



**Historic Landmarks and Preservation
Districts Commission**

Certificate of Appropriateness

Report of the Committee

To: Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Robert Keesaer, AIA, NCARB- Urban Design Administrator
From: Becky Gorman, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: August 31, 2015

Case No: 15COA1161
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1209 Garvin Place

Applicant: Dustin Hensley
1st and Kentucky LLC.
1209 Garvin Place
Louisville, KY 40203
502.442.5151
dustinhensley@me.com

Owner: same as applicant

Architect/Design: Darnell Farris and R. Kevin Milburn

Contractor: TBD

Estimated Project Cost: \$144,000

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval for new construction of an addition to accommodate a dining room, master bedroom, bath and 2 bedrooms upstairs. The applicant has been working with the Kentucky Heritage Council on a design for the addition that will meet the Secretary of the Interior Standards in order to meet the criteria for Historic Rehabilitation Tax Credits. The applicant owns the adjacent lot and has consolidated a portion of the lot through a minor plat.

The addition begins with what will be called a "hyphen" between the original structure and the larger 2 ½ story addition. The hyphen is designed to keep the original structure intact from both the interior and exterior aspects. The west elevation, or front façade, of the hyphen consists of large windows with transoms and a glass door all with wood trim and a glass entry awning over the door. The north and south elevations of the hyphen will be brick. It will have a slight shed roof. AC units will be on the rooftop hidden behind the original structure. There is a chimney for the fireplace. The North elevation will consist of large windows and a center door with wood trim and brick to match South elevation. AC units will be on the rooftop.

The hyphen leads to the two and half story addition which is in line with the original structure and has the same front gable roof form and width as the original structure. It is approximately 26' in height, 16'-6" in width and 28'-0" deep and sheathed with fiber-cement board-and-batten siding with 12" on center batten strips. The south elevation consists of, a full lite wood door with a glass entry awning and each story contains 2- aluminum clad wood 2-over-2 double hung windows to match those of the original shotgun house. The gable roof is pierced with a dormer containing 4 windows also wood clad. The roof is sheathed with dimensional fiberglass shingles with the color to match the original house. The east elevation contains two horizontal eyebrow windows on the 1st floor. The north elevation does not contain any windows but has a slight bumpout on the 2nd floor to accommodate the bathroom. The bumpout has a matching roof structure, material, and does include a small vertical casement window.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on August 14, 2015. The application was determined to be complete and classified as requiring Committee Review on August 17, 2015.

The case was heard by the Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee on August 26, 2015 at 5:30 pm, at 444 South Fifth Street, conference room 302.

The Old Louisville ARC met on August 26, 2015 with the meeting commencing at 5:30 p.m. with committee members Nancy Woodcock, Deborah Stewart, Jim Mims, Bob Bajandas present and Herb Fink presiding as Chair. The property owner Dustin Hensley was present along with project Architect Darnell Farris. Ms. Gorman presented the case. Dr. Mims questioned the number of units on the lot. The applicant clarified the relationship of the two lots for 1209 Garvin and 426 W. Oak. That a minor plat is in process which adds on to the back of the lot

of 1209 Garvin. Staff stated that a variance will be needed for the reduction of private yard area. Mr. Bajandas voiced concern about the structure taking up the majority of the lot and that this may set a precedent. Mr. Fink clarified that the project would need a variance. Ms. Joan Williams of 1213 Garvin Place spoke in favor of the proposed project. Ms. Woodcock questioned if anything would be done to the original structure, lighting and garbage storage. Mr. Hensley stated at some point he'd like to take it back to its original lap siding, he would use a sconce type lighting, and create a concrete pad for the garbage cans. Dr. Mims made a motion to accept the staff report and conditions as outlined in the report and include #7 to submit coloration of brick and siding to staff for review, all predicated on the approval of a variance from BOZA. The motion was seconded by Mrs. Stewart. The motion was approved with 4 ayes: Mims, Woodcock, Fink, and Stewart and 1 no: Bajandas based on his concerns stated above. The meeting was adjourned.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Addition, New Construction-Residential, and Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

This is a one- story frame shotgun clad with asbestos siding. The façade features an entrance on the south side of the front elevation with a shed roof front entry. It has a front gable roof sheathed with asphalt shingles. The front gable features a pair of windows and vent just above them. The front façade also features ganged one-over-one double hung windows with trim and window hood. The site is zoned TNZD (Traditional Neighborhood Zoning District) and is within the Traditional Neighborhood form district. The 1905-1922 Sanborn map shows a one story wood frame dwelling on the lot.

Conclusions

The applicant has been working with the Kentucky Heritage Council staff to ensure the design meets the Secretary of the Interior Standards in order to receive a Historic Rehabilitation Tax Credit. Staff also consulted with KHC staff on the submitted design. The proposed addition hyphen uses a modern design and materials to differentiate the addition from the original shotgun while leaving the historic structure in its original form on the exterior as well as interior. This hyphen addition resembles a setback side entry of a shotgun or camelback structure. The addition leads to the 2 story portion which uses a modern material for a board-and batten look. This part of the structure is in line with the historic house and is the same width. Its location, design and materials emulate a carriage house. The proposed new addition meets the applicable guidelines for

Old Louisville Historic District including, Addition, Site, and New Construction-Residential.

DECISION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved, predicated on an approval of a variance from BOZA, with the following conditions:

1. NC44- Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.
2. AC units on rooftop shall be screened.
3. Glass entry awning shall be attached on front façade of addition.
4. The addition foundation shall be stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance.
5. Submit exterior lighting to staff for approval prior to installation.
6. All stoop and exterior stairs are to be historic concrete mix.
7. Coloration of brick and siding shall be submitted to staff for review.

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.

HERB FINK.
Herb Fink
Chair

3 SEPTEMBER 2015.
Date

Attached Documents / Information

1. Staff Guideline Checklist
2. Applicant Submitted Information Packet

ADDITION

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted

NA Not Applicable

NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
A1	Ensure that the design of any new addition is in proportion with the size and scale of the historic building and district.	+	Massing is in scale with building in the surrounding area.
A2	Design any addition so that it is subordinate to the original building. Generally, additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.	+/-	
A3	Generally, additions should be attached to secondary elevations and should be set back from the front façade, so as not to damage or obscure character-defining features.	+	
A4	Use materials that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+/-	The use of brick on the north and south elevations is not in the direct viewshed.
A5	Respect original roof forms when designing an addition. Additions should complement existing forms, not overwhelm them.	+	
A6	Do not undertake any full-floor additions in residential preservation districts (adding an additional full floor on top of a building).	NA	
A7	Generally, the original orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade.	+	
A8	Design any new addition so that the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	+	
A9	Design additions to have the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion.	+	
A10	Design additions so that there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration. This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion.	+	
A11	Set back additional stories from the historic wall plane of commercial or institutional structures when such an approach is required for a new use. The construction of additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible and not damage or destroy character-defining features.	NA	
A12	Do not design additions to appear older than the original building.	NA	
A13	Comply with the Kentucky building code in such a way that a historic building's character-defining features are preserved.	+	
A14	Do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features when adding a new code-required stairway or elevator. Any such addition should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	NA	

A15	Install fire escapes only on secondary elevations. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. They should preferably be painted to match the color of the wall.	NA	
A16	Do not construct a deck on a front or side façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or finished with an opaque stain. Use the railing detail developed by the Landmarks Commission or other approved detail.	NA	
A17	Design rear decks so that they do not extend beyond the side walls of the house and are not visible from the street.	NA	
A18	Wood fire stairs should be painted or stained and should be kept to a minimum functional size.	NA	

NEW CONSTRUCTION

RESIDENTIAL DESIGN GUIDELINES

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NC1	Make sure that new designs conform to all other municipal regulations, including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations.	+/-	A variance may be required for reduction of private yard area
NC2	Do not demolish contributing structures in a historic district to make way for new or large-scale construction. Non-contributing buildings are identified in each of the district or individual landmark designations or National Register nominations.	NA	
NC3	Design new construction so that the building height, directional emphasis, scale, massing, and volume reflect the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+	
NC4	Make sure that the scale of new construction does not conflict with the historic character of the neighborhood.	+	
NC5	Incorporate materials and design elements that complement the color, size, texture, and level of craftsmanship seen in surrounding buildings.	+	
NC6	Do not use materials in new construction that are visually incompatible with surrounding historic buildings within the district. Materials to be avoided include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, chain-link fencing, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unpainted wood, and asphalt siding.	+	
NC7	Design new construction to reinforce the human scale of historic districts where this is a character-defining feature.	+	
NC8	Design new construction in such a way that it does not disrupt important public views and vistas.	+	
NC9	Reinforce existing patterns of open space and enclosure, created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, in designs for new construction.	+	

NC10	Design infill construction that reinforces the spatial organization established by surrounding buildings. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly-designed facades.	NA	
NC11	Design infill construction in such a way that the façade's organization closely relates to surrounding buildings. Window and door openings should be similar in size to their historic counterparts, as should the proportion of window to wall space. Cornice lines, columns, and storefronts are other important character-defining facade elements.	NA	
NC12	Design new construction so that the building mass has a similar sense of lightness or weight as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solids (walls) to voids (window and door openings). Historic window proportions are generally two-and-one-half (height) by one (width).	+	
NC13	Develop designs for new construction using windows that are sympathetic to the window patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportions, and muntin configurations is encouraged.	+	
NC14	Develop designs for new construction using front doors that are sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.	+	
NC15	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main entrance is the same as the majority of other buildings on the street	+	
NC16	Incorporate paved walks between sidewalks and the front entrances for new construction located on streets where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC17	Retain the character-defining features of a historic building when undertaking accessibility code-required work.	NA	
NC18	Investigate removable or portable ramps as options to providing barrier-free access.	NA	
NC19	Locate handicapped access ramps on secondary elevations wherever possible. If locating a ramp on the primary façade is required, it should be installed in a manner that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible.	NA	
NC20	Design infill construction so that it is compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings.	NA	
NC21	Design new construction to have a floor-to-floor height that is within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the floor-to-floor height is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	+	
NC22	Maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape. The space between new construction and existing structures should fall within 20 percent of the average spacing for the block.		
NC23	Maintain historic setback patterns. In order to maintain the continuity of the streetscape, setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.		
NC24	Ensure that the roofs of new buildings relate to those of neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+	
NC25	Follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings when designing rooflines for infill construction. Where the predominant form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated.	NA	

NC26	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main roof form is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street, where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.	+	
NC27	Design new construction to emphasize the existing cornice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC28	Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered.	+	
NC29	Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction.	NSI	
NC30	Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings. While use of wood siding is preferred, vinyl siding may be used for new construction, but only in areas where the predominate historic construction material is wood.	+	
NC31	Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction. Red brick is the most common masonry material found throughout the city's historic districts.	+	
NC32	Incorporate stone or cast-stone sills and lintels into new construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-defining features.	NA	
NC33	Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction.	NA	
NC34	Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance.	+	Stucco concrete block.
NC35	Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof.	NA	
NC36	Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head.	NA	
NC37	Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of adjacent secondary structures.	NA	
NC38	Site new garages adjacent to alleys where present. Review the garage prototype insert that identifies styles appropriate to preservation districts when planning a garage construction project.	NA	
NC39	Where no alleys exist, garages should be sited at the rear of the property behind the main house. Garage doors should not face the street, and access should be along the side yard. Landscape screening along the driveway is encouraged.	NA	
NC40	Use of smaller, single garage doors rather than expansive double or triple doors is preferred.	NA	
NC41	Orient the roofline of a new garage so that it is parallel with the main house or follow the predominant pattern of existing secondary structures where such a pattern exists.	NA	
NC42	Roof pitch should be no less than one in six. Where the roof form of the main house is character-defining, owners are encouraged to echo the form of the main house.	+	

NC43	Design new construction so that access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	NA	
NC44	Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	+	Downspouts will be routed in crawl space and empty into the yard on the south elevation. Potentially a bioswale location.

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+	
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	+/-	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	NA	
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	NA	
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	+	A portion of the side steps will be removed. Maintain existing stoop and stair if possible if not use historic concrete mix.
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	NA	
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	NA	
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	NA	

ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NSI	
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NA	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	+	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	