



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer *CE*
From: Savannah Darr, Planning & Design Coordinator
Date: September 20, 2019

Case No: 19-COA-0053
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 211 E. Magnolia Avenue

Applicant: Dennis Lally
Lally Construction, LLC
1031 S. 7th Street
Louisville, KY 40203
502-974-6945
denlally@gmail.com

Owner: John Long
211 E. Magnolia Avenue
Louisville, KY 40208
502-797-1210
Jpm444@gmail.com

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks after-the-fact approval to remove the historic front porch roof and columns and replace them. The new columns are fiberglass columns made by HB&G. The applicant also seeks approval to replace the non-historic front door with a new ¾ lite door.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on August 1, 2019 and considered complete and requiring staff level review on August 5, 2019. Staff conducted a site visit on August 7, 2019 and discovered the porch columns and roof had been demolished without a COA or building permit. A Notice of Violation was sent August 8, 2019 and work continued. Zoning Enforcement and Building Enforcement issued stop work orders

on August 23, 2019. The case became a committee level review on August 19, 2019 and required elevation drawings and building materials, which were submitted to staff on August 23, 2019. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on September 25, 2019 at 5:30 pm, at 444 S. 5th Street, Conference Room 302.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Door** and **Porch**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The property is located on the north side of E. Magnolia Avenue one lot east of S. Brook Street. The site is zoned TNZD within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The two-story masonry residence is surrounded by other residences of varying sizes and architectural styles. In 1990, staff issued a COA (S-90-25-OL) for replacement of gutters and roofing materials.

Conclusions

The proposed front door replacement generally meets the Old Louisville design guidelines for **Door**. The existing door is non-historic and the appearance of the historic door is unknown. The proposed $\frac{3}{4}$ lite door without the muntins is appropriate for this style of architecture.

The proposed front porch replacement generally meets the Old Louisville design guidelines for **Porch**. However, when historic porch materials are proposed for replacement, staff conducts a site visit to determine their state of deterioration. Columns are a character-defining historic element that should be preserved when possible. Yet when staff conducted a site visit, the porch had been removed. Thus, the historic materials were not reviewed or documented. While the new porch meets the design guidelines, retention of historic materials whenever possible is preferred.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions**:

1. The new door shall be a $\frac{3}{4}$ lite door without muntins.
2. The applicant and/or their representative shall obtain a building permit.
3. If the design changes, the applicant and/or their representative shall contact staff for review and approval.

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.

9/20/19

Date

Savannah Darr

Savannah Darr

Planning & Design Coordinator

DOOR

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
D1	Do not alter the character of entrances by either removing historic elements or through the addition of elements for which there is no historic precedent.	+	The current door is non-historic
D2	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric	+	
D3	Use historical, pictorial, and physical documentation when undertaking the reconstruction of a missing entrance or porch feature. If there is not sufficient information to determine the original design, a new design should be prepared that is compatible with the architectural character of the building and the district. Conjectural or falsely-historical designs are not appropriate.	+	
D4	Use only those replacement doors that duplicate the design, proportion, and arrangement of paneling and glazing of the original.	+/-	It is uncertain what the historic door looked like but a $\frac{3}{4}$ lite door without muntins is appropriate.
D5	Do not replace historic double leaf doors with a single door.	+	
D6	Do not alter original openings to accommodate stock doors.	+	
D7	Install only screen doors or storm doors that are simple with a narrow-frame design that enables the inner door to be seen. Metal screen and storm doors should be painted or finished to match the inner door.	NA	
D8	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original doors or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grilles should retract out of sight during business hours and preferably be mounted inside the glass. Painting security bars an unobtrusive color is recommended.	NA	

D9	Differentiate between primary and secondary doors, using the detailing of the doors or the articulation of the frame.	NA	
D10	Do not add vestibules to primary facades unless there is a historic precedent. Such additions alter the character, proportion, and massing of the façade.	NA	
D11	Do not create new entrances on facades that can be seen from a public way.	NA	
D12	Replacement of non-original, non-historic doors with new doors that are appropriate to the period and style of the building and are the size of the original opening is recommended.	+	

PORCH

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
PO1	Replace reconstructed entrance or porch features with in-kind materials. If that is not economically or technically feasible, a compatible substitute material may be considered. Composition and plastic moldings, however, should not be used due to their unproven longevity.	+/-	Staff did not review the historic material prior to its removal. Only have pictorial evidence, which is not as reliable.
PO2	Photographically document architectural porch features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	+/-	Photographed by applicant but not by Landmarks staff
PO3	Design replacement porch railings and balusters to match the originals as closely as possible. If it is technically or economically unfeasible to accomplish this, a simplified porch rail and baluster design may be used of 2" x 4" rails and 2" x 2" pickets, set between top and bottom rails, and nailed to the inside face of the rail. Railings should be finished with paint or an opaque stain. Plans are available from the Landmarks Commission.	NA	
PO4	Do not use cast- or wrought-iron columns, railings, or balusters as a replacement for brick or wood porch elements. Columns should match the proportion, detailing, and size of the original.	NA	
PO5	When installing a new code-required handrail or railing, select a design that is simple and stylistically appropriate. Generally, metal is appropriate for masonry buildings and wood for frame buildings.	NA	
PO6	Do not add conjectural porch ornament; often its style conflicts with the style of the house.	NA	
PO7	Do not use over-sized boards (2" thick) for porch floors. 3/4" to 1" tongue-and-groove boards are generally appropriate.	NA	

PO8	Install replacement porch flooring that closely matches the original tongue-and-groove flooring dimensions. A maximum gap of 1/16" should be left between boards to allow for expansion. Wood edging should be applied to the exposed ends of floorboards to prevent moisture infiltration into the grain.	NA	
PO9	Do not cover porch or cornice elements with vinyl or aluminum siding.	+	
PO10	Do not install porch ceilings or close in exposed eaves where none existed previously. Exposed rafters and roof decks are character-defining features for certain architectural styles.	NA	
PO11	Replace deteriorated porch steps with in-kind materials. Replacement steps should be of the same scale and dimensions as the original. Stone steps may be patched with concrete that is tinted a visually-compatible color.	NA	
PO12	Do not replace historic stone steps unless the stone itself is no longer useable. Resetting stones on a firm foundation and repointing or applying sealant can address most problems.	NA	
PO13	Do not enclose front porches. Screen panels that can be removed seasonally, are set behind porch elements, and do not damage historic fabric may be permitted.	NA	
PO14	Do not obscure the design or detailing of original porch elements when undertaking a side or rear porch enclosure project. Large sheets of glass recessed behind original porch features should be used rather than solid materials such as wood, stucco, or masonry.	NA	
PO15	Do not add porches to the primary façades of structures that never had porches.	NA	