



---

## Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

### Report to the Committee

---

To: Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee  
Thru: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Officer  
From: Priscilla Bowman, Historic Preservation Specialist  
Date: September 1, 2023 *SD*

---

**Case No:** 23-COA-0154  
**Classification:** Committee Review

#### GENERAL INFORMATION

**Property Address:** 1426 Cherokee Road

**Applicant:** Ellyn Schill  
1426 Cherokee Road  
Louisville, KY 40204  
(310) 801-4742  
[Generic018@yahoo.com](mailto:Generic018@yahoo.com)

**Owner:** Matthew Carrico  
1426 Cherokee Road  
Louisville, KY 40204  
(502) 802-1554  
[matt@boonevilledrugs.com](mailto:matt@boonevilledrugs.com)

**Estimated Project Cost:** \$15,000

#### Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to replace three doors on the carriage house's south elevation, which faces the alley. Specifically, two previously replaced garage doors on the west (left) side of the elevation are proposed to be replaced as well as one historic wood carriage style garage door on the east (right) side of the elevation. The two larger openings on the west side of the alley façade proposed will each be 11' x 7', Clopay solid 20 panel steel garage doors. The smaller door opening on the east side of the alley façade will be a 9' x 7', Clopay solid 16 panel steel garage door.

## **Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application**

The application was received on June 12, 2023. Staff contacted the applicant on June 21, 2023 and continued communication to discuss alternative door styles. On July 14, 2023, the applicant confirmed they wished to continue with the original doors proposed, and the application was determined to be complete and classified as requiring Committee level review that same day.

The case is scheduled to be heard by the Cherokee Triangle Architectural Committee Review (ARC) on September 6, 2023 at 4:30pm in the Metro Development Center (444 S. 5th Street, Room 101).

## **FINDINGS**

### **Guidelines**

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Door** and **Garage**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

### **Site Context/ Background**

The property is located on the south side of Cherokee Road, three lots east of the intersection of Cherokee Road and Willow Avenue. The property is zoned R4 and is located within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The main home is a circa 1912, two-and-a-half story, High Style Arts and Crafts, masonry structure, designed by architects Loomis & Hartman.

On September 9, 2022, staff approved a COA (22-COA-0215) for the replacement of a historic wood carriage house door with a new, similar wood carriage house door facing the rear yard on the north elevation of the carriage house. On June 24, 2021, staff approved a COA (21-COA-0109) for the replacement of three sets of exterior rear doors on the primary house.

### **Conclusions**

The carriage house is a contributing building in the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District. The primary house was designed by architects Loomis & Hartman. It is unclear if this carriage house was built contemporaneously or after, but it was constructed by 1928 at the latest (Sanborn Fire Insurance Map). It was designed to be subordinate to and compliment the architectural style of the primary house. Prior to District Designation in 1975, the two westernmost (left) garage doors were replaced. The door openings were modified to allow for the current garage doors. However, the historic door to the east (right) remains.

As the two westernmost (left) doors have already been replaced, they can be replaced again using the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District Design Guidelines for **Garage**. The guidelines simply state that "Surface area of door broken up by articulated panels or

stiles and rails to reduce scale.” The proposed Clopay solid 20 panel door is broken up with articulated panels. Staff would prefer a garage door that better complements the style of the carriage house; however, these doors do meet the Garage guidelines.

Since the historic carriage style door remains, the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District Design Guidelines for **Door** are utilized for its proposed replacement. This door is a classic carriage style door with three distinct panels featuring a chevron patterned wood and 4-lite windows. Furthermore, this door opening has not been modified for modern garage doors. The applicant proposes to lower the door opening in order to accommodate the proposed new door. The proposed new garage door would be a solid 16 panel steel door to match those proposed to the west. It would not replicate or compliment the design of the historic door it is proposed to replace. Thus, the proposal does not meet Door Guidelines D1, D4, and D6. Staff has held the replacement of other historic garage doors in the District to the same standard. For these reasons, staff recommends denial of the application.

The applicant can reapply to replace the two, previously replaced doors the on the west (left) side of the south elevation of the carriage house with those proposed. However, the remaining historic door and opening to the east (right) of these shall have a replacement door design that complements the architecture of the building.

#### **RECOMMENDATION**

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **denied**.



Priscilla Bowman  
Historic Preservation Specialist

09/01/2023

Date

# DOOR

## Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

|           | Guideline                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Finding | Comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|-----------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>D1</b> | Do not alter the character of entrances by either removing historic elements or through the addition of elements for which there is no historic precedent.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | -       | The wood carriage house door toward the east side of the alley façade is a historic carriage house door. The new modern solid panel steel garage door is not a historically or architecturally appropriate replacement.                                                                                                     |
| <b>D2</b> | Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | +       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| <b>D3</b> | Use historical, pictorial, and physical documentation when undertaking the reconstruction of a missing entrance or porch feature. If there is not sufficient information to determine the original design, a new design should be prepared that is compatible with the architectural character of the building and the district. Conjectural or falsely-historical designs are not appropriate. | NA      | There is a historic door to use as evidence.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| <b>D4</b> | Use only those replacement doors that duplicate the design, proportion, and arrangement of paneling and glazing of the original.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | -       | The historic wood carriage house door to the east has a character-defining carriage style configuration. The proposed replacement door is a solid 16 panel steel garage door. The proposed solid panel garage door does not duplicate the design, arrangement of paneling, and glazing of the existing carriage house door. |
| <b>D5</b> | Do not replace historic double leaf doors with a single door.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | NA      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| <b>D6</b> | Do not alter original openings to accommodate stock doors.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | -       | The door openings to the two replacement garage doors have been previously modified by lowering the head height approximately 18". The opening to the east has not been modified. However, this proposal would modify it to match those to the west.                                                                        |
| <b>D7</b> | Install only screen doors or storm doors that are simple with a narrow-frame design that enables the inner door to be seen. Metal screen and storm doors should be painted or finished to match the inner door.                                                                                                                                                                                 | NA      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| <b>D8</b> | Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original doors or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grilles should retract out of                                                                                                                                                                                                     | NA      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |

|            |                                                                                                                                                                                      |     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
|------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|            | sight during business hours and preferably be mounted inside the glass. Painting security bars an unobtrusive color is recommended.                                                  |     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| <b>D9</b>  | Differentiate between primary and secondary doors, using the detailing of the doors or the articulation of the frame.                                                                | NA  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| <b>D10</b> | Do not add vestibules to primary facades unless there is a historic precedent. Such additions alter the character, proportion, and massing of the façade.                            | NA  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| <b>D11</b> | Do not create new entrances on facades that can be seen from a public way.                                                                                                           | NA  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| <b>D12</b> | Replacement of non-original, non-historic doors with new doors that are appropriate to the period and style of the building and are the size of the original opening is recommended. | +/- | As the two westernmost doors have already been replaced and their openings modified, they can be replaced again. While this guideline recommends that a more appropriate door be used, it's not a requirement, and it's not a standard to which the District has been held. |

# GARAGE

## Design Guideline Checklist

|     |                                           |
|-----|-------------------------------------------|
| +   | Meets Guidelines                          |
| -   | Does Not Meet Guidelines                  |
| +/- | Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted |
| NA  | Not Applicable                            |
| NSI | Not Sufficient Information                |

| Design Element   | Building Feature | Finding | Approved                                      | Comments |
|------------------|------------------|---------|-----------------------------------------------|----------|
| <b>Location</b>  |                  | NA      | Rear-yard location                            |          |
|                  |                  | NA      | Align with adjacent secondary structures      |          |
|                  |                  | NA      | Use to define and enclose rear yard           |          |
|                  |                  | NA      | Minimize paving                               |          |
| <b>Materials</b> | Walls            | NA      | Horizontal wood siding (3" or 4" exposure)    |          |
|                  |                  | NA      | Board and batten siding                       |          |
|                  |                  | NA      | Brick                                         |          |
|                  |                  | NA      | Stucco over frame or concrete block           |          |
|                  |                  | NA      | Cast stone, molded concrete block             |          |
|                  |                  | NA      | Aluminum and vinyl siding (3" or 4" exposure) |          |
|                  |                  | NA      | No painted concrete block.                    |          |
|                  |                  | NA      | No un-painted concrete block.                 |          |
|                  |                  | NA      | No T-111 plywood.                             |          |

|                       |            |     |                                                                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|-----------------------|------------|-----|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                       | Roof       | NA  | Asphalt, fiberglass, wood, vinyl, or slate shingles.                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|                       |            | NA  | Metal roofing                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|                       |            | NA  | Half-round or Ogee gutters                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|                       |            | NA  | Approved Gable-end element                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|                       |            | NA  | No membrane roofing on sloped roofs.                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| <b>Building Forms</b> | Main Block | NA  | Simple, rectangular, prismatic volumes                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|                       |            | NA  | Ell-shaped buildings                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|                       |            | NA  | Slightly-projecting bays                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|                       |            | NA  | Cantilevered, second floors                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|                       |            | NA  | No overly-elaborate volumes                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|                       | Roof       | NA  | Simple gable roofs (6-in-12 minimum slope)                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|                       |            | NA  | Hipped, shed, and flat roofs with parapets                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|                       |            | NA  | Intersecting gables                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|                       |            | NA  | Overhanging eaves                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|                       |            | NA  | Half-round gutters                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|                       |            | NA  | No low-pitched gable roofs (less than 6-in-12 slope)                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|                       |            | NA  | No flush eaves                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|                       |            | NA  | No roofs without gutters                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| <b>Openings</b>       | Garage     | +   | Single-car openings                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|                       | Doors      | +/- | Surface area of door broken up by articulated panels or stiles and rails to reduce scale | The two western most doors have been previously replaced. The proposed Clopay solid 20 panel door is broken up with articulated panels. Staff would prefer a garage door that better complements the style of the carriage house. |
|                       |            | +   | No double and triple doors                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|                       |            | +   | No flush garage doors (they accentuate the large size of the openings)                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|                       | Windows    | NA  | Use window openings to break up wall surface                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|                       |            | NA  | Security grills installed on the inside face of the windows                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |