



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Clifton Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Bob Keesaer, AIA, NCARB, Planning & Design Supervisor
From: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: January 5, 2017

Case No: 16COA1309
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1942 Payne Street

Applicant: Jeff Rawlins
Architectural Artisans
748 E. Market Street
Louisville, KY 40202
502-582-3907
jr@architecturalartisans.net

Owner: Monica Mahoney
1942 Payne Street
Louisville, KY 40206
502-727-7747
monicamahoney@gmail.com

Architect/Design: same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant requests approval to construct a small 330 sq. ft. bedroom/bathroom addition on the rear of the existing 823 sq. ft. residence. The addition will have a shed roof covered in dark asphalt shingles, and the exterior walls will be clad in dark bronze, exposed fastener, metal panels. There will be no windows on the east elevation of the addition, which faces Angora Court, in order to meet fire safety codes. A reverse dormer with a fixed window and skylight are proposed for the roof. The west elevation of the addition will contain an aluminum storefront window and door that will face the rear yard. A new wood deck will also

be constructed connecting the rear of the existing house and the side of the new addition.

The applicant also requests approval to construct a new 541 sq. ft. garage/studio behind the proposed addition in the rear yard. The garage will be situated 28'-2" north of the rear alley, which is setback farther than the other secondary structures on the alley. However, this is proposed to preserve the mature elm tree as well as avoid the fire hydrant located on the alley. Access to the garage will be off of Angora Court rather than the rear alley. The garage will have a shed roof covered in dark asphalt shingles, and the exterior walls will be clad in dark bronze, exposed fastener, metal panels. The north elevation, which faces the rear yard, will have a garage door. The east elevation of the garage will have an open carport area, which is where parking and vehicles will be confined. There is a flush metal pedestrian door and a garage door past the carport, which will allow for a car to enter the garage when necessary. The rear elevation, which faces the alley, contains a garage door. All garage doors will be flush metal panels with window inserts and will be used primarily for light and ventilation for the homeowner to paint. The west elevation will have two fixed windows at the reverse dormer.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on December 8, 2016 and considered complete and requiring committee level review on December 12, 2016. Staff contacted the applicant on December 13, 2016 for further information on the proposed materials, windows, and doors. Staff also contacted Tammy Markert with Transportation Planning to ensure that the applicant did not need a permit for the garage entry off Angora Court rather than the rear alley.

The case is scheduled to be heard by the Clifton Architectural Review Committee on January 11, 2017 at 4:30 pm, at 444 S. Fifth Street, Conference Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Clifton Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Addition, Garage, New Construction-Residential, and Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The R5A zoned property in the Traditional Neighborhood Form District is located at the southwest corner of Payne Street and Angora Court. The one-story frame and masonry home is surrounded by other one-story frame homes. Landmarks staff approved the last COA (12072) for the property in 2008. The COA approved a new standing seam metal roof to replace the previous metal roofing.

Conclusions

The proposed rear addition generally meets the **Addition** guidelines. The design does not meet Guideline A8, but that is a result of the more modern architectural style as well as the lack of windows on the east elevation to meet fire safety code. While the addition is modern in style, it does not detract from the historic nature of the main house or the neighborhood.

The proposed new garage generally meets the **Garage, New Construction-Residential, and Site** guidelines. The design does not meet Guidelines G11 and NCR28 because of the dark bronze, exposed fastener, metal panels proposed for the exterior cladding of the garage. Similar to the proposed rear addition, the design of the garage is very modern in style, so it does not match the other secondary structures on the rear alley. However, its form, massing, and volume are similar to some of those structures. The modern design will not detract from the historic nature of the main house or the neighborhood.

The applicant is aware that they will need a variance from the Land Development Code for the addition to encroach into the required side yard setback along Angora Court. Additionally, they will need a waiver to reduce private rear yard to 22% from the required 30%.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved** with the following conditions:

1. All new concrete shall be a historic concrete mix.
2. The new wood deck elements shall be opaque stained or painted.
3. The applicant shall apply for the necessary waivers and variances from the Land Development Code.
4. If the design changes, the applicant shall contact staff.

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.

1/5/17

Date


Savannah Darr
Historic Preservation Specialist

Attached Documents / Information

1. Staff Guideline Checklist
2. Applicant Submitted Information Packet

Addition

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
A1	The design of any new addition or expansion should be compatible and in proportion with the mass and scale of the historic building, adjacent structures, and the district.	+	
A2	New additions should be designed in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new. Do not design additions to appear older than the original building.	+	Modern shape and design
A3	Additions should be designed so there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration. This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion. Do not duplicate the exact form, material, style, and detailing of the historic building in the new addition.	+	Modern design and different materials
A4	Additions should be attached to side or rear elevations (façades) and should be set back from the street front façade, and should not damage or obscure character-defining features.	+/-	The proposed rear addition is setback from the front of the house, but it is visible from the front of the house.
A5	The design of the new addition should be subordinate to the original building. Rear and side additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.	+	The footprint of the proposed addition is under half of the original building's footprint.
A6	The original street front orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade. (The side or the rear of the house should not become the front of the house.)	+	
A7	The new addition should be designed so the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	+	
A8	The new addition should be designed with the intent to maintain the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion. The size and placement of doors and windows should be proportional to the number, size, and shape of the new wall elevation as compared to the mass and scale of the historic building. See Door and Entrance and Window guidelines for more details.	-	The proposed addition will have a very different solids to voids ratio than the historic house. However, the addition is more modern in style and the lack of windows on one elevation meets fire safety code.
A9	Full-floor additions on contributing residential structures (adding an additional full floor on top of a house) are not recommended unless the full-floor addition will be compatible with the existing streetscape and adjacent homes and structures and the impact on the character of the historic home is not totally transformed.	NA	
A10	Materials should be used that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+	
A11	The original roof pitch, style, shape, and volume should be respected when designing an addition. The roof on	+/-	The proposed addition roof is different from the historic

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	the addition should complement the existing roof forms, not overwhelm them.		hipped roof, but it does not overwhelm it.
A12	On commercial or institutional structures, the construction of new additions or additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible when viewed from the street and should not damage or destroy character-defining features. New additions or additional stories should be set back from the historic wall plane.	NA	
A13	New additions to structures may incorporate contemporary, energy efficient, and sustainable design and materials. However, do not imitate an historic style or period of architecture in new additions, especially for contemporary uses such as drive-in windows or garages.	+	
A14	Sunrooms or screened porches that are compatible with the home may be constructed as a rear or side addition and built with a similar level of quality construction and design.	NA	
A15	Decks may be constructed on the rear or an inconspicuous side of the building. Do not construct a deck on the front façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or stained.	+	
A16	The rear deck design should not extend beyond the side walls of the house and should not be visible from the front façade or street.	+	
A17	When adding new exterior steps, stairways, fire escapes, or elevator shafts, do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features. The new addition's construction scale and materials should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	NA	
A18	Exterior fire escape steps should be installed only on the side or rear façade of the building. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. The fire escape should be as inconspicuous as possible when viewed from the street.	NA	
A19	Exterior fire escape steps constructed of wood should be painted or stained, oriented to the yard, and kept to a minimum functional size.	NA	

Garage

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
G1	Contributing secondary structures should be preserved. However, when demolition is being requested to make way for a new secondary building, then Landmarks staff and/or the ARC will evaluate and review the demolition permit request based on the structure's integrity, historical character and materials, functionality, and security concerns. All structures in the district will be identified as either contributing or non-contributing at the time of application. See the Demolition guidelines for more details.	NA	
G2	New garages or other secondary structures should be designed so they complement the scale, mass, roof	+/-	More modern design than the other garages on the rear

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	form, setback, and materials of adjacent secondary structures. They should also be subordinate to the primary structure.		alley.
G3	New garages should be sited adjacent to an alley where present. Review the garage prototype illustration that identifies styles appropriate to preservation districts when planning a garage construction project.	+/-	Proposed garage sited adjacent to secondary street rather than alley due to lot complications.
G4	When no alley exists, garages should be sited at the rear of the property behind the main house. Landscape screening is encouraged along the driveway.	+/-	Proposed garage sited adjacent to secondary street rather than alley due to lot complications.
G5	Single garage doors should be used rather than expansive double or triple doors.	+	
G6	The roofline of a new garage should be oriented so it is parallel with the main house or follows the predominant pattern of existing secondary structures when a pattern exists.	+/-	The roof forms on the alley are varying.
G7	Roof pitch should be no less than one in six. The roof form of the garage should match the roof form of the main house when it is a character-defining feature.	+/-	4:12 shed roof pitch does not match the historic hipped roof, but complements.
G8	New garages should be designed so access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	+	
G9	New garages should be located at the rear of the property, should define and enclose the rear yard, and should be aligned with adjacent secondary structures.	+/-	Proposed garage sited adjacent to secondary street rather than alley due to lot complications.
G10	The garage design should be simple and rectangular in shape. Ell-shaped floor plans, slightly-projecting bays, and cantilevered second floors are also permitted.	+	
G11	New garage walls should be constructed with any of these materials (1) Horizontal siding to match existing exposure of the primary structure (normally 3" or 4" exposure), (2) corner boards and trim around openings, (3) board and batten siding, (4) brick, (5) stucco over frame or concrete block, (6) painted concrete block with parged or flush joint finish, (7) cast stone, molded concrete block, or (8) wood, aluminum or vinyl siding, or fiber cement siding or board to match existing exposure of the primary structure. Do not use these materials: T-111, exposed uncoated concrete block, or painted concrete block unless parged or skim coated first.	-	Dark bronze, exposed fastener, metal panels are proposed and very different from other materials. The panels fit the modern design of the garage.
G12	Approvable roof designs include simple gable roofs (6-in-12 minimum slope), hipped, shed, and flat roofs with parapets, intersecting gables, overhanging eaves, and gable end-vents. Not approvable are low-pitched gable roofs (less than 6-in-12 slope), flush eaves, and roofs without gutters.	+	4:12 shed roof is proposed.
G13	Asphalt, fiberglass, wood, tile, metal, slate or synthetic shingles are recommended roof materials. Half-round or ogee gutters, gable-end elements, and solar collectors are approvable. Do not use membrane or roll roofing on sloped roofs with 3-in-12 pitch or greater. See Roofing guidelines for additional details.	+	Dark asphalt shingles are proposed.
G14	Single-car garage doors or openings are preferred. Double- or triple-wide doors which convey the appearance of 2 or 3 single doors may be approved. Flush garage doors which accentuate the large size of the opening are prohibited.	+	
G15	Garage window openings should be used that visually break up the wall's surface and may be placed at higher elevations for security. Security grills may be installed on the inside face of the windows.	+	

New Construction - Residential

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NCR1	New construction designs should conform to all applicable regulations including the Land Development Code, Zoning District Regulations, Building, and Fire and Safety codes, MSD, and any other regulatory agency. All new construction architectural designs will be reviewed by the Clifton ARC.	+	Applicant is aware of the variance and waiver needed.
NCR2	No structure should be demolished to make way for new or large-scale construction. All structures in the district will be identified as either contributing or non-contributing at time of application. The Landmarks staff and ARC will evaluate and review all demolition permit requests. See the Demolition guidelines for more details.	+	
NCR3	Building height, scale, massing, volume, directional emphasis, and setback should reflect the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+/-	Proposed height and massing are similar, but setback is more than surrounding garages.
NCR4	The scale of new construction should not conflict with the historic character of the district.	+	
NCR5	Building materials and design elements in new construction design should be sympathetic with surrounding historic buildings in the district. Materials should be of a complementary color, size, texture, scale, and level of craftsmanship.	+	
NCR6	Creative design is encouraged. Examples of materials to avoid include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unfinished wood, and asphalt siding. Chain-link fences should not be installed where visually incompatible.	+	
NCR7	New construction design should reflect and reinforce the human scale of the neighborhood, which is a character-defining feature of the preservation district.	+	
NCR8	Important public views and vistas should not be disrupted by new construction design. See the Cultural Landscape guidelines for more details.	+	
NCR9	Existing spatial patterns created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, should be reinforced in new construction design.	+	
NCR10	The spatial organization established by surrounding buildings should be reinforced in infill construction design. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly designed façades.	+	
NCR11	The façade's organization should closely relate to surrounding buildings in infill construction design. Cornice lines and columns are other important character-defining façade elements. Imitating an historic style or period of architecture in new construction is not recommended.	NA	
NCR12	A new building's mass should have a similar sense of lightness or weight as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solid surfaces	+	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	(walls) to voids (window and door openings).		
NCR13	Window patterns should be sympathetic with those of surrounding buildings. Compatible frame dimensions, proportion, panel and light, and muntin configurations are encouraged. Historic window proportions are generally two-and-one half (height) by one (width).	+/-	The proposed garage will have a very different solids to voids ratio than the historic house but sympathetic. The addition is more modern in style and the lack of windows on one elevation meets fire safety code.
NCR14	Front door design should be sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings in new construction design. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.	NA	
NCR15	The orientation of the main entrance should be the same as the majority of other buildings on the street in new construction design.	+/-	Slightly different due to site.
NCR16	Paved walks should be installed between public sidewalks and front entrances where this is a character-defining feature on the street.	NA	
NCR17	Handicapped access ramps should be located on secondary elevations (side or rear) wherever possible. If the only option is to install the ramp on the street address façade, it should be installed in a manner that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible. Removable or portable ramps may also be used.	NA	
NCR18	Infill construction design should be compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings.	NA	
NCR19	Horizontal elements such as band boards, brick coursing, window sills or lintels in new construction design should be within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the similar height of the horizontal elements is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	NA	
NCR20	The historic rhythm of the streetscape should be maintained.	+	
NCR21	Historic building setback patterns should be maintained. To maintain the continuity of the streetscape, front setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.	+/-	Proposed garage sited adjacent to secondary street rather than alley due to lot complications.
NCR22	Roofs of new buildings should relate to neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+/-	The roof forms on the alley are varying.
NCR23	Rooflines for infill construction design should follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings. Where the predominant form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated.	NA	
NCR24	The orientation of the main roof form in new construction design should be parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.	+/-	The roof forms on the alley are varying.
NCR25	The existing cornice line on each block should be emphasized in new construction design where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	
NCR26	Rooftops should remain uncluttered and mechanical systems should be obscured from public view in new	+	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	construction design.		
NCR27	Trash receptacles should be screened from public view with a four-sided enclosure.	NSI	
NCR28	Exterior sheathing should be compatible with surrounding historic buildings. Painted wood siding or fiber cement board is preferred. Vinyl siding may be used for new construction on streets where the predominant historic construction material is wood. See Siding and Trim guidelines for additional details.	-	Dark bronze, exposed fastener, metal panels are proposed and very different from other materials. The panels fit the modern design of the garage.
NCR29	Masonry types and mortars should be compatible with surrounding buildings. Red brick is the most common masonry material found in the district. See Masonry guidelines for additional details.	NA	
NCR30	Stone or cast-stone sills and lintels should be incorporated into new construction design on streets where these elements are character-defining features.	NA	
NCR31	Raised masonry foundations which are compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings should be used. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance.	NA	
NCR32	New front porches should be built on streets where they are a predominant character-defining feature, and are allowed on other streets, and should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. New columns should consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof.	NA	
NCR33	Porches on newly constructed buildings should be designed so the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the façade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head.	NA	
NCR34	Storm-water management systems in new construction design and water runoff should not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	NSI	

Site

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Paving materials (concrete, brick, paver stones, cobblestones, asphalt, gravel, stone, permeable or pervious materials) that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character should be used for private sidewalks, drives, and roadways.	+	All concrete work shall use historic concrete mix
ST2	Historic paving materials for streets, alleys, sidewalks, and curbing (brick, hexagonal pavers, cobblestones, limestone, granite, or natural stone) should be protected, maintained, restored, and reused. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Replacement with historic materials is encouraged. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original. See Masonry M13 guideline for cement mortar mix recipe.		
ST3	Steps on private property made of brick, stone, or poured concrete should be maintained wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps where they are a character-defining feature.	+	
ST4	Paving companies and utility contractors shall not harm historic resources during road or underground utility repair projects.	NA	
ST5	Driveways, parking areas, and loading docks should be constructed or located to the side and rear of properties. Alley access is preferred.	+	
ST6	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not re-contour front yard berms into stepped terraces. Do not use railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically inappropriate material for retaining walls.	NA	
ST7	Excavations, trenching or re-grading adjacent to a building or site should be performed cautiously so as not to cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources. Every reasonable effort shall be made to protect and preserve architectural resources affected by, or adjacent to, any project.	NA	
ST8	Masonry walls in street-visible locations should not be installed unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless an historic precedent exists.	NA	
ST9	Retaining wall and curbing should match the existing character of the original materials when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST10	Fencing should match existing sections of fencing in material, height, design, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST11	Iron fencing should be installed, historically compatible, and of a similar height where there is a demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST12	Front yard fencing should not be installed where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST13	Rear yard or side yard privacy fencing should be installed with the finished side out and a side wall setback from the front of the house of at least two feet. Privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Refer to the Land Development Code or contact the Department of Codes and Regulations regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST14	Chain-link fencing painted black or dark color may be installed in residential front yards or along commercial corridors at the street where there is an historic precedent. Split-rail, woven-wood fencing, opaque fencing, painted or stained pressure-treated wood fencing, or recycled or reclaimed materials may be permitted with appropriate design. Synthetic or composite fencing that is durable may be considered.	NA	
ST15	Exterior lighting fixtures should not be falsely historical. The fixture should be attached to the exterior in a way as to not damage historic fabric.	NSI	
ST16	Exterior lighting for parking areas, architectural	NSI	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	features, or other site areas should be directed down and away from neighboring properties. Energy-efficient lights should be used to create a soft illumination and to minimize the impact to adjacent properties. Reference the Land Development Code for illumination restrictions.		
ST17	Parking lot design requires a portion of the parking area to be landscaped or buffered from adjoining properties. Reference the Land Development Code for specifics on parking lot design, maneuvering, landscaping, and buffering requirements.	NA	
ST18	Auxiliary fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, rain barrels, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, should be located on secondary elevations (side or rear) so they do not detract from the street-address façade and the character of the site.	NA	
ST19	Trees in front yards should be preserved. Established street tree patterns should be enhanced by planting additional trees along the public rights-of-way in the grass area between the street and sidewalk. Consult the city arborist or Frankfort Avenue Street Tree Master Plan to determine tree species that are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review by Landmarks staff unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety concerns.	NA	
ST20	Cellular towers and associated fixtures should be strategically located to minimize the impact on historic view shed(s), screened from public view, and should not damage historic elements when attached to structures.	NA	
ST21	Utility lines should be installed underground whenever possible.	NA	
ST22	The concrete mixture should match the existing or historic concrete mixture when repairing or replacing sidewalks or installing new sidewalks in the public right-of-way. Contact the Landmarks staff for the appropriate mixture and specifications.	NA	