Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To:	Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee
Thru:	Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From:	Savannah Darr, Planning & Design Coordinator
Date:	December 13, 2019

Case No: 19-COA-0138
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 2453 Glenmary Avenue

Applicant:
Vadim Kaplan
Studio A Architecture
2330 Frankfort Avenue
Louisville, KY 40206
502-589-8007
vadim@studioaarch.com

Owner:
Mike Basham
Louisville Collegiate School
2427 Glenmary Avenue
Louisville, KY 40204
502-479-0361
mbasham@louisvillecollegiate.org

Estimated Project Cost: $42,846

Description of proposed exterior alteration:
The applicant seeks approval to replace the existing historic windows on all of the building elevations. The existing windows are 6/1 double hung wood windows with storm windows on the exterior. The proposed replacement windows are Renewal by Andersen E-Series aluminum clad wood windows with full divided lights.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application
The application was received on November 18, 2019. It was determined to be complete and requiring a committee level review on November 25, 2019. Staff conducted a site visit in January 2019 to review the windows and explain the process.

The case is scheduled to be heard by the Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on December 18, 2019 at 4:30 pm, at 444 S. 5th Street, Conference Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Window**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The R7 zoned property, within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District, is located on the north side of Glenmary Avenue, west of Ray Avenue. Louisville Collegiate School, established as a girl's school in 1915, moved to Glenmary Avenue in 1927. The original Georgian Revival Schoolhouse was designed by Frederic Lindley Morgan. Over the years, Collegiate has continued to grow and acquire many of the buildings surrounding the schoolhouse, including five former residences on Glenmary Avenue. Furthermore, multiple additions and new buildings have been constructed on the site.

2453 Glenmary Avenue is one of the five former residences on the campus. It is located on the north side of Glenmary Avenue, four buildings west of Ray Avenue. The Colonial Revival style building is a two-and-a-half-story masonry building. In 2009, staff approved a COA (12662-CT) for the installation of an ADA ramp on the west side of the building. In 2004, the Cherokee Triangle ARC approved a COA (C-04-25-CT) for the demolition of the 1920s stucco, two-car garage that was located behind the building.

Conclusions

The proposed window replacement generally does not meet the **Window** guidelines for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District. W1 states, "Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. ..." Landmarks staff has defined severely deteriorated as windows that are so rotten, they cannot be repaired, or as windows that have been repaired enough times, they are no longer contain historic material. The windows on 2453 Glenmary Avenue do not meet the definition of severely deteriorated. Routine maintenance such as reglazing, paint removal, and repair or replacement of broken parts, would enable the windows to function properly. This maintenance coupled with newer interior or exterior storm windows would increase the energy efficiency of the windows. Furthermore, the building would retain its historic fabric and historic integrity.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **denied**.

However, if the ARC determines that the window replacement meets W1, then the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness can be **approved with the following conditions:**

1. **The replacement windows shall match the historic windows in muntin configuration and muntin size.**
2. **The replacement windows shall fit the historic window openings.**
3. **Historic window trim shall not be wrapped with metal or siding material.**
4. **The window glass shall not have smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass or reflective or insulating film on building facades that can be seen from a public way.**
5. **If the design or materials change, the applicant and/or their representative shall contact staff for review and approval.**

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.

Sayannah Darr
Planning & Design Coordinator

12/13/19
Date

WINDOW

Design Guideline Checklist

+ Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
NA Not Applicable
NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of vinyl- and aluminum-clad wood window systems on primary elevations may be permissible if the proportion and detail closely match the original.	-	The existing historic windows are not severely deteriorated.
W2	Select windows that match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when repair of original windows is impossible.	+/-	See conditions of approval

W3	Evaluate the option of using appropriate salvage materials when replacing windows that are deteriorated beyond repair.	NSI	
W4	Do not use replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock windows	+/-	See conditions of approval
W5	Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie windows in exterior window openings.	NA	
W6	Do not install synthetic replacement windows (vinyl, etc.) on primary facades.	+	Aluminum clad wood windows
W7	Install replacement windows that operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	+	
W8	Do not replace multi-pane windows that have true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on primary façade elevations.	+	Full divided light proposed
W9	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	+/-	See conditions of approval
W10	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	+/-	See conditions of approval
W11	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	NA	
W12	Do not block-in or back-paint transoms or sidelights.	NA	
W13	Use surviving prototypes to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds. The reconstructed element should be constructed of materials for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if that is not possible.	NA	
W14	Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	NA	
W15	Locate any new windows openings that may be required for a new use on a façade that cannot be seen from a public way. Newly-installed windows should be compatible with the overall design of the building.	NA	
W16	Do not obscure historic window trim with metal or siding material.	+/-	See conditions of approval
W17	Do not install new floors or dropped ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W18	Install exterior storm windows that duplicate the shape of the original window. Storm windows should be painted to match the color of the window frame.	NA	
W19	Do not install exterior storm windows or screens that damage or obscure historic windows or frames. Mount storm windows on the blind stop within the window frame. Storm window or screen rails should always match the rails of the windows behind. They should have either wood or narrow, metal frames that are painted to match the color of the building trim.	NA	
W20	Do not install window air conditioning units on a primary façade if installation on a secondary façade can address the same need. If this is not an option, do not alter the window sash to accommodate the air-conditioning unit.	NA	
W21	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	

W22	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W23	Install awnings made of weather-proofed canvas of a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	
W24	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	
W25	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	
W26	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
W27	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7' above the sidewalk.	NA	
W28	Repair shutters with in-kind materials. If damage is so extensive that they cannot be repaired, replacement shutters should match the visual appearance of the originals.	NA	
W29	Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. Replacement shutters should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically-appropriate material. Solid shutters are appropriate for the ground floor, and solid or louvered shutters are appropriate for upper floors.	NA	
W30	Mount replacement shutters so that they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. This gives shutters the appearance that they are indeed operable, even if in truth they are not. Shutters should not be applied to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window.	NA	
W31	Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters.	NA	
W32	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	+	