

Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes

November 17, 2016

A meeting of the Louisville Metro Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission was held on Thursday, November 17, 2016 at 9:00 a.m. at the Old Jail Building located at 514 W. Liberty Street, Louisville, Kentucky.

Commission Members present:

Bob Vice, Chair

Emily Liu (left at approximately 9:30 a.m.)

Roberto Bajandas

Amin Omidy

Joanne Weeter

Milton Haskins Jr.

Tom Owen (left at approximately 9:58 a.m.)

Carrye Jones (arrived at approximately 9:15 a.m.)

Tamika Jackson (arrived at approximately 9:25 a.m.)

Commission Members absent:

Robert Kirchdorfer

Jay Stottman

Reba Doutrick

Chris Hartman

Staff Members Present:

Bob Keesaer, Urban Design Supervisor

Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer

Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Specialist

Becky Gorman, Historic Preservation Specialist

John Carroll, Legal Counsel

Sue Reid, Management Assistant

The following matters were considered:

Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes

November 17, 2016

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

NOTE: The Approval of Minutes was heard out of order, as Item #4 on the agenda.

Approval of the minutes of the October 20, 2016 Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission meeting.

00:34:33 On a motion by Commissioner Bajandas, seconded by Commissioner Jones, the following resolution was adopted:

RESOLVED, that the Louisville Metro Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission does hereby **APPROVE** the minutes of the meeting conducted on October 20, 2016.

The vote was as follows:

Yes: Commissioners Owen, Haskins, Weeter, Bajandas, Jones and Chair Vice

Abstain: Commissioners Omidy and Jackson

Absent: Commissioners Liu, Kirchdorfer, Stottman, Doutrick and Hartman

NOTE: The following comments regarding Minutes were made at the end of the docket, just prior to Adjournment.

00:57:50 Commissioner Weeter stated she knows that Deborah Stewart and perhaps others were hoping to speak at the October 20, 2016 meeting. She stated her question is a procedural one; Commissioner Weeter stated she doesn't know that at any point the Commission asked for public comment and she was wondering if that was because of the nature of the appeal process.

00:58:24 Chair Vice stated our Ordinance does allow us, at our discretion, to take additional evidence or not. Chair Vice stated it's a public hearing, but not necessarily where testimony is taken; it's an open meeting and our discretion whether we take additional testimony. Chair Vice stated that prior to the meeting we were thinking that because this was an appeal by – the owner got the approval they needed from the ARC so they weren't the appellant. It's sort of an unusual situation; it was a member of the public that was affected that appealed. Chair Vice stated he thinks their mindset was we hear from the applicant and we hear from the owner, it was basically that simple. Chair Vice stated we were

Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes

November 17, 2016

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

unaware until after the meeting that some of the members of the ARC wanted to speak, and again, given the context of the way that appeal arose, he'd have to say that thinking back that was probably sort of a first impression. Chair Vice stated normally the ARC has denied something and the owner appeals and it's a different environment. Chair Vice stated that after the meeting one of the ARC members did come up and express interest in speaking and he said we weren't aware of that frankly because of the way it came up, but we'll certainly look to that in future appeals to make sure we cover that. Chair Vice stated that two of the members of the Commission are on the ARC; one of them was here and spoke about the ARC's proceeding and we had the ARC's record. Chair Vice stated that on the one hand, again, that's within our discretion because we do have a record before us and we had the applicant and the owner speaking, but certainly we value the participation of the ARC members on the ARC's, and in situations where they want to participate, if they do, we would want to hear from them. Chair Vice stated that candidly, it just wasn't on the radar in the context of that appeal.

01:00:30 Commissioner Weeter stated she agrees with everything Chair Vice said. Commissioner Weeter stated she wonders if that particular point, if we don't need to make sure that that point gets in the minutes specifically; just the procedural nature of the dynamic.

01:00:55 Chair Vice stated they're in these minutes.

01:00:58 Commissioner Weeter stated her point is that rather than just a statement in the next minutes that reflect this meeting that say there was a general discussion of the public hearing held on October 20th, I wonder if we couldn't go into just a tiny bit more detail. Commissioner Weeter stated she's talking about this discussion, not what happened on October 20th.

01:01:23 Bob Keesaer asked Commissioner Weeter what she would like to have put on the record.

01:01:26 Commissioner Weeter replied "what Bob said". Commissioner Weeter continued by saying she fully supports, but her sense is that Deborah Stewart and perhaps others felt that there should have been an opportunity for them to speak and they did not get that opportunity and we don't have to go back and revisit that, but she thinks there needs to be a little bit of explanation in the record.

01:01:57 Chair Vice stated he's very comfortable with that; we've already said what we've said and he doesn't want to back over all that. Chair Vice stated

Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes

November 17, 2016

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

the point is, it's certainly in the record now and when we get the minutes from this meeting we can take a look at that.

01:02:09 Commissioner Weeter stated she would appreciate that and she thinks Deborah would too.

Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes

November 17, 2016

NEW BUSINESS

NR_1005_16

Request:	National Register Nomination
Project Name:	Calvary Lutheran Church
Location:	1838 Bardstown Rd
Jurisdiction:	Louisville Metro
Council District:	8- Tom Owen
Applicant:	Cash Moter
Case Manager:	Cynthia Elmore

An audio/visual recording of the Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission meeting related to this case is available on the Planning & Design Services website, or you may contact the Customer Service staff to obtain a copy.

Agency testimony:

00:06:49 Cynthia Elmore provided a description of the case, and introduced the applicant, Cash Moter, who will be presenting the case (see recording for detailed presentation).

The following spoke in favor of the request:

Cash Moter, 550 S. 4th Street, Louisville, KY 40202

Summary of testimony in favor of the request:

00:07:58 Cash Moter presented the case and showed a Powerpoint presentation. Mr. Moter responded to questions from the Commissioners (see recording for detailed presentation).

The following spoke in opposition to the request:

No one spoke.

00:18:42 On a motion by Commissioner Weeter, seconded by Commissioner Haskins, the following resolution was adopted:

Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes

November 17, 2016

NEW BUSINESS

NR_1005_16

RESOLVED, that the Louisville Metro Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission in Case Number NR_1005_16, does hereby **RECOMMEND FOR APPROVAL** the National Register Nomination (Calvary Lutheran Church) to be reviewed by the National Register State Review Board.

The vote was as follows:

Yes: Commissioners Liu, Owen, Haskins, Weeter, Bajandas, Omidy, Jackson, Jones and Chair Vice

Absent: Commissioners Kirchdorfer, Stottman, Doutrick and Hartman

Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes

November 17, 2016

NEW BUSINESS

NR_1006_16

Request:	National Register Nomination
Project Name:	Haury Motor Company Garage
Location:	741 S. 3rd St.
Applicant:	Joe Pierson
Jurisdiction:	Louisville Metro
Council District:	6-David James
Case Manager:	Cynthia Elmore

An audio/visual recording of the Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission meeting related to this case is available on the Planning & Design Services website, or you may contact the Customer Service staff to obtain a copy.

Agency testimony:

00:20:10 Cynthia Elmore provided a description of the case, and introduced the applicant, Joe Pierson, who will be presenting the case (see recording for detailed presentation).

The following spoke in favor of the request:

Joe Pierson, 1501 Morton Ave., Louisville, KY 40204

Summary of testimony of those in favor of the request:

00:20:54 Joe Pierson presented the case and showed a Powerpoint presentation. Mr. Pierson responded to questions from the Commissioners (see recording for detailed presentation).

The following spoke in opposition of the request:

No one spoke.

00:30:57 On a motion by Commissioner Bajandas, seconded by Commissioner Haskins, the following resolution was adopted:

Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes

November 17, 2016

NEW BUSINESS

NR_1006_16

RESOLVED, that the Louisville Metro Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission in Case Number NR_1006_16, does hereby **RECOMMEND FOR APPROVAL** the National Register Nomination (Haury Motor Company Garage) to be reviewed by the National Register State Review Board.

The vote was as follows:

Yes: Commissioners Owen, Haskins, Weeter, Bajandas, Omidy, Jackson, Jones and Chair Vice

Absent: Commissioners Liu, Kirchdorfer, Stottman, Doutrick and Hartman

Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes

November 17, 2016

NEW BUSINESS

ARC_Appt_Lindsey_Stoughton

Request: Butchertown ARC Application-Lindsey Stoughton
Project Name: Butchertown ARC Application-Lindsey Stoughton
Location: Butchertown Historic Preservation District
Applicant: Lindsey Stoughton
Jurisdiction: Louisville Metro
Council District: 9-Bill Hollander
Case Manager: Bob Keesaer

NOTE: This case was heard out of order, as the first item on the agenda.

An audio/visual recording of the Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission meeting related to this case is available on the Planning & Design Services website, or you may contact the Customer Service staff to obtain a copy.

Agency testimony:

00:03:07 Bob Keesaer provided a brief review of Lindsey Stoughton's background (see recording for detailed presentation).

00:04:14 On a motion by Commissioner Bajandas, seconded by Commissioner Haskins, the following resolution was adopted:

RESOLVED, that the Louisville Metro Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission does hereby **RECOMMEND** to the Louisville Metro Council that the proposed nomination of Lindsey Stoughton to the Butchertown ARC be **APPROVED**.

The vote was as follows:

Yes: Commissioners Liu, Haskins, Weeter, Bajandas, Omidy and Chair Vice

Abstain: Commissioner Owen

Absent: Commissioners Kirchdorfer, Stottman, Doutrick, Hartman, Jackson and Jones

00:05:36 **Chair Vice noted that there has been a resignation on the Old Louisville ARC.**

Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes

November 17, 2016

Business Session LMC.ARC.Cont.Ed

Request: ARC & LMC Continuing Education - Bob Keesaer
Project Name: Continuing Education
Jurisdiction: Louisville Metro Government
Case Manager: Bob Keesaer

An audio/visual recording of the Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission meeting related to this case is available on the Planning & Design Services website, or you may contact the Customer Service staff to obtain a copy.

Agency testimony:

00:35:41 Bob Keesaer provided a continuing education on Mid-Century Modern Design and showed a Powerpoint presentation (see recording for detailed presentation).

NOTE: This was an educational session only. Therefore, no vote or action was taken.

Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes

November 17, 2016

The meeting adjourned at approximately 10:13 a.m.