



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Individual Landmarks Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Bob Keesaer, AIA, NCARB, Planning & Design Supervisor *Pdla*
From: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: May 19, 2017

Case No: 17COA1102
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 105 and 107-109 W. Main Street

Applicant: Steve Poe
Poe Companies, LLC
1250 River Road
Louisville, KY 40206

Owner: LOUWEXY, LLC
701 E. 83rd Avenue
Merrillville, IN 46410

Attorney: Glenn Price
Frost Brown Todd, LLC
400 W. Market Street, Ste. 3200
Louisville, KY 40202
502-779-8511
gaprice@fbtlaw.com

Architect: HKS, Hospitality Group
350 N. Saint Paul Street, Ste. 100
Dallas, TX 75201

Plan prepared by: Ann E. Richard, ASLA, RLA
Land Design & Development, Inc.
503 Washburn Avenue, Ste. 101
Louisville, KY 40222
502-426-9374
richard@ldd-inc.com

Estimated Project Cost: \$90,000,000

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant requests approval to construct a new 14-story dual-branded hotel behind the historic facades at 105 and 107-109 W. Main Street and on the vacant lot at 101 W. Main Street. **NOTE: The proposed corner portion of the hotel is located at 101 W. Main Street, which is outside of the individual landmark boundary. Thus, the Individual Landmarks ARC cannot review the construction at 101 W. Main Street.**

The first story storefront located at 105 W. Main Street will have glass panels, a pedestrian door on the westernmost bay, and a revolving door in the central door opening. The aforementioned glass panels are part of an enclosure for a proposed restaurant space on the first story. The east side of the façade will be connected to the new building at 101 W. Main with an inset, enclosed, glass walkway adjacent to the façade. The upper story window openings in the façade will be left open, and the steel structural support behind the façade will remain in place. Set back 20' from the historic façade, a 13-story glass tower will be constructed behind 105 W. Main Street. The 14th story of the tower will be clad in a grey brick. The west elevation of the tower will be clad in grey brick. The Washington Street side of the 105 W. Main Street lot sits lower than the W. Main Street side. The Washington Street façade will contain the 14-story tower with the east half clad in gray brick and the west half with glass. The lower levels will have glass elevator shafts, which transition to grey brick as well as areas clad with light grey metal panels.

The first story storefront located at 107-109 W. Main Street will have glass panels and a pedestrian door on the westernmost bay. Much like 105 W. Main Street, the first floor of the façade will be enclosed with glass for a proposed restaurant space that connects to 105 W. Main Street, except around the westernmost bay, which will remain open-air with access from the aforementioned pedestrian door. Interior stairs, from the entry at the westernmost bay, lead to an open-air terrace bar area with a louvered canopy located behind the façade. An open walkway extends from the Main Street bar area to the Washington Street façade of the building where there will be a second terrace bar area. Outdoor seating is proposed for the sidewalk in front of the W. Main Street façade with a street planter wall system. The upper story window openings in the façade will be left open, and the steel structural support behind the façade will remain in place. The portion of the hotel located behind the 107-109 W. Main Street façade will be 3 to 4 stories tall and will not extend above the historic façade. The west elevation of this portion of the hotel will be clad in light grey metal panels and will likely not be seen from W. Main Street because of 111 W. Main Street. The Washington Street façade will contain a mix of grey brick and light grey metal panels. The first story of the façade will have large glass windows while the lower/basement story will have two overhead garage doors and pedestrian doors to the west.

The applicant does not anticipate modifications to the existing historic masonry or steel bracing to prepare them for being permanently exposed. The existing steel is galvanized with bolted connections for long-term use. The existing masonry is in good condition and was tuckpointed during previous restoration. Simpson Gumpertz Heger (SGH) will evaluate the condition of the historic masonry, the

flashings and waterproofing, as well as the steel installed during the previous façade stabilization to ensure its preservation. This firm designed the waterproofing and structure for the façade stabilization in 2011.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on May 1, 2017 and considered complete and requiring committee level review on May 8, 2017. On April 27, 2017, staff met with the applicant's representatives and architects from HKS to discuss the design prior to application submittal.

The case is scheduled to be heard by the Individual Landmarks Architectural Review Committee on May 24, 2017 at 5:30 pm, at 444 South Fifth Street, Conference Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for Individual Landmarks, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **New Construction-Commercial and Institutional**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The facades at 105 and 107-109 W. Main Street are located west of the northwest corner of First and Main Streets. The facades are bound on the east by a vacant lot (101 W. Main Street), beyond which is First Street and the Belknap Hardware (Humana) building. They are bound on the north by an office building (111 Washington Street) and the Presbyterian Center. The facades are bound on the west by the remaining Whiskey Row Individual Landmarks (111-121 W. Main Street), which have intact historic facades. They are bound on the south by Aloft Hotel and other intact historic commercial storefronts, similar to those on Whiskey Row.

105 W. Main Street was constructed circa 1877 in the Renaissance Revival and Neo-Grec styles as a whiskey warehouse following a fire that destroyed a structure previously occupied by the liquor wholesaler, Cochran and Fulton. The new building would house a number of whiskey wholesalers and distillers, including W.H. Thomas and Sons (1882-1894), J.T.S. Brown & Sons (1895-1905), D. Sachs and Sons (1906-1920), and W.W. Dant Distillery and Kunz's Inc. (1930s-1940s). Beginning in the 1950s, it housed various office and manufacturing concerns and later a succession of bars and nightclubs. It has been vacant since the late 1980s.

The design of 105 W. Main Street is attributed to the renowned architect, Henry Whitestone, based on his involvement following a fire that destroyed the first structure on the site. Whitestone was known for designing several commercial buildings on W. Main Street, the second Galt Hotel (now demolished), Monsarrat

School (individual landmark), several prominent residences (many now demolished), Cathedral of the Assumption tower/spire (individual landmark), and Metro Hall clock tower (individual landmark). Whitestone brought D.X. Murphy into his firm and gave him control of it when he retired in 1881. Murphy later named the firm D.X. Murphy & Bro., Architects. Today, the firm operates under the name Luckett & Farley, Inc.

J.T.S. Brown & Sons built 107-109 W. Main Street in 1905 in the Chicago School Style. J.T.S. Brown & Sons was one of Louisville's oldest and most successful wholesale whiskey and distilling firms. The firm operated as J.T.S. Brown Wholesale Liquors until 1885. John Thompson Street Brown was born in Munfordville, Kentucky in 1829. In Munfordville, J.T.S. Brown was a successful businessman and postmaster and his two marriages produced sons, George Garvin Brown and J.T.S. Brown, Jr. In 1855, J.T.S. Brown, Jr. moved to Louisville and entered the wholesale whiskey business. The business grew rapidly through the Civil War and Brown amassed a considerable fortune. With his brother, he founded J.T.S. Brown & Bro., in 1870, with offices located at 322 Main Street, and developed a number of whiskey products including Old Forrester. In 1895, the firm's headquarters moved to 105 W. Main Street and subsequently next door to 107-109 W. Main Street in 1905. The firm suspended operations during Prohibition but was reorganized and resumed distilling in 1933 in Nelson County. Creel Brown, Jr. ran the firm until 1955 when it was sold to Gould Interests, which eventually sold to Canadian-based Seagram's. 107-109 W. Main Street later housed a wholesale grocery company, a coffee roasting company, and a variety of short-term tenants through the 1950s. It has been largely vacant since the 1960s.

The design of 107-109 West Main Street is attributed to D.X. Murphy one of Louisville's most accomplished architects of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Murphy was known for designing Presentation Academy, the grandstand and twin spires at Churchill Downs, the Jefferson County Jail (individual landmark), US Custom House and Post Office (now demolished), St. Joseph's Infirmary (now demolished), Louisville General Hospital, and several downtown residences and commercial structures. As previously stated, Murphy took over Henry Whitestone's firm, naming it D.X. Murphy & Bro., Architects. Today, the firm operates under the name Luckett & Farley, Inc.

The buildings at 105 and 107-109 W. Main Street were listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1998. Both buildings were designated as individual landmarks in 2010. The entire parcel on which each building was situated was landmarked. The buildings, except the front facades, were demolished in 2011, due to severe deterioration (COA 16061-IL). The facades were supported with steel and eventually restored. The conditions of approval from the COA did not require any new construction. The COA approved the construction of a parking lot off Washington Street behind the facades.

Conclusions

The proposed 14-story dual brand hotel generally meets the design guidelines for **New Construction-Commercial and Institutional**. The design is sympathetic to

the historic building facades located at 105 and 107-109 W. Main Street. It does not detract from the intricate architectural detailing of those facades and it preserves them in a unique way. While the 14-story hotel will be the tallest building on that block, it will relate well to 11-story Belknap Hardware (Humana) building, the 8-story Aloft Hotel, and 7-story parking garage, all on the opposite corners of First and Main Streets.

Preservation professionals have named the method of constructing a new building behind a historic façade as facadism. This method is not always considered to be good preservation practice and is not encouraged by the design guidelines. However, this specific case is unique. The buildings that once stood at 105 and 107-109 W. Main Street had become too deteriorated from years of vacancy and neglect by previous owners and had to be demolished. The front facades were stabilized and preserved. New construction could have incorporated the facades in a traditional manor, such as the historic façade on the Aloft Hotel across Main Street. However, this approach of preserving the facades as an almost ruin, preserves the history of the site while incorporating the recent history of the demolition and stabilization. It creates a unique space behind the facades that allows people to interact with them in ways they typically would not. This re-use meets the design guidelines as much of the new construction is stepped back from the historic facades leaving the historic streetscape mostly intact.

The plans do not show clear illustrations of the proposed signage or canopies for the buildings nor the proposed outdoor dining boundary walls on W. Main Street. Staff would need to review these as they are developed for compliance with the applicable guidelines. The outdoor dining boundary wall should not be permanently affixed to the sidewalk like a poured concrete wall. The boundary wall should be able to be removed or adjusted as needed. Street walls are generally not appropriate for historic properties and only meet the design guidelines in specific situations.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved** with the following conditions:

1. **Detailed drawings of all proposed signage and canopies for 105 and 107-109 W. Main Street shall be submitted by the applicant or their representative to staff for review.**
2. **Detailed drawings of the outdoor dining boundary walls on W. Main Street shall be submitted by the applicant or their representative to staff for review.**
3. **If the plan changes, the applicant or their representative shall contact staff.**

5/19/17

Date



Savannah Darr
Historic Preservation Specialist

NEW CONSTRUCTION

COMMERCIAL AND INSTITUTIONAL DESIGN GUIDELINES

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NC1	Make sure that new designs conform to all other applicable regulations including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations.	+	To be confirmed via the Planning Commission process, after 1 st review there are not significant issues identified. Approval will be required
NC2	Do not demolish contributing structures in a historic district to make way for new or large-scale construction. Non-contributing buildings are identified in each of the district or individual landmark designations or National Register nominations.	NA	Existing facades to remain
NC3	Design new construction so that the building height, scale, massing, volume, directional emphasis, and setback reflects the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+/-	Height of the tower similar to Belknap Hardware (Humana) building, Aloft, and parking garage to the southeast. The massing and design of the building is sympathetic to the facades and the other Whiskey Row buildings to the west.
NC4	Make sure that the scale of new construction does not conflict with the historic character of the district.	+	The scale of the building is sympathetic to the remaining historic facades and the other Whiskey Row buildings to the west.
NC5	Select materials and design elements for new construction that are sympathetic with surrounding historic buildings in the district. Materials should be of a complementary color, size, texture, scale, and level of craftsmanship.	+	The proposed glass tower is contemporary in design and complements the highly detailed historic facades.
NC6	Do not use materials in new construction that are visually incompatible with surrounding historic buildings within the district. Materials to be avoided include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, chain-link fencing, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unpainted wood, and asphalt siding.	+	
NC7	Have new construction reinforce the human scale of historic districts by emphasizing the base of the building where this is a character-defining feature.	+	The scale of W. Main Street is retained by the existing facades. The Washington Street façade will be similar to others on the street with overhead doors and large windows.

NC8	Design infill construction that enhances the pedestrian-oriented character of historic commercial districts. Commercial buildings should have a well-defined base at the pedestrian level with details conveying a sense of horizontality and progression along the sidewalk.	+	Pedestrian level will be the historic facades on W. Main Street. The Washington Street façade will be similar to others on the street with overhead doors and large windows.
NC9	Design new construction in such a way that it does not disrupt important public views and vistas.	+	
NC10	Plant canopy trees in front of any large-scale new construction to provide a visual sense of consistency along a streetscape.	+/-	No trees are currently planted along this block of W. Main Street and none are proposed.
NC11	Reinforce existing patterns of open space and enclosure, created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, in designs for new construction.	+	Reinforces urban/zero lot line density
NC12	Design infill construction that reinforces the spatial organization established by surrounding buildings. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly-designed facades.	+	
NC13	Design infill construction in such a way that the façade's organization closely relates to surrounding buildings. Window and door openings should be similar in size to their historic counterparts, as should the proportion of window to wall space. Cornice lines, columns, and storefronts are other important character-defining facade elements.	+	The historic facades are intact on W. Main Street. The Washington Street façade will be similar to others on the street with overhead doors and large windows.
NC14	Design new construction so that the building mass has a similar sense of lightness or weightiness as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solid surfaces (walls) to voids (window and door openings).	+	Retained by existing facades on W. Main Street. The Washington Street façade will be similar to others on the street with overhead doors and large windows.
NC15	Maintain historic patterns of window and door proportion and placement in designs for new construction.	+	The historic facades are intact—the new tower will be stepped back and be glass on the front. The Washington Street façade will be similar to others on the street with overhead doors and large windows.
NC16	Develop designs for new construction using windows that are sympathetic to the window patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportions, and muntin configurations is encouraged.	+/-	The historic facades and entrances are intact and new, simple storefront windows and doors will be installed. The upper window openings will be left open with no windows. The Washington Street façade will be similar to others on the street with overhead doors and large windows.
NC17	Develop designs for new construction using front doors that are sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.	+/-	The historic facades and entrances are intact and new, appropriate storefront windows and doors will be installed.
NC18	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main entrance is the same as the majority of other buildings on the street.	+	
NC19	Retain the character-defining features of a historic building when undertaking accessibility code-required work.	NA	

NC20	Investigate removable or portable ramps as options to providing barrier-free access.	NA	
NC21	Locate handicapped access ramps on secondary elevations wherever possible. If locating a ramp on the primary façade is required, it should be installed in a way that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible.	NA	
NC22	Design infill construction so that it is compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings. The rhythm of the façade should also reflect the characteristic rhythm of existing buildings on the street. Vertical elements (doors, columns, and storefronts) should be spaced approximately every 20 to 40 feet at the pedestrian level.	+/-	The historic facades are intact—the new tower will be stepped back. Its height is taller than the surrounding buildings but its width is similar. The Washington Street façade will be similar to others on the street.
NC23	Design new construction to have a floor-to-floor height that is within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the floor-to-floor height is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	+	The visual impact of the floor to floor – primarily door and windows openings, cornice lines – is maintained by keeping the existing facades on W. Main Street. The Washington Street façade will be similar to the other buildings on the street.
NC24	Incorporate set-back upper stories into designs for new construction that exceed the established cornice line.	+	The historic facades are intact—the new tower will be stepped back
NC25	Maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape. The space between new construction and existing structures should fall within 20 percent of the average spacing for the block. New construction should be built out to the property lines where this is a character-defining feature.	+	The historic facades are intact—the new tower will be stepped back. The Washington Street side will be constructed in line with the historic buildings to the west.
NC26	Historic commercial properties have long been anchors in Louisville's preservation districts. Construction of commercial properties on vacant corner lots should preferably be built to the corner with an entrance oriented to the corner.	NA	Corner property outside of jurisdiction. The corner property is being developed thereby anchoring this row of individual landmarks.
NC27	Maintain historic setback patterns. In order to maintain the continuity of the streetscape, setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.	+	The historic facades are intact—the new tower will be stepped back. The Washington Street side will be constructed in line with the historic buildings to the west.
NC28	Ensure that the roofs of new buildings relate to those of neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+	
NC29	Follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings when designing rooflines for infill construction. Where the predominate form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominate form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated.	+	
NC30	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main roof form is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.	+	

NC31	Design new construction to emphasize the existing cornice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	The existing cornice lines of the historic facades are intact. The other buildings along Washington Street do not have a strong emphasis on the cornice line.
NC32	Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered.	+	
NC33	Make provisions for screening and storage of trash receptacles when designing new construction.	+	
NC34	Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings.	+/-	Grey brick is complementary, but not found on the surrounding historic structures. The glass panels are similar to the parking garage to the southeast. Metal panels are also proposed on the Washington Street side. These materials are contemporary in design and contrast with the historic materials to clearly delineate the old from the new.
NC35	Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction.	+/-	Grey brick is complementary, but not found on the surrounding historic structures. The brick is contemporary in design and will clearly delineate the old from the new.
NC36	Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction.	+	
NC37	Design parking garages so that they relate closely to adjacent structures. Their facades should reflect the hierarchical organization and design elements seen on surrounding buildings.	NA	
NC38	Design new construction so that access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	NA	
NC39	Generally, leave at least 20 percent of a parking lot's surface area unpaved and planted. All parking lots must meet the minimum requirements of the city's Development Code. Perimeter landscaping, fencing, colonnades, or other construction that visually continues the building line along open sidewalks is encouraged.	NA	
NC40	Generally speaking, parking should be located in the rear.	NA	
NC41	Design required new parking in such a way that it is as unobtrusive as possible and minimizes the impact on the historic setting. Shared parking areas among groups of businesses is encouraged.	NA	
NC42	Do not build additional surface parking lots within the West Main Preservation District.	+	Actually removing an existing lot that was added when the buildings were demolished.
NC43	Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	NSI	
NC44	Do not create additional open space within the West Main Historic District.	+	