



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee
From: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
Date: January 15, 2020

Case No: 19-COA-0141
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 210 E. Ormsby Ave.

Applicant: David Wheeler
1379 Ouerbacker Ct.
Louisville, KY 40208
502-767-5456
davidwheeler1969@gmail.com

Owner: John Daniel
Dream LLC
120 Mercer Lane
Greenville, KY 42345
502-724-4466

Estimated Project Cost: \$2,500

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks an after-the-fact approval to replace the gable window on the front façade. The window and lintel along with seven rows of bricks had become unstable and were at risk of falling. The new windows are wood double-hung one-over-one windows. The two windows replace a non-historic one-over-one window that was installed in the past by a different owner. The damaged limestone lintel which was replaced with a flat concrete lintel with a keystone detail. The lintel and bricks will be painted to match existing.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on November 13, 2019 and considered complete and requiring committee level review on December 16, 2019.

The case is scheduled to be heard by the Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on January 22, 2020 at 5:30 pm, at 444 S. 5th Street, Conference Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Window**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The three-story masonry structure is located on the south of E. Ormsby Ave. between S. Brook St. and S. Floyd St. The site is zoned TNZD within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The site contains a two-and-a-half-story frame house surrounded by mostly commercial and industrial properties and one residential building.

There are two previous cases associated with this property. **S-05-206-OL** granted approval for replacement windows on the sides and rear of the house. An additional COA, **16-COA-1284** was granted for the replacement of a rear deck and stairs.

Conclusions

The proposed window replacement generally meets the design guidelines for **Window**. The original designation photo indicates that there were two one-over-one windows in the gable of the front façade. At some point after designation, these original windows had been replaced with a one-over-one window that filled the entire opening. The recent replacement windows restore the original configuration of the fenestration in the gable of the front façade. This work would comply with **W1**. The replacement windows are wood which complies with the **W6**.

The original window opening had a rusticated lintel that spanned had been damaged over time. It was removed along with the window and bricks were removed prevent further instability. The replacement lintel is smooth concrete with a keystone detail in the center. Guideline **W13** states that window elements should be reconstructed when there are surviving prototypes. The new lintel matches the smooth-faced sill. The keystone element is a conjectural detail that should be minimized. Painting the lintel should help reduce the appearance of the keystone, but adding an addition skim coat on the lintel surface would further reduce the appearance.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved** with the following conditions:

1. The lintel keystone should be minimized further with an additional skim coat and painted to simplify design.
2. If the design changes, the applicant, owner, and/or their representative shall contact staff for review and approval.

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.



Cynthia Elmore
Historic Preservation Officer

1/15/2020

Date

WINDOW

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of vinyl- and aluminum-clad wood window systems on primary elevations may be permissible if the proportion and detail closely match the original.	+	The original windows were removed in the 1970s.
W2	Select windows that match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when repair of original windows is impossible.	+	The new windows are one-over-one double hung sash units which restore the historic appearance.
W3	Evaluate the option of using appropriate salvage materials when replacing windows that are deteriorated beyond repair.	NA	There is no existing window trim due to alterations from a previous fire
W4	Do not use replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock windows	+	The new windows are one-over-one double hung sash units which restore the historic appearance.
W5	Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie windows in exterior window openings.	NA	
W6	Do not install synthetic replacement windows (vinyl, etc.) on primary facades.	+	Wood windows installed.
W7	Install replacement windows that operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	+	The new windows are one-over-one double hung sash units which restore the historic appearance.
W8	Do not replace multi-pane windows that have true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on primary façade elevations.	NA	
W9	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	+	
W10	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	+	
W11	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	NA	
W12	Do not block-in or back-paint transoms or sidelights.	NA	
W13	Use surviving prototypes to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds. The reconstructed element should be constructed of materials for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if that is not possible.	+/-	There is no existing window trim due to alterations from a previous fire. The historic limestone lintel was failing and was removed. New concrete lintel installed.

W14	Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	NA	
W15	Locate any new windows openings that may be required for a new use on a façade that cannot be seen from a public way. Newly-installed windows should be compatible with the overall design of the building.	NA	
W16	Do not obscure historic window trim with metal or siding material.	NA	
W17	Do not install new floors or dropped ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W18	Install exterior storm windows that duplicate the shape of the original window. Storm windows should be painted to match the color of the window frame.	NA	
W19	Do not install exterior storm windows or screens that damage or obscure historic windows or frames. Mount storm windows on the blind stop within the window frame. Storm window or screen rails should always match the rails of the windows behind. They should have either wood or narrow, metal frames that are painted to match the color of the building trim.	NA	
W20	Do not install window air conditioning units on a primary façade if installation on a secondary façade can address the same need. If this is not an option, do not alter the window sash to accommodate the air-conditioning unit.	NA	
W21	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W22	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W23	Install awnings made of weather-proofed canvas of a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	
W24	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	
W25	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	
W26	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
W27	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7' above the sidewalk.	NA	
W28	Repair shutters with in-kind materials. If damage is so extensive that they cannot be repaired, replacement shutters should match the visual appearance of the originals.	NA	

W29	Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. Replacement shutters should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically-appropriate material. Solid shutters are appropriate for the ground floor, and solid or louvered shutters are appropriate for upper floors.	NA	
W30	Mount replacement shutters so that they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. This gives shutters the appearance that they are indeed operable, even if in truth they are not. Shutters should not be applied to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window.	NA	
W31	Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters.	NA	
W32	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	NA	