

Unedited Captioning Transcript of the Government Oversight/Audit and
Appointments Committee Meeting - August 4, 2026

WEBVTT

1 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:00:08.028 --> 00:00:29.430

Nope.

2 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:00:29.430 --> 00:00:47.610

What's the best on you? Stay alone.

3 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:00:47.610 --> 00:01:09.780

Sir. What's going on this? How's good is everything going on?

4 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:01:46.530 --> 00:02:06.530

Oh, ok, ok, ok.

5 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:02:06.530 --> 00:02:26.340

Have a good time. It's something.

6 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:02:26.340 --> 00:02:43.650

Yeah. So.

7 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:02:43.650 --> 00:03:04.730

Okay. Oh yeah, six.

8 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:03:36.450 --> 00:03:55.170

Okay. Yeah.

9 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:04:26.339 --> 00:04:45.599

Okay cycle. Okay. Yes sir, thank you.

10 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:20:59.699 --> 00:21:29.089

Metro TV, 30 s, please.

11 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:21:51.679 --> 00:22:13.849

Good evening, Welcome to the regular meeting for government
accountability oversight. I'm the chairperson councilwoman, Donna Pervis.
I am joining Chambers today by councilman Piogitini. Councilman Reed,
Council Woman Betsy Rui. Councilmen Herndon, Councilman Owen. I'm
joining.

12 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:22:13.849 --> 00:22:43.019

Conversely by Councilwoman, Jenny Murray Lurech by co chair along with councilwoman, Tammy Hawkins and councilman Bretcher. We have a qualm? Okay. The 1st on the agenda today is MSD. I understand this time restraint, so I'm gonna go ahead and let them go 1st Mr. Parrott, are you all ready for your presentation?

13 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:22:43.019 --> 00:23:13.879

For the record, everyone's speaking, please identify yourself, sorry. Kelly Watson general Council for MSD.

14 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:23:13.879 --> 00:23:34.069

Good afternoon, mr. Chair. This is Chairman and the committee. My name is Tony Perrod. I'm the executive director of the Metro Olin Sewer district. And I want to thank you for the opportunity to tell the MSD story and to comment on the proposed changes to ordinance 50.24. Just want to introduce.

15 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:23:34.069 --> 00:23:54.069

Introduce a few of my team members that maybe addressing questions as well as they come up with me alongside my general council, Kelly Watson. I also have our chief financial officer, mr. Brad Good. Mr. David Johnson, our chief engineer, our chief of staff, dr. Carmen Morreeno.

16 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:24:07.859 --> 00:24:27.859

Okay, so, we were asked to come and talk a little bit about the the changes to ordinance 50.24 and the changes would amend the ordinance to decrease the msd's board authority in our.

17 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:24:27.859 --> 00:24:57.529

Dependent rate setting flexibility which would negatively impact our ability to meet state and federal regulations. You should have, the PowerPoint and so what I want to do is just kind of run through a few slides and then open it up for questions. In 1946 I want to provide a just a brief overview of MSD and our consent decree. MSD was established by.

18 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:24:57.529 --> 00:25:15.179

State statute, as a wastewater utility in 1946, in 1986 MSD and Louisville Metro government entered into an MOU for MSD to assume the responsibility of storm water and drainage, management and flood protection system.

19 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:25:15.179 --> 00:25:35.179

The MOU specified that MSD would fund the two services through rates and charges. So I think it's a good point to recognize that, you know, aside from our statutory wastewater responsibilities, we are essentially three

separate utilities in one and the current MOU with legal metro government expires in.

20 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:25:35.179 --> 00:25:51.359

2036. Also between 1986 and 1997, MSD assumed the responsibility for executing local metro council ordinances, the hazardous materials ordinance, the erosion prevention and sediment control ordinance.

21 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:25:51.359 --> 00:26:11.359

And the flood plane ordinance. MSD performs the duties required under each ordinance independently with its own staff and funding because of our vast scope MS.

22 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:26:11.359 --> 00:26:33.359

SD has multiple levels of oversight. 1st, in 1997 MSD assumed the responsibility for under KRS 76 which sets the guidelines for our eight member board.

23 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:26:33.359 --> 00:26:50.189

Each member of the MSD board is appointed by the mayor, subject to this committee and the full global metro council approval. It does not MSD does not participate in that process. Also MSD.

24 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:26:50.189 --> 00:27:05.549

To all applicable federal state laws, industry standards and ordinances. This means we have multiple and frequent formal and informal meetings with regulators. E.g., we meet with the state and federal regulators.

25 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:27:05.549 --> 00:27:25.549

To discuss issues and other challenges. Specific to our consent decree, we have formal quarterly meetings with EPA to discuss projects and other requirements and we also have a list of formal written documents we must send based on current consent decree reporting requirements.

26 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:27:26.909 --> 00:27:46.909

As far as the details on the history of our in 2005 MSD, the EPA, the Department of justice, and the Commonwealth of Kentucky entered into a consent decree, and at that time, the EPA issued consent decrees to multiple utilities in the Midwest and on the East Coast to an.

27 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:27:46.909 --> 00:28:11.549

Sure long term compliance with the clean Water Act under federal law to protect public health and safety. All parties acknowledged the would likely be amended over time as MSD developed compliance measures. In 2009, the consent decree was amended as anticipated to clarify provisions, timeliness, and projects.

28 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:28:11.549 --> 00:28:33.109

In 2016, MSD was in the final stages of completing the, our critical repair and reinvestment plan, and that plan focused primarily on infrastructure improvements that we need in terms of operating and maintaining our assets tied to the admitted consent decree.

29 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:28:33.109 --> 00:28:57.469

And also other assets that were not a part of the consent decree. MSD briefed metro council on the preliminary findings of the CRRP and in 2000 06:17 MSD presented our plan to address the needs of the plan and the remaining amended consent decree work. To complete the plan MSD in 2017.

30 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:28:57.469 --> 00:29:12.959

Tested a 20 % increase, and that was not approved, but also during that process, during that hearing, there were several requests that came back to us that said maybe if you phase it in over time.

31 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:29:12.959 --> 00:29:32.959

So in 2018, we presented a plan requesting a 10 % rate increase over three years, but that was also not approved. As such, MSD entered into negotiations with the EPA in 2019 to adjust the timeline.

32 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:29:32.959 --> 00:29:56.059

Is in the amended consent Cree to allow us time to complete the work identified in the consent to cree and those identified in the critical repair and reinvestment plan. When we went to EPA, we had three main ask. We asked to extend the deadline to complete the waterway protection tunnel because we actually added.

33 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:29:56.059 --> 00:30:20.249

Approximately another mile on that tunnel to go all the way up to Lexington road. And, we also asked for one of the requirements that set the standard for eliminating capturing and treating combining sewer overflows in our decree from 98 % in a typical year down to 95 % now that we had more updated models that we could verify capture.

34 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:30:20.249 --> 00:30:40.249

And then, we asked for the remaining projects that were identified as sanitary sewer overflow projects being extended out to December 2035 and that was approximately \$220000000 worth of work, to address other priorities that had popped up as emerged.

35 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:30:40.249 --> 00:30:59.849

Urgencies. Number one was our biosolids project at Morris Foreman and the Patty's run flood pump station, which was in dire need to have

improvements and the pumping capacity doubled to protect most of West Louisville and shively.

36 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:30:59.849 --> 00:31:16.919

So, when we think about the proposed changes to, there were a lot of things that we were doing, in exchange of the requested timelines that we had at that time.

37 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:31:16.919 --> 00:31:34.739

EPA required that we put in additional money \$70 million for critical sewer rehab. Those are for like large diameter brick sewers that were caving in under the streets of our city, and we put in an allowance of \$25 million a year.

38 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:31:34.739 --> 00:31:52.739

For asset management so that we could keep on top of other asset needs and adding those two provisions into the consent decree. The EPA also reviewed MSD's 15 year work plan for asset management and enforcement options.

39 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:31:52.739 --> 00:32:12.739

To ensure monitoring and project completion of previously included projects. Those negotiations and work plans were based on MSD's board authority, meaning when we looked at the amendment and we looked at the financial capability, it was gauged upon our ability to.

40 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:32:12.739 --> 00:32:28.949

Rates up to the the current authority of 6.9 below seven and with the approval of 2nd amendment and the additional work included MSD was expected to meet the requirements of the consent decree by 2035.

41 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:32:28.949 --> 00:32:47.339

So I've just wanted to kind of give that background to lay the foundation for the comments, specific to the proposed change to ordinance 50.24 by changing the limit from 7 % to as submitted in June.

42 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:32:47.339 --> 00:33:07.339

CPI plus 1 %. This would equate to a rate increase of between two and 4 % a year according to the the proposal that was submitted in June. This would change MSD's board authority and essentially require MSD to come before council each year for a rate increase.

43 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:33:07.339 --> 00:33:27.649

Now while we understand the need to keep affordability, at the forefront, which we have demonstrated for the past two years, where our board has

guided us to stay at 3.9 % with the lowest increases that we've had in our district over 20 years, MSDs.

44 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:33:27.649 --> 00:33:35.039

Right setting flexibility will ultimately costs the rate payers additional money, and I'll discuss that in the future.

45 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:33:35.039 --> 00:33:55.039

Also msd's budget is driven by capital requirements based on regulatory obligation, construction costs, debt markets, emergencies, and system needs, not just CPI. MSD does CIP work.

46 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:33:55.039 --> 00:34:16.439

All over Jefferson County and one of the things that I think is very important is that, as we continue to do work and we look out over the next five year window, there are several major infrastructure projects and programs that would be impacted by the proposed ordinance change.

47 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:34:16.439 --> 00:34:36.439

E.g., one of the largest projects we have remaining in the consenter cree is our upper middle fork tunnel project which is required to eliminate illegal sanitaries who are overflows, that project would be laid, be delayed. This project impacts areas from san.

48 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:34:36.439 --> 00:34:53.789

Matthews down to the Highlands area. Also expansion and economic development in the eastern part of Jefferson County would be impacted. E.g., the Floyd's Fork interceptor project and any expansion of the Heights Creek.

49 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:34:53.789 --> 00:35:09.119

Water treat water quality treatment plant or the fluids fork water quality treatment plant or the cedar Creek water quality treatment plant would be pushed beyond if the next 15 year window until funding could be identified.

50 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:35:09.119 --> 00:35:30.259

We would not be able to update our 70 plus year old flood pump stations. Our flood protection system protects 280000 people and important infrastructure like LG and E plants, Churchil Downs, the University of Louisville, the airport, UPS, Ford.

51 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:35:30.259 --> 00:35:51.629

And most of downtown. Also, project dry, which is our drainage response initiative program would lose funding. Our catch base and replacement program, which is a critical part of our older mitigation program

required by an agreed order with the air pollution control district, would also lose funding.

52 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:35:51.629 --> 00:36:12.979

And as far as the catch base and replacement program, I know there were some questions about what kind of progress we've been making with the older mitigation. This just gives you a snapshot of all the neighborhoods we are inspecting catch basins and the level of replacements that we've had that have really been.

53 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:36:12.979 --> 00:36:31.409

Benefited a lot of the older mitigation and we've seen about a 16 % decrease in older complaints year after year. One of the largest areas that we are still looking at is the Russell neighborhood. We have.

54 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:36:31.409 --> 00:36:51.409

About a \$15 million projection for that area, and that area currently is unplanned and unfunded. So we have made some progress under the APCD agreed order. As we move on, there would be also an impact on services we provide for.

55 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:36:51.409 --> 00:37:13.249

We would need to evaluate our ability to administer the three ordinances that I mentioned earlier, the erosion control, the hazardous mitigation and the flood plane. Also we would need to understand the impact of providing continuing to provide free sewer service to Louisville Metro, which equates to a.

56 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:37:13.249 --> 00:37:18.119

About this current fiscal year.

57 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:37:18.119 --> 00:37:37.799

We would also need to consider the financial implications of moving to CPI plus one for our rate setting authority. Ultimately this change would mean lower levels of capital funding, higher levels of debt, and lower financial metrics which would eventually lead to a ratings downgrade in our opinion.

58 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:37:37.799 --> 00:37:57.799

Simply introducing this pros change alerts the rating agencies as they have previously identified risk associated with failure to implement timely and necessary increases. Each notch of a ratings downgrade is estimated to cost rate pairs an additional ten to 20.

59 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:37:57.799 --> 00:38:03.209

Million dollars in interest costs depending on the bond market.

60 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:38:03.209 --> 00:38:23.209

So the next two slides really just kind of shows you comments that we have received from two of our larger rating agencies. The 1st one is from Moody's, where they believe that rate management is worth about 10 % of overall scorecard as they evaluate us every time we go out to the bond market and.

61 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:38:23.209 --> 00:38:43.209

The length of time to implement a rate rate increase is embedded in the score, noting utilities that require outside approval may face delays objection or partial denial. From our 2025 report factors that could lead to a downgrade are identified, which are a significant increase in debt to.

62 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:38:43.209 --> 00:39:00.810

Revenues, substantial decrease in coverage during one and a half times or liquidity that below falls below 300 days of cash flow on hand. And failure to implement timely rate increases or to meet the consent to cree guide guidelines.

63 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:39:00.810 --> 00:39:17.100

We included the, for S&P, we included the full ratings report, in the packet for you to look at, but for S&P, they already viewed the 7 % cap as a negative already.

64 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:39:17.100 --> 00:39:37.100

And then in their 2025 ratings report, they stated that in their view, the MSD governance factors have increased risk as rate increases above 7 % must be approved by the Louisville Betro council. And the risk is somewhat.

65 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:39:37.100 --> 00:39:59.390

Who have had the ability to still approve rate hikes up to 7 %. The highlighted numbers are some of the key financial metrics that we look at. Our CFO looks at every year, and I mentioned the one and a half times rating metric.

66 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:39:59.390 --> 00:40:19.080

That is a metric that we are currently predicting for our current fiscal year budget as we implemented our 3.9 % rate increase. The fiscal year 27 rate supports those financial policies and mirrors the recommended recommended levels.

67 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:40:19.080 --> 00:40:36.270

By the rating agencies. Based upon the latest rating report, we think that if we go below the one half, one, one and a half times that will lead to a downgrade.

68 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:40:36.270 --> 00:40:57.470

The other area I think is for clarity is is our oversight. The oversight for MSD really is impacted when you think about the proposed change to the ordinance, the oversight and the impact of the concentrate are.

69 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:40:57.470 --> 00:41:23.700

With that change. The ordinance change means the board authority would shift to Louisville Metro council. As such, Louisville Metro Council would become a party to 2nd amended consent decree and would need to oversee msd's budget development process in order to change 2nd amended consent decree to reflect the ordinance change. Loyal Metro Council would need to go to a federal judge.

70 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:41:23.700 --> 00:41:43.700

So, given the scenario that I discussed, there is certain language decree that I wanted to make sure that everybody is aware of.

71 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:41:43.700 --> 00:42:07.590

That would be triggered by any change to the existing board authority. Namely section 58 of the amended consent decree is shown here and that's in your packet and you can read that, but I'll break it down a little bit further. What this means is MSD must use its best.

72 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:42:07.590 --> 00:42:27.590

Efforts to seek approval for anything over 7 %, which is current board authority or CPI plus one, which is the proposed change. If the rate increase request is denied, MSD must notify the EPA to explain the justification for the rate increase, its best efforts and why the increase was.

73 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:42:27.590 --> 00:42:48.060

Denied. The con the cabinet which is the Kentucky or the Department of Justice and the EPA can exercise its authority to force approval of all necessary rate increases in the event in the event that the denials and enforcement continue. So.

74 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:42:48.060 --> 00:43:05.580

In essence, that means that the regulators could have oversight over MSD and will lose our local authority and oversight. And as previously stated, we understand affordability is an issue. You have appointed aboard.

75 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:43:05.580 --> 00:43:21.480

That takes affordability very seriously, and we have demonstrated that in two consecutive years by holding the rate increases at a very lower level. We consistently engage with the state and federal government.

76 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:43:21.480 --> 00:43:38.730

To develop policies, secure grants, and go after congressionally directed spending to keep our rates lower. We also use a diverse portfolio of options such as our commercial paper program.

77 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:43:38.730 --> 00:43:54.300

And rate stabilization fund to lower our rates. We will start to pursue, continue to pursue grant funding, and low interest loans and other avenues as we focus on affordability for the future.

78 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:43:54.300 --> 00:44:12.390

About seven years ago, we were borrowing 95 % of our capital needs because of the formula that we've put in place with our commercial paper program, now we're down to borrowing anywhere between 70 and 74 %. So we're trying to be.

79 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:44:12.390 --> 00:44:32.390

Formulatically setting up a way to put us in a better position with our debt service, and it is projected over the next five years, even though we'll be issuing more debt next year that our overall debt service payment is going to be pretty similar to what it's gonna be over the next couple of years through 2035.

80 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:44:32.390 --> 00:44:52.820

So, I just wanted to provide this information to you, and we appreciate the opportunity to explain our position and hope we have provided some clarity on some of the questions and some of the issues, and we know that this is a very complex issue and probably needs a lot more dialogue, but with that.

81 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:44:52.820 --> 00:44:57.720

I'll end my comments and take any questions.

82 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:44:57.720 --> 00:45:17.720

Thank you, Mr., you provided us with a well comprehensive information. I do have some questions myself before I move to my colleagues, if it's my underst it is my understanding that if we go to the consumer price index plus one.

83 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:45:17.720 --> 00:45:37.720

Percent, this will have a negative impact on some of the projects that you're trying to complete with the agreement for the consent decree, is that correct? Yes ma'am, that is correct. Actually, what we have on the books right now, we would not be able to, do the work that we've already consented to do.

84 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:45:37.720 --> 00:46:12.260

With a CPI plus 1 %. So if that is the authority, we would be coming to you asking for a rate increase higher than CPI plus 1 % just to complete the work that we've already done. Our work we've already committed to. And you're saying that 7 % is really low. Is that is that correct? Well, what they're saying is that they're they're really troubled by the fact that we have a controlled board authority or controlled ability to.

85 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:46:12.260 --> 00:46:32.260

To the level where we need to, they are they have been following this historically from our critical repair plan that I pointed out those two years where we did go and ask for more and we didn't get, you know, any traction. So they've been following us for quite some time. And one of the things that I think they're pointing out to us.

86 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:46:32.260 --> 00:46:59.270

Us is that, you know, we set up the plan because that wasn't the 1st option they gave us. They wanted us to get all the work done in five years, and we told them based upon our board authority we could not do that and so they consented that we could stretch it out to 2035 as long as we are in compliance with everything that we've done. So S&P and moodies, I think will be one.

87 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:46:59.270 --> 00:47:33.680

Watching to see ok if we do not get what we need, number one, will that result in a downgrade, and ultimately will that make interest rates higher as we continue to borrow and finish out the program? So right now the consent decree goes to 2035. That is correct. Would this push the consent decree past 2035? Currently the what we've consented to our projects that are supposed to be completed by 2035?

88 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:47:33.680 --> 00:47:54.110

The one thing I can tell you, and i've told a few of these members of the committee, the clean Water Act is sort of the umbrella for us and we don't have any control over future regulations. Whether we are gonna ultimately be required to do nutrient removal at our foreign treatment plan.

89 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:47:54.110 --> 00:48:20.000

Time which is the largest plan in the state or whether we'll ultimately have to do in reduction of PFOS in wastewater and in sludge. Those things are being debated at the national level right now. If those things come

to fruition, they're gonna be billion dollar tickets and you cannot do those in a very quick manner. You've got to work with e.

90 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:48:20.000 --> 00:48:50.420

Which could result in finds to the agency. Basically, there are two ways that we can be impacted. Number one will be.

91 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:48:50.420 --> 00:49:10.420

If we miss milestone days for projects, and then if we also are not meeting guidelines for our asset management plan or we are not doing the adequate reporting that we're supposed to be doing, all of those can lead to stipulated penalties. The other challenge we have is, you know.

92 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:49:10.420 --> 00:49:25.590

So if we, are not meeting permit at our operational facilities, that that's another impact on the back end if we don't get the improvements that we need to meet our discharge permits to the Ohio River.

93 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:49:25.590 --> 00:49:43.950

So, you have gotten some pretty major projects completed as a result of having the ability to go to what, 6.9 without getting approval from the council. Okay, you still have major projects in the works.

94 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:49:43.950 --> 00:50:03.950

As you mentioned, I think st. Matthews, influence fork. Okay, so what happens with those projects? You're in the process of completing these projects and it goes to the consumer price index plus 1 %. What happens with these projects that you are currently.

95 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:50:03.950 --> 00:50:34.550

Working on. In my opinion I think that automatically, if that's gonna be the board authority I mean the the level of authority that we have, two things are gonna happen. Number one, like I said, we're gonna be coming to you every year asking for it to go above the CPI plus one, and then we're gonna have to inform EPA that that changes our ability to meet the timelines that they have laid out for us because every project that we.

96 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:50:34.550 --> 00:51:07.020

Programmed was based upon the 6.9 % board authority. So it's gonna trigger the language itself I think is going to trigger a, amendment to the again because particularly the project that I mentioned for the st. Matthews area, which is a very large tonel project right now is probably estimated close to \$400 million, and we will not have the financial capabilities to do that project. We would have to ask for an extension on that project.

97 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:51:07.020 --> 00:51:21.687

Yes sir. Councilwoman Hawkkins? Councilmen Hawkins, we cannot hear you.

98 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:51:27.418 --> 00:51:32.940

Else Woman Hawkkins?

99 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:51:32.940 --> 00:51:52.940

We're going to councilman Scott Reed. Thank you Madam chair. And hopefully we'll, we'll get to councilmen Hawkins in just a minute. Thank you director Perit for coming, and we had a nice talk on on Friday, and I just wanted to be very clear to everyone that this isn't a tribunal, nothing like that. We're here to look.

100 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:51:52.940 --> 00:52:12.940

I think one of the problems that we have in the community is that people just legitimately don't understand your year to year increases. They don't understand consent degree, and That's really what I'm gonna focus on. My questions are gonna be about the consent degree. Absolutely because when they look at their bill, they see that and it's a big percentage of their bill.

101 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:52:12.940 --> 00:52:22.290

Yeah, and they think, well, it was supposed to have gone away in 2020, still hasn't gone away as this here forever and ever, so Jared, were you are you able to.

102 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:52:22.290 --> 00:52:37.890

Get that up on the screen and I'm sorry, I'm not trying to boot you out, I just want to pull the consent decree up.

103 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:52:45.180 --> 00:53:05.180

So just one more thing before why Jared enters this in, explain what the consent decree is and how it came to be to begin with, please. So the term consent decree, I know that people think that that is a s a specific term in terms of consent. We talked a little bit about that, but it's essentially a tool.

104 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:53:05.180 --> 00:53:25.180

Tool that the EPA and the Department of Justice uses to quantify and verify that every party or any entity that is a part of a regulatory solution agree on what everybody's responsibilities are. Thus the term consent agreement. And.

105 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:53:25.180 --> 00:53:26.370

So.

106 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:53:26.370 --> 00:53:46.370

Most of the Midwest and in the East started back in the early 2000s, and the primary focus was on the treatment plants to make sure that we could shore up larger treatment plants and get rid of multiple.

107 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:53:51.570 --> 00:54:08.550

Jefferson County had hundreds of package plants and those have been ultimately eliminated and now we have the five major regionals that we have in Jefferson County. 2nd part of the focus from the federal government was to look at.

108 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:54:08.550 --> 00:54:28.550

How we could address combined sewer overflows. A lot of major river cities have combined sewers which were sewers built to to handle ways from homes and businesses and also carry storm water directly to the ohio River. Most of those systems were built back in the mid 1800s and.

109 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:54:28.550 --> 00:54:33.750

And they were designed.

110 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:54:33.750 --> 00:54:53.750

To fill up. So the 1st phase of that for the combined sewer overflow program was to make communities commit to reducing the amount of annual combined sewer overflows that they had in our community.

111 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:54:53.750 --> 00:55:03.660

And to be able to capture that overflow via storage facilities or tunnel facilities.

112 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:55:03.660 --> 00:55:23.660

And then ultimately get that overflow to a treatment plant and treat it at a certain level. In our case, most of the combineds who overflow that we are capturing with our tunnel project, our storage projects are taken to more is foreman and that's where we're committing to meet the 95 % capture and just with the tunnel project.

113 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:55:23.660 --> 00:55:43.660

Overflows into the ohale River and Bearcrast Creek by over 6 billion gallons a year. And then 2nd part of that is going to be the sanitary sewer overflows which are systems that are separate from strom water and under the clean Water Act, those.

114 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:55:45.900 --> 00:56:05.900

Combined sewer over overflows, we try to commit to a certain level of capture and treatment. Sanitatures sewer overflows. You're supposed to

tighten up the system and completely eliminate those enumerated ssos as we call them. And most of those are outside of the water. Most of the combined sewer overflows are inside the water.

115 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:56:06.720 --> 00:56:26.720

Okay, so for those that maybe watching, a consent decree is an agreement made with the federal government to make sure that what, that we're by abiding by the rules and the laws that that a court, a federal court sets forward. That's, is that correct? That is correct. And one of the challenges.

116 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:56:26.720 --> 00:56:46.720

One of the things that is very clear. If you know beyond just the stipulated pilmerties and the civil fines and those type of things, there's also accountability for directors or elected officials or whoever are a party to the degree if you are not doing the work.

117 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:56:46.720 --> 00:57:06.720

That you could be subject to a criminal prosecution. And so we take these very seriously and in our case, it's actually a three party, four party agreement with the cabinet or the state of Kentucky who partnered with EPA and the Department of Justice to bring this case against us here.

118 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:57:06.720 --> 00:57:09.840

Okay, thank you. So.

119 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:57:09.840 --> 00:57:29.840

We're gonna reference and perhaps Kelly may want to come up to to talk to this. Paragraphs 17 to 21 envision that events outside of the consent degree terms can impact the timing and ability of MSD to meet the CD, the consent degree terms, and all parties in.

120 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:57:29.840 --> 00:57:49.840

Anticipate the consent decree maybe further amended. As of now, does MSD anticipate on additional unmet needs requiring another extension of the consent decree or does MSD as of right now think that the consent decree will be complete in 2025 or or sooner?

121 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:57:49.840 --> 00:57:54.030

I can address that. Based upon what we know today.

122 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:57:54.030 --> 00:58:14.030

And what we've committed to, what we've outlined through 2035, we expect that our work will be completed and we will meet the requirements of the existing consent decree. Now, there is one caveat this is more so for the or what we call.

123 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:58:14.030 --> 00:58:32.370

Be the long term control plan for the CSO, the combined who are overflow. There is national discussion and we have already started talking about it in Kentucky as well. The EPA is starting to say well yeah you completed your long term control plan, you met your 95 % capture and treat.

124 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:58:32.370 --> 00:58:52.370

But we're still not seeing water quality standards in streams and rivers. And so that is something that we are just listening to and we're watching. So, you know, once we get to the goal line, are they gonna say, hey, we want you to try to do or squeeze something else out of that. Our argument would be is because we're appeal.

125 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:59:03.840 --> 00:59:23.840

And the other communities that maybe attributing to some of the water quality issues in the streams and rivers. So, but to answer your question is, we anticipate that this work will be.

126 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:59:23.840 --> 00:59:43.840

2035 unless there's some future regulations that we can foresee right now. Okay. And councilman Reed I'll just add that the beginning of the amended consentscree document items like one through 30, the whereas clauses are kind of like the, the context and the background.

127 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:59:43.840 --> 00:59:51.390

For where we are. So it sets the stage and it's telling you why we had a consent decree to begin with.

128 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

00:59:51.390 --> 01:00:11.390

Then it goes in and it tells you why it was amended, which is what you were looking there with like 17 through 21, like all the things that we said we were already MSC was doing and had completed at that time. Adjusting the project timelines as mr. Parentas suggested, and then it goes on to tell you further in those clauses.

129 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:00:11.390 --> 01:00:16.560

Why this amendment was also necessary, if that makes sense. Okay.

130 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:00:16.560 --> 01:00:36.560

On pages 18 and 32 determined? I don't know the actual schedules I'm gonna defer to the experts on that one. But as I said, when you're getting through all of those in the very begin.

131 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:00:36.560 --> 01:00:41.910

Guinea, right? 18 through.

132 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:00:41.910 --> 01:01:01.910

These were as closes beginning with 18 is telling you basically that in 2015, this is where we said we were these, this is where the material change kind of occurred, that we needed to do projects that were critical to the system as well as continue to work on the required consent decree projects.

133 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:01:01.910 --> 01:01:21.910

So beginning in 18, it's telling you we needed to work on the biosolid project that mr. Parrott focused on. Beginning in 2019, it's telling you we needed to do some flood pump flood protection system projects. Beginning in 20 is telling you that we were also needing to work on some other system critical repairs that needed to.

134 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:01:21.910 --> 01:01:30.300

To be done. All of that leading to where you are in 20 section number 22 if you want to scroll.

135 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:01:30.300 --> 01:01:44.000

Scroll down a little bit, where it tells you on page ten, where it's gonna tell you where we're looking at, all the other measures that were in our long term control plan and.

136 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:01:44.000 --> 01:01:59.329

And our other our IOP modifications that needed to be done if that makes sense. So all that's still more background, but starting in 17 is leading to why this was amended again. Does that make sense? Please jump in if I mischaracterize any of that.

137 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:01:59.329 --> 01:02:18.110

Okay so it might be helpful and I'm gonna see the floor to my colleagues and probably come back in if we have time. It might be helpful if we if there was some sort of document that started that shows where we started in 2005.

138 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:02:18.110 --> 01:02:38.110

The projects that have been completed under the, under consent decree, what what has been planned and where we are in those projects, so that we then can go to our constituents and say, Look, this is, this was the plan, this is where we're headed. As far as we know, the consent decree isn't here from now until Doom's Day.

139 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:02:38.110 --> 01:03:03.790

Because, you know, people see just this annual increase every year and I think that it would, it would help you guys with, with your, with PR. It would help us relate to our constituents and I think it would be good situational around if we could come up with something like that. Do you think we could? Well, I think that there's probably a document that we've already prepared when we went into 2nd amendment discussions with the regulators, so it would be a matter of just.

140 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:03:03.790 --> 01:03:23.790

Taking a look at that and see if that needs to be, something that we can provide you and then maybe it's something that we can update a little bit based upon the last four or five years since we got the 2nd amendment completed because I don't think anybody argues that we want clean water. We we want we don't want flooding.

141 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:03:23.790 --> 01:03:51.123

We we want the essential services of MSD, right? Right. But sometimes it's difficult to convey that to to our constituents. It it is a very mechanism to get there. It is a very complex issue and when you start dealing with regulators attorneys, but I'm saying in attorneys and I sometimes we have to think about what what are they actually asking us to do, so. Okay.

142 "Kramer, Kevin" (416065024)

01:03:51.123 --> 01:04:00.345

Thank you. Adam Chairman just add to that one little bit. I'll come back into the queue for my own questions.

143 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:04:00.345 --> 01:04:02.070

Where's this?

144 "Kramer, Kevin" (416065024)

01:04:02.070 --> 01:04:05.583

This Councilman, I'm sorry.

145 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:04:05.583 --> 01:04:07.296

Sure.

146 "Kramer, Kevin" (416065024)

01:04:07.296 --> 01:04:33.150

Thank you. As you put together that list, Tony or I'm sorry, director paired, as you put together that list, would it be possible to include also the changes to the goal posts that had been, that had been put in place since the original consent decree? I know we've been making efforts towards it and I know that EPA has come back subsequently and said, oh yeah, by the way, we also want you to, to.

147 "Kramer, Kevin" (416065024)

01:04:33.150 --> 01:05:15.707

Do this. So I'm not as interested in although I don't I'm not as interested in the speculative piece although I'm not opposed to your sharing it. I know the EPA is talking about PFOS, but that's not before us right now. So, again, if you want to add that, that's fine, but I'm more interested in when we signed the consent to Korea in 2005, these were the expectations between 2005 and 2026, some, there have been additional expectations. And so as you're putting that list together for councilman Reed, if you could, you know, delineate where those additional expectations were added, I think that would help us with our constituents as well.

148 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:05:15.707 --> 01:05:20.624

Absolutely.

149 "Kramer, Kevin" (416065024)

01:05:20.624 --> 01:05:22.804

Thank you.

150 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:05:22.804 --> 01:05:48.080

So I wanted to make a comment on, Councilman Crayman Cramer in the statement he made, I've heard and I don't know that money's allocated for certain projects under the consent decree will spend in other areas. Can you confirm if that is true or not? What I can tell you is that.

151 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:05:48.080 --> 01:06:04.160

The only shifting of, of, of projects that we have done is what we've talked about today, which is shifting the sanitary sewer, required projects, and there's probably 19 or 20 of them.

152 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:06:04.160 --> 01:06:39.000

For about \$220000000 we moved them to the back end of the schedule so that we could do the work at Morris Foreman biosolids and at Patty's run flood pump station, another work at Morris Foreman under a state agreed order. Collectively, the work that we did at Morris Foreman and at Patty's run is approaching \$600 million. And so that's why we had to shift the original schedule for those sanitary sewer projects to the back end so that we could address in our mind which were emergency.

153 "Kramer, Kevin" (416065024)

01:06:39.000 --> 01:07:09.943

Yeah, I'm sorry. I I don't mean I hope it didn't sound like Alex suggested that you moved money away from consent projects to something else. That was not what I was saying at all. My, my concern question is I know that when we entered the consent decree, there were a list of things we were expected to do on whatever schedule that was. Since we started work on that, the EPA has come back and added to the list additional things that were now also responsible for doing. I mean.

154 "Tammy Hawkins" (2249237248)

01:07:09.943 --> 01:07:11.305

Interested to know.

155 "Kramer, Kevin" (416065024)

01:07:11.305 --> 01:07:32.525

When and how often has the EPA come back in after the fact and said, Oh yeah, you're already doing this, but now you have to do this as well. That's what I'm asking for. I just want a list of when, when that happened. Again, NO implication you've moved running around at all. I'm not, this is not an implication. This is not a comment about MSD at all, right?

156 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:07:32.525 --> 01:07:59.619

Yeah. No, I think the original in 2005 contemplated that there would be a 1st amendment which happened in 2009 because once we got some sure short certainty on some of the metrics, but this second amendment was sort of a, a mutual approach to how we were going to address emergency prior emerging priorities and.

157 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:07:59.619 --> 01:08:32.908

What the state wanted us to address at Morris foreign, and so that's, you know, we can identify those projects. The two things that I mentioned that was added in by EPA was dealing with the large diameter pipe failures we were having and also the annual asset management allowance that they wanted us to make sure we were reinvesting in the system so but we could try to put together a narrative that folks could understand. Thank you.

158 "Tammy Hawkins" (2249237248)

01:08:32.908 --> 01:08:54.939

Thank you. 1st thanks MSD for being here and just for the sake of time, all the questions that I have, I'm gonna email them to you all and you all can answer. But I just have one thing and you can have anybody answer mr. Prayer for all those constituents that have contacted my office, you know, and that have.

159 "Tammy Hawkins" (2249237248)

01:08:54.939 --> 01:09:27.399

Concerns just about the, you know, it's been a lot of rain, the catch basings, still a lot of flooding going on in part Duval, those fanage has still been put up after about ten years. I just want to know what do you have to say to, to everybody who's watching because you you know our constituents who depend on us to be their voice, I wanna know what you have to say.

160 "Tammy Hawkins" (2249237248)

01:09:27.399 --> 01:09:51.066

To them just on behalf because they don't understand the consent decree. They don't understand, you know, the reason that you all want to continue to raise rates and they want us to fight against that. So I want to know what you, you know, what, what do you all have to say to them? So they have hope that you, you know, that there will be some change.

161 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:09:51.066 --> 01:10:08.419

Well, thank you for your question and you know it's, it's it's a challenge when when you think about you know when you identify flooding, you know, is it overland flooding, is it, is it street flooding, those type of things. I can tell you that particularly in the area.

162 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:10:08.419 --> 01:10:28.419

Over the last five years, we've made tremendous changes on how we're addressing overland flooding. And changed out a lot of catch basins in Park Duval. We don't see unless there's a problem with the coordination with the water that's coming off the interstate. We don't see a lot of overland flo.

163 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:10:28.419 --> 01:10:42.668

Flooding there. We have continued to look at the catch basins in that area. I think in Park Deval we've actually inspected and replaced all of the catch basins in that area, not only for for flooding, but all.

164 "Tammy Hawkins" (2249237248)

01:10:42.668 --> 01:10:46.609

Excuse me, but we don't just gotta talk.

165 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:10:46.609 --> 01:10:48.783

I just think.

166 "Tammy Hawkins" (2249237248)

01:10:48.783 --> 01:11:01.009

Yeah, yeah, yeah. But but but but part Duba is a huge problem. It's been for over ten years. Every last predecessor that I've had all the way leading back to Miss Green and even before her.

167 "Tammy Hawkins" (2249237248)

01:11:01.009 --> 01:11:21.009

It has been an issue right there by the community center that Flix. There's NO signage, there's nothing. All I'm asking for, if it can't be fixed, just at least show some signage so it won't nobody get hurt. Cause eventually, and I've been sending emails and emails just talk, talk to miss George about signage.

168 "Tammy Hawkins" (2249237248)

01:11:21.009 --> 01:11:41.009

You know, if if we can at least, you know, put some preventative measures there so so NO one gets hurt, you know, I don't want to have to, you know, go to a sand company and go put some sands there myself. But I'm gonna have to do what I'm gonna have to do if to stop people from getting hurt right there. So we want to make sure that that doesn't happen again and just.

169 "Tammy Hawkins" (2249237248)

01:11:41.009 --> 01:12:07.925

What you all can say because I'm all talked out when it comes to what, you know, how can make the public understand on why you all continue to ask for raises. And I do want to say thank you because when I called you all, you all came out to a district that was not man and and made some constituents understand about those catch bases. So I want to say thank you about that. But just whatever you all have to say, I I just hope everybody's listening.

170 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:12:07.925 --> 01:12:23.989

Well, the one thing I will add on the signage issue, we are gonna be working in conjunction with public works because I think they are the ones who put the signs up and then secondly, just as an explanation, we know, at least it seems like this year.

171 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:12:23.989 --> 01:12:43.989

And sometimes, you know, we do have identified hotspots in the area where we try to do a pre storm event run to make sure those base catch basins are not blocked. But then sometimes we get that five or 6 " rain.

172 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:12:43.989 --> 01:13:08.679

But if there areas that are impacted longer than that and we wanna take a look at it and see if how we can make it better.

173 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:13:08.679 --> 01:13:11.224

And Hawkins are you done?

174 "Tammy Hawkins" (2249237248)

01:13:11.224 --> 01:13:31.659

One more thing, and then I'm I'm done and I appreciate y'all coming. The communication, when the public calls in, there was some huge concerns just about the 1st line of communication, you know, when people are calling in about their catch base scenes, because I'm trying to educate people on one end that clean your own catch ba.

175 "Tammy Hawkins" (2249237248)

01:13:31.659 --> 01:14:02.746

You know, a lot of times when they call in, it's always, well, that's not us. You know, is it a rule is do do constituents have to call in and say, hey, my catch basing hasn't been cleaned out or do I just need to tell them to clean it out they said? Or just to help out? Is it, is it in rotation? What is it? You know, can you help me out with educating them on what is the best.

176 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:14:02.746 --> 01:14:14.389

Our our our our direction would be is that if you know that there is a catch base that needs cleaned or a catch base that's clogged, you should notify us so that we can respond and do that work.

177 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:14:14.389 --> 01:14:42.999

Okay, Councilman Piotrainee. Thank you, madam chair. So, a couple things. 1st of all, I believe the last two years, the board agreed to increases less than the 6.9 %, Isn't that correct? At least for the last two years, and it may have been a couple years in the last five years. Right.

178 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:14:42.999 --> 01:15:03.519

So, so we don't need the 6.9 %. Not that's not what we're saying. We're we have to legal question. Yeah. They don't need 6.9 % every year.

179 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:15:03.519 --> 01:15:33.519

Correct. No, what the board looked at was a capital program where we have deferred significant capital projects because we knew that we could not afford to do them, which would have probably driven us way above the six nine. We have been getting a lot of heat from the community as you know, there was language introduced two years ago to try to reduce.

180 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:15:33.519 --> 01:16:01.149

You know, our our our board authority as well. And we went up and had a lot of discussions with the state legislature just like we're doing now, and the issue is is that we know that affordability is an issue. And so our board has directed us to look at how they, how we can keep rate increases at a moderate level unless it is some regulatory driven issue that we have to.

181 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:16:01.149 --> 01:16:24.729

Address. E.g., in this year's fiscal year budget, we eliminated 35 positions and we've also looked at other programs that we are NO longer gonna fund. That's how we got down to the 3.9 %. But the capital program is suffering significantly because we are trying to be cost cost effective.

182 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:16:24.729 --> 01:16:42.829

You want to be very precise here. You said a moment ago that you're going to meet the requirements. So how could it be suffering? Well, there's projects that mr. Johnson can probably speak to this, but there's projects that we have on our books.

183 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:16:42.829 --> 01:17:02.829

That have been pushed back for for several years, and when we look at those projects, we're doing the required projects, but there's other projects that we just cannot afford to do, and I mentioned the Floyd's Fork interceptor as one example. That.

184 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:17:02.829 --> 01:17:30.099

Project, you know, we would love to get that done, but we can't afford to do it. So we're looking at significant deferrals of projects and

improvements and it's almost like the rusty bucket. We're still playing that band aid row where we are, you know, fixing what we can and trying to control our capital investments. So 1st of all, I would I would be careful to threaten that we, we just.

185 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:17:30.099 --> 01:17:50.099

Slow down growth in the east end if we did this because, you know, don't, don't, don't tell the east end they can have a good time because I think most of the residents out there would appreciate the slowdown. But what I'm simply trying to, the picture I'm trying to paint here is we we can't have it both ways, right? We either have a dire picture.

186 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:17:50.099 --> 01:18:17.049

Sure and we need the 6.9 and we need the 6.9 every year, otherwise we'll be out of compliance or we don't need it, right? And it seems to me we don't. I think we have evidence we don't. Like I'll give you another example. You in your timeline, before 2nd amendment, you came to council with multiple requests, at least two, for a much larger increase. They were denied.

187 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:18:17.049 --> 01:18:37.179

The consent decree actually states that the federal government, if they, if we, if you and good faith come to the council, the council rejects you. If they think that is out of compliance, they can mandate the rate increase, they can just override and mandate the rate increase that didn't happen.

188 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:18:37.179 --> 01:18:57.669

Hey, you were wearing out of compliance by denying those and then we get the updated so there's a renegotiation. Again, you didn't say it was renegotiated because we denied that. He says renegotiated because there was new things that came up we had to incorporate, ok, fine.

189 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:18:57.669 --> 01:19:29.899

That happens, I'll just that in a minute. And then now, and again, you could say affordability, that's fine, I mean, look I appreciate it being lower. As a matter of fact, the current rate increase is just about CPI plus 1 %. So if we had initiated this, you actually would have gotten the rate increase you wanted without even coming to us for a vote with this updated ordinance. So I'm just saying it's hard for me to justify saying it's dire we need the 6.9 %. When in multiple instances, we have not done the 6.9 % and.

190 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:19:29.899 --> 01:19:45.229

You you've said we're in compliance, right? You might have delayed things, but you know we're hitting the 2035 deadline. The EPA has not said that we're out of compliance with the consent degree. The court has

not said we're out of compliance, the state has not said so, so I'm struggling with that.

191 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:19:45.229 --> 01:20:03.109

Yeah. Well, I think there's two two things I want to say. The language that you're referring to in terms of the denied rate increase language, that did not exist when we brought the two options in 17 and 18 to metro council. Secondly, I would say that.

192 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:20:03.109 --> 01:20:23.109

When we are looking at controlling the rates, we also know at some point we're gonna be edging back closer to six nine because of a bond issue. E.g., next year we'll be going out for bonds and the rate is gonna be higher than three nine, and we also know once this upper middle four project.

193 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:20:23.109 --> 01:20:41.149

Get started. We're probably gonna need more than that. So we haven't been able to we set the schedule and the financial capability based upon our board authority. So we're trying not to to to go about over six nine.

194 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:20:41.149 --> 01:21:01.149

So, thank you. So, and so a couple things. 1st of all, I This is why, I I think consent decrees are a horrible, horrible, horrible thing. I, I'd much rather frankly, the EPA just said, hey, we're gonna find you or we're gonna have some other penalty or whatever, and then we continue to.

195 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:21:01.149 --> 01:21:21.149

Deal with it, right? Because then we can continue to do so locally. Now we have multiple layers of federal and state bureaucracies not doing anything. Really, you guys are doing the work, the local entity is doing, it's not as though the state EPA or the federal EPA are coming in and doing anything. They're just looking over your shoulder and and you know being annoying. They're not adding.

196 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:21:21.149 --> 01:21:41.149

Value. E.g., I would ask you, and I think we discussed this the other day, but I want people to understand, with all of the moving of the EPA standards and all the additional things they're doing, how is, what is the federal EPA or state environmental protections agencies done to help fund those unfunded mandates? What's the trend line that you've seen in.

197 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:21:41.149 --> 01:22:02.229

20 years. Well, unfortunately, the trend line has declined 20 years ago, maybe 30 years ago, you could almost, for a mandate, you could almost go after 75 % federal grant. Today, you'd be lucky to get.

198 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:22:02.229 --> 01:22:30.789

At six to 7 % of a federal grant for an unfunded mandate. And I'll just show share one more statistic with you. Clean water agencies, predicts that all across the country utilities are raising rates just this fiscal year at an average of 4.4 %. And it is projected over the next five years that it's gonna all utilities are gonna, because of these programs.

199 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:22:30.789 --> 01:22:59.679

The local cost of service and the regulatory cost of service is falling on the local rate payer and it's probably gonna average up to 6.8 % over the next five years for local rate payers. So, we're doing our job to advocate for more grants. We know that's the answer. But we want free money and so my board authorizes us to spend a lot of time in Frankfurt, a lot of time in DC trying to get free money.

200 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:22:59.679 --> 01:23:26.289

I, I don't call it free money as taxpayer money at the state or federal level, but the point is if they're gonna make all these mandates, right, that may or may not work for this jurisdiction, then they need to come up with it. I mean this is part of the problem. If you got rid of the federal EPA, I don't think the citizens of be like what the hell is water, right? We would just organize locally and say we're gonna hold MSD accountable, but we're gonna do it at a local level and make sure that we're discussing.

201 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:23:26.289 --> 01:23:46.289

Right, obviously with federal waterways, you know, with interstate waterways, that's where the federal government kicks in. But I see them more and more as a complete impediment to progress and just a massive cost center as opposed to somebody that's actually helping us try to, and I think that's something that public needs to understand. You know, they keep moving the goalposts that includes extending this con.

202 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:23:46.289 --> 01:24:19.359

Consent degree, now it's gonna be a 30 year consent decree, you know, with, without doing anything to support how we get to a solution. My last question here is you're, you somewhat make the assumption here both in your comments and in your financial projections that we will reject all rate increases, right? In other words, in reality, we could pass this ordinance, it could be CPA plus CPA plus 1 %, and you could come every year and be like, look, we need 6.9 %, we need 6.9 %, and we might approve it, right?

203 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:24:19.359 --> 01:24:39.489

I want to understand why that assumption was made and why is it bad and I'll use 2nd consent decree renegotiation as an example. My understanding, somebody can tell me I'm wrong, but it is not as though

Metro Council had oversight or there was a big public process. That was renegotiated between MS.

204 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:24:39.489 --> 01:24:59.489

This is a great conversation. Okay, there's a clause here.

205 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:24:59.489 --> 01:25:19.489

It says this, ok, well that means something. So I guess my question is, if our goal was really more to say, hey, we want more of this to go on before rate increases happen so the public understands what's going on and at least can rationalize it. Is that a bad thing?

206 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:25:19.489 --> 01:25:47.199

And why, why would you assume we wouldn't Well I don't think any assumptions were. Trying to go above 6.9 % and the fact that our financial capability for this amendment with the government was based on so we thought it was our obligation to assume.

207 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:25:47.199 --> 01:26:14.109

Which also. As mr. Payer stated that the consent decree is based upon the board authority. So if the board authority changes, right, then.

208 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:26:14.109 --> 01:26:35.169

This case, well, even if it went up, if the board authority changes is that's still an amendment that we would have to go to EPA and go to the cabinet and say, this is the material change, they would definitely consider that, right? And so we would have to do that. So then that would mean for us to remain with the same authority, let's say it's still.

209 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:26:35.169 --> 01:26:55.299

So, if you got a glass, right, the glass is full and the board's at 6.9 and anything above that is the council. If it's now CPI plus one, then now it's two to 4 % and anything above that is council, you all are still now part of our process in, approving our rate making, if that makes sense. You're part of the, you're now become.

210 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:26:55.299 --> 01:27:21.249

Part of the governance and that's now a factor, and that's what not necessarily a denial, but if the board's authority stops here and then we come here and that's not to say NO, it's just to say that you're gonna say NO, it's just to say that you're now part of MSD governance. What I would expect would.

211 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:27:21.249 --> 01:27:41.249

Awareness is that the the judge would haul us in and say, you're in violation of this. Either the EPA would request it or the judge would do

it, either one. The the EPA would would petition the judge and say look this is nonsense. That's the other thing I don't think a lot of people get. It's it's not even like us and the state and us in the EPA, there's a judge now involved. That judge has accepted it.

212 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:27:41.249 --> 01:28:16.179

And we need to convince the judge that everybody's on the same page or not on the same page. So what I suspect would happen is the EPA would signal the judge, the judge would haul everybody in, saying you're in violation of it, you either need to renegotiate or or the the Or we're back at we're in a lawsuit where they're gonna try to take over and we would be in an actual court case where the the outcome could be federal takeover of MSD, which is exactly my point of why I, I think we need to engage more with our federal partners, our federal delegation, Congress and the Senate.

213 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:28:16.179 --> 01:28:35.419

To really work on a relationship with the EPA to get out, to see if we can negotiate a way out of this faster than the next ten years because I, I get they want us to achieve these certain things, but all this comes down to federal takeover of and micromanagement when.

214 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:28:35.419 --> 01:28:51.919

Hello we might say, you know, at this point the way that the current the consent decree is structured, we can't increase the board's, authority without being in violation of the consent decree. Well, I think if Mitrol can either.

215 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:28:51.919 --> 01:29:11.919

If you decrease the board's authority or increase the board's authority, that is a material change, right? We would still have to make a note and go to EPA and the state to say this change has occurred. If it's lower and now Mitrol Council is our other, is part of our governance, then it's.

216 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:29:11.919 --> 01:29:31.989

MsD's board and metro Council who's actually voting for and the threshold is lower, it's not 6.9 anymore. It's CPI plus 1 %. Does that make? So if it's CPI plus one, let's say I don't know, we, the board's authority is still lower, it's gonna that impact, right? Whether you pass it every time.

217 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:29:31.989 --> 01:29:55.989

Name is is or every year we come and and let's say it's just 5 % or something that the board is now asking for. That difference is still something that we're gonna have to come to Metro Council for. You can pass it, but either way it goes, that's still a material change to this and we're all in it yeah you're right. It's a governance it's Yes.

218 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:29:55.989 --> 01:30:15.989

That's correct. That's why I, you know, look I probably said it i'll publicly say it, I don't know which is worse what we have now or federal takeover. I don't see the distinction. Like at this point, we can't sneeze without getting somebody's approval from the federal government and and it's really, I I don't know.

219 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:30:15.989 --> 01:30:35.989

Which is why, and I don't care if it's MSD or if it's LMPD or if it's any other organization as to why such myself and several of my colleagues here have come out very strongly against ever entering into another consent decree for the rest of our lives. I'd rather take it to court because I I think we have we're now.

220 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:30:35.989 --> 01:30:55.989

Now in a spiral that I'm I'm actually with director parrot. I think his caveat is spot on about whether or not we make it through 2035I have NO expectation this will be over at 2035I think this will be a 40 to 50 year consent decree if we're lucky, because there's NO way they will not change move the needle again in ten years.

221 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:30:55.989 --> 01:31:14.068

So unless some massive grant program comes out and we can you know just don't think it's gonna happen, but I've taken away too much time. Thank you, madam chair. Thank you for all of your comments. Council Woman McCraney.

222 "Paula McCraney" (1527230976)

01:31:14.068 --> 01:31:30.039

Thank you, madam chair. Mr. Parrot, thank you and your team for being here. I appreciate your time and this valuable conversation. I want to go back to councilman Reed's request for that comparison and.

223 "Paula McCraney" (1527230976)

01:31:30.039 --> 01:31:49.642

Analysis from you and would like to know, is this information on your website? And if not, could it be a part of your website? And where can I go now to get any type of information that we have talked about today to refer to some of my constituents?

224 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:31:49.642 --> 01:32:11.468

Most of the information that we've talked about today is available on our website, we will make sure that we send pertinent, links et cetera to make sure you can have that. And in terms of what councilman Reed requested is probably gonna be any documents that exist and then if there's any update to those documents we need to do that would be available later down the road.

225 "Paula McCrane" (1527230976)

01:32:11.468 --> 01:32:26.703

Where on your website should I refer? I mean, is there a section like there's a list and I can say go to this and click on this. What is that today?

226 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:32:26.703 --> 01:32:33.145

Where you need to go to get that.

227 "Paula McCrane" (1527230976)

01:32:33.145 --> 01:32:37.545

Thank you so so much. You're welcome.

228 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:32:37.545 --> 01:33:04.149

Thank you chair. It's, 06:15, so I'm not gonna debate my colleague about regulation and why they're in place and why it matters sometimes that we have oversight. But, so how many times in the last five years or let's say ten, have you guys not come in front of metro county.

229 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:33:04.149 --> 01:33:23.899

Council because you didn't have to. Do you know the answer to that? Well, I can tell you that we have been below the 6.9 % in the last five to ten years. We do come before metro council when we have a bond ordinance because we have to get your approval to issue debt.

230 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:33:23.899 --> 01:33:40.309

But how many times when you've been under the 6.9 %, have you kind of said, have we skipped this process? Has that happened multiple times in the last ten years? I would say that, you know, when you talk about this process, we, what we have to do now is we have to send notification.

231 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:33:40.309 --> 01:34:00.309

Whenever the rate increases above 4 %, we have to send notification to Metro council, which we do once the board preliminary approves a budget, there's a 60 day comment period, and we send those letters directly to each council member, and you know, if there's some people that reach out to us and we have a conversation, there's been.

232 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:34:00.309 --> 01:34:26.019

So I think it's really important that we're having these conversations about affordability both with wastewater and utilities across the state and energy and other things as well that were having the same same conversation at the PSC right now. So I think these are important conversations to have. And so.

233 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:34:26.019 --> 01:34:57.909

So whether the, whether the authority is at this rate or at this rate, I think it's I think one of the things I'm hearing is we'd like to be a part of that process. Now we've had just had this conversation about governance and whether you have to go back to the the EPA or the Department of Justice and renegotiate the amendment and all of those sorts of things. But I think some of what I'm hearing here is we're hearing it from our constituents.

234 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:34:57.909 --> 01:35:17.909

And I don't know how many people are are watching this today or you know how it will be reported in the paper tomorrow. But I think having this conversation when affordability is such a big concern is worth having, whether you're asking for a 2.9 % rate increase, a 4.9 rate percent rate increase or it's a.

235 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:35:17.909 --> 01:35:37.909

1.9 % rate increase. So I think we can figure out where that needs to be, that authority needs to be. But I would suggest that we have this conversation on an annual basis, whether you're getting, you know, issuing new bonds or not, we have this conversation on an annual basis. If for NO other reason that we learn something in this room.

236 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:35:37.909 --> 01:35:55.189

And people listening, learn something, and maybe a few of the questions that people are asking about ****, why is my bill going up so much? Maybe some of those questions are answered. So that's all I'll say for now. Thank you all for being here. I appreciate it. Thanks.

237 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:35:55.189 --> 01:36:15.189

Thank you very much and thank you Director Parent for coming here today. I've got a couple questions, so 1st of all, should you not get the requested, how is that gonna affect the time frame towards theoretically getting the 23rd.

238 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:36:15.189 --> 01:36:36.009

Well, currently, our board has the authority to raise the rates to 6.9 %. If this proposed ordinance changes that, and we're set at a lower level lower level, it's gonna cause projects that we've already committed to to be.

239 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:36:36.009 --> 01:36:57.879

The pushback and it's gonna change the timeline, particularly on the largest project we have remaining, because we just won't have the financial capability to go out and borrow money, and it's gonna mess with our metrics, as I mentioned before, our debt service coverage, debt service coverage, and our our our cash on hand, all those metrics.

240 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:36:57.879 --> 01:37:17.879

That guide our we do not want to get downgraded, number one. Number two, I would say that it's mostly gonna be a timeline issue. E.g., if we say a project was gonna be done by 2030, it may shift it to 2033 or if the the.

241 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:37:17.879 --> 01:37:36.889

This is gonna be, if the interest rates go up, and we have to go out to the bond market later than we were going to, that's gonna cost the customers more. But if we get downgraded, one tick on a downgrade is probably gonna cost us ten to \$20 million interest over life of a bond.

242 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:37:36.889 --> 01:37:56.889

Okay, thank you. Another question that's been brought up in my office is you have various rates for residential customers versus industrial customers, would they both be facing the same rate increase? I have my CFO here.

243 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:37:56.889 --> 01:38:09.979

Residential.

244 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:38:09.979 --> 01:38:28.939

Good after good evening Brad Good, chief Financial officer. Many years we have increased commercial industrial residential rates at the same percentage in the fiscal year 27 rate proposal that our board just approved last month. We had.

245 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:38:28.939 --> 01:38:47.239

Rates designed based on cost of service. So residential rates went up 3.9 %. Commercial and industrial rates were adjusted at different percentages based on how those customers contributed costs to our system. Some of the rates went down, some of the rates went up.

246 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:38:47.239 --> 01:39:07.239

Okay, well, our residential rate customers are the ones who are hurting the most by this. So, is it possible to raise the rates to the industrial customers to help offset some of this? So our residential customers are not hurting so much. Industry practice is.

247 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:39:07.239 --> 01:39:37.969

Is to design rates based on cost of service, so customers are paying based on our respective costs to capture and treat the flow that they're contributing to the the system. That's the nationwide, that's the standard practice of how you set rates. Does anybody else do it differently? Not that I'm aware of. All right, well, just on behalf of my constituents I wish you would consider it.

248 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:39:37.969 --> 01:39:55.370

And then my last question is, is a very long range one. So we finally get out from under this consent to Kareem, we've made all the modifications that we need to make, all the changes in the upgrades.

249 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:39:55.370 --> 01:40:15.370

And this is gonna go back to director Parrot. How long is it gonna take to get out of this hole? Cause it's a deep hole. Well, it it's definitely a balance, particularly when you think about, you know, the monies and the focus we've had on the regulatory side.

250 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:40:15.370 --> 01:40:35.370

Our asset management approach, which is how we deal with aging infrastructure, e.g., under this concurrent program, we have a 15 year plan that we have identified and we say we're going to fund and the regulators have to pay for, I mean, approve our 15 year plan. The.

251 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:40:35.370 --> 01:40:58.330

The aging infrastructure is a challenge because it would take us quite a while, even after the consent decree timeline is finished in 2035 to continually invest in aging infrastructure. The one at one example I will give you is our flood pump stations, 16 major flood pump stations.

252 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:40:58.330 --> 01:41:18.330

Built in the 1940s and the 1950s, and they all have critical needs and right now we've only been able to attack one of them, and that's our Patty's run station, that was a \$240000000 project. So we have 15 more to go. So we can only address what we can address.

253 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:41:18.330 --> 01:41:43.450

Address when we can afford to address it and so it's gonna be some time. So what's it gonna look what what do projected rate increases and stuff do you think is gonna look like when we're done with the consent decree and we still have to catch up on all these other things? Well, I think that you know once we complete the consent decree, I mean, I think we we forecasted that we want to be down near.

254 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:41:43.450 --> 01:42:14.900

Thank you. Okay, thank you guys for being here with your detailed information. I really appreciate it. I learned a lot. We need to wrap this up. We have some other business to take care of.

255 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:42:14.900 --> 01:42:38.060

No, Item two on the agenda is being held again.

256 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:42:38.060 --> 01:42:56.090

The next item agenda on the agenda, the 3rd item is an ordinance amending section 50.24 of the Metro coder ordinance to amend the debt service adjustment. I need a motion in a second. Okay, councilman Reed.

257 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:42:56.090 --> 01:43:19.240

We're gonna hold this like a motion to hold place. Okay. Thank you. All the motion second. Okay, we will now move to the board apartments. 1st one is apartment of celebrating to the affordable housing.

258 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:43:19.240 --> 01:43:42.560

Trust fun board term expires 31 December 2028I need a motion in a second, please. Miss Morrow. Oh, Greenberg Administration. What's Donna, it's been six years! Oh Jesus, I'm sorry wrong.

259 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:43:42.560 --> 01:44:02.560

Who's the 1st person? Sarah Brady. Sarah Brady, you can come to the Sarah Brady is filling the seat of the homeless community. She is with the family scholarhouse where she is the president of the family Scholarworks. She.

260 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:44:02.560 --> 01:44:16.550

Manages multi million dollar state and federally funded grants. She has experience with workforce development strategic planning. She has a bachelor of Science and communication from you Aville.

261 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:44:16.550 --> 01:44:32.870

Thank you. Does anyone have any questions for Miss Brady? No questions? Okay. All right. Are we ready to vote on her? All those in favor of her apartment say I, I, any oppositions, the eyes have it. Thank you Miss Brady.

262 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:44:32.870 --> 01:44:54.560

The next item on the agenda is Reappointment of Robert Blurr to the air pollution control District board. Term expires 30 June 20:29 A.M. Motion in a second, please. Okay, miss Catrova, I have to introduce myself every time.

263 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:44:54.560 --> 01:45:11.330

Mr. Blair couldn't be with us tonight. He had an emergency with his child, but his supervisor Flannery is here to speak for him. Robert Blair is the RN with the, with you Avail.

264 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:45:11.330 --> 01:45:31.330

Out of Metro Council District 18. He has a master's bachelor's and Associate of Science in nursing, and is an adjunct professor at Galen College. Good evening, I'm Flan Ryanial. I'm the acting director of the

air pollution control District and mr. Billier apologizes, but is back to school time and he had a a.

265 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:45:31.330 --> 01:45:55.840

The School conflict tonight, so he apologizes for not being here. I'm sure the previous MSD was a little enlightening position? Yes, absolutely, ok. No. Councilman Herndon. Thank you madam chairman. I just want to thank you and everybody else here. You've stepped forward to serve your community by being on.

266 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:45:55.840 --> 01:46:23.390

Forcing commissions. Thank you for that. And you've endured an hour and 20 min of other stuff important and necessary conversation, but just want to thank you for sitting through that as well. Thank you. Okay, NO other comments or questions, are those in favor of her apartments say I, I, any opposition? Thank you. The next two we will do together, the reop.

267 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:46:23.390 --> 01:46:40.850

Reapportment of Michelle Gordonner to the anti displacement commission. Term expires 26 June 2029, and the reapportment of Terrance Elliott to the anti displacement commission term expires 26 June 2029. Any second, please?

268 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:46:40.850 --> 01:47:00.850

Okay, miss Cato Rooke tomorrow Greenberg Administration. Michelle Gardner is a disabled senior that lives in the anti displacement area who wants to give back. They live in metro. She lives in Metro council District four and Terrence Elliott is in Metro Council District six. He is a Salone owner. He is the community.

269 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:47:00.850 --> 01:47:08.930

He advocate eager to serve, and he lives in the area for the boundaries.

270 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:47:08.930 --> 01:47:25.160

Would you like to say anything? I'm just glad to be here and just be glad to be reappointed. Reappointed. I would like to I'm glad I'm here. I just want to say hi to everyone.

271 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:47:25.160 --> 01:47:45.160

Yes, I'm glad to be reappointed to advocate for people that can advocate for themselves. Okay. Say I, I, in the opposition, the asset. Thank you. Okay.

272 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:47:45.160 --> 01:48:05.160

The, next ones will be together. The reappointment of Sharon Bond to the Board of Zoning adjustment term expires 30 June of 2029, and the

reapartment of Merlin Louis to the board of zoning adjustment. Term expires 30 June 2029I need a motion and assign.

273 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:48:05.160 --> 01:48:26.590

Second, please. Thank you, Miss. Greenberg Administration. Sharon Bond is in Metro District number five represents the planning commission per the ordinance. She is retired. She is a former chief of civil works planning.

274 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:48:26.590 --> 01:48:46.590

Program and project management division of the Louisville District Corps of engineers. She is involved in the community and her sorority and has been a committed member. Marilyn Lewis is in district 19, retired civil engineer with the US Army Corps of engineers. Miss Lewis is a professional engineer and is registered in Tennessee.

275 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:48:46.590 --> 01:48:55.130

And a member of the Society of American military Engineers and the Kentucky society of professional engineers.

276 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:48:55.130 --> 01:49:15.130

Would you ladies like to say anything? Just like to say we appreciate the opportunity for consideration to serve continue to serve on the board of zoning adjustment. I appreciate the honor of serving on Boza and being a liaison to the planning commission. So, again, thanks for your consideration.

277 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:49:17.510 --> 01:49:37.510

Yes. Thank you Miss Lewis? I would echo what Miss Bond said. I appreciate the opportunity to serve on the board of zoning adjustment and I'm willing to give the time to that. Yeah, just as the chair of planning and zoning, I actually.

278 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:49:37.510 --> 01:49:50.485

Watch Bozo meetings sometimes and so I just wanted to say thank you all to, for doing it. It's, it's, it's hard work and it's a lot of work and so thank you all for, for being willing. Thank you, sir. Thank you.

279 "Paula McCraney" (1527230976)

01:49:50.485 --> 01:50:00.029

Okay, Adam chairwoman. Yeah I just have a quick. Who was that?

280 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:50:00.029 --> 01:50:02.543

Yes ma'am.

281 "Paula McCraney" (1527230976)

01:50:02.543 --> 01:50:24.109

Thank you for recognizing me. I do too want to say that that is hard work. I often attend the Boza meetings and I watch both of these ladies and they take their task and responsibility very serious and I think they do a great job in asking the right questions, so I appreciate their willingness to continue in that role. So thank you ladies.

282 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:50:24.109 --> 01:50:44.440

Thank you, ma'am. Thank you. Thank you. I know it's pretty far away to come in here, but I appreciate you coming in and serving on boza. It's, you know, these, anything related to planning commission is particularly in our area. Like it's it's always seems to be super controversial issue.

283 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:50:44.440 --> 01:51:12.670

Thank you. Thank you. All those in favor of the appointments say I, I, in the oppositions? The eyes haven't. Thank you. Thank you. Okay, items team 1112, and 13 will, will all be together.

284 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:51:12.670 --> 01:51:32.890

The item number ten is reappointment of David Green to the greater Louisville lodging Management District Board. Term expires 1 May 2027. The next one is reappointment of Jamie Capacisano to the greater Louisville logic Management district board. Term expires 1 May 2029.

285 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:51:32.890 --> 01:51:52.890

Item number twelve Reappointment of Leslie Schaefer to the greater Louisville lodging Management District Board. Term expires 1 May 2029. Item number 13, Reapportment of Andrew Blighen to the greater Louisville Lodging Management District Board Term expires 1 May 2029.

286 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:51:52.890 --> 01:52:15.010

Adding a motion in a second, please. Second. Okay, thank you Miss Katura. Greenberg Administration. David Green is filling the seat for properties of 150 rooms or more. He is with white lodging districts white lodging services excuse me. David has 30 plus years of hospitality experience.

287 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:52:15.010 --> 01:52:35.900

She is skilled with organizational planning, I think that should say he. Organizational planning and execution, proficient in developing and realizing sales goals through plans and actions that address the market share growth. He has expertise in contract negotiation, developing sales growth. He is skilled in all aspects of the hotel business.

288 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:52:35.900 --> 01:52:55.880

Jamie Campasano, who is virtual, lives in district nine. She is in the C 450 and more. She is the director of interior design, VP of operations, and HR for Zyo. Zio co developed a six story hotel with a hundred and 70 rooms.

289 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:52:55.880 --> 01:53:15.880

Andrew Bleedan is Metro Council District eight. Executive of Butchertown Market and block properties. He has been in real estate since 1980. He specializes in bringing properties in disrepair back to life and has been recognized as a top innovator for adaptive reuse of real estate.

290 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:53:15.880 --> 01:53:19.730

Leslie Schaefer.

291 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:53:19.730 --> 01:53:36.230

Is the general manager for aloft Lovel East? And I believe that is everybody, correct? Is that all of them? That was all four. Anyone in the chambers?

292 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:53:36.230 --> 01:53:42.386

Yes.

293 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:53:47.123 --> 01:54:12.230

I'm David Green. I'm Andy Bleedan. So council has been backed up tonight and then an effort to keep things I know the council's been backed up tonight in an effort to keep things flowing. I have NO questions or comments. I like you. Well, unlike David.

294 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:54:12.230 --> 01:54:32.230

We're gonna be here for a while. Now, I want to say thank you guys so much. The mayor called me up and he said, hey, I want you to be on a board and I said, Great, fantastic. And he said, well, do you want to know what the board is? And I said, I don't care. I've never been named to a board that's fantastic, but it's an honor to serve, and it's a great board.

295 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:54:32.230 --> 01:54:54.880

So thank you guys, thank you all very much. Thank you Mr. Sana for representing district nine, and your willingness to serve. There's a reason mr. Bleedan has never been nominated for a board before. I'm not sure why it happened this time and I might let it go through, but it's not entirely sure entirely sure and I'm I apologize.

296 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:54:54.880 --> 01:55:15.540

For you having to wait for an hour and a half, but I I'm I'm happy that that that Andy had to wait for an hour and a half so he could, so he could be here with us. Thank you. And miss Capasano is virtual. I'm sure everybody is the process. Miss Capasano, would you like to say anything?

297 "Jamie Campisano" (876449792)

01:55:15.540 --> 01:55:44.945

No, I just it's it's been an honor to be amongst the people of this board for the last year. It's you know like David and Andy, people who care so much about Louisville and not only, you know, getting heads in beds, but making locals enjoy all the festivities and things that we're bringing to this great city and I've really, I've learned a lot. I've loved the company and it would be an honor to serve again.

298 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:55:45.590 --> 01:56:05.590

Thank you. Okay, so all those in favor of these apartments say I, I, any oppositions, the eyes haven't. Thank you. Thank you. Thank you. Yeah, thanks. The next two will be joined together. Apartment of Marina Gonzalez to the police merit board term.

299 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:56:05.590 --> 01:56:07.880

1 June 2028.

300 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:56:07.880 --> 01:56:27.880

The appointment of Matthew back to the police merit board term expires 1 June 2029I need a motion in 2nd. Okay, miss Katura. Greenberg Administration. Marina Gonzalez is out of metro council distri.

301 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:56:27.880 --> 01:56:47.880

23 and is the head of global inclusion and belonging, governance and compliance with FIS. She is people centered talent and organizational development leader, skilled with navigating across HR technology and business teams to bring clarity, alignment and large scale initiatives. Matthew Beck.

302 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:56:47.880 --> 01:57:04.520

Is out of Metro Council District 16 and is an entrepreneur and marketing professional attended both Middle Tennessee State University of UVL Skill and Ulval, and Skilled and Marketing analytics, strategic planning, Business development, Web designs.

303 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:57:04.520 --> 01:57:24.520

What did you go to? I went to Middle Dennessee State University and the University of Louisville. Okay. Any comments, any questions? I, I'll keep it quick. I have a five year old who starts kindergarten tomorrow, so she's anxious for me to get home and and put her to bed, but I I appreciate everybody's work.

304 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:57:24.520 --> 01:57:41.630

Yeah, and I learned a lot about MSD tonight a lot I didn't know, so I I feel informed and I also want to thank councilmen Reed for all the work you do in prospect. I I watch our prospect city council meetings and see

all the work that you do and when you're in attendance and I appreciate that.

305 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:57:41.630 --> 01:58:01.280

Yeah, 1st of all I commend you for actually sitting through a prospect city council meeting that shows somebody that is really involved in in in local government, so thank you very much and I take it that your dad out there. Yes, your dad's a great man. Thank you. Thank you. Thank you.

306 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:58:01.280 --> 01:58:17.150

Did you like to say anything? Just thank you for the opportunity to be able to serve. Okay. No, thank, thank you guys for serving. I didn't think I was in the queue. Thank you. Okay.

307 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:58:17.150 --> 01:58:37.150

If we're ready to vote on these, are those in favors say I, I, any oppositions, the eyes have it. Thank you. Thank you. Okay, the next one will be handled singlely and forgive me if I mispronounced this name and Dereka Tibo.

308 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:58:37.150 --> 01:58:53.600

Naderika Tabo. I was gonna say tabo. The appointment of Naderica Tabo, correct? Okay. Miss Tabo.

309 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:58:53.600 --> 01:59:13.600

For the Riverport authority board term expires 31 July 2027I need to watch 1 s. Thank you. Mr. Boe is not a stranger to Metro council. She is the president and executive director of Lumed. She comes out of Metro council District 22. She has.

310 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:59:13.600 --> 01:59:32.150

30 plus years in leading large scale operational capital and strategic initiatives. Prior to Lumed, she was a senior director for clinical effectiveness. Also, she was the director of design and construction plus enterprise program management. She is the perfect fit for this board.

311 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:59:32.150 --> 01:59:52.150

Oh, sorry. Administration everyone. I just wanted to say thank you for the opportunity. It's Naderica Tibo, and you pronounce it the way 99 % of the people do so you were right along with most people.

312 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:59:52.150 --> 01:59:58.940

Day but it is, yeah. It's my husband, not me but yeah so just I wanna thank.

313 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

01:59:58.940 --> 02:00:18.940

I'm loving the economic development and all the work that we're doing in Lumed, and so this gives me an opportunity to extend it to the south side of town, and looking forward to it. So thanks for the opportunity.

314 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

02:00:18.940 --> 02:00:21.290

Thank you, thank you.

315 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

02:00:21.290 --> 02:00:39.860

Thank you ma'am. I agree, a positive and and consistent influence in district four and your your term expires on my birthday in 2028, so it was meant to be. All right. Thank you. Okay. Are those in favor of.

316 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

02:00:39.860 --> 02:00:59.860

This apartment, say I, I, in the opposition, the eyes have it. Thank you. Thank you all. The last two will be together the reapartment of Brian Fonk to the waste management District 109 board term expires 22 June 2028.

317 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

02:00:59.860 --> 02:01:20.230

The next one is reappointment of Kevin Gibson to the waste management District 109 board. Term expires 22 June 2028I need a motion and a second. Okay, Miss Greenberg Administration. Brian Funk also is NO stranger to Metro Council and is out of district.

318 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

02:01:20.230 --> 02:01:40.230

Direct 24 is an independent and mr. Funk was the assistant director of the Metro Department of Public Works until 2022. Kevin Gibson is a regionalization director, very involved in the community, experienced in commercial and development projects within the civil and environmental.

319 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

02:01:40.230 --> 02:01:50.420

Engineering industry, experience with budget development and control environmental practices and a dedicated member of our city.

320 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

02:01:50.420 --> 02:02:10.420

Does anyone have any questions for mr. Funk? Mr. Funk, do you have any comments you'd like to make? Sure, just very briefly, as mentioned, I was a former assistant director of public works for metro government until of my retirement. Prior to that, I've been in the, the, the public works and.

321 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

02:02:10.420 --> 02:02:13.700

Parts of recreation business for.

322 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

02:02:13.700 --> 02:02:32.840

Oh I'd say what, total of 30, about 40 years now prior to retirement and a lot of that was overseeing and managing various solid waste functions both as a managing employees as well as managing contractors. So, this is a great board and look forward to serving again.

323 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

02:02:32.840 --> 02:02:50.030

Last but not least, I appreciate your perseverance and thanks for for being willing to serve. Thank you. Thank you.

324 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

02:02:50.030 --> 02:03:08.810

You're ready to take a vote on miss Funk. Mr. Fonk, thank you. Oh, sorry. Oh, and mr. Gibson, all those in favor, say I, I. In the oppositions? The eyes have it. Thank you for your. Really appreciate it. All right.

325 "Harward, Sonya" (1819394048)

02:03:08.810 --> 02:03:28.000

Okay, that concludes our meeting. No further business, the meeting is adjourned. Thank you. Hopefully Alpha will be back on the 18th. Hopefully Alpha will be back on the 18th. Hopefully. Hopefully.