



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: April 14, 2021

Case No: 21-COA-0017
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 218 W. Oak St.

Applicant: Joseph Impellizzeri
239 S. 5th St. Ste. 1021
Louisville, KY 40202
(502) 996-2272
josephimpellizzeri@gmail.com

Owner: Same as Applicant

Estimated Project Cost: \$10,000.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

1. The applicant is seeking approval to construct a concrete retaining wall approximately 2' – 11-7/8" in height with an aluminum picket fence that will rest atop of the retaining wall at approximately 2' – 6" in height for a total height of approximately 5' – 6". The retaining wall and fence will extend approximately 14' from the left front corner of the north façade, toward the sidewalk, then they will make a 90 degree turn and continue to the right approximately 22' – 9" along the sidewalk where they will tie into the proposed new steps, allowing for an approximately 36" break, before then continuing approximately 22' – 9" where the wall and fence will terminate at the property line, and eliminating the existing off-street parking available to the building. The space within the retaining wall will then be filled with dirt and grass will be planted.

2. The applicant also seeks approval for a new concrete walk, proposed to be approximately 36" wide and 14' long, with two stairs that will lead pedestrians from the sidewalk, to the entrance of the building.

3. The applicant requests approval to remove and replace the existing replacement windows on the north, south, and east facades of the building. The applicant proposes to extend the size of 3 windows on the north façade, to go from floor to ceiling height, as well as to change out the replacement door with a five lite glass entry door. The applicant proposes to remove the paneling and install six new windows within the existing opening on the east façade, as well as to remove the two windows located at the right corner of the east façade, expand the opening, and install three floor to ceiling height windows to match those on the north façade. On the south façade, the applicant proposes to remove the paneling in the existing window opening and install a double entry five lite door with a transom above each.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was submitted on February 5, 2021. Staff emailed the applicant to let them know that the application had been received, and to learn more about the project. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on April 21, 2021 at 5:30 pm, online.

The Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee met on April 21, at 5:30pm to hear the case. At that time the committee decided to continue the case, to allow the applicant time to rework the design of the proposed front fencing. The applicant has combined this project with a larger project adjacent to it, and will be presenting the new design to the Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee meeting on September 22, 2021 at 4:30 pm, online via WebEx. At that time the applicants designer will discuss the redesign of the building in correlation with the larger project for the Oak St. corridor.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Site**, and **Windows**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The site is located three lots west of the intersection of W. Oak St. and S. 2nd St. The property is zoned TNZD in a Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The Mid-Century-style structure appears to be constructed circa 1950 and is a one-story, brick and siding clad commercial building, that has been somewhat altered in terms of the materials on the exterior facades as well as openings over the years.

Conclusions

The proposed location of the retaining wall and fencing (Part 1) are primarily along the front of the building that faces W. Oak St. The proposed fencing and retaining wall generally do not meet the Old Louisville Design Guidelines for **Site**. The primary conflict with the Design Guidelines relates to **ST8** which states to maintain the original front yard topography, **ST10** which states not to install masonry walls in

street visible locations unless they are used to retain earth or there is an historic precedent **ST13** and **ST14** which states not to install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent, and historically-compatible iron fencing should be under 2'-5".

The proposed location of the walk (Part 2) connects the sidewalk to the front façade and generally does meet the Old Louisville Design Guidelines for **Site. ST3** states to use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.

The proposed window replacement generally does meet the Old Louisville Design Guidelines for **Windows. W14** states not to alter the number, size, and location of original windows. The existing windows however are not original, and the sizes of the existing windows have been altered previously.

Recommendation for part 1

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, Staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **denied**.

Recommendation for part 2 and part 3

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, Staff recommends the application for a certificate of appropriateness be approved.

- 1. If the scope of the project were to change, applicant shall contact staff for approval.**
- 2. The applicant shall use historic concrete mix, for any and all concrete visible from the street**
- 3. The applicant shall provide staff with a window cut sheet for the proposed window change prior to work commence.**
- 4. The applicant shall obtain any and all necessary work permits.**

Bradley Fister
Bradley Fister
Historic Preservation Specialist

04-14-2021
Date

WINDOW

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of vinyl- and aluminum-clad wood window systems on primary elevations may be permissible if the proportion and detail closely match the original.	NA	
W2	Select windows that match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when repair of original windows is impossible.	+/-	Existing windows are not historic and have been enclosed.
W3	Evaluate the option of using appropriate salvage materials when replacing windows that are deteriorated beyond repair.	NA	
W4	Do not use replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock windows	NA	
W5	Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie windows in exterior window openings.	NA	
W6	Do not install synthetic replacement windows (vinyl, etc.) on primary facades.	NA	
W7	Install replacement windows that operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	+/-	Windows being replaced were not original.
W8	Do not replace multi-pane windows that have true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on primary façade elevations.	NA	
W9	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	+	Glass shall be clear
W10	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	+	Glass shall be clear
W11	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	NA	
W12	Do not block-in or back-paint transoms or sidelights.	+	
W13	Use surviving prototypes to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds. The reconstructed element should be constructed of materials for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if that is not possible.	NA	
W14	Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	+/-	The windows have been replaced
W15	Locate any new windows openings that may be required for a new use on a façade that cannot be seen from a public way. Newly-installed windows should be compatible with the overall design of the building.	+/-	The resize and shape of the new windows are visible from street.
W16	Do not obscure historic window trim with metal or siding material.	NA	
W17	Do not install new floors or dropped ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W18	Install exterior storm windows that duplicate the shape of the original window. Storm windows should be painted to match the color of the window frame.	NA	

W19	Do not install exterior storm windows or screens that damage or obscure historic windows or frames. Mount storm windows on the blind stop within the window frame. Storm window or screen rails should always match the rails of the windows behind. They should have either wood or narrow, metal frames that are painted to match the color of the building trim.	NA	
W20	Do not install window air conditioning units on a primary façade if installation on a secondary façade can address the same need. If this is not an option, do not alter the window sash to accommodate the air-conditioning unit.	NA	
W21	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W22	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W23	Install awnings made of weather-proofed canvas of a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	
W24	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	
W25	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	
W26	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
W27	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7' above the sidewalk.	NA	
W28	Repair shutters with in-kind materials. If damage is so extensive that they cannot be repaired, replacement shutters should match the visual appearance of the originals.	NA	
W29	Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. Replacement shutters should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically-appropriate material. Solid shutters are appropriate for the ground floor, and solid or louvered shutters are appropriate for upper floors.	NA	
W30	Mount replacement shutters so that they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. This gives shutters the appearance that they are indeed operable, even if in truth they are not. Shutters should not be applied to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window.	NA	
W31	Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters.	NA	
W32	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	NA	

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	NA	
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	NA	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	NA	
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	NA	
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	NA	
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	-	Proposal of project regrades existing site
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	+/-	The applicant shall be cautious of any Excavation near the site
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	-	The masonry wall is street visible
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	

ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	-	The proposed fencing height is greater than 2'-5"
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	-	There is not historic precedent in this case.
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NA	
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NA	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NA	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	