



---

## Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

---

### Report to the Committee

---

---

To: Butchertown Architectural Review Committee  
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer *CE*  
From: Becky Gorman, Historic Preservation Specialist  
Date: August 3, 2018- August 17, 2018

---

**Case No:** 18COA1160  
**Classification:** Staff Review

#### GENERAL INFORMATION

**Property Address:** 1641 & 1643 Story Ave.

**Applicant:** Kristina Pohl  
2318 Winston Ave  
Louisville, KY 40205  
502.797.7318  
Kristina.m.pohl@gmail.com

**Owner:** Martin Pohl  
HP Investments, LLC  
922 Franklin Street  
Louisville, KY 40206  
502.777.4359  
martypohl@yahoo.com

**Estimated Project Cost:** \$9000.00

#### Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant proposes to replace all wood windows with new white vinyl one-over-one double hung windows.

#### Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on June 27, 2018. The application was determined to be complete and classified as requiring Committee Review on July 2, 2018. Prior to the submittal of the application, a case was opened by 311

enforcement for the replacement of windows without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

The case is scheduled for a hearing at the regular meeting of the Butchertown Architectural Review Committee on August 8, 2018 at 5:30p.m., at Metro Development Center, 444 South Fifth Street in conference room 101.

The Butchertown Architectural Review committee met on August 8, 2018 at 5:30p.m., at Metro Development Center, 444 South Fifth Street in conference room 302 to review the case #18COA1160. Members present were Lindsey Stoughton (Presiding Chair), Tim Stephens, Tamika Jackson, and Amin Omidy. The applicant Kristina Pohl and owner Martin Pohl were present. Staff representative Becky Gorman presented the case. Ms. Pohl presented a PowerPoint presentation with additional interior photos stating her case for replacing the windows. Mr. Pohl also discussed the block in which this house is located and that the neighboring structures have replacement vinyl windows. Nick Phillips, of 922 Franklin Street, was present and spoke in support of the applicant changing the windows. Stephens expressed his concern regarding the replacement of historic windows especially the windows most visible from the street. There was further discussion about the Window Design Guidelines, evaluation of windows, and meeting guideline W1 in order to replace windows. Mr. Pohl mentioned again the level of deterioration of the windows from the interior. There was discussion about deferring the meeting and staff re-evaluating the windows from the interior. Mr. Omidy stated supporting the staff report but was open to deferring the meeting for further evaluation of the windows from the interior. The committee was in agreement. Mr. Omidy made a motion to defer the decision for further evaluation by the staff and reconvene the meeting on Wednesday, August 22, 2018 at 5:30p.m. The meeting was adjourned.

## **FINDINGS**

### **Guidelines**

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Butchertown Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Window**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

### **Site Context/ Background**

The double shotgun masonry house is located on the north side of Story Avenue. The structure is located next to another double shotgun house and surrounded by other one and two story homes built around the late 1800's.

Case# 18COA1147 was received at the same time as this application but was eligible for staff review. The non-original existing front entry doors were approved for replacement with a wood panel door with two vertical lights and the

other door will be a wood panel door without lights. The asphalt shingles on the roof were replaced in-kind which is considered general maintenance.

The house has most of its original wood windows with the exception of the three that were recently replaced. The front façade windows are 4-over-4 double hung wood windows. The front window of 1643 was replaced with a 1-over-1 double hung vinyl window. There are 5 windows on the brick portion of east elevation which are 6-over-6 wood windows. The two windows closest to the front façade have been replaced with 1-over-1 double hung vinyl windows. The windows in the rear addition vary from 1-over-1 double hung wood windows to 6-over-6 double hung wood windows. There are 5 windows in the brick portion of the structure on the west elevation. The one closest to the front façade is a 4-over-4 double hung wood window. Two of the windows that were originally 4-over-4 double hung wood windows have had repairs and are now 4-over-1 double hung wood windows. The two remaining windows are 6-over-6 double hung wood windows. There are two windows in the upper story of the rear elevation. These are 6-over-6 double hung wood windows.

### **Conclusions**

Three of the windows were replaced prior to the submittal of the application. However, the owner has the windows that were removed on site. Staff inspected the material condition of the remaining windows on August 1, 2018. Staff determined that the windows in the brick portion of the structure are not severely deteriorated. Staff did note that the sills of the 6-over-6 windows on the west elevation are rotting. The windows in the rear addition meet the criteria of severely deteriorated.

The vinyl replacement window on the front façade in 1643 does not match the look or muntin configuration of the original historic wood window and therefore, does not meet Window guidelines W2 and W6. The windows in the brick portion of the structure do not meet the criteria for severely deteriorated as required in guideline W1 and the proposed vinyl replacement windows do not match the muntin configuration of the existing wood windows. Therefore, the proposal does not meet the application Window guidelines W1 and W2.

The windows in the rear addition meet the criteria for severely deteriorated, however, the new replacement windows would have to meet W2, W4, and W7.

Staff conducted a site visit on August 9, 2018. After re-evaluating the windows from the interior of the structure, staff concluded that the 6-over-6 windows on the west elevation and the 2 windows in the upper story rear elevation do meet the criteria for severely deteriorated. The remaining windows on the west elevation, the 4-over-4, and 4-over-1 windows, do not meet the criteria for severely deteriorated and should be repaired. The remaining 6-over-6 windows on the east elevation do not meet the criteria for severely deteriorated and should be repaired. Staff discussed with Ms. Pohl repairing the remaining 6-over-6 windows on the east elevation and moving them to the window openings closest to the street and reinstalling the replacement windows further back and adding appropriate grids to the new windows. Staff maintains that the remaining window

on the front façade should be repaired and the one that has been removed should be repaired and reinstalled.

## RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends that the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved with the following conditions:

1. The remaining original historic window on the front façade shall be repaired.
2. The original historic window that has been removed should be repaired and reinstalled.
3. The 4-over-4 and 4-over-1 historic wood windows on the west elevation shall remain and be repaired.
4. The remaining 6-over-6 historic wood windows on the east elevation shall be repaired and moved to the window openings closest to the street. Appropriate grids shall be added to the replacement windows. Then those replacement windows shall be installed in the openings where the wood windows are removed.
5. New windows shall match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features.
6. Openings shall remain as they are and are not to be altered for stock windows.
7. Any changes to the scope of work or material shall be submitted to staff for review and approval prior to installation.
8. The applicant shall meet all other development and building codes that pertain to the project.



Becky Gorman  
Historic Preservation Specialist

Date

8/17/18

## Attached Documents / Information

1. Staff Guideline Checklist

# WINDOW

## Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted

NA Not Applicable

NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
<b>W1</b>	Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of vinyl- and aluminum-clad wood window systems on primary elevations may be permissible if the proportion and detail closely match the original.	+/-	The windows that meet the classification for severely deteriorated may be replaced. See conclusions and the conditions of approval.
<b>W2</b>	Select windows that match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when repair of original windows is impossible.	+/-	See conclusions and the conditions of approval.
<b>W3</b>	Evaluate the option of using appropriate salvage materials when replacing windows that are deteriorated beyond repair.	NSI	
<b>W4</b>	Do not use replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock windows	NSI	See the conditions of approval.
<b>W5</b>	Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie windows in exterior window openings.	+	
<b>W6</b>	Do not install synthetic replacement windows (vinyl, etc.) on primary facades.	+	See conclusions and conditions of approval.
<b>W7</b>	Install replacement windows that operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	+	See conditions of approval.
<b>W8</b>	Do not replace multi-pane windows that have true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on primary façade elevations.	+	
<b>W9</b>	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	NA	
<b>W10</b>	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	NA	
<b>W11</b>	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	NA	
<b>W12</b>	Do not block-in or back-paint transoms or sidelights.	NA	
<b>W13</b>	Use surviving prototypes to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds. The reconstructed element should be constructed of materials for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if that is not possible.	NA	
<b>W14</b>	Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	NA	
<b>W15</b>	Locate any new windows openings that may be required for a new use on a façade that cannot be seen from a public way. Newly-installed windows should be compatible with the overall design of the building.	NA	
<b>W16</b>	Do not obscure historic window trim with metal or siding material.	NA	

<b>W17</b>	Do not install new floors or dropped ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
<b>W18</b>	Install exterior storm windows that duplicate the shape of the original window. Storm windows should be painted to match the color of the window frame.	NA	
<b>W19</b>	Do not install exterior storm windows or screens that damage or obscure historic windows or frames. Mount storm windows on the blind stop within the window frame. Storm window or screen rails should always match the rails of the windows behind. They should have either wood or narrow, metal frames that are painted to match the color of the building trim.	NA	
<b>W20</b>	Do not install window air conditioning units on a primary façade if installation on a secondary façade can address the same need. If this is not an option, do not alter the window sash to accommodate the air-conditioning unit.	NA	
<b>W21</b>	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
<b>W22</b>	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
<b>W23</b>	Install awnings made of weather-proofed canvas of a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	
<b>W24</b>	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	
<b>W25</b>	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	
<b>W26</b>	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
<b>W27</b>	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7' above the sidewalk.	NA	
<b>W28</b>	Repair shutters with in-kind materials. If damage is so extensive that they cannot be repaired, replacement shutters should match the visual appearance of the originals.	NA	
<b>W29</b>	Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. Replacement shutters should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically-appropriate material. Solid shutters are appropriate for the ground floor, and solid or louvered shutters are appropriate for upper floors.	NA	
<b>W30</b>	Mount replacement shutters so that they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. This gives shutters the appearance that they are indeed operable, even if in truth they are not. Shutters should not be applied to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window.	NA	
<b>W31</b>	Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters.	NA	
<b>W32</b>	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	NA	