



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: May 6, 2022

Case No: 22-COA-0045
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 2246 Grinstead Dr.

Applicant: Alex Morse
2246 Grinstead Dr.
Louisville, KY 40204
972-951-8606
alex@makesitgood.net

Owner: same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant requests after-the-fact approval to replace the 5" reveal synthetic lap siding under the front facing gable, with a synthetic siding that mimics the look of wood shake siding.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on February 5, 2022. Staff has worked with applicant extensively to explore ways to bring the property into compliance prior to coming to the committee. It was then determined that this application would need a Committee-level review and is scheduled to be heard by the Cherokee Triangle ARC on Wednesday May 18, 2022 at 4:30pm, in-person at the Metro Development Center 444 S. 5th S. Rm. 101.

Findings

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Siding and Trim**. The report of the Commission staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is included in this report.

Site Context/ Background

The R5B zoned property in the Traditional Neighborhood Form District is located on the south side of Grinstead Dr., eight lots northeast of its intersection with Hilliard Ave. The circa 1941 home is a one-and-a-half-story, Perma-Stone, and vinyl lap sided home with a partially exposed raised concrete foundation. The surrounding buildings are a mix of homes, and condos in a number of different styles and time periods.

Previously approved at staff level 22-COA-0 , was the after-the-fact door change, and the after-the fact painting of the Perma-Stone and vinyl siding.

Previously approved at staff level (S-98-127-CT) was the after-the-fact vinyl siding on the sides, and rear of the house.

Conclusions

The shake siding under the front gable generally does not meet the Cherokee Triangle design guidelines for **Siding and Trim**. There is shake style siding in the District, but it is on houses that historically had shake style siding. This house did not and would not have historically had this type of siding. Thus, the synthetic shake siding is conjectural and falsely historic. That is why it does not meet the Design Guidelines, and why staff must recommend changing this back to 5" reveal lap siding like was previously there.

It should be noted, this house is one of the later constructions in the district and is currently not eligible for tax credits because the 1976 National Register nomination ended the date of the district at 1924, which was standard practice at the time. Since this house was built in 1941, it's currently outside the eligible dates. However, it is still historic, and is physically located within the National Register District and Preservation District boundaries.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions**:

- 1. The applicant shall remove the existing synthetic shake siding and replace it with 5" lap siding within two years of approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness by the Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee.**
- 2. The applicant shall contact staff if the scope of the project were to change, and before the applicant makes any other exterior changes to the property.**

SIDING & TRIM

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
SD1	Do not replace missing wood features with conjectural or falsely-historic reconstructions or with newly-designed elements that are incompatible with the building's size, scale, material, or color.	-	Previously there was 5" reveal synthetic lap siding on the front elevation. The synthetic shake siding is conjectural and falsely historic.
SD2	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	+	Photos are available of the house before and after work was done
SD3	Consider using contemporary wood siding, which conveys the visual appearance of historic siding, when replacement of such materials is required.	+	See conditions of approval
SD4	Do not use textured plywood (T-111) vertical siding. It is not an appropriate substitute material.	NA	
SD5	Do not install artificial stone, asbestos shingles, or asphalt shingles over or as a replacement for exterior siding.	NA	
SD6	Orient all replacement siding horizontally, unless there is sound, historic documentation for a different original orientation.	+	Replacement siding is hung horizontally
SD7	Do not install vinyl or aluminum siding on primary elevations on historic buildings. Retention of exposed original wood siding is always preferred; however, if a decision is made to apply siding to side and rear elevations, it should be done in a way that does not obscure or damage historic ornament, such as fishscale shingles, window casings, sills, hoods, brackets, and corner-boards.	--	The front elevation previously contained synthetic siding on this front portion.
SD8	Use only vinyl or aluminum siding that matches the dimensions of the original siding. Generally, smooth-faced, narrow-profile siding (3" or 4" depending on the character of the existing siding) is acceptable for installation on secondary elevations. Wherever possible without causing damage to historic fabric, trim, such as corner-boards, should project slightly beyond the vinyl siding.	-	Replacement siding does not match the lap siding that was on the front façade previously.
SD9	Make sure that removal, handling, and disposal of lead-containing paint complies with all local, state, and federal standards.	NA	
SD10	Do not remove exterior siding to install insulation within the exterior walls of historic wood frame construction. This can result in damage to historic fabric. Installation of insulation with a proper vapor barrier should be done from the interior.	NA	