



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Staff Report to the Committee

To: Clifton Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer *CE*
From: Becky Gorman, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: October 18, 2018

Case No: 18COA1263
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address 2227 Payne Street

Applicant: Terry Seelow
Seel Construction
33 Autumn Hill Court
Louisville, KY 40059
502.649.7870
Seel.construction.ky@icloud.com

Owner: Gabriel Anderson
Blue Sapphire, LLC
941 Baxter Ave, Unit 102
Louisville, KY 40204
812.207.7999
Gabe.anderson@outlook.com

Estimated Project Cost: \$10,000

Description of proposed exterior alteration

The applicant seeks approval for the construction of two new dormers on to east and west sides of the one-story roof of the house. The dormers will have slight shed roofs that will extend from the existing roof ridge, sheathed in membrane roofing, and gutters that will match the existing house. They will be clad in vinyl

lap siding to match the existing house. The elevation of the dormer which faces Ratstetter Avenue will feature 2 one-over-one double-hung vinyl windows that will match those in the existing house.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

A pre-application meeting was held on October 9, 2018 with the applicant on-site. After assessing his renovation efforts thus far, and seeing both plan layout and site constraints, an understanding of his rationale was made, and agreement to seek review via Architectural Review Committee. The application was received on October 12, 2018. The application was determined to be complete and classified as requiring Committee Review on October 15, 2018.

The case is scheduled for a hearing of the Clifton Architectural Review Committee on October 24, 2018 at 6:30 P.M at Metro Development Center, 444 South 5th Street.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Clifton Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Addition and Roofing**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/Background

The wood frame shotgun house is located on the northwest corner of Payne Street and S. Rastetter Avenue. The house has a primary entrance with an open front porch and a second setback side entrance that faces the street. The house has a front gable roof that connects to a hip roof. It is surrounded by other 1 and 1½ story wood frame shotgun, camelback, and bungalow houses. It is zoned R-5A in a Traditional Neighborhood Form District.

The applicant submitted an application (18COA1262) requesting approval for window replacement on the sides and rear elevations. The windows on the front façade will be repaired. This application is being reviewed at staff level.

Conclusions

The proposed addition generally meets the Clifton design guidelines for Addition and Roofing. Although the dormers are not fully compliant with A4, A9, and A11, they do not directly conflict with these guidelines either. The proposed dormers will be located on top of the one-story roofline and set back from the front of the house. Therefore, a good portion of the original roofline at the front of the house will maintain the original roof form. The proposed dormers will have shed roofs

that extend from the roof ridgeline. Staff recommends that the dormers start below the ridgeline not directly from the ridgeline and have more of a pitch to them than what is shown on the drawings. A slightly steeper pitch would better complement the existing roof. The dormers extend from the roofline to the wall plane of the side walls of the existing house. Staff recommends that the dormers be slightly recessed from the existing side walls. The dormers are generally subordinate to the main structure and distinguishable as new from the historic character and form of the existing structure.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions:**

1. The dormers shall start below the ridgeline not directly from the ridgeline and have more of a pitch to them than what is shown on the drawings.
2. The dormers shall be slightly recessed from the existing side walls.
3. All Planning & Design approvals and building permits shall be obtained prior to construction.
4. If the design changes, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.

Becky Gorman
Historic Preservation Specialist

10/19/18

Date

Attached Documents / Information

1. Staff Guideline Checklists

Addition

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
A1	The design of any new addition or expansion should be compatible and in proportion with the mass and scale of the historic building, adjacent structures, and the district.	+	
A2	New additions should be designed in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new. Do not design	+	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	additions to appear older than the original building.		
A3	Additions should be designed so there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration. This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion. Do not duplicate the exact form, material, style, and detailing of the historic building in the new addition.	+	
A4	Additions should be attached to side or rear elevations (façades) and should be set back from the street front façade, and should not damage or obscure character-defining features.	+/-	The proposed dormers will be located on the roof and are set back from the front of the structure.
A5	The design of the new addition should be subordinate to the original building. Rear and side additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.		
A6	The original street front orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade. (The side or the rear of the house should not become the front of the house.)	+	
A7	The new addition should be designed so the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	+	
A8	The new addition should be designed with the intent to maintain the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion. The size and placement of doors and windows should be proportional to the number, size, and shape of the new wall elevation as compared to the mass and scale of the historic building. See Door and Entrance and Window guidelines for more details.	+	
A9	Full-floor additions on contributing residential structures (adding an additional full floor on top of a house) are not recommended unless the full-floor addition will be compatible with the existing streetscape and adjacent homes and structures and the impact on the character of the historic home is not totally transformed.	+/-	The new dormers have some impact to the structure but they are distinguishable from the historic character and form of the structure. The new dormers will not negatively impact the existing streetscape.
A10	Materials should be used that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+	
A11	The original roof pitch, style, shape, and volume should be respected when designing an addition. The roof on the addition should complement the existing roof forms, not overwhelm them.	+/-	The dormers will have shed roofs.
A12	On commercial or institutional structures, the construction of new additions or additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible when viewed from the street and should not damage or destroy character-defining features. New additions or additional stories should be set back from the historic wall plane.	NA	
A13	New additions to structures may incorporate contemporary, energy efficient, and sustainable design and materials. However, do not imitate an historic style or period of architecture in new additions, especially for contemporary	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	uses such as drive-in windows or garages.		
A14	Sunrooms or screened porches that are compatible with the home may be constructed as a rear or side addition and built with a similar level of quality construction and design.	NA	
A15	Decks may be constructed on the rear or an inconspicuous side of the building. Do not construct a deck on the front façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or stained.	NA	
A16	The rear deck design should not extend beyond the side walls of the house and should not be visible from the front façade or street.	NA	
A17	When adding new exterior steps, stairways, fire escapes, or elevator shafts, do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features. The new addition's construction scale and materials should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	NA	
A18	Exterior fire escape steps should be installed only on the side or rear façade of the building. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. The fire escape should be as inconspicuous as possible when viewed from the street.	NA	
A19	Exterior fire escape steps constructed of wood should be painted or stained, oriented to the yard, and kept to a minimum functional size.	NA	

Roofing

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
 - Does Not Meet Guidelines
 - +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions
- NA Not Applicable
 NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
R1	Replacement roofing materials should closely match the original roofing material in texture and profile. Some substitute materials including asphalt shingles, dimensional shingles, or cement tiles may be considered. Contact the Landmarks staff for any new emerging roof technologies.	NA	
R2	Metal roofing materials like lead-coated copper, terne-coated steel, and aluminum/zinc-coated steel can successfully replace tin, terne plate, zinc, or lead. Copper-coated steel is a less expensive (and less durable) substitute for sheet copper. While copper roofs may be left unpainted, terne-metal roofs should be painted a traditional roof color. Repair and replacement with in-kind materials is recommended in order to preserve the visual appearance of the original. Contact the Landmarks staff for any new emerging metal roof technologies.	NA	
R3	When replacing metal roofing on residential roofs, the proportion and spacing of the seams and trim should match the original. Commercial-grade architectural metal roofing systems should not be used on residential architecture because the scale is inappropriate.	NA	
R4	On historic terra cotta clay tile roofs, ridge and hip tiles should be retained. Field tiles may be replaced with a compatible substitute material, such as a dimensional shingle in a color approximating the original. Ridge and hip tiles should be reinstalled to maintain the roof's historic	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	profile. Reinstallation of sound roof tiles and slates on smaller, secondary roof forms (porches, bay windows, etc.) is encouraged wherever possible.		
R5	On slate roofs, historic roof details, such as decorative cresting and finials and metal ridge caps, should be replaced with in-kind materials or materials that are visually compatible.	NA	
R6	The reconstruction of any missing roof feature should be based on historical, pictorial, and physical evidence. If the evidence is insufficient, the roof feature should be of a compatible new design rather than a falsely historical or conjectural reconstruction.	NA	
R7	On additions or new construction, new roof designs should be similar or compatible with the shape, size, scale, and materials of the historic building and other buildings within the district.	+	The shed roof is compatible. A slightly steeper pitch would better complement the existing roof.
R8	For major decaying or deteriorated roof features – like cupolas, dormers, or chimneys – the form and detailing of the features should be used to create appropriate replicas. Smaller irreparable historic roof details – such as decorative cresting, finials, or metal roof caps for slate roofs – should be replaced with in-kind or visually compatible materials.	NA	
R9	Extensive areas of flashing should not be visible and should be avoided. Portions of metal flashing may be covered by mortar or stucco.	NA	
R10	When installing replacement gutters, do not destroy the historic roof detail.	NA	
R11	When replacing gutters, use half-round replacement gutters or ogee profile gutters that have a simple design and do not alter the character of the trim. When it is not possible to repair or replace the original box gutters, the box gutters should be roofed over and the replacement gutters attached.	NA	
R12	Unpainted galvanized steel gutters or downspouts are not preferred as they will rust and stain adjacent materials. Galvanized gutters should be appropriately primed and painted after a period of weathering. Vinyl gutters and downspouts should be avoided due to their short life expectancy.	NA	
R13	Historically exposed rafter ends and eaves should remain and be preserved.	NA	
R14	New roof-top additions should not compromise the structural integrity of the building.	NA	
R15	Any new roof-top mechanical or service equipment should be installed in a manner as to not damage the historic elements or fabric; examples include: cupola, weathervane, and chimney.	NA	
R16	Mechanical equipment or systems (examples: HVAC or water) should not be installed on roofs where they may overload and compromise a historic building's existing structural system. Additional support systems may need to be constructed to support the additional weight load.	NA	
R17	Antennae, satellite dishes, skylights, vents, roof-top mechanical units, decks, terraces, dormers, or high-profile solar panels should not be installed where they can be seen from a building's street address façade or primary elevation. Skylights should be flush (not the "bubble" type) with curbs painted to match the color of the roof material. Consolidate antennae wherever possible.	NA	