



Downtown Development Review Overlay

Report of the Urban Design Administrator & Staff to the Committee

Case No: 17DDRO1013
Classification: Non- Expedited

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 101 W. Muhammad Ali Blvd.

Owner: Girish B. Patel
Shiv Krupa Motel Inc.
2130 Club Vista Place
Louisville, KY 402045
502-216-6451
502-644-1000
Girish8386@yahoo.com

Applicant: Same as Owner

Architect: Benjamin J. Van Eps, AIA
Geoffrey H. Butler, Architects
319 North Main, Suite 200
Springfield, MO
417-521-6114
Ben@brpae.com

Estimated Cost: \$ not provided

DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT:

The applicant requests approval for modifications to the existing building to allow for the conversion of the existing building from an office building to a Holiday Inn Hotel. Primary modifications include removal and replacement of exterior finish and cladding elements, addition of a fifth story, as well as a restaurant addition on the ground floor. The restaurant addition will be located at the corner intersection of Muhammad Ali Boulevard and First Street. The building will have a total building area of 44,956sf, and will contain 94 hotel rooms. The one-story restaurant addition extends the southeast corner of the structure to the southeast corner of the site and is composed of brick veneer with a large glass storefront. Pedestrian access to the restaurant's entry is provided via stairs at the sidewalk along Muhammad Ali Boulevard.

Two existing surface parking lots located to the north and west of the property will remain and be used for hotel parking. A new curb cut is requested to be created in front of the building at Muhammad Ali Boulevard to allow for vehicular drop off in front of the hotel lobby.

New façade elements include fiber cement panels along the ground floor with a transition to EIFS on the upper levels. The ground level is accented with a combination of brick, fiber cement panels, and glazing. Materials transition to EIFS and glazing at the upper levels. Throughout the façade, elements are arranged in vertical bands and include variations in material color and thickness.

COMMUNICATIONS WITH APPLICANT; COMPLETE APPLICATION

Overlay staff met with the applicant team to generally discuss the project, guidelines, and process in November 2017. Develop Louisville received an application for an Overlay Permit on December 14, 2017. Overlay staff provided initial comment regarding compliance with the guidelines. A revised set of drawings was submitted on January 30, 2018 at which time the application was determined to be substantially complete and classified as requiring Non-Expedited Review by the Urban Design Administrator.

FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

The following Principles and Design guidelines are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration:

Principle 1: Site Planning, Principle 2: Building Massing, Principle 3: Building to Context, Principle 4: Building to Pedestrian, Principle 5: Parking, Vehicular Use, and Accessibility, Principle 6: Open Space, Principle 7: Street and Sidewalk Character, Principle 8: Signage, and Principle 9: Public Art.

The report of the Overlay Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report. The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context

Adjacent and near to the subject property along 101 W. Muhammad Ali are a series of one, two, and three story masonry buildings constructed in the late 1950s. Materials seen on this block are primarily masonry and brick. The J. Graham Brown School is located to the south of the property at 546 S. First Street. The school building has minimal fenestration and a sculptural masonry base. To the east of the property, across S. First Street, is an area of green space adjacent to the overpass of I-65. Setbacks along First Street vary, with The Brown School built directly on the property line, whereas 444 S. First Street has a setback from the sidewalk with a landscaped area in front of the building's entrance.

Background

The existing structure located on the site was constructed in 1979 and was previously occupied as an office building. In terms of style the building has some elements of the style known as "Brutalist" – generally characterized by simple massing, strong and stark design elements often rendered in simple materials such as masonry and concrete. Design elements often emphasized underlying structure as well as inventive elements such as cast in place sun screens. The existing building has some of these traits such as top-heavy massing, the use of slender base supports, and the sculptural use of concrete. The architect of this particular building is unknown. Per Metro Preservation Officer, Cynthia Elmore, the building at this site is not eligible for listing on the National Register due to being an underage resource that does not appear to meet exceptional significance (Criteria Consideration G of the NRHP).

Conclusions

With the proposed structure's increased height and new corner addition, a stronger presence is created at the corner of S. First Street and Muhammad Ali Boulevard. The restaurant addition extends to the property line at the site's southeastern corner and further defines the building's base and improves the building's relationship to the street and pedestrian. Existing green space is lost with the addition of the restaurant. An opportunity to mitigate this loss and increase compliance with Principle 6 – Open Space and Principle 7: Street and Sidewalk Character would be to incorporate the addition of street trees or screening of the surface parking lot. The

pedestrian experience along the northeast corner is improved at this intersection; however, the opportunity to continue to engage pedestrians further down S. First Street and Muhammad Ali Blvd. is limited. The curb cut for vehicular drop off creates a break in the sidewalk and disrupts pedestrian access. Compliance could be improved with Principle 4: Building to Pedestrian by further developing the hotel's street level elements. BP2 reads Articulate the building façade to provide an engaging pedestrian experience with design elements such as open shop-fronts or arcades, multiple entries, merchandising and display windows, street front open space with artwork or furniture, awnings, signage, and light fixtures. In some instances raised landscaped beds may be appropriate. As a general rule 50 percent of the wall surface at the sidewalk level should be transparent, utilizing glazing that is not highly tinted or reflective. These types of elements are currently not proposed. The lobby entrance and overall façade design could be refined to show more detailing and variations in material, and encourage pedestrian engagement with a more prominent entrance point.

The buildings along this block were constructed in the late 1950's and have similarities in materials (masonry), massing, and elements of vertical façade organization. With the redesign of the building's façade, some unique stylistic qualities of the building are lost. However, the new design is generally compatible with the character of nearby buildings in massing and scale. EIFS, especially in large surface areas is not fully compatible with this corridor of downtown.

Recommendation

Considering the information furnished Staff finds that the proposal substantially complies with the applicable Principles and Guidelines of the Overlay and **recommends approval** of the Overlay Permit with the following conditions:

- 1. Review based on drawing set dated January 16, 2018. Any changes to the design drawings to be submitted to Overlay Staff for review.**
- 2. Final signage shall be submitted to Staff for review and approval prior to installation.**
- 3. Applicant to improve compliance with BP2 along the South Façade and ground level of hotel to provide an engaging pedestrian experience. Applicant encouraged to incorporate design elements, including but not limited to multiple entries, merchandising and display windows, street front open space with artwork or furniture, awnings, signage, raised landscaped beds and light fixtures.**
- 4. Final streetscape design elements shall be submitted to staff for final review and approval.**
- 5. Curb cuts and vehicular access shall be designed in conformance with the Access Management Standards and Design manual within the Land Development Code and appropriate Metro Agencies.**

Date

Burcum Keeton
Architectural Projects Coordinator

Date

David R. Marchal, AIA
Urban Design Administrator

Principle 1-Site Planning

Design Guideline Checklist

Objective

Each downtown site lies with a specific neighborhood, Adjacent to specific traffic corridors and intersections, And may be adjacent to areas of different intensity of Development; may be near public open spaces; may be near historic and/or significant structures; and may contain historic and/or significant structures. These basic issues should be evaluated for the project site and considered at the earliest stages of concept development.

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
SP1	Building placement and orientation. It is intended that Downtown develop as an urban environment with a consistent, animated street wall which defines a physical area that is friendly, active, and safe for the public. Generally speaking new construction should build to the front property line and extend the width of the property. Corner properties should be built to both frontages. Properties with 3 or more frontages should give consideration to the relative character of the frontages and focus development accordingly-primary consideration should be given to orientation toward major thoroughfares.	+/-	(+) New construction of addition at corner is built to both frontages (+/-) street wall is animated along east elevation but lacking along south elevation
SP2	Public space. Setbacks from the property line may be considered provided the setback area is developed as a Public Open Space and amenity or as a location for exterior activity related to ground floor usage of the buildings, such as outdoor dining or retail. Consideration should be given for providing Public Open Space on sites that align with other significant urban elements such as open spaces or vistas, significant neighboring structures or public institutions, axis or terminus or the street grid.	NA	None proposed
SP3	Preservation of Existing Structures. Existing structures that are identified locally or nationally as having significant historic character should be retained and incorporated into new development. Modifications to these structures shall be in accordance with the latest edition of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. No application to demolish these structures shall be approved unless the applicant is able to demonstrate that: a) rehabilitation of the structure or its replacement will have a greater positive impact on the economic vitality of the district than preserving the existing structure and that the construction of the new structure would not be possible or economically feasible without the demolition of the existing structure; or b) that the applicant cannot obtain a reasonable economic return from the property or structure unless the existing structure is demolished. Development with the West Main Street local preservation district shall be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission.	NA	Noncontributing building as classified by Metro Historic Preservation Officer.. Building is not proposed to be demolished
SP4	Site Access. Careful consideration should be given to vehicular site access, on-site circulation, parking, and sufficient access for storage and collection of waste and recycled materials to minimize impacts to the street wall, pedestrian environment, and the streetscape. Consideration should also be given for other types of access such as pedestrian, public transit, and bicycle.	+/NSI	(+) Bike racks shown (NSI) dumpsters not shown (NA) Existing parking and site circulation to remain undisturbed except for curb cut and drive from Muhammad Ali Blvd. See Principle 5 for comments related to curb cuts

Principle 2-Building Massing

Design Guideline Checklist

Objective

*Develop an architectural concept and compose the major building elements and massing to reinforce desirable urban features in the surrounding area and district.
Compose the massing of the building to create transition to the height, bulk, and scale of development in nearby less intensive zones.*

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
BM1	Arrange the mass of the building in response to the following as applicable: a) Distinct and noteworthy characteristics of the district/neighborhood: b) Adjacent landmark or noteworthy building: c) major public entity or institution nearby: d) neighboring buildings that have employed distinctive and effective massing compositions: e) Public views and vistas: f) Potentially negative micro-climate issues such as extensive shadows and urban wind effect.	+	Façade massing is broken down vertically with the use of detailing, change in materials, and color. At addition, base is expanded and helps to further define building base.
BM2	Compose the massing of the building to relate strongly to nearby buildings and create a transition to the height, bulk, and scale of development in nearby less-intensive zones. Buildings on zone edges should be developed in a manner that creates a step in perceived height, bulk, and scale between the development potential of the adjacent zones. Factors to consider in analyzing potential height, bulk, and scale impacts include: a) distance from a less intensive district edge: b) differences in development standards between abutting neighborhood: c) type and amount of separation between districts, i.e. property line, alley or, street.	+	
BM3	Design a well-proportioned and unified building. Compose the massing and organize the interior and exterior spaces to create a well-proportioned building that exhibits a coherent architectural concept. Design the architectural elements and finish details to create a unified building, so that all components appear integral to the whole.	+	Façade shows a coherent architectural concept consistent with chain's branding.
BM4	The building composition should include a well-defined base at the pedestrian level that fits well into its context. As a general minimum the base should be 2 to 3 stories.	+	Base is well defined with materials and restaurant addition.
BM5	To allow adequate light and air to reach the street level, high rise buildings (over 14 stories) should generally: a) be located about 100 feet from other high-rise buildings within the same block: b) have upper stories which are progressively narrower; the higher the story, the narrower.	NA	
BM6	Rooftops should not look cluttered from any pedestrian vantage point. All mechanical or utility equipment should be well-integrated into the overall design.	+	

Principle 3-Building to Context

Design Guideline Checklist

Objective

A certain amount of architectural diversity is expected in any downtown. However, buildings should be “good neighbors” by relating well to the common patterns of windows, entrances, cornice lines and column spacing around them and reinforcing the overall character of their immediate surroundings. Develop an architectural concept and compose the major building elements to reinforce desirable urban features in the surrounding context and district.

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
BC1	Be compatible with the general character of nearby buildings in terms of façade organization, materials, finishes, scale of detail, and respecting established horizontal and vertical elements and spacing in the nearby context such as cornice lines and pier/column spacing.	+	
BC2	Reinforce the character of nearby buildings having historic or architectural significance by developing designs that respect established cornice lines, horizontal and vertical façade organization, and massing of historic buildings in context.	+	Vertical elements and masonry materials seen in nearby buildings are reinforced with proposed façade changes
BC3	Follow the rehabilitation standards in the latest edition of the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation whenever historic or architecturally significant structures are to be altered, expanded, or when new construction is to occur adjacent to such structures.	NA	Noncontributing structure

Principle 4-Building to Pedestrian

Design Guideline Checklist

Objective

People should have strong visual connections to buildings as a strong building-to-pedestrian relationship helps make downtown feel more inviting and active 24 hours a day. Therefore develop the street level of the building's exterior to create safe, inviting, and active environments and spaces to engage pedestrians. These environments are defined by the used that occur within them, physical space for them to occur, and articulation of the physical surroundings.

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
BP1	Where sidewalk width is limited consider setting portions of the building back slightly to create spaces conducive to pedestrian-oriented activities.	NA	
BP2	Articulate the building façade to provide an engaging pedestrian experience with design elements such as open shop-fronts or arcades, multiple entries, merchandising and display windows, street front open space with artwork or furniture, awnings, signage, and light fixtures. In some instances raised landscaped beds may be appropriate. As a general rule 50 percent of the wall surface at the sidewalk level should be transparent, utilizing glazing that is not highly tinted or reflective.	+/-	(+) Restaurant addition at corner engages pedestrian with activated patio and storefront (-) Ground floor of hotel does not include design elements such as open shop-fronts or arcades, multiple entries, merchandising and display windows, street front open space with artwork or furniture, awnings, signage, and light fixtures, or landscaping elements See Conditions of Approval
BP3	Utilize building materials characteristic of the area having texture, color, pattern, and a higher quality of detailing.	+/-	Upper levels are predominately a single material (EIFS)
BP4	Variations on the façade plane such as inset entries, building piers, and other details can assist in providing relief to long expanses of building wall.	+	Variations due to material thickness and applied vertical façade elements
BP5	Building entries should be clearly identifiable and visible from the street. Principle building entrances should face the street. Entrances should be inviting and easily accessible. They should have a high level of articulation and be well-lit. Canopies or awnings provide protection from the weather.	+/-	Due to the one way traffic flow of Muhammad Ali, the primary entrance has limited pedestrian and traffic visibility.
BP6	Changes in sidewalk material aid in defining exterior spaces and entryways.	NA	
BP7	Develop alley facing facades at least one bay into the alley to eliminate harsh contrasts in the street wall. Provide adequate lighting and signage for quick orientation by motorists and safety for pedestrians.	NA	
BP8	Exterior lighting should be designed to be visually integrated into the exterior design of the building. Lighting should be designed to provide illumination that creates a greater sense of activity, security and interest to the pedestrian.	NSI	Lighting plan not provided at this time

Principle 5-Parking, Vehicular Use and Access

Design Guideline Checklist

Objective

Parking garages, surface parking, and vehicular use areas should have the same qualities and characteristics as any other downtown developments. They should relate strongly to their context, reinforce the urban street wall, and be designed to promote comfort and safety for pedestrians.

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
P1	Parking garages. A parking garage visible from the street should be integrated into its surroundings and provide active and inviting street level appearance. The garage should: a) follow all Principles and Guidelines for building and site design: b) minimize the use of ramped floors visible from the street: c) openings and entrances should be in scale with people. Parking garage entries shall be minimized in size but fully articulated as an opening in the structure. Pedestrian entrances should also be fully articulated. d) screen parked cars from pedestrian view.	NA	
P2	Surface parking lots and vehicle use areas. Generally speaking, development of downtown sites solely as surface parking lots or vehicle use areas is discouraged due to their negative impact on the street wall, streetscape, and pedestrian-friendly character of downtown. Specifically, demolition of buildings for development of new surface parking lots is discouraged. Surface parking and vehicle use areas elsewhere, when deemed appropriate, should adhere to the following: a) surface parking and vehicle use areas should not create gaps along the street and sidewalk. They should be fully screened from pedestrian view through a combination of solid building like elements such as colonnades, decorative fencing, and dense decorative landscaping intended to continue the street wall. Dense landscaping intended for screening should be 3' high at time of planting and maintained visibility and safety. The screening may be also an opportunity for Public Art.; b) Provide adequate interior landscaping, especially shade trees.; c) When associated with a principal structure on the same site, surface parking, loading, and waste/recycling storage and collection areas shall be located fully behind the principal structure on the site.	NA	No changes to existing surface parking proposed. Improvements to the site could be made through the addition of landscaping and public art elements.
P3	Vehicular access and design: a) curb cuts and vehicular access shall be designed in conformance with the Access Management Standards and Design manual within the Land Development Code and appropriate Metro agencies: b) vehicular access should be designed to minimize conflicts between cars and pedestrians: c) access from the alley shall be utilized to the fullest extent possible, where the alley is unimproved or of insufficient width or length for the new development it shall be improved as part of the project for viable use: d) existing curb cuts that are not proposed to be re-used should be removed and replaced with walk and curb compatible with the current standard design for that location: e) existing curb cuts to be re-used should be minimized in width and number to the fullest extent possible: f) driveways should be located to be shared with adjacent properties whenever possible: g) driveways and vehicular entrances should not occur in dominant locations on the site: h) provide adequate directional information for motorists	NSI	Since a new curb cut is proposed, applicant shall consult with appropriate Metro agencies to confirm compliance with Access Management Standards and Design manual within the Land Development Code

Principle 7-Street and Sidewalk Character

Design Guideline Checklist

Objective

Downtown streets and sidewalks should be safe and attractive for both cars and pedestrians. Getting from one place to another should be a pleasant, comfortable, and rewarding downtown experience.

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
S1	Developments involving new construction and or modifications to existing curb and sidewalk along the frontage(s) of the site should include improvements to the streetscape including sidewalk and curb in accordance with the current standards for that street and the Street and Road Side Design Standards of the Land Development Code.	+/-	Applicant shall consult with appropriate Metro agencies to confirm compliance with Street and Road Side Design Standards of the Land Development Code +/- Applicant shall further detail drawings to show streetscape improvements in accordance with Overlay Guideline BP2. See Conditions # 3 , #4, and #5
S2	Street furnishings. Street furnishings including but not limited to benches, news racks, bicycle racks, and trash containers shall conform to the standards established by the Downtown Streetscape Manual.	+	
S3	Lighting-Street lighting for public streets shall conform to the standards established by the Downtown streetscape Manual. On-site lighting should also be compatible with street lighting standards.	NSI	None shown
S4	For the sake of visual continuity trees shall be planted in the right-of-way every 25' to 35' along the curb line in order to create a continuous canopy. Tree species and caliper and planting area shall conform to the standards established by the Downtown Streetscape Manual. A mix of ornamental and shade trees should be planted outside the right-of-way for both shade and visual variety.	NA	Existing trees shown undisturbed, no new trees proposed.
S5	Pedways. The pedestrian environment is substantially impacted by the actual number of pedestrians engaging in activity on the street level. Generally speaking, the more pedestrians engaging in activity at street level the more the streetscape environment feels active, inviting and safe. Overhead pedestrian walkways (pedways) have real potential to negatively impact the street level environment by removing pedestrians from it. Overhead pedestrian structures therefore are generally discouraged. When a pedway is deemed to be appropriate it should: a) be designed to be architecturally compatible with the design of the structures at the end: b) have articulated street level access or clear direction to access points for pedestrians: c) provide entry points within each building that are comparable to street level	NA	

entrances like lobbies that are attractive and have clear directions to internal circulation elements and other internal use: d) give consideration for views underneath including material finish and lighting: e) not have permanent signage		
--	--	--

- These guidelines are in addition to the streetscape guidelines of the Department of Public Works and Assets, the Metro Arborist, and the Land Development Code.
- Project features developed as public amenities should also be designed in conformance with Metro Louisville Complete Streets Manual, October 2007, which promotes the design of transportation corridors that are safe and convenient for pedestrians, cyclists, motorists and bus riders of all ages and abilities.