



---

## Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

### Report to the Committee

---

To: Butchertown Architectural Review Committee  
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer *CE*  
From: Savannah Darr, Planning & Design Coordinator  
Date: October 5, 2018

---

**Case No:** 18COA1247  
**Classification:** Committee Review

#### GENERAL INFORMATION

**Property Address:** 601 E. Main Street

**Applicant:** Brandon Denton  
Denton Floyd Real Estate Group  
1473 S. 4<sup>th</sup> Street  
Louisville, KY 40208  
502-339-0611  
[Bdenton@dentonfloyd.com](mailto:Bdenton@dentonfloyd.com)

**Owner:** same as applicant

**Plan Prepared By:** John Campbell  
Heritage Engineering  
642 S. 4<sup>th</sup> Street  
Louisville, KY 40202  
502-562-1412  
[jcampbell@heritageeng.com](mailto:jcampbell@heritageeng.com)

**Estimated Project Cost:** TBD

#### **Description of proposed exterior alteration:**

The applicant requests approval for the following for the **front façade**:

- Reconstruct the two missing stories of the building to match the historic façade, which was previously removed;
- Remove the CMU infill walls and replace with matching brick;
- Remove the storefront windows and replace with 1/1 double hung windows to match the rest of the building;
- Replace the storefront windows on the 5<sup>th</sup> bay and replace with an aluminum double door entry system with transoms and sidelights;

- Remove the concrete dock and door on the 6<sup>th</sup> bay and add windows on the first and second stories; and,
- Remove the double entry doors on the 7<sup>th</sup> bay and add windows on the first story.

The applicant requests approval for the following for the **west façade**:

- Add window openings and 1/1 double hung windows on all stories where there are no windows presently;
- Install two exit doors on the first story where there are no doors presently; and,
- Construct a new lobby addition with an aluminum curtain wall system, double entry door system, and stairs. The new addition will be taller than the front façade of the building.

The applicant requests approval for the following for the **north façade**:

- Remove the sliding door on the 1<sup>st</sup> bay and install ganged 1/1 double hung windows on the first and second stories;
- Remove the sliding door on the 2<sup>nd</sup> bay and install ganged 1/1 double hung windows on the first and second stories. Also add an exit door with a single window above it; and,
- Remove the doors on the 3<sup>rd</sup> bay and install 1/1 double hung windows on all four stories.

The applicant requests approval for the following for the **east façade**:

- Remove a window and door on the southernmost side of the façade;
- Add window openings and 1/1 double hung windows on all stories where there are no windows presently; and,
- Install doors and small balconies where there are none presently.

All new 1/1 double hung windows will be wood windows clad in aluminum or vinyl. The applicant requests approval to construct an interior courtyard area where there is currently building. Furthermore, the applicant proposes to demolish the existing rooftop addition that is clad in metal.

### **Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application**

The application was received on September 28, 2018. The application was determined to be complete and was classified as requiring Committee Review on October 1, 2018. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Butchertown Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on October 10, 2018 at 5:30 pm, at 444 S. 5<sup>th</sup> Street, Conference Room 302.

## **FINDINGS**

### **Guidelines**

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Butchertown Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Addition, Demolition, Door, and Window**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

### **Site Context/ Background**

The property, zoned EZ1, is located within the Downtown Form District at the northeast corner of N. Hancock and E. Main Streets. The two-story masonry building known as, Grocer's Ice & Cold Storage, is bound by I-65 to the west, E. Washington Street to the north, Main & Clay Apartments to the east, and E. Main Street to the south. The Kentucky Transportation Cabinet holds a preservation easement on this property from Section 106 mitigation. Staff approved a COA (17COA1281) for site work at the property in 2017, which needs to be amended based on the site plan submitted with this COA application.

### **Conclusions**

The proposed work generally meets the Butchertown Design Guidelines for **Addition, Demolition, Door, and Window**. The front façade of the building, which has been greatly altered will be restored to a historic appearance. While the restoration will not match the historic façade perfectly, any proposed modifications, including windows and doors, are appropriate for the overall design of the building, which was industrial. The proposed lobby addition on the west façade is in keeping with the scale of the building and overall block. While it will be taller than the front façade, it is stepped back, and should not be noticeable from E. Main Street. Furthermore, the design of the addition is of its time and does not create a false historicism. The proposed demolition of the metal rooftop addition will not affect the integrity of the building. The proposed interior courtyard will not be visible from the exterior of the building and is an acceptable modification for the multi-family adaptive reuse.

### **RECOMMENDATION**

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions**:

1. **The windows shall not have reflective or insulating film, or smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass that can be seen from a public way.**
2. **The proposed scope of work shall be submitted for review to the entity(ies) stated in the preservation easement on the property.**
3. **If the design or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.**

*The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.*

10/5/18  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Savannah Darr  
Planning & Design Coordinator

# ADDITION

## Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
<b>A1</b>	Ensure that the design of any new addition is in proportion with the size and scale of the historic building and district.	+	The new lobby addition is proportional to the building. The reconstruction of the front façade with new stories brings the building back to its historic scale.
<b>A2</b>	Design any addition so that it is subordinate to the original building. Generally, additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.	+	
<b>A3</b>	Generally, additions should be attached to secondary elevations and should be set back from the front façade, so as not to damage or obscure character-defining features.	+/-	The reconstruction of the front façade with new stories will be on the front.
<b>A4</b>	Use materials that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+	Additions will be brick like the building
<b>A5</b>	Respect original roof forms when designing an addition. Additions should complement existing forms, not overwhelm them.	+	
<b>A6</b>	Do not undertake any full-floor additions in residential preservation districts (adding an additional full floor on top of a building).	+/-	The reconstruction of the front façade with new stories will be on the front.
<b>A7</b>	Generally, the original orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade.	+	
<b>A8</b>	Design any new addition so that the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	+	
<b>A9</b>	Design additions to have the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion.	+	
<b>A10</b>	Design additions so that there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration. This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion.	+/-	The reconstruction will try to match the historic façade. However, the lobby addition will be of its time.
<b>A11</b>	Set back additional stories from the historic wall plane of commercial or institutional structures when such an approach is required for a new use. The construction of additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible and not damage or destroy character-defining features.	+/-	The reconstruction of the front façade with new stories will be on the front and not set back. However, the lobby addition will be taller than the front façade and will be stepped back.
<b>A12</b>	Do not design additions to appear older than the original building.	+/-	See comment above

<b>A13</b>	Comply with the Kentucky building code in such a way that a historic building's character-defining features are preserved.	+	
<b>A14</b>	Do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features when adding a new code-required stairway or elevator. Any such addition should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	+	All new exits are appropriate
<b>A15</b>	Install fire escapes only on secondary elevations. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. They should preferably be painted to match the color of the wall.	+	
<b>A16</b>	Do not construct a deck on a front or side façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or finished with an opaque stain. Use the railing detail developed by the Landmarks Commission or other approved detail.	NA	
<b>A17</b>	Design rear decks so that they do not extend beyond the side walls of the house and are not visible from the street.	NA	
<b>A18</b>	Wood fire stairs should be painted or stained and should be kept to a minimum functional size.	NA	

# DEMOLITION

## Design Guideline Checklist From Economic Hardship Exemption

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

### Introduction

Unless the city has determined that it poses an imminent threat to life or property, do not demolish any historic structure or part of a historic structure that contributes to the integrity of any historic district, or any individual landmark or part of an individual landmark.

### Demolition by Neglect

*The deteriorated condition of a historic building attributable to the owner's failure to provide proper maintenance over an extended period of time will not be considered a mitigating circumstance in evaluations of economic hardship. Hardship that is attributable to a building's being allowed to deteriorate will be considered self-imposed; restoration costs incurred to remediate such neglect will not be considered.*

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
<b>DE1</b>	Do not demolish existing non-contributing buildings and additions in a manner that will threaten the integrity of existing contributing structures.	+	Demolition of the existing rooftop addition that is clad in metal will not harm the structure.
<b>DE2</b>	Do take steps to assure the integrity of a wall exposed to the elements by the removal of a non-historic addition.	+	
<b>DE3</b>	Do remove non-historic interior finishes such as plaster, drywall, or paneling that may be exposed as a result of the removal of non-historic additions.	NA	

<b>DE4</b>	Do infill non-historic openings in historic walls, exposed as a result of the removal of the non-historic finishes.	+	
<b>DE5</b>	Do landscape areas that are left vacant as the result of removals of non-contributing buildings and additions. Topography should be made consistent with that of adjacent properties. The slope and grades of land left vacant after demolition should continue and be consistent with those features on adjacent properties.	NA	
<b>DE6</b>	Do take measures to reestablish the street wall after demolition through the use of low fences, walls, and/or vegetation.	NA	

# DOOR

## Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	<b>Guideline</b>	<b>Finding</b>	<b>Comment</b>
<b>D1</b>	Do not alter the character of entrances by either removing historic elements or through the addition of elements for which there is no historic precedent.	+/-	The historic elements had been previously removed. The new doors will be more appropriate.
<b>D2</b>	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric	NA	
<b>D3</b>	Use historical, pictorial, and physical documentation when undertaking the reconstruction of a missing entrance or porch feature. If there is not sufficient information to determine the original design, a new design should be prepared that is compatible with the architectural character of the building and the district. Conjectural or falsely-historical designs are not appropriate.	+/-	While the new doors will not match perfectly, they will be more appropriate than what is there now.
<b>D4</b>	Use only those replacement doors that duplicate the design, proportion, and arrangement of paneling and glazing of the original.	+/-	See comment above
<b>D5</b>	Do not replace historic double leaf doors with a single door.	NA	
<b>D6</b>	Do not alter original openings to accommodate stock doors.	+/-	The door openings have been previously filled in. The new doors will have a new opening.
<b>D7</b>	Install only screen doors or storm doors that are simple with a narrow-frame design that enables the inner door to be seen. Metal screen and storm doors should be painted or finished to match the inner door.	NA	
<b>D8</b>	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original doors or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grilles should retract out of sight during business hours and preferably be mounted inside the glass. Painting security bars an unobtrusive color is recommended.	NA	
<b>D9</b>	Differentiate between primary and secondary doors, using the detailing of the doors or the articulation of the frame.	+	

<b>D10</b>	Do not add vestibules to primary facades unless there is a historic precedent. Such additions alter the character, proportion, and massing of the façade.	NA	
<b>D11</b>	Do not create new entrances on facades that can be seen from a public way.	+/-	The door openings have been previously filled in and moved. The new door openings are appropriate.
<b>D12</b>	Replacement of non-original, non-historic doors with new doors that are appropriate to the period and style of the building and are the size of the original opening is recommended.	+	

# WINDOW

## Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	<b>Guideline</b>	<b>Finding</b>	<b>Comment</b>
<b>W1</b>	Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of vinyl- and aluminum-clad wood window systems on primary elevations may be permissible if the proportion and detail closely match the original.	+/-	Non-historic storefront windows being removed and replaced with double hung wood windows.
<b>W2</b>	Select windows that match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when repair of original windows is impossible.	+/-	Non-historic storefront windows being removed and replaced with double hung windows.
<b>W3</b>	Evaluate the option of using appropriate salvage materials when replacing windows that are deteriorated beyond repair.	NSI	
<b>W4</b>	Do not use replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock windows	NA	Non-historic storefront windows being removed and replaced with double hung windows.
<b>W5</b>	Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie windows in exterior window openings.	NA	
<b>W6</b>	Do not install synthetic replacement windows (vinyl, etc.) on primary facades.	+	All new windows will be wood windows clad in vinyl or aluminum.
<b>W7</b>	Install replacement windows that operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	+/-	Non-historic storefront windows being removed and replaced with double hung windows.
<b>W8</b>	Do not replace multi-pane windows that have true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on primary façade elevations.	NA	No windows have muntins

<b>W9</b>	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	+	See conditions of approval
<b>W10</b>	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	+	See conditions of approval
<b>W11</b>	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	NA	Non-historic storefront windows being removed
<b>W12</b>	Do not block-in or back-paint transoms or sidelights.	NA	
<b>W13</b>	Use surviving prototypes to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds. The reconstructed element should be constructed of materials for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if that is not possible.	+	This is proposed for the front façade reconstruction.
<b>W14</b>	Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	+/-	The historic window configuration had been previously changed. New windows and openings will be installed on all facades. However, the design is in keeping with the style of the building.
<b>W15</b>	Locate any new windows openings that may be required for a new use on a façade that cannot be seen from a public way. Newly-installed windows should be compatible with the overall design of the building.	+/-	See comment above
<b>W16</b>	Do not obscure historic window trim with metal or siding material.	NA	
<b>W17</b>	Do not install new floors or dropped ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
<b>W18</b>	Install exterior storm windows that duplicate the shape of the original window. Storm windows should be painted to match the color of the window frame.	NA	
<b>W19</b>	Do not install exterior storm windows or screens that damage or obscure historic windows or frames. Mount storm windows on the blind stop within the window frame. Storm window or screen rails should always match the rails of the windows behind. They should have either wood or narrow, metal frames that are painted to match the color of the building trim.	NA	
<b>W20</b>	Do not install window air conditioning units on a primary façade if installation on a secondary façade can address the same need. If this is not an option, do not alter the window sash to accommodate the air-conditioning unit.	NA	
<b>W21</b>	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
<b>W22</b>	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
<b>W23</b>	Install awnings made of weather-proofed canvas of a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	
<b>W24</b>	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	



<b>W25</b>	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	
<b>W26</b>	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
<b>W27</b>	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7' above the sidewalk.	NA	
<b>W28</b>	Repair shutters with in-kind materials. If damage is so extensive that they cannot be repaired, replacement shutters should match the visual appearance of the originals.	NA	
<b>W29</b>	Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. Replacement shutters should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically-appropriate material. Solid shutters are appropriate for the ground floor, and solid or louvered shutters are appropriate for upper floors.	NA	
<b>W30</b>	Mount replacement shutters so that they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. This gives shutters the appearance that they are indeed operable, even if in truth they are not. Shutters should not be applied to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window.	NA	
<b>W31</b>	Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters.	NA	
<b>W32</b>	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	+	Photographs submitted with COA application