

**Captioning Transcript of Labor and Economic Development Committee Meeting
- September 13, 2022**

"Chair Dorsey"

Just kidding, welcome to the regularly scheduled meeting for the labor and economic development committee. I'm your Chair Council Woman Dorsey I'm joined by my Vice Chair Councilman Robin Engel. I'm joined in chambers by Council Member Brent Ackerson

I'm joined virtually by Council woman Donna Purvis

By councilman and Kevin Kramer.

By a Council Woman Amy Holton Stewart

That's it for right now we will extend an excuse absence for Councilman Mulvihill and he

Is it oh, I see his shadow and we are now joined by Councilman Pat Mulvihill

All right.

I think we're going to be skipping item number 1 for right now. Can we jump to item number 2? Can you read that into the record? For me? Please, thank you.

"Olivia Bennett"

Yes, item number 2 is our dash 110 dash 22 a resolution pursuant to the capital and operating budget ordinances, approving the appropriation to fund the following non competitively negotiated sole source contract for park concerning parking meter replacement parts incorporated for 75,000 dollars right?

"Chair Dorsey"

Full motion to approve. right full motion to approve

Thank you 2nd, by Dorsey. Who do I have here to speak to this item?

Please come to the front, introduce your name and a title for the record and proceed.

"Mike Tudor"

Yeah, thank you. My name is Mike Tudor. I'm the director for park.

And so this resolution is for our Palm contract, that is our parking meters that we have on the street and we use this contract to be able to provide for the proprietary parts that go along with the system such things as.

Coin shoots dome heads meter at the top of the meter MEC as far as the housing and this is just for us to be able to get parts for it throughout the year.

"Chair Dorsey"

Thank you, Madam Clerk, would you please keep an eye on the queue for me sir? You have a couple of questions in regard to always wanting to make sure that we provide a little bit of transparency around these non, competitively negotiated source contracts.

So this is under the contract that we have, who is that firm with? And are these parts proprietary.

"Mike Tudor"

Uh, so, yeah, the parts are a proprietary and the firm is Palm.

And the only like, the only thing really, not proprietary with it is, it takes a 9 Volt battery, but we source that locally. And so we don't even get that through the contract here. But all the other parts of the coin shoots, and they make those in house themselves, and we have to get those from them.

"Chair Dorsey"

Thank you MV replacements parts, part of the budgeted contract so we know every so many years we're going to have to allot a certain amount of money, per per department or excuse me per asset apartment. Lord help me too busy today per the meter fixes. So, what is that maintenance schedule? How much are we budgeting annually?

"Mike Tudor"

And it seems as though we've been in this contract for about 25 years. So it doesn't seem that long. It's been probably since about 2000. two thousand And 8, I think is when we started with the palm meters prior to that, it was a system called Duncan, which is also proprietary, but we did put it out to bid at that time. And palm was the 1 that won that competitive bid process. And since then we've used their their parts and their mechanisms for on street meter parking the, um. 75,000 does cover so we get a price list from them that list down each part number. And what the cost of it is. And 75,000 is the estimate of what we would use to replace Parse throughout this fiscal.

"Chair Dorsey"

What is our annual budget for replacing parts? Is it? Is it a flat 75 that we do? What we need to do with this 75 or do we evaluate what's broken get that get an estimate on that and then go back.

"Mike Tudor"

So that's a good question. This is an estimate based on since we've been using for so long. We know approximately from past year's usage what we'll use within a fiscal year. fiscal year

"Chair Dorsey"

And just an overall question, our overarching question, if we were to rebuild this whole contract out, for example, to another entity outside of palm per se, what would that look like, in regard to the upfront costs? And then ongoing capital maintenance costs? Are we looking at the same thing with any other company where they're going to provide proprietary equipment? So we're going to be locked into not only the initial wind, but we're going to be locked into their particular. Products which will require the same source contracting, because they'll be the only ones to provide it. Could you elaborate that a little bit?

"Mike Tudor"

Yeah, sure. So if we put out some competitive bid, most of parking equipment today is still proprietary in many of the services and parts that they provide to us.

We would have to replace approximately 4,800 meters or there's 4,800 meter spaces that are monitored right now on metric streets. now on metric streets

And so to put the hardware out there for each of those, each meter right now cost us about 500 dollars.

To be able to purchase, so you just multiply that out times. 5,000. so I'm just doing rough math here. Is that 250,000? Or is that more than that?

I'm doing rough math in my head on it, but it would be a considerable capital outlay to be able to put in all new meters. And then we would still have to go back to that. Whoever won that bid to be able to provide those parts and service for that equipment. and service for that equipment

"Chair Dorsey"

Um, I will tell you in the new year, I'm going to be upfront on this 1 taking good notes. I would like to see us have at least a strategy around what it would look like to bid. Not saying that we have to.

But understanding, who are the competitors in the market, what are their products look like, and just kind of do an evaluation to make sure that we are with the right agency as the council is allocating these funds?

I I think we all understand that we need ongoing maintenance with anything.

That we do, but at the same time, we want to make sure we're getting the best bang for our buck. So we're just being taxpayer and watchdogs over here. That being said, I see. 1 person in the queue Councilman Engel.

"Vice Chair Engel"

Thank you. Madam chair.

You really, really did a good job of teeing this thing up, but I'm kind of interested because I'm very familiar with proprietary products, not parking meters, but proprietary type products and there's 2 ways to look at look at that.

Okay, when Palm is both, it sounds like so they actually won the bid. And they also provide provide proprietary parts. That's that's a good thing.

I think, but proprietary to me in my world is.

You get free equipment, because you're using my proprietary equipment, right? Or you have non proprietary equipment where you can use anybody's parts or various parts correct?

So, I'm just wondering, have we looked at both both sides on this thing. And I think maybe that's where the chair's going for next year. I don't know. Are we going to rebid this thing?

"Mike Tudor"

Yeah, we're we're not currently looking at rebooting this because again, it'd be quite a capital outlay.

It's something that we can look at, as far as the, you know, there's other vendors out there that obviously provide meter parking on street,

and we can definitely look and see what those products are and how they would play out into what it would take to put 5,000 spaces, monitored on street I will say that we have with technology. There are advancements and we're already using those. You may have heard about some of the parking apps that we're using and, of course. course Takes away that capital outlay because now it's the cell phone. And everyone has that we don't have to pay for everyone's cell phone. Right? So we are moving in directions to help limit this in the future. But, it's, it's a process, because that doesn't cover everyone in an equitable manner because everyone may not have the data or the ability to set up an account on a cell phone. So, we still want to have some meters out there to be able to support them as well.

"Vice Chair Engel"

And then a good question. A lot of times comes down to have we looked at other cities. What are what are the, what? Cincinnati. Indianapolis Lexington, what are they doing with their meters? Is it Palm or are there other several vendors in this space?

"Mike Tudor"

There are other vendors in the space. So we have Palm is 1 of them is another duncan's another. So there are several different ones. We're pretty familiar with them. I sit as president on the board for the regional parking association and so we talk to those vendors all the time. We have them at our conferences. And so I'm very familiar. With the other products that are out there, and they all seem to run very similar in their components and how they set up, you buy the product and then it's proprietary as far as the parts that go to their product.

"Vice Chair Engel"

I just conclude Madam chair similar to maybe where you were headed. I don't know, but it never hurts to look at. What, if what if we replaced this this many meters with another. System and what impact would that be? It's our job to look at these things, I think, and even more most recently, we need to look at these sole source contracts. Thank you.

"Mike Tudor"

Yeah, totally agree. 1 thing to know. Just. So the committee is aware, the funds for this are not general funds. These are part funds that pay for all this. So it comes from our revenues. And and there's nothing appropriated from the general budget.

"Chair Dorsey"

Thank you, we like, when you're using your own money, we also like, when we get some of that put back in our coffers, that being said, I think we're good to go on this just to recap. Um. We definitely want to see this evaluate it not. Necessarily, let's see, you know, everything from I, I just came from DC, so there aren't really parking meters. They have this little thing that's just in the middle of the block, and you put in your license plate number.

So, do we actually have to replace all the parking meters or do we go to a new system? So, I think having an evaluation of this, when we've been into this contract for about 20 years, just to say, you know, this is why we're going to continue to go along with this company or we're going to look at.

Pivoting in the next, you know.

Year or so, and I know that's not always the best thing to say in committee open product,

but at least a level of being able to say we've evaluate it and we want to go back to bid and maybe you keep some of those things proprietary because we do want to make money off of this as a city, but at the same time, we just want to make sure that we're getting the biggest bang for our book.

Everybody likes a clearance sale. I do. So essentially, you know, we want to see who has a sale going on. And is it a better fit for us? And what that long term investment will be.

And then to Councilman Engel's point, if we are looking at a proprietary entity, that was the 1 thing that was kind of going off in my head is if we, if we have a contract with an entity, shouldn't, you know, those products be either provided somewhat some grace because the contract covers that, or is this an iteration of the contract or whatever?

But typically, if we're going to award a contract, we know that there's people put in place barriers to leave, which is what this seems like when the contract and then.

They have these barriers to leave the contract by saying you're going to use our proprietary sole source equipment, which kind of locks you into it. I'd like us to be a little bit more strategic and figure out if there are ways to do this.

I see emergency in here, Kelly I know there's sometimes where you just have the best in the business if Palm is the best in the business, and they're good at what they do. Cool beans. But if not, let's evaluate that. That's all. We're saying councilman Kramer and I think this all happened a queue Council. Thank you. Bye.
Councilman Ackerson question.

"Committee Member Kramer"

Anyone who's going to bid

And you alluded to 20 years is that how long this contract has actually been in place? Was that just an example? And if not.

How long has this contract been in place and when this contract was 1st agreed to, was it done as a sole source? Or was this actually put out for bid?

"Mike Tudor"

Yeah, so it was originally put out for bid and palm was the 1 that won the contract. This is when parts took over meter operations on street operations in 2005.

And we went through and replaced the old technology at that time.

"Committee Member Kramer"

Okay, and are you looking at I heard again, our council endorsed,

you mentioned that a year from now or 2 years from now you're going to be looking at reconsidering is that a suggestion of the councils or are you already anticipating reevaluation after 20 years.

"Mike Tudor"

We are always looking at the technology as we move forward into the future, and as councilman Dorsey mentioned, you know, about her trip to D. C. with the pay stations in the middle, the street. We do have some of those currently in the middle of the streets.

They're not through Palm, it's through a, another competitively bid contract that we have with the car park that runs our operations force for on street parking.

And so we have about, I think 20 of those on the street right now, and looking to expand that into the future.

So, we're constantly looking at the technology that is provided for on street parking, knowing that the curve space is continually changing, especially as we've gone through covid here.

"Committee Member Kramer"

But as far as Palm is concerned, there's not an end to this current current contract.

"Mike Tudor"

When when we take the last Palm meter off the street, it would be the end of it. Yes.

"Committee Member Kramer"

Okay, thank you.

"Mike Tudor"

You're welcome.

"Chair Dorsey"

Thank you. Councilman Ackerson

"Committee Member Ackerson"

Thinking about I'm sharing. Did I hear you say that 1100 meters? And it would cost approximately 500 dollars per meter to convert.

"Mike Tudor"

1800 spaces, some of the meters are they take care of 2 spaces so it wouldn't be quite that number of meters. And my math may have been really bad when I was.

"Committee Member Ackerson"

If we say 1800 spaces, let's say there's 1 meter that split between 2 spaces that's going to be 2400. we're looking at 1.2Million dollars and cost to replace those meters.

1.2Million that would be in addition to wherever the new contract is, we're bidding out and so.

You know, I get the idea behind the need for competitive bidding, but at the same time, from a business perspective, the 1.2Million+whatever other costs of converting software things gives me costs for pause.

And so I'm saying it's good to look around, but at the same time, it's also good to be cautious. also good to be cautious
Parking meters don't have to be at the top of the line if we're not looking for the iPhone, 12 and iPhone 6, as far as the parking meter will work. Just fine. And the reality is the bulk of the money we make all these things off the ticketing.
Versus the actual meters, correct?

"Mike Tudor"

We do make a considerable amount off of the citation revenue that comes in. Yeah, revenue does go back to the general funds.

"Committee Member Ackerson"

Yep. And so we appreciate you for that. Thank you Madam chair.

"Chair Dorsey"

Thank you.

And 1 last thing just for clarification. You did mention that there is we are using those, which are called park stations. What was the name of it stations?

Pay, stations so we can use them or we are currently using them in some instances.

And they are alleviating replacing what are they doing in regard to the meters?

"Mike Tudor"

Yeah, so when we put those in, we do eliminate the meters in those areas. And, um, so that does reduce the capital outlay for that area and just puts it into. Typically, you have to have a couple of pay stations for a block to be able to handle the parking on a block. Uh, pay station will handle 10 to 20 spaces.

Depend on how they're laid out with a block.

"Chair Dorsey"

So, essentially, we could not that we would, we could eliminate all the meters by phasing in these pay stations essentially with another vendor correct?

"Mike Tudor"

We could sometimes you find operationally that if you have a space or 2, that are on a block, that there's a curved card, maybe fire hardest things it's separated. It's better for citizens to be able to see meter to pay at.

Because they may not find the pay station necessarily, but we could eliminate a number of.

The civil space meters,

"Chair Dorsey"

thank you and I don't mean to get into the weeds of your business, but essentially what I'm what I'm really getting at is, even though we have this entity,

we have the ability to incorporate competitors essentially is what we're doing is already incorporating competitors who have a product that is different, but still serves the same function and we're able to use that.

So that's kind of where I'm getting at is we have the ability not necessarily to just. Be stuck with park with every, or, excuse me stuck with palm with the meters. We are diversifying the way that we are collecting. And there is a competitor already in place that allows us to do that. Correct?

"Mike Tudor"

Yeah, and to go back, just real quick to our apps that we have in place. We just recently in June announce that we have multiple apps that you can pay by. And we have found that our revenue at our meters 40. I think last month.

It was 4340% or 43% of our revenue was coming through the apps themselves.

The rest of the revenue came in through the meters, so we've already done a big change a big shift in how people pay for parking on street.

Thank you so much to the public. I think we just heard a business opportunity for somebody if you want to create additional competitive software and we do want to see this evaluate it next year. So thank you for that. I don't see anyone else in the queue. Madam Clerk do you see anyone in the queue?

"Olivia Bennett"

No ma'am

"Chair Dorsey"

All right, this is a resolution allowing for a voice vote all those in favor signify by saying, hi.

As opposed and unplugged the resolution passes please move to consider Madam please read item number 3 into the record for me. Please.

"Olivia Bennett"

Item number 3 is R dash 112 dash 22 a resolution pursuant to the capital and operating budget ordinances, approving the appropriation to fund the following non competitively negotiated sole source contract from parking authority of river river city park, concerning maintenance service and replacement parts for a price. for a price

Proprietary products purchase from hub, parking technology, USA, ink for 220,775 dollars, read of full.

"Chair Dorsey"

Motion to approve 2nd, Dorsey motion by Engel 2nd by Dorsey just reintroduce yourself and yourname and title for the record. Please proceed. The 1st thing I will ask is just to differentiate between what we just passed and what we are currently on right now.

"Mike Tudor"

Yeah, so again, Mike tutor director for parking authority diversity and so this resolution is for our parking garages. So, this is our off street parking.

We were previously talking about our on street parking, only, and we have 15 parking garages with if you park in the garage. You noticed that there's lane equipment that will collect from the patrons as they enter, or exit the garages.

And so, this lane equipment, it was competitively bid back in. I believe it's in 98, and we put in the equipment and throughout the years, we have upgraded it as they had newer technology to be able to be put in place. And we've also built new facilities during that time frame, since it was originally been out these, the value of this is in the millions of dollars as far as if we were to have to go out and replace this equipment the contract for this is a dedicated service person to be able to. to Service the equipment on a regular basis. And also provide the proprietary parts for the equipment, provide for the warranty of the equipment, and provide for the software side of it, which operates the equipment and compliance. So, we originally, last year, when we came before counsel for this, we were asking a little over 300,000 dollars for this resolution. We've reduced it to the 220,000 dollars because of covid. We don't have as much service need for the equipment and we've reduced the staffing. equipment and we've reduced the staffing That they were providing to us and so we've been able to bring it down by about 100,000 dollars this year.

"Chair Dorsey"

I'm really quick. Can you tell us what the breakdown is in regard to? I was about to say, but the staffing personnel versus parts in labor and how that's done in regard to is there some type of contingency? What's the word. Well, we're putting, we're basically we're playing a paying a flat fee for service, but we pay more. If we utilize the service. I can't think of the word right now.

"Mike Tudor"

So we, I think I can answer your question. We have set service hours for the gentleman who is on staff with us. It's about 100,000 dollars a year for his salary. His truck. his truck The labor, and then a lot of the parts end up being covered under warranty, because of the service contract that we have with them, there are parts if they're damaged outside of the normal wear and tear that, like, if someone were to run into the equipment, which happens from time to time, but then those things have to be covered outside of the normal warranty period and we have a price listing for all those parts.

"Chair Dorsey"

So, how much are we paying the, the personnel. On average, or what's been the trend?

"Mike Tudor"

We don't know what his exact cost is it's built into the contract because his cost, um, we know for the truck when we deleted the 2nd person who's 100,000 dollars that's his truck gas insurance salary. Everything that's involved. The actual person that does the work. I don't know what his exact salary is.

"Chair Dorsey"

Okay. So, I guess what I'm saying is, if they are on salary, are they working all the time? Or is that just built into the contract?

"Mike Tudor"

He's he has to provide us with. us with
And he does 40 hours, at least 40 hours worth of work each week.

"Chair Dorsey"

Yeah.
All right, uh, are there any other questions.
I think we got a lot of them answered on the 1st trial, which is always good.

"Mike Tudor"

Yeah, again this isn't general funds that helps out any this is park funds.
Um, and we are always looking again at New new technology just like you asked about on street, we're looking at newer technology to see how we can either reduce our cost, or make it better to the citizens who will be utilized in our facilities.
All right sounds good. This is a resolution allowing for a voice vote. Let me double check that no, 1 else is in the queue.
That's correct. Madame. Alright, this is a resolution along for both voicemail all those in favor. Signify by saying, aye aye aye. Aye aye. All those opposed, I'm quite please move this item to consent. Please read. I don't remember for into the record for me. Please. Thank you

"Olivia Bennett"

Item number 4 is 123 dash 22 a resolution approving the budget and economic improvement plans for the local downtown management district. For the period January. 1st 2023 through December 31st 2023. right?

"Chair Dorsey"

And full motion to approve.
2nd, Dorsey, who do I have to speak to this? Rectify shaker? Thank you because you just introduce you introduce yourself via name and your title on the record. Thank you.

"Rebecca Fleischaker"

That better, thank you, Rebecca Fleischaker. I'm executive director of local downtown partnership. I'm actually going to be turning it over to Lee.Weyland to do a quick introduction.

"Lee Weyland"

Thank you, Rebecca, thank you. Madam chair. My name is Lee. I'm a partner at core, real estate partners and I'm the board treasurer.
For the local downtown management district, thank you for having us here. Today.
The downtown partnership is the organization that oversees the clean and safe initiatives for downtown and we also focus on economic, residential and cultural vitality for downtown.

I'm a private property owner downtown, and the board is consistent of a combination of business owners, property owners and other organizations that are associated with downtown and we are in full support of Rebecca. High Shaker, and we were thrilled to have her at the organization and I will turn it over to Rebecca.

"Rebecca Fleischaker"

Great Thank you. Thank you very much.

All right, so just to kind of lay the table here, we come before you every year to give you, our, our next year's budget is statutory enabled ordinance that you guys created back in 991, the green shaded area in this map,

you will see is the business improvement district, that's what we call the downtown management district. It is a legally defined area that property owners such as Lee said. Yes, we want to be in this. We pay an assessment to receive extra additional.

to receive extra additional

Versus above, and beyond what public works would do for clean, safe and beautification, the red line is downtown.

The green shaded area is the business improvement district always trying to remind people that it's not the same.

Same definition of area so it goes straight to the budget wanted to let, you know, revenues are a little bit higher. This year. Our assessments are going up contracts for services are basically a fee in lieu.

So thank you to metro Council for increasing. What you pay for for Metro. Properties that don't have they're not accessible. So we have a little bit more in revenue this year. 1.55 is an assessments that is also due to an increase in our assessment.

That is a board approved vote that we we took so that we could have more money to do more in downtown. And I'll get into a little bit of that in a minute.

And then our expenditures, you'll see the bulk of which are really for how we keep the business improvement district clean and. district clean and

Safe and beautiful economic development is really our research and data.

We produce maps twice a year. It's our visitor tours map. We take that to the airport to all the hotels, marketing communications.

A lot of that is for free on social media, but we are doing more and more this year to tell what we do in downtown to remind people that we exist and that we do provide the service to help downtown businesses, residents and tourists and conventions.

And that administrative is really just our office ity back of the house kind of stuff that we.

That we need, I did want to point out really just to show in our expenses. Most of our money is used for clean, safe and beautiful.

It is important to you as a visitor to you is the resident, and especially for business people who come here every day that their downtown looks taken care of and loved. And that is where we want to spend our money.

Part of what we are doing with increased revenues is that we want to part of my goal actually, when coming on board was to increase the number of ambassadors that you see those are our gentlemen and women in orange shirts.

They are by through a contract with block by block, but they wear our logo. They are who provides these services in the downtown management district. We are adding 1 to our count.

So we have 14, total, 13.

On the street 6 at any 1 time, we really need to get up to 20 for downtown on our side. That's a long term goal.

So we're adding 1 for next year and really the reason for the increase in assessment was because we have the same number.

Of ambassadors today than we had when this started in 19 in the 990 s, but pay has gone up, we have inflationary pressures, and they are doing more on the street than they have ever done before collecting 5 times more letter.

Then we collected in 998 and there was more things to pick up as you can imagine with more traffic on the street. It's a good thing. But we need to increase the number of ambassadors along with.

Along with the services we provide so you can see here what they do. Hopefully, you've seen them before. Then we've got a couple of other verticals of work.

We do place making is really important in terms of making a space feel good and comfortable in a place that you want to be. So, we've done some work this year. We're going to do even more next year. Some more banners, more flower pots.

We just announced an expansion of the alley gallery program with a new public art program called.

Street gallery.

Where we will be wrapping an electrical signal boxes at intersections some way finding needs to be updated. It's been on the streets for at least 15 years and we're updating that.

And I'm working on a couple of lighting projects and on a daily basis, working with public works to make sure our streets and sidewalks and lights are taking care of.

Economic development is also another very strong vertical for us. We are just kicked off updating our downtown strategy. This is a 10 year plan. The last 1 we have is from 2013, so we're kicking off an update to that. We are going to have some immediate and midterm implementation projects to come out of that simply because we're in a time we've never been in before postcards and social protests. So it really is important that we're hitting the ground running on that. running on that

We're also going to be hiring a small business program manager. We really want to put some effort into recruiting small business, small businesses with a focus on minority, owned small businesses.

We've got some vacancies in the street level and then also how we advocate for new tools. That would attract new investment and new businesses.

Marketing communications is always important how you tell your story and how often you tell it and how well, you tell it. We did hire marketing communications specialist this year. And so we're always trying to get the word out and meet people where they are.

So that we can tell them what we're doing, and that they can join us. Part of that is also picking off a grassroots campaign for fundraising, but also kicking off new places. And so all of these things really come together under.

How we tell our story at different places that look good that people want to come to.

This is a list of our board members. I'm also, um. Officially, technically a board member I'm not on here. I think it's weird that by ordinance I am a board member, but I also am executive director of the organization and that is it. Chairwoman, you asked me to give a quick presentation so I did happy to take any questions.

"Chair Dorsey"

Thank you, I do have a couple and then I see some, some folks in the queue with revenue's going up. Rebecca would you be able to outline your major categories of revenue?
Our modalities

"Rebecca Fleischaker"

those are the sure those are the 3 buckets. You see, their assessments is what comes off of.

164

Property owners that are in the bid this is automatically applied. The sheriff's office collects it.

That's the bulk of our revenue contracts for services is metro government pays a contract is basically a fee in Lou, and that is to a little over 200,000 dollars.

The state pays some so that we take extra special care around the convention center. convention center

Oh, and then special projects and basically, that is balanced off by expenditures because we bring in money for flowerpots or special verification projects that we then put toward just those.

And then other income sources, I think there's interest on a couple of our accounts and just.

A little bit of cushion a couple, 100 dollars a discussion.

"Chair Dorsey"

Okay, thank you for that. Secondly, when we talk about the work that you all are doing over and beyond public work. So I saw some of that with snow removal letter abatement.

Are we in conjunction with public works or are you all taking on that task? Slowly and independently more so, I think, well, later it may be independent, but things like snow removal.

Can you explain some of those major indicators where you all are completely independent of public works.

Or, where you kind of can join with them to synergize.

"Rebecca Fleischaker"

Everything we do is independent of public works. We do not ever want the public or property owner to think that what they're.

Property taxes going toward as being kind of double dipped with an assessment. So it really does need to be above and beyond. We do work with public works quite a bit and we are constantly telling them things that we see if there's a sidewalk hazard.

If there's a light that's not working or light pole that's missing. But that is not anything that we're going to go find money for.

And replace ourselves that it's squarely what your property taxes pay for, in downtown everything that's listed here under supplemental cleaning is what we do that public works is not.

They do not sweep up litter on the sidewalks. They do not clean up bio hazards, which is feces, which is needles. Those are things that we will go and do we'd abatement leaf abatement where we will blow leaves in the fall. Snow removal is on the ramps of the sidewalks and then we have an agreement with park where we actually clean out the shelters. But again, it's not anything that public works would otherwise be doing. And in special projects again, independent of anything public works is doing.

"Chair Dorsey"

Thank you for delineation you may get hired in my district. How do I get you guys there?

Could you articulate for those who are listening and maybe didn't see or cannot see the detail on the map with the North South East West boundaries are of the business district that you serve?

"Rebecca Fleischaker"

Yeah. So we go.

We call it the power. T, because if you look at it, it's roughly kind of like a big T, but it's from 12th street to Floyd street between the river. river

Liberty on liberty, we, we do follow underneath the overpass and actually.

Things have changed a little bit in the last 2 years we've been working with public works, and the clean collaborative on that.

And then we shrink back down to 2nd, to 7th street, South liberty to Broadway.

And and really, that is a factor of government owned buildings or nonprofit own buildings that don't pay that aren't accessible that it didn't make.

You've got to make it make sense financial sense to.

To include them into your bed,

"Chair Dorsey"

thank you public safety question here in regard to lights and then I'm a bounced to sidewalks and paving. Are you all are liaising directly with? I know when it comes to downtown safety is a big issue and lights are 1 of those big things around passive safety that we do.

That being said, I think we, as the city all have issues with how the heck do we manage all these out power overhead lights but how do you all manage it? Are you all reporting directly? Are you putting it into 301? Are you liaising directly with with the management around that? management around that

"Rebecca Fleischaker"

We report everything that we see, and I actually did a couple hour drive a night drive with President James, which really was only about whites, because that's what you can see at night.

We do, we're in the midst of trying to work with public works the best way to report to them, because we want to track what we see, and what we are wanting to keep track of. We're not in the 301 system as a metro agency, but we can put things in there. things in there

So we're keeping track and we're trying to figure out. Is there an interface that would be best for public works and for us? However, having said that we do report everything straight to public works. So, it's by email it's about 301 is what we can do is generate a report out of our smart system by address. We send pictures, it is really multiple times a week. We're sending things. we're sending things

"Chair Dorsey"

We may task you with that special project to take on, for all of us. How do we manage all these outlets and then in regard to streets, streets and sidewalks paving and repair. So how do you all go about defining the prioritization of that? I know.

Oftentimes here as council members were always fighting for sidewalk repair. So good luck with that. But how do you all go about doing that in regard to paving when it is?

The central business district oftentimes may seem.

For volume, and actually heavier types of traffic. So how do you all go about with that? Are you working with the council member? Are you working directly with public works in that regard as well?

"Rebecca Fleischaker"

We are working with both council member and I've spoken with councilman Arthur and James, I think, with redistricting, redistricting I don't think downtown still in his district, but also straight with public works.

So the prioritizing of paving is not what we do. What we do is again report where we think roads are in bad shape. Please. Can you make sure this is on your list? They have the unenviable task of saying this is a state road.

This is a local road.

And rating it with other ones now, I will tell you.

I am partial to downtown, so I will make the case that it is an important neighborhood. It has all eyes on it at all times. It is though 1 neighborhood in the level that it's for everybody but I never want to.

Say do it in place if somebody else's road but so I'm always just highlighting blocks or streets that need to be that needs some attention. And that's the same for sidewalks.

Falling lands light poles, lights that are out as well.

"Chair Dorsey"

Thank you that I do have 1 more question, but I think we're good. I see councilman Ackerson in the queue councilman actress in the flowchart.

"Committee Member Ackerson"

Thank you Madam Chair, I'm sure if we go back to the proposed budget. Chart so I'm looking at the expenditures.

Because of the revenues and expenditures balance out.

Administrative, can you explain to me what an administrative is?

"Rebecca Fleischaker"

It's our overhead. It's not salary. It's our lease. It's it, it's everything for our office to.

"Committee Member Ackerson"

Gotcha, that's what I was concerned about, because the numbers weren't clicking for me there. So what category is is.
Labor,

"Rebecca Fleischaker"

We are all technically staff under downtown development corporations. So, local downtown partnership is an umbrella organization. There is a management agreement between the 2 organizations. We are technically paid by.

"Committee Member Ackerson"

Gotcha. Okay. Thank you. Madam chair.

"Chair Dorsey"

Vice Chair Engel

"Vice Chair Engel"

Thank you. Madam chair.

And sat on not a lot of the, uh, the panels and where we were going to invest money and.

Ambassadors came up quite often it seemed. And so there was lots of discussion as far as their roles.

And do they serve any type of sort of a safety net for us downtown with the violence at times? But I guess my question is ambassadors. Did we not.

Were were ambassadors not approved in the last budget, a number of ambassadors with the moneys. And how does that dovetail with what you your proposed budget?

Would we do you how many you mentioned? You were going to add a few could you, could you talk about investors?

"Rebecca Fleischaker"

So, what you approved with money, or for the community ambassador program, which is not our.

Downtown ambassador program, however, we do have 3 of those people as part of our staff for now. So it is separate pot of money. It is not in this budget. It is.

Basically, it's going to be a temporary until as long as city government funds that.

The community ambassador program, it's the same program that has the bardstown road ambassadors. Councilman purpose has some ambassadors in her district as well.

So, it's separate.

"Vice Chair Engel"

I know a lot of the discussion though was downtown.

"Rebecca Fleischaker"

Yeah. And so is there more if you were offering? Oh, you know, we're there to your safety question.

I believe that more feet on the street always increases and improve safety. So you want the more people you have around you the safer you're going to feel.

So part of my desire for more ambassadors in general will help improve perception of safety.

Because you feel like you're.

You're with people that are looking out for you, they're not armed, so there's not any, they don't have any legal police powers, but the presence of them, they will discourage any unwanted street behavior. They also can't help in any kind of uncomfortable situation.

"Chair Dorsey"

Thank you so, director 3 of the community ambassadors are a sound are assigned to the downtown business district.

"Rebecca Fleischaker"

That is correct. Okay.

"Chair Dorsey"

And what what's the plan regarding sustainability in regard to the dollars once they are exhausted or run out how what's the sustainability plan around absorbing them?

Or what what's the long term plan around that dollars

"Rebecca Fleischaker"

The ARP dollars that you all approved? And I'm not gonna remember when this was the fall of 21 has already run out because I think that was to get through this. this

This past summer, but you approved in your.

23 budget another round of general 5 dollars to fund those ambassadors.

So, that is going to be something that we hope you continue to fund and we think it's a great idea. And we do benefit in downtown from your, from your funding. Those.

"Chair Dorsey"

So, that's what I wanted to highlight Thank you to make sure that we understood how they were being funded. So they are being funded out of the general fund all of them. But we have 3 assigned assigned to the downtown partnership.

I do see 1 more person in the queue before we go to calling the question councilmen Mulvihill.

councilman, we can't hear you councilman Mulvihill.

Oh, wait, no.

"Committee Member Mulvihill"

Can you hear me we can hear you now. Okay. Let's be the headphones. Sorry just real quickly. I may I had to step out so you may have answered this.

Can you talk about the vacancy rate of kind of the different types of office space we have in downtown especially the class a space.

What's that looking like and, uh, uh, how do we intend on maybe trying to attract people to take it.

"Rebecca Fleischaker"

Sure, I don't have a breakdown of different class of office space. I'd be happy to send you a report for that.

We're in the low twenty's vacancy, and part of what we're doing is to help create an environment in which businesses would want to locate so little before those are the, those are the entities that are going after businesses.

I do help. We do help with some of those pitches and walking tours. I'm. I'm involved in several of those, but what we're trying to do is create an environment, which is where they want to locate.

"Committee Member Mulvihill"

When you say, 20%, is that on the high end low end where we, where does that compare to 5 years ago or and, uh, I guess Pre covenant postcode.

"Rebecca Fleischaker"

Yeah, our office market was a little soft going into covid, so it wasn't great. Pre covered covered. Made it worse? Obviously I'd have to look back.

I think we were high teens, Pre covered and I think that we're a little bit higher, but we are seeing some movement, even with offices shrinking that are staying in downtown. We're seeing some new business is located downtown.

Hopefully you saw exceptions announcement yesterday.

"Committee Member Mulvihill"

I don't know that I did, but I'm glad to hear that they are coming and where are they coming to new employees coming down town? And where are they going?

"Rebecca Fleischaker"

They're going to be in the tower at 5th in Maine.

"Committee Member Mulvihill"

Oh, good. Okay. Well, thank you. Appreciate it.

"Chair Dorsey"

Council Member Purvis

"Committee Member Purvis"

thank you, Madam chair. I've been trying to get somebody's attention for at least 20 minutes. I was not in the queue. Uh, but I wanted to ask MS Fleischaker if.

If it's possible, we could have a list of their board members.

"Rebecca Fleischaker"

Yeah, it should be in the back of the book with it as part of this agenda and also we have hard copies here.

Our board members

"Committee Member Purvis"

is that something you can email to us? Please

"Rebecca Fleischaker"

of course. Yeah. Okay.

"Committee Member Purvis"

And 1 last question you mentioned that you have an agreement with tork to clean the bus stops is that a paid contract that you guys have with them?

"Rebecca Fleischaker"

It is not. Okay. All right. Thank you. Thank you.

"Committee Member Purvis"

Yeah, thank you.

"Olivia Bennett"

This is what I sent.

"Chair Dorsey"

I'm sorry go ahead.

"Olivia Bennett"

Committee Member Purvis. This is Olivia. The clerk.

It is attached on the 3rd item down as lieu dot downtown management district economic.

I'm sorry improvement plan.

"Committee Member Purvis"

Okay. I'll get it out of the Thank you.

"Chair Dorsey"

Sorry all right this is a resolution that you everyone for. Good questions. I like this. This is a resolution allowing for a voice vote all those in favor signify by saying, aye.

Uh, I was opposed.

I don't like the resolution passes, please move this item to consent. We are now ready for special discussion. I want to thank chief golden for bringing this forward.

This is in regard to potential and pending legislation, but we wanted to make sure out of transparency and our great discussion and partnership that we have an opportunity to discuss prior to the legislation being brought to this committee. If there's a potential for sales source contracting, which.

There is so again thanks to chief, golden and for all of those that are here to speak to this to enlighten us, we are ready for item number 1, Madam clerk. Would you please read it into the record? And then we can proceed.

"Olivia Bennett"

Item number 1 is ID 22 Dash, 162 corrected topic title discussion regarding contract for Metro, safe concerning project analysis and evaluation. A pilot 901 call prioritization program. University of Louisville.

"Chair Dorsey"

Thank you, Madam. No proof. 2nd, and we have the item before us. I just want to give us a heads up that I am going to set the timer for 8 minutes leaving 2 for QA. If we have any additional questions.

Please follow up via email. We will call the meeting right on time, but we will proceed. So please introduce your name and your title for the record and proceed. Thank you.

"Jody Meiman"

Okay. Thank you. I'm Jody Meiman. I'm the executive director for a Louisville metro emergency services, and we appreciate the time. This is.

I know that there are some concerns about Salesforce.

Contracts, but we want to do the right thing. There is a resolution that's out there that you'll see, and get to hear in this committee in the next couple of weeks. But we wanted, like I said to do the right thing and come and talk a little bit about the program. And what university local has done for us.

Already and what they want to do for us in the future, all the council members should have received the actual report that Dr Shafer who I'll introduce here very shortly did and on our 1st, 3 months of the deflection program. He'll talk again a little bit about that and again, a little bit about what he wants to move forward very quickly, our crisis called diversion program. It's a very good program that we developed. We started on March, 21st of 2022. we developed. and twenty two we developed

It's a call diversion call consultation or call de escalate the escalation. So we have behavioral health specialists that are sitting in the 901 center from 2 to 10. 0. P. M. every day it is still a pilot program. We started in the local metro police departments.

4th division since then we have expanded to 2 other divisions the 1st, and the 2nd, so we're moving along our next goal is to continue hiring and move towards the 24 hour period where we're capturing this round the clock.

These are the, and this is in the presentation. is in the presentation That you have, so I won't focus too much on it, but these are some of the cursers. That would not where a non on 1 call would not be sent to the call crisis diversion, triage worker that's in the 900 center. And it would still be sent to the police department.

But within the 1st, 5 months over 400 calls, we're diverted directly from 901 to the or that crisis triage worker that was in the 911 center. So, you know, that's.

I think there was out of that 364 people that were actually sent to some type of services for mental health crisis out of that number, or it was 423 just over 400% to gotten gotten some type of help. But the interesting number.

gotten gotten some type of help but the interesting number

Is that over.

There were almost 2000 calls that were kind of came into the 911 center that are what we code is deflection not available. Where, if we had been in another police division, or it was outside of that time parameters. So, this is a number that, as I mentioned in my budget hearing this is the number that points in the direction that we need to continue this, this program. And now I'm going to turn it over to Dr Brian Schaefer again, that was some basic numbers.

Just some additional, just some additions to it from what I gave him my budget hearing back in June, but Dr Shavers going to talk. going to talk

Little bit about very quickly what he's done with for us and then what he plans on doing in the future.

"Chair Dorsey"

Thank you please introduce yourself name and title for the record and proceed.

"Dr. Brian Shafer"

Hello, my name is Dr. Brian Shafer associate professor in the school of public health and information sciences at the university level. I was the principal investigator for this evaluation, and led a wonderful team during this initial pilot phase.

Our research focused on the timeframe from March 21st to May 8. so we had a very tight time frame to deliver our report on June 6, but during this timeframe, we were able to conduct over 70 interviews with 93 responders and administrators.

We had focus groups with 96 community members and then we. and then we I managed to gather 7 different data sets and do Pre, thorough analysis. Ahead and switch slides. You're good. And so during this timeframe, it is important to recall that the intervention has developed over time it has expanded. But at this point in time, we are focused primarily in the 4th division where it was fully available.

And during this evaluation, we performed a mixed methods research design where we looked at the process, the outcomes as well as the costs we really wanted to understand is the program functioning as it was designed.

How do those functions impact the outcomes.

Is like volume deflection opportunities and then what, what does it look like from a cost perspective and a cost effectiveness perspective as well?

And so, this is just a little visualization to see that during this evaluation period. We were existing in multiple spaces all at once and so to really the complexity of this intervention, the different responders it touches.

We went and met with the administrators and responders for police. The entire deflection teams that's the crisis triage workers. Mobile crisis response team respite. We met with community.

As well, as 901 call takers and 901 dispatchers to really understand how this intervention is operating, what the needs are and what the successes and challenges are as well.

And so the report's been released, I won't touch too much on this report again. This was in the early stages. So the numbers presented by Dr director are much more accurate on that front.

But during this early phase, we saw within the 4th division around 19. 17% of all behavioral health calls coming in between 2 and 10. 0. P. M. when the intervention was operating, went to the deflection team the rest of those went to. And of course, this is largely driven by the inclusion exclusion criteria that were set.

So, of those 55 calls that came into the 4th division. fourth division You had 27 that were handled by crisis triage workers only and then 28 of them had a mobile crisis response team and then there was an additional

60+calls that were from other divisions where they only had access to the crisis triage workers.

And so we also examine how the calls were resolved.

We, we were able to examine how resolve calls looking at both hospitalizations and RS going into jail as well as in the crisis triage workers and the mobile crisis response team. We note that 5 people during that time, when to respite.

And then also tracking what type of services people, individuals who interacted with the, that is the crisis called a version program. We're able to receive both in forms of crisis, immediate crisis support as well as the referrals made.

And then 1 of the big questions that came out continuously was interest in the costs associated with that.

So, we looked at resource utilization, particularly focusing because of the short intervention period, on the amount of time deflected from the police looking at the total intervention time for the police as well as the different deflection options where those crisis triage only or crisis triage along with mobile crisis response team.

And what we discovered as a whole was that the costs are largely driven by volume but the cost effectiveness is pretty attainable for how the model's designed and so moving forward as it expands.

We can see very rural avenues for a very cost effective model.

We looked at stakeholder, perceptions a few high points. There is a very real need for this intervention across the board by all the stakeholders. Safety is on everyone's mind both for the individual receiving support as well as the stakeholders and there's a lot of room and interest and expansion.

So, we presented in our report different presentations of what our stakeholders thought for expansion things like wider access to the interventions more time more geography Co, response models were mentioned.

As well, as even moving beyond behavioral health calls, and then we provided recommendations issues ranging from continuing with data analysis, improving infrastructure, securing long term funding, expanding respites space.

All being options, and then moving forward with our proposed evaluation plan. The core elements that we conducted in the report would continue, but then we're also looking to expand based on lessons, learned limitations.

So, conducting things like a 911 call review to validate our findings expanding to look at fire in.

With an expected interim report coming in January 2023 and then a final report for that cycle.

"Chair Dorsey"

I'm going to stop you really quick. I want to because we're into a lot of the programmatic nuances, but what I want to come up a level. I see. Council Woman Holton Stewart. We're right at 2 minutes. So I've gotten some questions Jodi if it's okay. I'm gonna go ahead and put those on the record.

So, 1, if we can talk about the percentage of the project in regard to cost or expenditure that the program evaluation is taking up. Overall I see the.

Attract is well, if we could talk about the percentage versus the overall cost of it,

the benefits of using an academic institution versus a traditional nonprofit org have we identified any potential competitors in the space. That can do this going back to the academic institution versus the if this is an actual academic study. And if there's a way to potentially have funding for.

This under additional grant funding that can be sought out through the school of public health, where we can have a joint joint endeavor in regard to longevity.

And then I think that was the last question. But basically, what are the benefits of having an NPO or excuse me an academic institution versus MPO and looking at the financial opportunities that are grant.

Can come under a traditional academic institution and any benefits directly to the University of global. We're 1 minute out. I see. 1 person in the queue Council Woman Holton Stewart. That will be the last question Council. My home store. It floor is yours?

"Committee Member Holton Stewart"

Thank you, Madam chair Mr. Meiman

wasn't necessarily a question, but more of just an observation that I made just wanted to let, you know,

that I met some of your behavioral health specialists at the National night out and not only was I impressed by their enthusiasm, but their, their knowledge as well.

And we had lengthy a discussion about how they operate and what they do and how many.

Lives that they have saved in our community, and I wanted to let, you know that we look forward to their expansion and to the 3rd division. So thank you for this.

"Jody Meiman"

Thank you,

"Chair Dorsey"

thank you council members, Jodi, just open praise as we close this meeting out. I did happen to sit in the 911 dispatch.

I saw those dispatchers 1 thing you didn't claim was how many people they offer this service to, versus how many people accept and that's a huge shout out to our dispatchers Council. Women. Darcy sat with.

Y'all couldn't do your job, but I love the fact that you are off in this, offering the services to so many people. I've actually seen people decline the service, but I appreciate what you're doing for this community and the leadership is. leadership is

Kelly, so thank you. This meeting is adjourned, and we will come back and we'll address it later. Thank you.