



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: July 19, 2021

Case No: 21-COA-0127
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 2409 Ransdell Ave.

Applicant: Amadeo Abraham & Maria Asensio
2409 Ransdell Ave.
Louisville, KY 40204
(781) 588-1310
amadeolucas@hotmail.com

Contractor: John Henry
(502) 759-6119
johnhenrystonemason@gmail.com

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval for an after-the-fact 2' tall retaining wall, constructed of brick and historic mix mortar.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application:

The after-the-fact application was received on June 21st, 2021. The application was classified as requiring Committee Review. Staff met on site with the applicant prior to the application being submitted, following a zoning enforcement violation being issued for the work in progress.

The ARC meeting was originally scheduled for Wednesday, July 28, 2021, at 4:30PM Online via WebEx. Due to a noticing error, the meeting was rescheduled for Wednesday, August 11, 2021 at 4:30PM Online via WebEx.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is included in this report.

Previous COA's for the property:

A-87-35-C

A COA was issued by the CT ARC on **July 1 1987** for the demolition of the existing garage at the rear of the property.

A-87-36-C

A COA was issued by the CT ARC on **Sept 9, 1987** for the construction of a two-car garage at the rear of the property.

S-92-54-C

A COA was issued at staff level on **July 10, 1992** for a wood lattice trellis panel on the side of the front porch.

S-9073-CT

A COA was issued at staff level on **June 20, 2007** for the replacement of historic dormer windows.

21-COA-0100-CT

An after-the-fact COA was issued at staff level on **May 25, 2021** for new brick clad stairs and front walk. The applicant also repaired a chimney which was deemed to be general maintenance at this time too.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The circa 1910 wood frame with stucco house sits four lots north of the intersection of Bassett Ave. and Ransdell Ave. The house is a two-and-one-half-story Colonial Revival style house. The hipped roof dormer, historic front facing windows, and porch are distinguishable elements to the house. The site is zoned R5 within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District.

Conclusions

The after-the-fact changes to the property have been found not to meet the design guidelines for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District. Staff determined that the proposed work is not appropriate for this property at this time. If deemed necessary, a lower curb-style border would be more in keeping with the Design Guidelines. Per the Cherokee Triangle Site Design Guidelines, **ST-8** states to maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present, and **ST-10** which states not to install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless

a historic precedent exists. The applicant was aware a COA is required for all exterior changes to the property prior to construction. The applicant has also not provided evidence for the need of a retaining wall or justification for its height.

Recommendation

Based on the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness is **denied**.

Bradley Fister

7-19-21

Bradley Fister
Historic Preservation Specialist

Date

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	-/+	The retaining wall generally does not meet the design guidelines in height. The material is generally complimentary to the property.
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any re-platting should be consistent with original development patterns.	+	Property line patterns remain the same.
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	NA	
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	NA	
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	NA	
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	-	The topography of the front yard has been changed.
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	-	The after-the-fact retaining wall did not have historic precedent and was not necessary to retain soil. If necessary, a lower curb-style border would be more in keeping with the Design Guidelines.

ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NA	
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NA	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NA	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	