



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Priscilla Bowman, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: January 4, 2023 *SD*

Case No: 22-COA-0294
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 2111 Cherokee Parkway

Applicant: Charles Williams
1626 Windsor Place
Louisville, KY 40204
(502) 459-1810
charliewilliamsdesign@gmail.com

Owner: Thomas G. Curtin
2111 Cherokee Parkway
Louisville, KY 40204

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant is seeking approval to construct two additions on the existing garage in the rear of the property. The first addition will be on the first story on the west side and clad in smooth composite lap siding with a 4" reveal. One new single carriage style garage door will be placed to the west of the existing garage door located on the north façade of the structure facing the rear alley. A 7:12 shingled pent roof will be constructed above the garage doors. The second addition is a 26'-0" X 34'8" full second floor addition over the entire garage. The proposed addition will have a partial 4' overhang facing the rear yard. The addition will be clad in smooth composite board and batten siding. The proposed windows will be 1/1 double hung windows, as well as 1-lite awning and slide by windows. The new addition will have a 3.5:12 shingled hip roof. An exterior stairway with a cable rail will be located on the south, side yard elevation, with a storage room below. New painted wood posts over stone piers are proposed under the overhanging second floor, and as well as a new iron gate facing the rear alley.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was submitted November 10, 2022. The application was considered complete and requiring Committee level review on November 14, 2022. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on January 11, 2023 at 4:30 pm, in person, at 444 S. 5th Street, Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Addition** and **Garage**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The site is located on the north side of Cherokee Parkway, four lots east of its intersection with Cherokee Road, and seven lots west of its intersection with Everett Avenue. The property is zoned R5B and is within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The house is a circa 1905, 2½-story, Eclectic Style masonry home. The garage is a more modern construction with a concrete block foundation, composite lap siding, a front gable roof, and a two-car garage door. The garage is noncontributing to the National Register-listed Cherokee Triangle Historic District and the locally designated Cherokee Triangle Preservation District.

Conclusions

The proposed garage addition generally meets the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District design guidelines for **Addition** and **Garage**. Addition Guideline A6 states, "Do not undertake any full-floor additions in residential preservation districts (adding an additional full floor on top of a building)." However, this garage is an accessory structure and is more modern in age. It is noncontributing to the District, so this full-floor addition would not impact any historic integrity. The existing garage is clad in horizontal, smooth-faced composite siding, which will be continued on the new first story addition. Smooth composite board and batten siding is proposed around the second story addition. The proposed change in (vertical) orientation of the second-story siding will help break up the massing of the addition and balance the overall design. Furthermore, the change from a front gable roof to a hip roof will also minimize the height and massing of the building. The size, scale, and overall design of the new addition is proportionate to, and complementary of, the historic building and district.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions**:

1. **Comply with the Kentucky building code in such a way that a historic building's character-defining features are preserved.**
2. **The projection of the roof may not exceed 18 inches into the required (rear) yard.**
3. **No flush garage doors (they accentuate the large size of the openings).**
4. **Half-round or Ogee gutters shall be installed.**

5. The currently exposed concrete block foundation shall be clad with a parge coat.
6. The applicant shall use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Light should be directed down and away from neighbors.
7. If the design or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.


 Priscilla Bowman
 Historic Preservation Specialist

01/04/2023

Date

ADDITION

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
A1	Ensure that the design of any new addition is in proportion with the size and scale of the historic building and district.	+	The size and design of the new addition is proportionate to, and complementary of the historic building and district.
A2	Design any addition so that it is subordinate to the original building. Generally, additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.	+/-	This is a full floor addition; however, it is a carriage house addition over an existing detached garage.
A3	Generally, additions should be attached to secondary elevations and should be set back from the front façade, so as not to damage or obscure character-defining features.	+/-	New addition on a detached garage at the rear of the property. See conclusions.
A4	Use materials that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+	The existing garage has smooth-faced lap siding on exterior façades. Smooth composite lap siding and smooth composite board and batten siding are proposed on exterior façades of the new addition.
A5	Respect original roof forms when designing an addition. Additions should complement existing forms, not overwhelm them.	+	The proposed asphalt shingle hipped roof with 2'2" shingled pent roof facing the alley complement the surrounding existing roof forms.
A6	Do not undertake any full-floor additions in residential preservation districts (adding an additional full floor on top of a building).	+/-	This is a full floor addition; however, it is a carriage house addition over an existing detached garage. The garage is more modern in age.

A7	Generally, the original orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade.	+	The original orientation of the building will not be altered.
A8	Design any new addition so that the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	NA	
A9	Design additions to have the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion.	+/-	The number of new windows proposed outnumbers the number of existing windows. However, the amount and placement of the new windows proposed will be proportionate and more appropriate for the building's (carriage house) design.
A10	Design additions so that there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration. This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion.	+	The existing garage is clad in horizontal, smooth-faced siding. The new second-floor addition will have smooth board and batten siding. The proposed (vertical) orientation of the second-story siding will help break up the massing of the new addition and balance the overall design.
A11	Set back additional stories from the historic wall plane of commercial or institutional structures when such an approach is required for a new use. The construction of additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible and not damage or destroy character-defining features.	+/-	The addition is not setback. See conclusions.
A12	Do not design additions to appear older than the original building.	+	
A13	Comply with the Kentucky building code in such a way that a historic building's character-defining features are preserved.	+	See conditions of approval
A14	Do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features when adding a new code-required stairway or elevator. Any such addition should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	NA	
A15	Install fire escapes only on secondary elevations. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. They should preferably be painted to match the color of the wall.	NA	
A16	Do not construct a deck on a front or side façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or finished with an opaque stain. Use the railing detail developed by the Landmarks Commission or other approved detail.	NA	
A17	Design rear decks so that they do not extend beyond the side walls of the house and are not visible from the street.	NA	
A18	Wood fire stairs should be painted or stained and should be kept to a minimum functional size.	NA	

GARAGE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

Design Element	Building Feature		Approved	Comments
Location		+	Rear-yard location	
		+	Align with adjacent secondary structures	
		+	Use to define and enclose rear yard	
		+	Minimize paving	
Materials	Walls	+	Horizontal wood siding (3" or 4" exposure)	Lower half will have horizontal composite lap siding with a 4" reveal.
		+	Board and batten siding	On the upper half of the structure
		NA	Brick	
		NA	Stucco over frame or concrete block	
	Roof	NA	Cast stone, molded concrete block	
		NA	Aluminum and vinyl siding (3" or 4" exposure)	
		+	No painted concrete block.	Concrete block is existing
		+	No un-painted concrete block.	Concrete block is existing
		NA	No T-111 plywood.	
		+	Asphalt, fiberglass, wood, vinyl, or slate shingles.	
		NA	Metal roofing	
		+	Half-round or Ogee gutters	See conditions of approval
		NA	Approved Gable-end element	
		NA	No membrane roofing on sloped roofs.	
Building Forms	Main Block	+	Simple, rectangular, prismatic volumes	
		NA	Ell-shaped buildings	
		NA	Slightly-projecting bays	
		+	Cantilevered, second floors	
	Roof	NA	No overly-elaborate volumes	
		NA	Simple gable roofs (6-in-12 minimum slope)	Gable end vent
		+	Hipped, shed, and flat roofs with parapets	
		NA	Intersecting gables	
		+	Overhanging eaves	
		+	Half-round gutters	Ogee gutters are acceptable. See conditions of approval.
		NA	No low-pitched gable roofs (less than 6-in-12 slope)	
		NA	No flush eaves	
		NA	No roofs without gutters	

Openings	Garage	+	Single-car openings	
	Doors	NA	Surface area of door broken up by articulated panels or stiles and rails to reduce scale	
		NA	No double and triple doors	
		-	No flush garage doors (they accentuate the large size of the openings)	Flush garage doors are proposed. See conditions of approval.
	Windows	+	Use window openings to break up wall surface	
		NA	Security grills installed on the inside face of the windows	