



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts
Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Hasmik Pavlova, Planner I – Urban Design
Date: April 29, 2026

Case No: 26-COA-0069
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Address: 2544 Glenmary Avenue

Applicant: Ben Fabish
Authentic Carpentry LLC
7707 Floydsburg Rd
Crestwood, KY 40014

Owner: Jonathan L Witten & Alexandra Cohen
2544 Glenmary Ave
Louisville, KY 40204

Project Cost: \$36,642

Description of proposed exterior alterations:

The applicant requests approval to cover the historic concrete porch floor with slate and replace a portion of the historic concrete walkway with flagstone.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was submitted on March 16, 2026 and assigned to a case manager on March 23, 2026. Staff requested more information regarding the scope of work and the proposed materials on March 27, 2026. The applicant responded with the requested information and on April 7, 2026, the application was considered complete and requiring committee level review. Staff conducted a site visit to take photographs on April 23, 2026.

The case is scheduled to be reviewed by the Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on Wednesday, May 6, 2026 at 4:30 PM, in Room 101 of the Metro Development Center located at 444 South 5th Street.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Porches and Decks** and **Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report. The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The property is zoned R-5B Two-Family Residential and is located within the Traditional Neighborhood form district. It is located on the south side of Glenmary Avenue, two lots west from its intersection with Grinstead Drive. The structure is a one-and-a-half story, stone clad, side-gabled, Cape Cod style building. Character-defining features include an asymmetrical front façade with a gabled entry and concrete porch, below a large shed style dormer, and an offset smaller gabled dormer; both of which have multi-lite windows and are clad with traditional lap siding (Figure 1 and Figure 2). It is surrounded by structures of varying massing and styles from the same general era.

Previous COAs include case #18281 for a rear carport demolition and new garage construction featuring a residential addition and pool house, approved in October 2012.



Figure 1: 1975 designation photo.



Figure 2: Staff photo, April 2026

Conclusions

The proposal to clad the porch floor with slate generally does not meet the standard design guidelines for **Porches and Decks**, specifically **PO.1** and **PO.2**. The addition of slate to the historic concrete porch floor does not meet **PO.1** because it is ornament that did not exist historically. The porch floor is concrete at the same height as the poured concrete foundation of the building. This is a design feature to create one continuous horizontal concrete line across the base of the building. The slate would significantly change this original design detail. Furthermore, **PO.2** calls for porch repair in a way that maintains historic character using matching materials. The porch does show signs of requiring repair. In order to comply with the guidelines, that needs to be done with matching concrete.

The proposal to replace a portion of the concrete walk with flagstone generally does not meet the standard design guidelines for **Site**, specifically **ST.16**. This guideline requires preservation of a historic site material and when necessary, replacing with the same material or one that closely matches. The flagstone does not closely match concrete. It is also not compatible with adjacent sites or architectural character. The designation photo shows the historic concrete walkway leading to the front porch as well as a later grade level, flagstone patio behind it (**Figure 1**). However, that patio was removed sometime after August 2011 and before October 2014 per Google Streetview without a COA. While

flagstone is found on the site, it is not character defining to the site. The concrete walkway is character defining to the site and to the District as a development pattern.

As the application does not meet the applicable guidelines, Staff must recommend denial. However, Staff recommends that the applicant consider working with staff to change the arc of the character defining concrete walk to restore it to the 1975 designation photo (**Figure 1**). This would create space to add a flagstone patio where one was previously removed.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant and the applicable design guidelines, staff recommends that the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **denied**.

Hasmik Pavlova

 Hasmik Pavlova
 Planner I – Urban Design

5/1/2026

 Date

Porches and Decks

Standard Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines NA Not Applicable
- Does Not Meet Guidelines NSI Not Sufficient Information
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
PO.1	Preserve a historic porch in its original location. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Do not move, screen, enclose, or demolish a historic porch. • Do not add new ornament to a historic porch that did not exist historically or cover architectural details. • Do not add a front porch to the primary facade of a historic structure that never had a porch. • Screen panels may be permitted if they can be removed seasonally, are set behind porch elements, and do not damage historic fabric. 	-	Though the location of the porch will not change, the proposed addition of the slate floor is adding ornament that did not exist historically. The porch floor is concrete at the same height as the poured concrete foundation of the building. This is a design feature to create one continuous horizontal concrete line across the base of the building. The slate would change this design detail.
PO.2	Repair a porch in a way that maintains the historic character. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Use a material that is similar to the historic structure material in style, texture, finish, composition, and proportion. • Do not cover porch or cornice elements with vinyl or aluminum siding unless historic documentation shows this material was original. • Do not install porch ceilings or close in exposed eaves where none existed previously. Exposed 	-	Applicant proposes to install slate on the porch floor. The porch floor has historically been concrete. The porch floor does show signs of needing repair and to comply with this guideline, it needs to be repaired with matching concrete.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	<p>rafters and roof decks are character-defining features for certain architectural styles.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> An alternative material may be considered for a porch when the appearance is similar to that of the original. Consult the Alternative Materials guidelines for more information. 		
PO.3	<p>If reconstruction is required, design porch elements in a way that reflects the time period of the historic structure and use in-kind materials. Consult the Alternative Materials guidelines for more information.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Install replacement flooring that closely matches the original tongue and groove flooring dimensions. Match the dimensions of the original material. Do not use over-sized boards for a porch floor. Do not replace historic stone steps unless the stone is no longer usable. Replace deteriorated porch steps with in-kind materials. Replacement steps should be of the same scale and dimensions as the original. 	NA	
PO.4	<p>When enclosing a side or rear porch, preserve the design and detailing of original porch elements.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Use large sheets of recessed glass rather than solid materials for the enclosure. 	NA	
PO.5	Preserve a historic railing or baluster.	NA	
PO.6	<p>Design a replacement railing or baluster to match the historic as closely as possible.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> If matching the historic design is technically or economically unfeasible, a simplified porch rail and baluster may be used. When installing a code-required handrail or railing, select a design that is simple and stylistically compatible with a historic railing. Use a replacement material appropriate to the material of the historic structure. For example, a cast- or wrought-iron column, railing, or baluster should not be used to replace a brick or wood porch element. 	NA	
PO.7	<p>Minimize visibility of a new deck.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Do not construct a new deck along a street-facing or street-address facade. Construct a new deck at the rear of a historic structure. It should not extend beyond the side walls of the historic structure. If a deck is needed on a secondary elevation, screen it from view from the primary street and the street-facing or street-address facade. 	NA	
PO.8	Minimize damage to the historic structure and maintain the ability to remove the new deck.	NA	
PO.9	<p>Use wood when constructing a new deck.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> All wood will be stained or painted. Alternative materials may be allowed on certain portions of a new deck. Consult the Alternative Materials guidelines for more information. 	NA	

Site

Standard Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST.1	<p>Preserve established property line patterns as well as street and alley widths in a preservation district.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> If re-platting is considered, draw boundaries based on historic development patterns. 	NA	
ST.2	<p>Maintain a walkway that connects the street and building when this is a character defining feature in the surrounding context.</p>	+/-	While the applicant proposes to change the material and shape of a portion of the walkway, a walkway will be maintained. See ST.16 for further analysis.
ST.3	<p>Install a new sidewalk to be compatible with the historic ones in the area.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Maintain the existing width of neighboring sidewalks. Use a traditional sidewalk material as seen in the surrounding context, such as historic concrete mix or pavers. Match the pattern of the historic sidewalks where that is character defining. 	NA	
ST.4	<p>Minimize the visual impact of parking and delivery areas.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provide access to structures from an alley wherever one exists. If alley access is unfeasible, locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Use landscaping to screen a parking area. Plant and landscape a large parking lot to soften the impact of paving. Do not use paving in the front yard for a parking area unless necessary due to site specific conditions or historically appropriate to the surrounding context. Do not create a new driveway or garage that opens onto a primary street unless necessary due to site specific conditions or historically appropriate to the surrounding context. 	NA	
ST.5	<p>Maintain a historically significant fence or site wall.</p>	NA	
ST.6	<p>Repair a historic fence with materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in height and detail.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> If an exact match of materials cannot be made, a simplified design that is subordinate to the historic is appropriate. 	NA	
ST.7	<p>Design a new fence to be compatible with the architectural style of the house and existing fences in the surrounding context.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Install a metal fence under 3' in the front yard where there is historic precedent. Wood may be used where there is historic precedent in the District. Install a rear- or side-yard privacy fence to be set back from the side wall by at least 2'. Install a rear- or side-yard privacy fence so the finished side is presented out. Use stained or painted wood for a wood privacy fence. 	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Any privacy fencing shall be 7' feet in height or less, as measured from grade, including any retaining walls. Do not install a masonry wall in a street-visible location unless it is used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists. Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing or concrete block walls in areas visible from the public view unless historically appropriate to the surrounding context. 		
ST.8	<p>Preserve a large tree in the front yard unless it is diseased, dying, and/or damaging the historic building. A report from an arborist can determine this.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Select and place trees or landscaping that minimize the likelihood of damage to structures once mature. 	NA	
ST.9	<p>Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and berms.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces. Do not use railroad ties, landscape timbers, or other historically inappropriate materials for retaining walls. Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archaeological resources. 	NA	
ST.10	<p>Use low-water and non-evasive species when considering a new planting.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Consider the use of plantings and placement that will assist in managing rainfall at the site. These Low Impact Design (LID) strategies help to control rainfall and storm water runoff at the source. It also helps distribute storm water across the site to replenish groundwater supplies and contribute to overall water efficiency. 	NA	
ST.11	<p>Match the grade of adjacent properties with new construction.</p>	NA	
ST.12	<p>Preserve and maintain a historic site wall or retaining wall.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Repair only the portion of a historic retaining wall or site wall that is deteriorated. Preserve the character of a historic mortar joint when repointing a historic wall or retaining wall. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate. 	NA	
ST.13	<p>Explore alternatives before proposing significant site and topographical changes to a historic site. Alternatives include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Construct a subterranean retaining wall to stabilize the slope, but that sits below the landscaped surface, and so remains invisible. Use a stabilizing plant material or other ground cover that does not require mowing or a high degree of maintenance, rather than constructing a new retaining wall. Construct a low, transparent fence at the top of the slope to provide an enclosed front yard area for children or pets, rather than replacing the slope with a new retaining wall. Where low curbing (approximately 6") is prevalent, replicate this rather than constructing a wall. 	NA	
ST.14	<p>Avoid adding a new retaining wall until all alternatives have been explored.</p>	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Only add a new retaining wall that will alter the slope of a historic front yard area where at least one of the following conditions is present: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The slope is not a character defining feature of the preservation district or individual landmark. There is a high level of variety in the treatment of front yard areas among adjacent properties, including retaining walls. The front yard slope is unstable, threatens the foundation of a historic structure, and other strategies have been tested and been unsuccessful. 		
ST.15	<p>If all other strategies have failed, locate and design a new retaining wall to minimize impacts on the preservation district or historic property.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Use a low-kick wall, up to 2' in height, to help stabilize the yard while maintaining most of the historic slope. Design a new retaining wall to minimize visual impacts on the character defining features of the historic property, block, and district. Use a material that is historically significant to the preservation district or that relates to the historic property. Avoid using terraced retaining walls. Do not completely replace the slope with a tall retaining wall. 	NA	
ST.16	<p>Preserve a historic site material when possible.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Maintain a brick, stone, or poured concrete step or pathway wherever present. Maintain historic curbing whenever possible. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with historic materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, pattern, and visual appearance of the original. Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character. 	-	<p>The historic material of the walkway is concrete. The applicant proposes replacing some of the walkway with flagstone. While flagstone is found on the site, it's not character defining to the site. The concrete walkway is character defining to the site and to the District as a development pattern.</p> <p>Staff recommends the applicant work with staff to redesign the arc of the path to better mimic that seen in the designation photo. This would create space for a grade level flagstone patio behind it as seen in the designation photo.</p>
ST.17	<p>Preserve and maintain a historic lighting fixture if it is character defining, when possible.</p>	NA	
ST.18	<p>Design new or replacement lighting that is in character with the setting.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Use a fixture that is compatible with architectural and site design elements. When adding a new fixture, use an understated fixture that is subordinate to the historic building. When installing a new fixture, attach it in a way that does not damage the historic fabric. Design lighting to be contained within a site and to not spill over to a neighboring property. Softly illuminate an architectural feature if desired. 	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Direct light down and away from a neighboring property. • For a commercial property, minimize free standing lighting. Instead, use ambient light from a storefront as a light source. • Do not use an imitation historic fixture that may convey a false sense of history. • Do not use a light source that creates a harsh glare or color. • Do not light parking lots in a harsh manner. • Do not use a blinking or animated light. 		
ST19	<p>Minimize the visual impact of a service area and its related fixtures.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Position an air conditioning unit, satellite dish, greenhouse addition, overhead wiring, or other fixture type on a secondary elevation where they do not detract from the character of the site. • Screen a cellular tower and associated fixture from view. • Install a utility line underground wherever possible. • Do not harm historic resources through road widening, driveway construction, or underground utility repair. 	NA	
ST.20	Locate pools in the rear yard. Do not harm historic resources during the construction of a pool.	NA	