistently been been putting money.

Into the trust fund, sometimes as you did in 2021, you give us specifics about how to use the funds other times it's open because we always have a mandate to serve those households under 50%. Am I. under fifty percent am i However, in November of this past year, you did something historic by putting in 40Million dollars. From the American rescue plan to fund housing, primarily for those extremely low income households, those households that are less than 30% are up to 30%. And we all know those are those households that are at most need. These are the programs in the projects that receive funding. From the rescue plan, uh, it will generate. Over 200 units of housing for up to 30% households, but it will also generate about an additional 60. Units of housing for those up to 50% housing. 50%. Here's some examples, some renderings, the eclipse, and we have already closed on that project. I'm so excited to say that we have already closed on 1 of the American rescue plan projects. The eclipse will be. On 29th street in the Russell neighborhood, it will feature 119 units for those under 30%. And then there will be another 100. 80, I'm sorry, 82 units I believe of house of units for up to 80%. Am I. This will be the Iroquois is senior apartments in the Bicknell area. Iroquois senior living apartments. Will feature 47 units for seniors. Making up to that 30% mark. And an additional 13 units for those that make up to 50%. So. And then here is another 1. Bland street apartments. This is a collaboration between paragraphs development and the volunteers of America, they are putting together a project. 20 of these units will be 4 households that make. Up to 30%, and then there are some 80% units as well as market rate. Units in this development, bringing together a true mixed income of housing in the. She'll be park smoked town area. This is what excites me. So, since. 2017, we have funded, our Metro has fund. Through October 31st, a total of 4,658 units of housing, 217, new single family homes, homeownership opportunities. From vacant lots and abandoned housing and over 4,400 units of multi family units, new construction, both new construction and renovated units. And approximately 2500 units are now in service. Families are living in them and families have been. Benefiting from the investment that loyal Metro has put into the affordable housing trust fund. Once again, I want everyone to always remember that by ordnance half of all public moneys. Must serve those households that earn. Up to, or below 50 am I. so, for a family of 4 given the 2022 unit numbers that number is. 42,350 dollars we have several of those folks. The work for Metro, you have a lot of those folks, they work for the school system, the hospitals.

We're not talking about people necessarily. Um. You know, everyone always says my 1 question I ask people is what is affordable housing the go to our race is section 8. And I always explain to them section 8 is a tool. For affordable housing, it is not affordable housing, but it is a tool. It's an excellent tool to produce affordable housing but the vast majority of the people in this community do not have section 8 vouchers. So, we are looking at households that make. Up to 42,350 dollars. That are considered very low income. And need your help in finding affordable housing. So some of the other things we do, we go out and get public private funds. I'm sorry and we have a few banks that have contributed to us. We have what is called our homeowner's loan assistance program, whereby we help. Homeowners that have lived in a home for 2 years and have low incomes. To do small dollar loans to fix their homes. Uh, we have replaced furnaces, we've replaced or have some roof repairs we have, and when I say we, we provide the funding because we don't do it. Tanya would kill me but. We do provide those funds and we have very lenient guidelines so that the person is. Able to have an affordable payment, not more than 50 dollars a month. And they can get the things that they need. Sometimes it's a senior that needs. Their bathroom renovated because they now have. Mobility issues those are some of the examples, um. We help in sometimes partner with other entities and data and research. Projects such as the housing needs assessment, we. Have a lot of advocacy in education with developers, local state and federal government. Officials I've gone to Frankfurt to talk to them about affordable housing needs and Louisville, so that they can get a picture of what the needs are here in loyal as well as the entire state. I sit on the board of the community advisory committee with the federal. Reserve Bank to talk about what families are needing in our communities and how trust funds and other. Tools that local governments are using can be partnered with some of the things they're doing on the federal level. We have partnerships with other lenders and this past year, we actually started to practice what we preach. We purchased a building our headquarters at 3rd and Saint Kathryn, and it actually has 9 units of housing. And they are all affordable units, um. Rates are less than the fair market rate for 1, bedrooms and 2 bedrooms but we want to be the example. We're not there yet. It's a typical old loyal building. So we will have some renovations to do. We'll have to fund raise because we can't use our own money. So we'll have to fundraise. But we believe and what we. Preach to the tune of wanting to practice what we preach. We don't want to just talk the talk. We want to walk the walk. Of course, you've seen these statistics, all of the needs in our community.

But we have a long way to go. We still have a need in Jefferson County schools. I have not gotten a new house. Statistic to date, but we do know that they still are hovering in that 4 to 5,000 range of unhoused students in Jefferson County schools. Um, we still know that nearly 72,000 households are cost burden. We still know. That we have more than 30,000 units of need it for those at 30%. We have a need of an affordable housing in this community. But we are hoping and we are working. To decrease that need as time goes on. So, with that. Do you have any questions? These are just some charts that you can see I know you have a copy. Of the presentation, but do you have any questions. "Chair Shanklin" 1st, I just want to recognize councilman kiesha Dorsey, send chambers. Anyone else have any questions. I do have 1 if you don't mind. Yes. You know, we have the I think it's the repair for. We have natural housing, and every time a constituent, a man goals. They always say they're out of money at a fund. So do y'all. Do you all. Actually have a program that have these people are they have to go through. Uh, repair for natural housing. "Christie McCravey" The repair affair is a program of the new directions. Organization, but we. Partner with all of them, they are all aware of our program so when they run out of money, they did call us and see if I can help. "Chair Shanklin" No, I had a lady yesterday that she's been whiteness. She has. Really bad arthritis and she's trying to be get a shower. And if she's on the list, and they're in 90% and she's 88, I think, and she called yesterday, she was really grand and nothing really we can do cause they said they have to go through all the 90 s before they get to the 80 s and. s and She's written by a sheep I just wanted to know, you know, later on for the inflammation. "Christie McCravey" Yes. They can call us. If any of you have someone that you some of your constituents that may have some need, depending on what the repairs are. Sometimes our dollar amount is too low. We do have to 6,000 dollars of

But in some cases, that may be doable. So I would encourage metro council members to call us. If you have some constituents that have a need. I mentioned that we partnered with banks, but in 2020.

repairs. repairs

We also received a significant donation from the Northeast Christian church to put money into the homeowner's loan program. So we are very excited about that program. "Chair Shanklin" Okay, anyone else do you have any questions or concerns. "Olivia Bennett" Yes, ma'am. Councilman in the queue. "Chair Shanklin" Okay. I'm sorry. "Council Member Hollander" I thank you, Madam chair, thank you for being here. Christie really is a pretty remarkable story. We've gone from. 0 dollars of local funds. For housing to the trust fund to 97Million dollars since 2016. And and you've put it all to very good use. I'm really pleased as you've said, that you've already closed on 1 of the 40Million dollars from the American rescue plan. Of course, 40Million of that of the 97 is American rescue plan dollars and we need to to be grateful for that funding. We also had 32Million dollars in American rescue plan money for permanent, supportive housing and where we have a tremendous need of people who are living on our streets. living on our streets Uh, who need more than just a key, but they also need. Um, support, they need addiction, recovery services. In some cases, they need mental health services. They just need a lot of work to get back on their feet. Does that mean. And and, um. 1 of the really great things I think here is that we had more good projects in that area than we had funds and 8Million dollars from the general trust fund appropriation was used to finish off essentially the wellspring program, which is going to get a lot of people off the street and into that kind of recovery. So I really, I don't have a question. I just have I'm very grateful for all of your efforts. I know there's a board member here. Uh. ııh Chris Harrigan, I think he's the board chair. Actually. He's a constituent of mine. He stepped up to lead this organization over the last few years, and I want to thank him as well. And thank all of you for your work. It's a very small office that's doing a lot of big things. Thank you. "Christie McCravey"

Thank you counseling and we are so thankful for all of your support from day. 1. we wouldn't be here. I don't think had you not been the. Cheerleader for the trust fund and what we could do, we are so excited.

About everything that has happened, I will would like to say too, that when we receive the. American rescue plan applications. We received 17 applications for a total of 98,000,000. Dollars each of those applications had merit. Each of those applications would have been able to get a significant number of people off the streets. But, of course, we all have a limitation, just like we have personally, we have. Limitations in finances, but I would like to say that. Developers are ready to meet the need. Of to answer the call, I should say of providing units. For those at the most vulnerable level. Of our population and of our community. They answered the call and they are ready to move forward. They are only limited by the gap funds that come into play. And i1 thing I'd like to explain before I leave, is that. A lot of people ask, why is it so difficult. To develop affordable housing and I like to use this explanation. So when you go to the bank, the bank will. Give you money is based on how much income is going to come in. From your apartments or your housing so when you have market rate, of course, you've got a significant amount of more income that is going to come into play. So they are feeling real comfortable about how much. They are going to be, are you are going to be able to pay if they lend you money. If that amount of money is lessened. By restrictions on the. Amount of rent you can charge then they're not filling as good. So what normally happens is. Let's say you're building units for 30%. And the bank sees that they're going to say, well, I'm going to give you. 50 per cent of the monies that you need. In order to build that housing. So what happens at that point is called a developer gap. So, you've only got 50% of the money from your permanent lender, which would normally be a bank. So, at that point, a developer has to seek other sources of funding. They may go to Kentucky housing Corporation for tax credits, or to other entities in. There are entities like the Federal Home Loan Bank list. Other entities that are in this business, but that still may only net them. Another 30% of the money, because they have such a large gap. So, they're still only at 80 so from there, they're looking at. Something that we call deferred develop developer fee. Defer developer fee is what they earn are able to earn. From creating the product project. Most of our developers use deferred developer fee, which is alone to the project. To make the project work, but there's a cap on how much a developer can use. They can only defer so much based on guidelines. So let's say they defer another 10%. They still have only 90% of the moneys. So, therefore.

Entities like the trust fund are necessary because we step in. And provide that last 10% of the money. And without that, that project can't move forward. Without that investment from Metro and local government or state sources. These projects will never get done because there is going to be a cap on how much money. A permanent lender is going to give to a project so, keep that in mind. It is difficult for a developer to go out and put all of these sources together. That's why in many cases you don't see just 1 lender. When you are developing affordable housing, some projects have about 10 different sources of funding. It just depends but it is a complicated way to do business. They could easily make money. Doing market rate housing, much easier so I commend the developers who are in this space because it is not easy. It's time consuming. It's expensive. But they want to do it. "Council Member Hollander" I'm sure if I can follow up just briefly. And I think that's a great point and not always understood when we talk about putting 97Million dollars into the trust fund that doesn't mean that we built our preserved 97Million dollars worth of projects. That means we've built or preserved a whole lot more than that. Because your leverage is. because your leverage is Enormous WH, what sort of leverage ratio? I know it's different in each project, but "Christy McCravey" it is. But overall with that 97Million, I believe there are about. 280, I don't have my chart with me, but I think there that has netted about 280Million dollars worth of investment overall. Into loyal Metro, right? And I don't think that's well enough understood just 1 more thing. If I can Madam chair I think the other thing that's really good. Um, in the in the last. 8 years is, is the fact that this has been elevated as a community conversation. When people ran for retro council this year, every person who ran was asked about, what's your position on affordable housing when you going to do about that that was a big issue in the mayor's race. On all sides and, you know, that's all very important because we're sure not done. There's a whole lot more to do. Thank you, thank you for all your work. Thank you. Thank you for the opportunity. "Chair Shanklin" Uh, Darcy.

"Committee Member Dorsey"

Thank you Madam chair. I just had to piggyback on counsel and Hollander I had the opportunity to sit actually on this board for about 2 years. And so to my fellow committee members, if you haven't had an opportunity, the meetings, I think are open to the public. Take the opportunity to go and sit in 1 of these meetings. It is a lot of work. I see the team out there smiling at Tanya, looking and vetting the projects to actually go through. I heard Christie talking about the amount of projects that have gone through. But you don't see the projects that don't go through because the committee does such a good job at vetting. What really has value add to this community what has to potential. And so I just want to commend the process it it hasn't happened overnight, but it's taken a lot of work a lot of hours to put together something that is so sustainable. And I want to commend you, not just for that, but also committee members, this team steps outside of that scope constantly. Christy was was right with me with the red lining project and so always looking for ways to push. The needle forward in the city when it comes to housing sustainability, et cetera. So, I want to publicly commend you and your team for your aqumen and your excellence and not only that within the trust fund, but stepping outside of that scope to also inform and consult with other groups. You all don't know that. She's been consulting everything from Simmons to any affordable housing project. I call Christie and I'm like, can you talk to them? And so it's a lot of work a lot of hours more than 40 hours a week. So because I've sat with them that goes into this, and I just want to thank you all it's a labor of love. We could never pay you enough for what you all have given to this community. Our job is to invest, but you all's job is to make sure that our investment actually nets the benefit that we want. 464 "Bennett, Olivia" (3476999168) 01:00:36.175 --> 01:00:48.325 It's tough here on my side to fight for it, but it makes it easy when you have these types of outcomes, it makes it easy for us to continue to fight for those investments. So, I want to thank you publicly for the work that you. Do tirelessly to make us in the city stronger every day. Thank you. "Christie McCravey" Thank you. Council woman. We appreciate it. We appreciate everyone that listens and we're always eager to speak to every counsel person. We will come and I know in January you have a lot of new members we will be making appointments talking to you about how this process works. Um. I know the councilman, James, I think he's, I don't know if he's still here. Always had a passion of switching around the council people. Being on the board, so that more could become educated about the process. And we appreciate that because.

Once you get in and you see that how our. Staff, and how the volunteers that work with us, how they work and how sincerely. Eager they are to make the best decisions possible for this community when you see that. You know that your investment is in good hands. And we, thank you for that opportunity, because we don't take this task. Lightly at all, "Chair Shanklin" thank you Christy and I have to say, um. Partially sitting on it board layout and just sitting and listening. It's really fun meetings that they have. I mean, I just enjoy sitting there listening to them because it's not really like a meeting meeting. I mean, it is a meeting. But they don't make it, like, when you go to a meeting and you'd have to sit for hours and it just gets boring. Their meetings are very interesting. And I appreciate that because I'm for 1 that hates meetings, especially boring meetings and they. In your meetings are never boring. I just sit there and listen and they just. Have fun is they working and you appreciate a boy like that? So, thank you, Christie for all the things to be done and thanks for all the work you've done over the years. I've worked with you over the years and I appreciate it. So, if there any, any more questions or concerns. You're in none if we don't have any more questions concerns. We are adjourned, thank you for everything. Thanks. Thank you.