



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Clifton Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Robert Keesaer, AIA, NCARB- Landmarks Supervisor *RK*
From: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: May 20, 2016

Case No: 16COA1100
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 214 Pope Street

Applicant: Thomas Rohleder
KSJ Realty
11510 Saratoga Ridge Drive
Louisville, KY 40299
502-759-9224
tom11510@gmail.com

Owner: same as applicant

Architect/Design: N/A

Contractor: TBD

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant requests approval to replace all of the front elevation windows with Alsie 1/1 double hung vinyl windows. The front elevation windows include

- One 8/1 double hung wood window on a recessed front elevation south of the main elevation;
- One 1/1 double hung wood window on the first story;
- Three 1/1 double hung vinyl replacement windows on the second story; and,
- Two wood stationary windows on the upper half story.

The applicant wishes to replace the large 1/1 double hung wood window on the first story with two 1/1 double hung vinyl windows like 225 Pope Street. The applicant also requests approval to reconstruct the first story transom window located over the large 1/1 double hung wood window. The transom has been missing and the new design will be art glass. There are no historic photos of this window.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on April 29, 2016 and was originally part of 16COA1092. This portion of the application was separated for committee level review. Staff approved the replacement of the windows on the side and rear elevations in 16COA1092. However, when staff conducted a site visit on May 17, 2016 to post the hearing sign, it was apparent that the applicant did not follow the COA. Two large double hung windows on the south elevation were replaced with two small double hung windows. One of those windows was one large vinyl window and the other was a 12/1 wood window. The new case 16COA1100 is scheduled to be heard by the Clifton Architectural Review Committee on May 25, 2016 at 5:30 pm, at 444 South Fifth Street, Conference Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Clifton Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Windows**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The R5A zoned property in the Traditional Neighborhood form district is located on the west side of Pope Street on the sixth lot south of Embury Avenue. The single-family home is a two-and-a-half-story frame Queen Anne style home. The surrounding buildings are predominately one to two-story frame homes.

Conclusions

Portions of the project generally do not meet the design guidelines for **Windows**. The existing wood windows should be repaired and retained as they are not severely deteriorated and are architecturally significant to the structure. Adding low profile storm windows can help with any energy efficiency concerns. Replacing one large double hung window with two smaller double hung windows does not meet W2 or W3. The window replacement on 225 Pope Street was done prior to the 2003 district designation. Replacing the stationary windows and the 8/1 double hung with 1/1 double hung windows does not meet W2. However, replacing the existing 1/1 double hung vinyl windows on the second story does meet the guidelines as does the reconstruction of the missing transom window. The proposed transom is fitting with the style of the house and the neighborhood.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved with the following conditions:

1. The large first story 1/1 double hung window, the upper story stationary windows, and the 8/1 double hung window shall be repaired and retained.
2. The new second story windows shall convey the same visual appearance—1/1 grid pattern replaced with 1/1.
3. The new second story windows shall fit the historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock-sized windows.
4. The new windows shall operate in the same way as the original windows—double-hung windows are replaced with double hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.

5/20/16
Date


Savannah Darr
Historic Preservation Specialist

Attached Documents / Information

1. Staff Guideline Checklist
2. Applicant Submitted Information Packet

Windows

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	The maintenance and repair of historic windows are essential to preserving the historic character and fabric of Clifton structures and the overall Clifton historic district. For that reason, historic windows on street-address façades and street-facing façades shall not be replaced with new windows unless the Clifton ARC determines that the condition of existing windows, safety or energy efficiency considerations, or other relevant factors support window replacement. During the planning stage for possible window replacement on any façade, and prior to submittal of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement, property owners should consult with the Landmarks staff on the application of these guidelines to their structure, options for addressing the property owner's	+	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	needs, and concerns regarding their windows.		
W2	If historic windows on façades other than street-address façades or street-facing façades are replaced, or the owner is authorized to replace windows on street-address façade or street-facing façade pursuant to W1, the new windows shall convey the same visual appearance as the historic windows. The visual appearance of a window is based on details such as sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and other decorative features. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of wood, metal, or synthetic window systems for authorized window replacement is permissible. During the planning stage for possible window replacement on any façade, and prior to submittal of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement, property owners should consult with the Landmarks staff on the application of these guidelines to their structure, options for addressing the property owner's needs, and concerns regarding their windows.	-	New windows will not convey the same appearance as the existing historic windows except the existing vinyl replacement windows.
W3	Replacement sash should not be used that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock-sized windows.	NSI	
W4	Replacement windows proposed for façades other than street-address façades or street-facing façades, and those authorized pursuant to W1 for street-address façades and street-facing façades, shall operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	+/-	Replacing the stationary windows with double hung windows does not meet the guideline, but the other windows are double hung.
W5	Thermal glazing windows that have muntins in accordance with W2 shall have such muntins permanently applied and may also incorporate internal dividers between the glass panes.	NA	1/1 double hung vinyl replacement windows
W6	Reflective or insulating film shall not be applied to window glass on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	NA	
W7	Smoked, tinted, or reflective glass shall not be used on windows on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	NA	
W8	Transoms or sidelights shall not be blocked-in or back-painted.	NA	
W9	The number, size, location, or shape of original windows shall not be altered on street-address façades or street-facing façades by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	NA	
W10	Any new window openings for a new use shall not be located on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	NA	
W11	The front face of historic window trim shall not be covered with metal or siding material. Siding may butt up to the side of historic window trim.	NA	
W12	New floors or dropped ceilings shall not be installed that block the glazed area of windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W13	If exterior storm windows are installed they should duplicate the shape of the original window.	NA	
W14	When installing exterior storm windows or screens do not damage or obscure historic windows or frames.	NA	
W15	Window sashes shall not be altered to accommodate window air-conditioning units.	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W16	When installing security bars do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W17	Awnings shall be designed to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W18	Awnings shall be of a material and form compatible with the building's historic character. Contemporary designs may be considered if compatible with the design and character of the building.	NA	
W19	Awnings shall be installed in a way that does not harm the building. Limit hardware installation to that which is required for structural stability. Anchors shall be installed in mortar joints, not masonry units.	NA	
W20	On commercial buildings attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings shall be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
W21	Awnings shall be installed so that the valance is no lower than permissible by code (Building Code or Public Works).	NA	
W22	Replacement shutters should match the visual appearance, size, and location of the originals and may be constructed of wood, metal, or synthetic material.	NA	
W23	Shutters shall be installed only where there is historic evidence for them.	NA	