

## **Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes**

**November 19, 2020**

A meeting of the Louisville Metro Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission was held on Thursday, November 19, 2020 at 9:00 a.m. online via Cisco Webex Video Teleconferencing.

### **Commission Members present:**

Chris Hartman  
Emily Liu  
Ashlyn Ackerman  
Stefanie Buzan  
Robert Kirchdorfer  
Carrye Jones  
Howard Rosenberg  
Christopher Fuller  
Tamika Jackson  
Morgan Ward  
Lori Stahlgren  
Amin Omidy  
David Morgan

### **Staff Members Present:**

Joe Haberman, Planning & Design Manager  
Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer  
Sue Reid, Management Assistant

On the recommendation of the Louisville Metro Department of Public Health & Wellness regarding congregate events and social distancing, and as permitted by Commonwealth of Kentucky Senate Bill 150, the November 19, 2020 Historic Landmarks & Preservation Districts Commission meeting was held online.

The following matters were considered:

# Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes

November 19, 2020

## APPROVAL OF MINUTES

### SEPTEMBER 10, 2020 HISTORIC LANDMARKS AND PRESERVATION DISTRICTS COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

**00:06:16** On a motion by Commissioner Ackerman, seconded by Commissioner Fuller, the following resolution was adopted:

**RESOLVED**, the Louisville Metro Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission does hereby **APPROVE** the Minutes of the meeting conducted on September 10, 2020.

The vote was as follows:

**Yes: Commissioners Jones, Buzan, Kirchdorfer, Liu, Ackerman, Rosenberg, Fuller, Ward, Jackson, Morgan, Stahlgren, and Hartman**  
**Abstain: Commissioner Omidy**

# Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes

November 19, 2020

## **PUBLIC HEARING 20-LANDMARK-0001**

Request: Individual Landmark Designation Review  
Project Name: Liberty Hall (Odd Fellows Bldg.)  
Request: 211-215 W. Muhammad Ali Blvd  
Jurisdiction: Louisville Metro  
Council District: 4-Barbara Sexton Smith  
Case Manager: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer

The draft designation report prepared for this case was incorporated into the record. The Commissioners received this report in advance of the hearing, and this report was available to any interested party prior to the public hearing. (The draft designation report is part of the case file maintained at Planning and Design Services offices, 444 South 5<sup>th</sup> Street.)

**An audio/visual recording of the Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission meeting related to this case is available on the Planning & Design Services website, or you may contact the Customer Service staff to obtain a copy.**

**00:07:45** Chair Hartman announced the case and reviewed the Individual Landmark Designation Review process (see recording for detailed presentation).

### **Agency testimony:**

**00:10:02** Cynthia Elmore presented the case and showed a Powerpoint presentation. Ms. Elmore reviewed the history and integrity of the building (see recording for detailed presentation).

### **The following speakers provided public testimony:**

Cash Moter, Joseph & Joseph Architects, 550 S. 4<sup>th</sup> Street, Louisville, KY  
Steve Wiser, 2862 Riedling Drive, Louisville, KY 40206  
Councilman Brandon Coan, 601 W. Jefferson Street, Louisville, KY 40202  
Heath Seymour, 631 S. 5<sup>th</sup> Street, Louisville, KY 40202  
Charles Cash, 500 Upland Road, Louisville, KY 40206  
Steve Porter, 2406 Tucker Station Rd., Louisville, KY 40299  
Forest Ramsey, 1116 Silver Crest Lane, Louisville, KY 40223  
Martina Kunnucke (did not provide address)  
Stephen Peterson, 932 S. 6<sup>th</sup> Street, Louisville, KY 40203  
Jeremy Dawkins, 4001 Maple Ave., Dallas, TX 75219  
John Owen, 653 N. 25<sup>th</sup> Street, Louisville, KY 40212

# Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes

November 19, 2020

## PUBLIC HEARING 20-LANDMARK-0001

### Summary of public testimony:

**00:25:43** Cash Moter spoke on behalf of the property owner. Mr. Moter stated significant change has happened to the building both internally and externally, and they do not think that the National Register Criteria would be met for this building. Mr. Moter stated they are going to show some interior photos of the building and historic fabric just doesn't exist. Mr. Moter stated the building has not been moved, so obviously there is high integrity of location. Mr. Moter stated one hundred percent of the street context has been demolished so there is zero integrity of setting. Mr. Moter stated there is very low integrity of design as the majority of the front façade is not intact. Mr. Moter stated there is low integrity of design for the secondary facades as well. Mr. Moter stated the building has low integrity of feel & association, and moderate integrity of material & workmanship. Mr. Moter reviewed the interior photos and stated no historic fabric exists from the interior. Mr. Moter reviewed the criteria for designation and summarized why they do not find that the actual criteria that's required for designation is met by any of these criteria. Mr. Moter responded to question from the Commissioners (see recording for detailed presentation).

**00:45:13** Cynthia Elmore responded to a question from Commissioner Morgan (see recording for detailed presentation).

**00:45:24** Steve Wiser spoke in favor of the designation request. Mr. Wiser stated this building is sound architecturally, structurally and aesthetically. Mr. Wiser stated they have done exhaustive research trying to figure out who the architect was and were not able to do that. However, in comparison to other buildings that existed at the time and in his mind William Dodd, a very famous architect, more than likely did this building as well (see recording for detailed presentation).

**00:52:08** Councilman Brandon Coan spoke neither for nor against the designation request. Councilman Coan stated even though there has been a lot of discussion about the interior of the building, we are really still talking about the exterior of the building. Councilman Coan stated the Landmarks Commission was given the ability to address the economic hardship exemption question if the property owner raises it. Councilman Coan stated that if the Omni Corporation decides to raise the economic hardship exemption question, he would ask the Commission to consider it for the record along with all the other criteria A through E. Councilman Coan responded to questions from the Commissioners (see recording for detailed presentation).

# Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes

November 19, 2020

## PUBLIC HEARING 20-LANDMARK-0001

**01:02:24** Heath Seymour spoke in favor of the designation request. Mr. Seymour stated the building seems to be economically viable, structurally viable, and retains a lot of its historic integrity (see recording for detailed presentation).

**01:06:42** Charles Cash spoke in favor of the designation request. Mr. Cash stated interiors are not part of the Landmarks designation authority. Mr. Cash stated what does matter about this building is its contextual relationship. Mr. Cash stated there is a high level of integrity associated with its location and role in the central business district. Mr. Cash stated to his knowledge, this is the last building of this particular type in the CBD, and one of the best examples architecturally of the public halls remaining in the city. Mr. Cash stated although the staff report didn't turn up the name of an architect, he agrees with his colleague, Mr. Wisner, that this building is undoubtedly the work of a design professional. Mr. Cash stated the fact that the store front has been modified is really not a negative, that's just evolution. Mr. Cash stated they believe this building meets Criteria A and D and deserves to be designated as a Landmark structure (see recording for detailed presentation).

**01:12:25** Steve Porter spoke in favor of the designation request. Mr. Porter stated he wanted to echo Mr. Cash in that it is the last of its kind in the downtown area. Mr. Porter stated it also meets Criteria D and believes this building should be preserved (see recording for detailed presentation).

**01:16:14** Forest Ramsey spoke in favor of the designation request (see recording for detailed presentation).

**01:19:47** Martina Kunnucke stated she has been on numerous Webex phone calls and this is not easily accessible by the public. Ms. Kunnucke spoke in favor of the designation request (see recording for detailed presentation).

**01:27:07** Stephen Peterson spoke neither for nor against the designation request. Mr. Peterson asked if there was additional information about the Liberty Hall Association. Mr. Peterson said he sees Cynthia shaking her head, so he'll accept that as staff looked thoroughly and couldn't find anything. Mr. Peterson asked if the potential to relocate this building had already been looked at and thought about if the current owners are not in favor of preserving it (see recording for detailed presentation).

**01:29:43** Jeremy Dawkins responded to Mr. Peterson's question (see recording for detailed presentation).

# Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes

November 19, 2020

## PUBLIC HEARING 20-LANDMARK-0001

**01:31:19** John Owen spoke in favor of the designation request (see recording for detailed presentation).

**01:36:46** Cynthia Elmore acknowledged she has received twenty-five comments from the public and Steve Wiser had submitted documents that were in the materials, and the Commissioner was sent all of those comments in advance of this meeting (see recording for detailed presentation).

**01:37:07** Emily Liu said, speaking as Planning & Design Staff, a physical location is provided to those who do not have access to technology to attend in person. Ms. Liu stated no one was present today at that location, which is Metro Development Center, Conference Room 101 (see recording for detailed presentation).

**01:37:54** Cash Moter stated examples of nominations they have written. Mr. Moter provided closing statements (see recording for detailed presentation).

**01:40:05** Jeremy Dawkins provided closing statements (see recording for detailed presentation).

### **01:41:30 Commissioners' deliberation**

**02:00:26** On a motion by Commissioner Buzan, seconded by Commissioner Stahlgren, the following resolution, based upon the Draft Designation Report, and the testimony heard today, was adopted:

**WHEREAS**, the Louisville Metro Historic Landmarks & Preservation Districts Commission adopts the Draft Designation Report as the findings of fact, and

**WHEREAS**, the Commission further finds that there is sufficient integrity to support Criteria A and D as it is an example of the important architectural type of a lodge building and has association with the Odd Fellows that had an important role in the development of Louisville, as well as its potential association with a master builder; now, therefore be it

**RESOLVED**, the Louisville Metro Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission in Case Number 20-LANDMARK-0001, Individual Landmark

# Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes

November 19, 2020

## **PUBLIC HEARING 20-LANDMARK-0001**

Designation Review, Liberty Hall (Odd Fellows Building) does hereby **APPROVE** the Individual Landmark Designation.

### **The vote was as follows:**

**Yes: Commissioners Jones, Buzan, Liu, Ackerman, Rosenberg, Fuller, Jackson, Morgan, Stahlgren, and Omidy**

**No: Commissioners Ward, and Kirchdorfer**

**Abstain: Commissioner Hartman**

**Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes**

**November 19, 2020**

**The meeting adjourned at approximately 11:25 a.m.**

---

**Chairman**

---

**Division Director**