



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Certificate of Appropriateness

To: Andrew Todd Shelburne
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: November 11, 2021 *edell*

Case No: 21-COA-0253
Classification: Staff Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 156 State St.

Applicant: Andrew Todd Shelburne
156 State St.
Louisville, KY 40206
(502) 718-6870
(502) 489-7402
toddshelburne@yahoo.com

Owner: Same as Applicant

Estimated Project Cost: \$50,000.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval for the after-the-fact modifications of

- an existing historic addition—the roof height was raised, and the shed roof was changed to a flat roof. The two windows on the first floor of the addition were removed and replaced with an entry door and transom window. The entire addition was then clad in wood lap siding.
- a new addition—approximately 112 sq ft was added to the southwest corner of the home. The new addition has a flat roof and cedar lap siding. An entry door and transom window were added for rear yard access.
- a new deck—the new deck extends across the entire rear elevation of the home. Constructed of wood, there is a metal guardrail around the whole structure. A

privacy wall was added on the south side of the deck for privacy. It is clad in cedar lap siding that matches the rear addition.

- a new privacy fence now encloses the rear yard. The fence is 7' tall with horizontal boards.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application:

The COA application was received on November 9, 2021. The application was determined to be Staff level review on November 10, 2021. The applicant contacted staff November 5, 2021 in response to a Notice of Violation that had been issued. Staff let the applicant know over the phone, and via email that the after the fact work would require a COA, as well as other possible approvals from other agencies on November 5, 2021.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Clifton Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Addition** and **Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is included in this report.

Site Context/ Background

The site is located on the west side of State St. seven lots north from its intersection with Frankfort Ave. The property is zoned R5A within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The building is a circa 1900, one-story, wood frame shotgun style home with a character defining wrap around front porch. It is surrounded by residential homes in a mix of ages, styles, and massing as well as the presence of a large institutional building across the street.

Conclusions

The proposed after-the-fact changes to the historic addition, new addition, and new deck located at the rear of the home generally meet the Clifton design guidelines for **Addition**. The additions are designed with a more modern aesthetic, but they are complementary to the historic building. Furthermore, this design helps differentiate the historic from the new. The proposed after-the-fact privacy fence generally meets the Clifton design guidelines for **Site**. The fence is appropriate in terms of design, location, and materials.

DECISION

Based on the information furnished by the applicant, the application for an after-the-fact Certificate of Appropriateness is **approved with the following conditions:**

1. **The applicant shall receive any necessary variances, including side yard setback, that may be needed for the after-the-fact work.**
2. **The applicant shall receive all necessary permits, including building permits, from all agencies for the after-the-fact work.**

3. The applicant shall paint, stain, or clear coat all wood related to the addition, deck, and fence within 1 year.
4. If the design or materials change, the applicant and/or their representative shall contact staff for review and approval.
5. Any other exterior work on the property shall be discussed with staff before work taking place.

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, their successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.

Bradley Fister

11/10/2021

Bradley Fister
Historic Preservation Specialist

Date

Addition

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

- | | | | |
|-----|----------------------------------|-----|----------------------------|
| + | Meets Guidelines | NA | Not Applicable |
| - | Does Not Meet Guidelines | NSI | Not Sufficient Information |
| +/- | Meets Guidelines with Conditions | | |

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
A1	The design of any new addition or expansion should be compatible and in proportion with the mass and scale of the historic building, adjacent structures, and the district.	+	The addition is generally compatible.
A2	New additions should be designed in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new. Do not design additions to appear older than the original building.	+	Addition is distinct from historic portion of the property.
A3	Additions should be designed so there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration. This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion. Do not duplicate the exact form, material, style, and detailing of the historic building in the new addition.	+	Addition is distinct from historic portion of the property.
A4	Additions should be attached to side or rear elevations (façades) and should be set back from the street front façade, and should not damage or obscure character-defining features.	+	Rear elevation
A5	The design of the new addition should be subordinate to the original building. Rear and side additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.	+	Addition is generally subordinate to the historic portion of the property.
A6	The original street front orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade.	+	The addition is generally not visible from the front of the street.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	(The side or the rear of the house should not become the front of the house.)		
A7	The new addition should be designed so the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	+	Addition floor height generally is the same as the existing.
A8	The new addition should be designed with the intent to maintain the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion. The size and placement of doors and windows should be proportional to the number, size, and shape of the new wall elevation as compared to the mass and scale of the historic building. See Door and Entrance and Window guidelines for more details.	+	Addition generally maintains the same relationship of solids and voids.
A9	Full-floor additions on contributing residential structures (adding an additional full floor on top of a house) are not recommended unless the full-floor addition will be compatible with the existing streetscape and adjacent homes and structures and the impact on the character of the historic home is not totally transformed.	NA	
A10	Materials should be used that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+	Addition materials are generally the same or subordinate.
A11	The original roof pitch, style, shape, and volume should be respected when designing an addition. The roof on the addition should complement the existing roof forms, not overwhelm them.	+/-	The new roof is not in keeping with the existing roof form, but helps to define the addition from the historic portion.
A12	On commercial or institutional structures, the construction of new additions or additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible when viewed from the street and should not damage or destroy character-defining features. New additions or additional stories should be set back from the historic wall plane.	NA	
A13	New additions to structures may incorporate contemporary, energy efficient, and sustainable design and materials. However, do not imitate an historic style or period of architecture in new additions, especially for contemporary uses such as drive-in windows or garages.	NA	
A14	Sunrooms or screened porches that are compatible with the home may be constructed as a rear or side addition and built with a similar level of quality construction and design.	+	Deck located at the rear.
A15	Decks may be constructed on the rear or an inconspicuous side of the building. Do not construct a deck on the front façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or stained.	+	Deck located at the rear.
A16	The rear deck design should not extend beyond the side walls of the house and should not be visible from the front façade or street.	+	Rear deck generally does not extend beyond the walls of the home.
A17	When adding new exterior steps, stairways, fire escapes, or elevator shafts, do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features. The new addition's construction scale and materials should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	+	Stairs to deck are generally in keeping with the character of the building and design.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
A18	Exterior fire escape steps should be installed only on the side or rear façade of the building. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. The fire escape should be as inconspicuous as possible when viewed from the street.	NA	
A19	Exterior fire escape steps constructed of wood should be painted or stained, oriented to the yard, and kept to a minimum functional size.	NA	

Site

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Paving materials (concrete, brick, paver stones, cobblestones, asphalt, gravel, stone, permeable or pervious materials) that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character should be used for private sidewalks, drives, and roadways.	NA	
ST2	Historic paving materials for streets, alleys, sidewalks, and curbing (brick, hexagonal pavers, cobblestones, limestone, granite, or natural stone) should be protected, maintained, restored, and reused. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Replacement with historic materials is encouraged. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original. See Masonry M13 guideline for cement mortar mix recipe.	NA	
ST3	Steps on private property made of brick, stone, or poured concrete should be maintained wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST4	Paving companies and utility contractors shall not harm historic resources during road or underground utility repair projects.	NA	
ST5	Driveways, parking areas, and loading docks should be constructed or located to the side and rear of properties. Alley access is preferred.	NA	
ST6	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not re-contour front yard berms into stepped terraces. Do not use railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically inappropriate material for retaining walls.	NA	
ST7	Excavations, trenching or re-grading adjacent to a building or site should be performed cautiously so as not to cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources. Every reasonable effort shall be made to protect	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	and preserve architectural resources affected by, or adjacent to, any project.		
ST8	Masonry walls in street-visible locations should not be installed unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless an historic precedent exists.	NA	
ST9	Retaining wall and curbing should match the existing character of the original materials when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST10	Fencing should match existing sections of fencing in material, height, design, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	+	Fencing generally meets the design guidelines.
ST11	Iron fencing should be installed, historically compatible, and of a similar height where there is a demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST12	Front yard fencing should not be installed where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST13	Rear yard or side yard privacy fencing should be installed with the finished side out and a side wall setback from the front of the house of at least two feet. Privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Refer to the Land Development Code or contact the Department of Codes and Regulations regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	+	Applicant appears to have installed the fencing with the finished side out.
ST14	Chain-link fencing painted black or dark color may be installed in residential front yards or along commercial corridors at the street where there is an historic precedent. Split-rail, woven-wood fencing, opaque fencing, painted or stained pressure-treated wood fencing, or recycled or reclaimed materials may be permitted with appropriate design. Synthetic or composite fencing that is durable may be considered.	NA	
ST15	Exterior lighting fixtures should not be falsely historical. The fixture should be attached to the exterior in a way as to not damage historic fabric.	NA	
ST16	Exterior lighting for parking areas, architectural features, or other site areas should be directed down and away from neighboring properties. Energy-efficient lights should be used to create a soft illumination and to minimize the impact to adjacent properties. Reference the Land Development Code for illumination restrictions.	NA	
ST17	Parking lot design requires a portion of the parking area to be landscaped or buffered from adjoining properties. Reference the Land Development Code for specifics on parking lot design, maneuvering, landscaping, and buffering requirements.	NA	
ST18	Auxiliary fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, rain barrels, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, should be located on secondary elevations (side or rear) so they do not detract from the street-address façade and the character of the site.	NA	
ST19	Trees in front yards should be preserved. Established street tree patterns should be enhanced by planting additional trees along the public rights-of-way in the grass area	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	between the street and sidewalk. Consult the city arborist or Frankfort Avenue Street Tree Master Plan to determine tree species that are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review by Landmarks staff unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety concerns.		
ST20	Cellular towers and associated fixtures should be strategically located to minimize the impact on historic view shed(s), screened from public view, and should not damage historic elements when attached to structures.	NA	
ST21	Utility lines should be installed underground whenever possible.	NA	
ST22	The concrete mixture should match the existing or historic concrete mixture when repairing or replacing sidewalks or installing new sidewalks in the public right-of-way. Contact the Landmarks staff for the appropriate mixture and specifications.	NA	