

**Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission
Amended Minutes
SPECIAL MEETING**

August 29, 2019

A meeting of the Louisville Metro Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission was held on Thursday, August 29, 2019 at 9:00 a.m. at the Old Jail Building located at 514 W. Liberty Street, Louisville, Kentucky.

Commission Members present:

Chris Hartman
Robert Kirchdorfer
Emily Liu
Stefanie Buzan
Amin Omidy
Joanne Weeter
Howard Rosenberg
Carrye Jones
Tamika Jackson (arrived at approximately 9:15 a.m.)

Commission Members absent (Excused):

Christopher Fuller
Jay Stottman
Ashlyn Ackerman

Staff Members Present:

Dave Marchal, Deputy Director. Develop Louisville
Joe Haberman, Planning & Design Manager
Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
Savannah Darr, Planning & Design Coordinator
Becky Gorman, Historic Preservation Specialist
John Carroll, Legal Counsel
Sue Reid, Management Assistant

The following matters were considered:

**Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission
Amended Minutes
SPECIAL MEETING**

August 29, 2019

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

**JUNE 20, 2019 HISTORIC LANDMARKS AND PRESERVATION DISTRICTS
COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES**

00:02:17 On a motion by Commissioner Omidy, seconded by Commissioner Liu, the following resolution was adopted:

RESOLVED, the Louisville Metro Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission does hereby **APPROVE** the minutes of the meeting conducted on June 20, 2019.

The vote was as follows:

Yes: Commissioners Buzan, Rosenberg, Hartman, Liu, Omidy, Jones, Kirchdorfer, and Jackson

Abstain: Commissioner Weeter

Absent: Commissioners Ackerman, Fuller, and Stottman

**Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission
Amended Minutes
SPECIAL MEETING**

August 29, 2019

NEW BUSINESS

CASE NUMBER 19DESIGNATION1000

Request:	Individual Landmark Petition
Project Name:	Holy Name Complex Designation Request
Request:	2914 S. 3rd Street and 2911 S. 4th Street
Jurisdiction:	Louisville Metro
Council District:	15-Kevin Triplett
Case Manager:	Savannah Darr, Planning & Design Coordinator

The draft designation report prepared for this case was incorporated into the record. The Commissioners received this report in advance of the hearing, and this report was available to any interested party prior to the public hearing. (The draft designation report is part of the case file maintained at Planning and Design Services offices, 444 South 5th Street.)

An audio/visual recording of the Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission meeting related to this case is available on the Planning & Design Services website, or you may contact the Customer Service staff to obtain a copy.

00:04:15 Chair Hartman briefly explained the designation process (see recording for detailed presentation).

00:06:39 John Carroll, Legal Counsel, briefly explained that the new Landmarks Ordinance would pertain to this case (see recording for detailed presentation).

Agency Testimony:

00:08:59 Savannah Darr presented the case and showed a Powerpoint presentation. Ms. Darr briefly reviewed the criterion for Integrity. Ms. Darr reviewed the Integrity of building 1 through 4 (see recording for detailed presentation).

The following spoke in favor of the petition:

Ann Ramser, 307 East Kenwood Drive, Louisville, KY 40214
Mike O'Leary, 1963 Payne Street, Louisville, KY 40206
Mary Purple, 4121 Brown Lane, Unit A8, Louisville, KY 40220
Jeff Underhill, 946 Goss Avenue, Louisville, KY 40217

**Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission
Amended Minutes
SPECIAL MEETING**

August 29, 2019

**NEW BUSINESS
CASE NUMBER 19DESGNATION1000**

Summary of testimony of those in favor:

00:21:59 Ann Ramser spoke in favor of the petition. Ms. Ramser provided an email in support to the Commissioners. Ms. Ramser showed a Powerpoint presentation. Ms. Ramser objected to using the August 8, 2019 amended ordinance to control the procedures for this Holy Name Landmark Petition, and moved to use the ordinance that was in effect when the petition was filed, and asked if the Commission would make that decision now (see recording for detailed presentation).

00:29:27 Chair Hartman stated there is no decision to be made; the law in Louisville is now the current Landmarks Ordinance, and we have no choice but to operate under it (see recording for detailed presentation).

00:29:44 Ms. Ramser stated that will be appealed. Ms. Ramser continued her presentation, detailing the reasons why the economic hardship application should not be reviewed (see recording for detailed presentation).

00:56:46 Mike O'Leary spoke in favor of the petition and showed a Powerpoint presentation, including other properties that have been restored (see recording for detailed presentation).

01:03:59 Mary Purple spoke in favor of the petition and showed a Powerpoint presentation. Ms. Purple presented Mother President Catherine Marie Schuhmann to support underrepresented women's history in Louisville (see recording for detailed presentation).

01:13:03 Jeff Underhill spoke in favor of the petition. Mr. Underhill stated that these buildings could and should be adaptively reused (see recording for detailed presentation).

The following spoke in opposition of the petition:

Jon Baker, 500 W. Jefferson St., Suite 2800, Louisville, KY 40202
Father Bill Bowling, 501 Cherrywood Rd., Louisville, KY 40207
Bruce Hines, 8100 Windsor Lakes Ct., Louisville, KY 40214
Lisa DeJaco Crutcher, 2911 S. Fourth St., Louisville, KY 40208
Mark Trier, 829 E. Market, Louisville, KY 40206
Bill Weyland, 815 W. Market, Louisville, KY 40202

**Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission
Amended Minutes
SPECIAL MEETING**

August 29, 2019

**NEW BUSINESS
CASE NUMBER 19DESGNATION1000**

Summary of testimony of those in opposition:

01:20:25 Jon Baker spoke in opposition of the petition and showed a Powerpoint presentation. Mr. Baker introduced speakers in opposition (see recording for detailed presentation).

01:26:14 Father Bill Bowling spoke in opposition of the petition. Father Bowling briefly reviewed the history of the parish. Father Bowling stated with the decline of finances, the ability to take care of buildings becomes far more challenging. Father Bowling introduced Bruce Hines, Business Manager, to speak in regard to the history of finances and the state of the buildings (see recording for detailed presentation).

01:36:23 Bruce Hines spoke in opposition of the petition. Mr. Hines spoke in regard to Holy Name's finances. Mr. Hines stated in late 2016 he had a meeting with Collin Underhill with Underhill and Associates. Mr. Hines stated Mr. Underhill evaluated the properties and indicated that there was absolutely no interest on the part of the investors in Underhill and Associates. Mr. Hines stated there was some point being made about demolition through neglect, and that is not purposeful, it is out of necessity (see recording for detailed presentation).

01:43:08 Father Bowling spoke. Father Bowling showed a map which indicated where people come from in Louisville Metro. Father Bowling stated in looking to their history of building and tearing down and building again to have structures that fit the ministries that they want to do (see recording for detailed presentation).

01:50:00 Jon Baker stated what they are looking to accomplish on the campus is removing non-income-producing religious structures and replacing them with another non-income religious structure. Mr. Baker stated the priority on the grounds is the church building, but the church building also needs resources to keep up. Mr. Baker stated there is a need for parking on the campus as they move forward (see recording for detailed presentation).

01:52:09 Lisa DeJaco Crutcher, CEO of Catholic Charities, spoke in opposition of the petition. Ms. Crutcher spoke in regard to the mission and ministries of Catholic Charities. Ms. Crutcher stated these buildings are not functional for the work they're trying to do. Ms. Crutcher stated the Holy Name

**Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission
Amended Minutes
SPECIAL MEETING**

August 29, 2019

NEW BUSINESS

CASE NUMBER 19DESIGNATION1000

location, however, is excellent for the work they're doing (see recording for detailed presentation).

02:10:44 Jon Baker noted objection that they are being deprived of due process if they are not allowed to continue their case in objection to this designation. Mr. Baker introduced Mark Trier (see recording for detailed presentation).

02:12:01 Mark Trier with JRA Architects stated JRA was hired by Catholic Charities to evaluate these buildings in terms of their program and also in terms of renovation costs. Mr. Trier showed a Powerpoint presentation and discussed evaluation criteria. Mr. Trier stated they cannot recommend rehabilitation of these buildings (see recording for detailed presentation).

02:26:32 Jon Baker reviewed legal objections to landmark designation, and introduced Bill Weyland (see recording for detailed presentation).

02:29:34 Bill Weyland spoke in opposition of the petition. Mr. Weyland stated in his professional capacity he has saved over forty buildings throughout this region that are historic in nature. Mr. Weyland stated he still believes that demolition in some instances is required to really have impactful redevelopment because of the real cost of saving buildings. Mr. Weyland reviewed examples of repurposed buildings (see recording for detailed presentation).

Public speakers:

Rosemary Hauck McCandless, 418 W. Kenwood Dr., Louisville, KY 40214

Heath Seymour, 631 S. 5th Street, Louisville, KY 40202

Eileen Murphy, 5611 Carolyn Way, Louisville, KY 40219

Keith Runyon, 1400 Willow Ave., Louisville, KY 40204

Ted Stone, 2830 Tremont Drive, Louisville, KY 40205

Martina Kunnecke, 311 Northwestern Pkwy., Louisville, KY 40211

Debra Harlan, 1734 Chichester Ave., Louisville, KY 40205

Cherise Williams, 1923 Quarry Street, Louisville, KY 40206

Summary of testimony of public speakers:

02:39:47 Rosemary Hauck McCandless spoke in favor of the petition (see recording for detailed presentation).

**Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission
Amended Minutes
SPECIAL MEETING**

August 29, 2019

NEW BUSINESS

CASE NUMBER 19DESIGNATION1000

02:42:06 Heath Seymour spoke neither for nor against the petition (see recording for detailed presentation).

02:43:52 Eileen Murphy spoke in favor of the petition (see recording for detailed presentation).

02:45:39 Keith Runyon spoke neither for nor against the petition (see recording for detailed presentation).

02:47:53 Ted Stone spoke in favor of the petition (see recording for detailed presentation).

02:50:22 Martina Kunnecke spoke in favor of the petition (see recording for detailed presentation).

02:52:58 Debra Harlan spoke in favor of the petition (see recording for detailed presentation).

02:55:18 Cherise Williams spoke in favor of the petition (see recording for detailed presentation).

REBUTTAL:

02:57:34 Ann Ramser spoke in rebuttal (see recording for detailed presentation).

03:00:35 Lisa DeJaco Crutcher spoke in rebuttal (see recording for detailed presentation).

03:02:51 Commissioner Weeter stated she strongly feels that they should defer any decision on this property and on this designation report at this moment (see recording for detailed presentation).

03:03:32 **Commissioners' deliberation**

**Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission
Amended Minutes
SPECIAL MEETING**

August 29, 2019

NEW BUSINESS

CASE NUMBER 19DESGNATION1000

03:06:43 On a motion by Commissioner Weeter, seconded by Commissioner Jones, the following resolution was adopted:

RESOLVED, the Louisville Metro Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission does hereby **CONTINUE** Case Number 19DESGNATION1000 to the September 19, 2019 Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission meeting, and that the Commission and the community be afforded an opportunity to take a closer look at the property in question with the permission of the Archdiocese and Catholic Charities, and to not close the public record.

The vote was as follows:

Yes: Commissioners Weeter, Buzan, Rosenberg, Hartman, Liu, Omidy, Jones, Kirchdorfer, and Jackson

Absent: Commissioners Ackerman, Fuller, and Stottman

**Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission
Amended Minutes
SPECIAL MEETING**

August 29, 2019

The meeting adjourned at approximately 12:18 p.m.

Chairman

Division Director