



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer *[Signature]*
From: Savannah Darr, Planning & Design Coordinator
Date: May 17, 2019

Case No: 19COA1140
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 103 W. Kentucky Street

Applicant: Brad and Amy Zimmerman
103 W. Kentucky Street
Louisville, KY 40203
812-972-8563
bzimmerman1987@gmail.com

Owner: same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicants seeks approval to not reconstruct the missing eyebrow roof vent that was removed by the roofing contractor. The applicant's contract with the roofer specifically stated that the vent should not be removed. However, it was. The applicants have obtained bids from the roofer and other contractors to remedy this but are requesting to not reconstruct the vent.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on May 9, 2019 and considered complete and requiring committee level review on May 13, 2019. Staff discussed the applicant's options at length prior to application submission. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on May 22, 2019 at 5:30 pm, at 444 S. 5th Street, Conference Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Roofing**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The property is located on the north side of W. Kentucky Street, south of the intersection with S. 1st Street. It is zoned TNZD within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The site contains the two-and-a-half-story masonry house and is surrounded by other masonry houses of varying architectural styles. In 2018, staff approved a COA (18COA1237) for the installation of front yard fencing, which had been previously removed. The Old Louisville ARC approved a COA (18COA1103) for front window replacement. Lastly, staff approved a COA (18COA1099) for the replacement of the side and rear windows on the house.

Conclusions

The design guidelines for Roofing are not clear about missing roof features like an eyebrow vent. Guidelines R7, R9, and R21 say that reconstruction of missing roof features should be done in appropriate materials and should not be conjectural or faux historic. However, they do not say that these elements have to be reconstructed if missing.

While the eyebrow vent was an interesting design element to this house, its loss does not negatively impact the integrity of the building. The house still retains its historic and architectural features that make it contributing to the Old Louisville Historic District. Staff has concerns that reconstructing the eyebrow vent will be more of a negative impact than its total removal. Furthermore, the design guidelines for Roofing do not specifically state that missing roof features shall be reconstructed when missing.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved**.

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.

5/17/2019
Date


Savannah Darr
Planning & Design Coordinator

ROOFING

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
R1	Use only replacement materials that closely match the original roofing material in color, texture, and profile. Possible substitute materials include asphalt shingles, dimensional shingles, or cement tiles.	NA	
R2	Use copper, lead-coated copper, terne-coated stainless steel, or terne metal when replacing a historic metal roof with in-kind materials. While copper roofs may be left unpainted, terne-metal roofs should be painted either muted red or green, traditional roof colors. Replacement with in-kind materials is recommended in order to preserve the visual appearance of the original.	NA	
R3	Make sure that the proportion of the seams and trim on replacement metal roofing matches that of the original. Commercial-grade architectural metal roofing systems should not be used on residential architecture, because the scale is inappropriate.	NA	
R4	Retain ridge and hip tiles on historic tile roofs. Field tiles may be replaced with a compatible substitute material, such as a dimensional shingle in a color approximating the original. Ridge and hip tiles, however, should be reinstalled to maintain the roof's historic profile. Reinstallation of sound roof tiles and slates on smaller, secondary roof forms (porches, bay windows, etc.) is encouraged wherever possible.	NA	
R5	Remove existing roofing material when replacing non-repairable or non-historic roofing. Removing these underlying layers will prolong the life of the roof and help restore the original profile of the roof edge.	NA	
R6	Do not apply asphalt shingles over wood shingles. This will trap moisture and cause deterioration of the roof structure.	NA	
R7	Base the reconstruction of any missing roof feature on historical, pictorial, and physical evidence. If such evidence is insufficient, the feature should be of a compatible new design rather than a falsely-historical or conjectural reconstruction.	NSI	
R8	New roof designs for additions or new construction should be compatible in size, scale, material, and color with the historic building and district.	NA	
R9	Use the form and detailing of severely deteriorated roof features, such as cupolas and dormers, or chimneys, to create appropriate replicas.	NSI	
R10	Avoid having extensive areas of flashing visible. In some cases, portions of metal flashing may be covered by mortar or stucco.	NA	

R11	Do not destroy historic detail when installing replacement gutters. If synthetic materials are used, they should be painted to match the trim color.	NA	
R12	Half-round replacement gutters that are of a simple design and do not alter the character of the trim, or in limited cases ogee profile gutters, are preferred. Synthetic materials painted to match the trim color are acceptable.	NA	
R13	Do not use unpainted galvanized steel gutters or downspouts, which rust and stain adjacent materials. These gutters should be painted after a period of weathering. Vinyl gutters and downspouts should be avoided due to their short life expectancy.	NA	
R14	Leave historically-exposed rafter ends and eaves open and uncovered.	NA	
R15	Make sure that any new roof-top additions do not compromise the structural integrity of the building.	NA	
R16	Install any new roof-top mechanical or service equipment in such a way that historic fabric is not damaged.	NA	
R17	Do not attach antennae, satellite transmitters, skylights, vents, air conditioning units, decks, terraces, dormers, or solar panels that can be seen from a building's primary elevation. Skylights should be flush (not the "bubble" type) with curbs painted to match the color of the roof material. Consolidate antennae wherever possible.	NA	
R18	Do not introduce mechanical equipment or systems that may overload and compromise a historic building's existing structural system.	NA	
R19	Paint all roof vent assemblies to match the color of the roofing material.	NA	
R20	Do not install ridge vents on historic structures. They are non-historic approaches to attic ventilation.	NA	
R21	Replace historic roof details, such as decorative cresting and finials and metal ridge caps on slate roofs with in-kind materials or materials that are visually compatible.	NSI	