Land Development & Transportation Committee Staff Report

September 24, 2015



Case No: Project Name: Location: Owner(s): Applicant: Representative: Jurisdiction: Council District: Case Manager: 15MISC1006 Redden Mobile Mechanic 4612 Knopp Ave Phil Charmoli, Charmoli-Knopp Properties Chris Guffey, Allegiant Construction Jason Hall, Prism Engineering & Design Group Louisville Metro 13 – Vicki Aubrey Welch Sherie' Long, Landscape Architect (Continued from September 16 DRC Hearing)

REQUESTS

- Waiver #1: Waiver of the Land Development Code Sections 5.8.1.B and 5.9.2.A.1.b.i, to not provide a sidewalk along the frontage of both Knopp and Melton Avenues; and not to provide the pedestrian connection from the building entrance to the right-of-way.
- Waiver #2: Waiver of the Land Development Code Section 10.2.10 and Table 10.2.6, to allow the parking area and pavement to encroach into the required 15' VUA LBAs along Knopp and Melton Avenues.
- Waiver #3: Waiver of the Land Development Code Section 10.2.10 and 10.2.11, to not provide the required screening and tree planting along both Knopp and Melton Avenues.
- Waiver #4: Waiver of the Land Development Code Sections 10.2.10 and Table 10.2.6, to eliminate the required 15' VUA LBA and plantings along the unimproved Rowe Street frontage.
- Waiver #5: Waiver of the Land Development Code Section 10.1.4 and Table 10.1.2, to allow a reduction of the required tree canopy.

CASE SUMMARY/BACKGROUND/SITE CONTEXT

This is a Category 2B Development Plan. The applicant is proposing to construct a new 5,600sf building on property located between Knopp Avenue and Melton Avenue on south/east side of Grade Lane. The new building will be used as a repair shop for semi-trailers with the remainder of the site being used for trailer storage. Access to the site will be from both Knopp and Melton Avenues. The site will remain as gravel surface except the employee parking area which is currently paved. No additional screen plantings are proposed, however four new Type A large canopy trees will be planted adjacent to Knopp Avenue. Two of them are being located along the perimeter of the new building to eliminate the need for a façade waiver in addition to counting toward the tree canopy and perimeter tree buffer requirements. The applicant is not providing the required tree canopy or the required buffer tree plantings along either of the streets. The only trees on the site being preserved are located within the existing fence line.

BACKGROUND/ PREVIOUS CASES

15MISC1006: Category 2B Development Plan – pending approval.

LAND USE/ZONING DISTRICT/FORM DISTRICT TABLE

	Land Use	Zoning	Form District
Subject Property			
Existing	Industrial & Commercial	EZ-1	SW
Proposed	NA		
Surrounding Properties			
North	Industrial & Commercial	EZ-1	SW
South	Industrial & Commercial	EZ-1	SW
East	Industrial & Commercial	EZ-1	SW
West	Industrial & Commercial	EZ-1	SW

INTERESTED PARTY COMMENTS

Staff has received any inquiry about the proposal from an adjacent property owner across Knopp Avenue.

APPLICABLE PLANS AND POLICIES

Land Development Code Cornerstone 2020

STANDARD OF REVIEW AND STAFF ANALYSIS FOR SIDEWALK WAIVER

Waiver #1: Waiver of the Land Development Code Sections 5.8.1.B and 5.9.2.A.1.b.i, to not provide a sidewalk along the frontage of both Knopp and Melton Avenues; and not to provide the pedestrian connection from the building entrance to the right-of-way.

(a) <u>The waiver will not adversely affect adjacent property owners; and</u>

STAFF: The waiver will not adversely affect adjacent property owners since there are no sidewalks located in the vicinity. Also, there are no transit stops close to this property.

(b) <u>The waiver will not violate specific guidelines of Cornerstone 2020.</u>

STAFF: Guideline 7, Policy 1 states that developments should be evaluated for their impact on the street and roadway system and to ensure that those who propose new developments bear or reasonably share in the costs of the public facilities and services made necessary by development. Guideline 9, Policy 1 states that new development should provide, where appropriate, for the movement of pedestrians, bicyclists and transit users with sidewalks along the streets of all developments where appropriate. The waiver request does not violate the comprehensive plan since there are no sidewalks or transit stops in the vicinity. Plus along both street frontages MSD has recently added paved ditches along with improved site access entrances from the street which has created an existing condition not conducive for construction of a sidewalk along either street frontage.

(c) <u>The extent of the waiver of the regulation is the minimum necessary to afford relief to the applicant</u>

STAFF: The extent of waiver of the regulation is the minimum necessary to afford relief to the applicant since the existing condition is not conducive for construction of a sidewalk along either street.

(d) Either:

(i) The applicant has incorporated other design measures that exceed the minimums of the district and compensate for non-compliance with the requirements to be waived (net beneficial effect); OR
 (ii) The strict application of the provisions of the regulation would deprive the applicant of the reasonable use of the land or would create an unnecessary hardship on the applicant.

STAFF: A strict application of the provision of the regulation would create a hardship for the applicant to construct the sidewalks because of the existing conditions and limitations created by the drainage improvements recently completed by MSD.

STANDARD OF REVIEW AND STAFF ANALYSIS FOR LANDSCAPE WAIVER

Waiver #2: Waiver of the Land Development Code Section 10.2.10 and Table 10.2.6, to allow the parking area and pavement to encroach into the required 15' VUA LBAs along Knopp and Melton Avenues.

(a) <u>The waiver will not adversely affect adjacent property owners; and</u>

STAFF: The waiver will adversely affect adjacent property owners because the encroachment of the pavement limits the area for the required perimeter planting. This area has been identified by the recently completed tree canopy assessment as an area lacking tree canopy therefore producing extreme heat. Extreme heat does adversely affect health.

(b) <u>The waiver will not violate specific guidelines of Cornerstone 2020; and</u>

STAFF: The waiver will violate guideline 3, Compatibility, of Cornerstone 2020, which calls for the protection of roadway corridors and public areas from visual intrusions, for mitigation of parking areas so as not to negatively impact nearby user and owners, and for parking areas adjacent to streets to be screened and buffered. The purpose of vehicle use area landscape buffer areas is to improve the appearance of vehicular use areas and property abutting public rights-of way. In addition to providing tree canopy to reduce the heating of pavement which has been determined to be a health hazard. The tree canopy and buffer plantings, along the street frontage and site pavement, also assists in filtering the carbon dioxide from the air and generally helps reduce pollutants.

(c) The extent of the waiver of the regulation is the minimum necessary to afford relief to the applicant; and

STAFF: The extent of waiver of the regulation is not the minimum necessary to afford relief to the applicant since there are no physical restraints preventing compliance with the regulations to be waived. The pavement can be removed to provide the necessary VUA LBA area along the street frontages.

(d) <u>Either:</u>

(i) The applicant has incorporated other design measures that exceed the minimums of the district and compensate for non-compliance with the requirements to be waived (net beneficial effect); OR
 (ii) The strict application of the provisions of the regulation would deprive the applicant of the reasonable use of the land or would create an unnecessary hardship on the applicant.

STAFF: The applicant has not incorporated other design measures that exceed the minimums of the district to compensate for non-compliance with the requirements to be waived. The strict application of the provisions of the regulation would not deprive the applicant of the reasonable use of the land or create an unnecessary hardship on the applicant since the proposed development can be built on the site while complying with the requirements requested to be waived.

STANDARD OF REVIEW AND STAFF ANALYSIS FOR LANDSCAPE WAIVER

Waiver #3: Waiver of the Land Development Code Section 10.2.10 and 10.2.11, to not provide the required screening and tree planting along both Knopp and Melton Avenues.

(a) <u>The waiver will not adversely affect adjacent property owners; and</u>

STAFF: The waiver will adversely affect adjacent property owners since the perimeter plantings are not being provided. This area has been identified by the recently completed tree canopy assessment as an area lacking tree canopy therefore producing extreme heat. Extreme heat does adversely affect health.

(b) The waiver will not violate specific guidelines of Cornerstone 2020; and

STAFF: The waiver will violate guideline 3, Compatibility, of Cornerstone 2020, which calls for the protection of roadway corridors and public areas from visual intrusions, for mitigation of parking areas so as not to negatively impact nearby user and owners, and for parking areas adjacent to streets to be screened and buffered. The purpose of vehicle use area landscape buffer areas is to improve the appearance of vehicular use areas and property abutting public rights-of way. Also to provide tree canopy to reduce the heating of pavement which has been determined to be a health hazard. The tree canopy and buffer plantings along the street frontage and site pavement also assists in filtering the carbon dioxide from the air and generally helps reduce pollutants.

(c) <u>The extent of the waiver of the regulation is the minimum necessary to afford relief to the applicant; and</u>

STAFF: The extent of waiver of the regulation is not the minimum necessary to afford relief to the applicant since there are no physical restraints preventing compliance with the regulations to be waived. The pavement can be removed to provide the necessary area for the tree and shrub plantings to be provided.

(d) Either:

(i) The applicant has incorporated other design measures that exceed the minimums of the district and compensate for non-compliance with the requirements to be waived (net beneficial effect); OR
 (ii) The strict application of the provisions of the regulation would deprive the applicant of the reasonable use of the land or would create an unnecessary hardship on the applicant.

STAFF: The applicant has not incorporated other design measures that exceed the minimums of the district to compensate for non-compliance with the requirements to be waived. The strict application of the provisions of the regulation would not deprive the applicant of the reasonable use of the land or create an unnecessary hardship on the applicant since the proposed development can be built on the site while complying with the requirements requested to be waived.

STANDARD OF REVIEW AND STAFF ANALYSIS FOR LANDSCAPE WAIVER

Waiver #4: Waiver of the Land Development Code Sections 10.2.10 and Table 10.2.6, to eliminate the required 15' VUA LBA and plantings along the unimproved Rowe Street frontage.

(a) <u>The waiver will not adversely affect adjacent property owners; and</u>

STAFF: The waiver will adversely affect adjacent property owners since the perimeter plantings are not being provided. This area has been identified by the recently completed tree canopy assessment as an area lacking tree canopy therefore producing extreme heat. Extreme heat does adversely affect health.

(b) The waiver will not violate specific guidelines of Cornerstone 2020; and

STAFF: The waiver will violate guideline 3, Compatibility, of Cornerstone 2020, which calls for the protection of roadway corridors and public areas from visual intrusions, for mitigation of parking areas so as not to negatively impact nearby user and owners, and for parking areas adjacent to streets to be screened and buffered. The purpose of vehicle use area landscape buffer areas is to improve the appearance of vehicular use areas and property abutting public rights-of way. Also to provide tree canopy to reduce the heating of pavement which has been determined to be a health hazard. The tree canopy and buffer plantings along the street frontage and site pavement also assists in filtering the carbon dioxide from the air and generally helps reduce pollutants.

(c) The extent of the waiver of the regulation is the minimum necessary to afford relief to the applicant; and

STAFF: The extent of waiver of the regulation is not the minimum necessary to afford relief to the applicant since there are no physical restraints preventing compliance with the regulations to be waived.

(d) Either:

(i) The applicant has incorporated other design measures that exceed the minimums of the district and compensate for non-compliance with the requirements to be waived (net beneficial effect); OR
 (ii) The strict application of the provisions of the regulation would deprive the applicant of the reasonable use of the land or would create an unnecessary hardship on the applicant.

STAFF: The applicant has not incorporated other design measures that exceed the minimums of the district to compensate for non-compliance with the requirements to be waived. The strict application of the provisions of the regulation would not deprive the applicant of the reasonable use of the land or create an unnecessary hardship on the applicant since the proposed development can be built on the site while complying with the requirements requested to be waived.

STANDARD OF REVIEW AND STAFF ANALYSIS FOR TREE CANOPY WAIVER

Waiver #5: Waiver of the Land Development Code Section 10.1.4 and Table 10.1.2, to allow a reduction of the required tree canopy.

(a) <u>The waiver will not adversely affect adjacent property owners; and</u>

STAFF: The waiver will adversely affect adjacent property owners since this area has been identified by the recently completed tree canopy assessment as an area lacking tree canopy therefore producing extreme heat. Extreme heat does adversely affect health.

(b) <u>The waiver will not violate specific guidelines of Cornerstone 2020; and</u>

STAFF: The waiver violates Guideline 13, Policy 5 which calls for standards to ensure the creation and/or preservation of tree canopy as a valuable community resource. The waiver violates the comprehensive plan since the required number of trees are not being provided on or off the site. The applicant has not explored all the alternative options to provide tree canopy. The preservation of

invasive plant material does not fulfill the policy to increase the tree canopy with native species to improve the overall health of the community.

(c) <u>The extent of the waiver of the regulation is the minimum necessary to afford relief to the applicant; and</u>

STAFF: The extent of waiver of the regulation is not the minimum necessary to afford relief to the applicant since there are alternative options to fulfill the tree canopy requirements. There are no mitigation circumstances affecting this site. Additional trees can be planted on the site and on an alternative site to fulfill the tree canopy requirements.

(d) <u>Either:</u>

(i) The applicant has incorporated other design measures that exceed the minimums of the district and compensate for non-compliance with the requirements to be waived (net beneficial effect); OR
 (ii) The strict application of the provisions of the regulation would deprive the applicant of the reasonable use of the land or would create an unnecessary hardship on the applicant.

STAFF: The applicant has not incorporated other design measures that exceed the minimums of the district to compensate for non-compliance with the requirements to be waived. The strict application of the provisions of the regulation would not deprive the applicant of the reasonable use of the land or create an unnecessary hardship on the applicant since the proposed development can be built on the site while complying with the requirements requested to be waived.

TECHNICAL REVIEW

The following Technical Review Items need to be addressed:

- 1. Identify the existing trees with size and species
- 2. Modify the plan to reflect the actual square footage of tree canopy existing on the site which was identified during the site visit prior to the public hearing.
- 3. Adjust the spacing of the four proposed trees.

STAFF CONCLUSIONS

Since there are no sidewalks located in the vicinity and there are no transit stops close to this property; plus the existing condition is not conducive for construction of a sidewalk; the sidewalk waiver is supported.

The three landscape waivers are not supported. The applicant is not providing any buffer plantings beyond the existing invasive vegetation. However, invasive vegetation should be removed and replaced with native species. Invasive vegetation has little or no benefit to the environment.

The tree canopy reduction is not supported. The applicant has not made a good faith effort to provide as many trees as possible on the site, on the adjacent right-of-way, or on an alternative site.

Therefore, the Land Development & Transportation Committee must determine if the proposal meets the standard for waivers established in the Development Code based on the testimony and evidence provided at the public hearing.

NOTIFICATION

Date	Purpose of Notice	Recipients
09/03/2015	Public Hearing - DRC	Neighborhood notification recipients
09/03/2015	Public Hearing - DRC	1 st tier adjoining property owners

ATTACHMENTS

- Zoning Map
 Aerial Photograph
- 3. Site Plan
- 4. Site Photographs









Attachment 4: Site Photographs



Knopp Avenue frontage



Knopp Avenue frontage



Knopp Avenue looking west



Melton Avenue frontage