

Captioning Transcript of Community Affairs, Housing, Health and Education Committee Meeting - October 19, 2022

"Chair Shanklin"

Hello.

Okay, this is the regular community affairs housing, health in education committee meeting October 19, 2022.

Welcome to order metal clerk. Can you please read the late notice?

"Olivia Bennett"

This meeting is being held pursuant to care at 61.826 in council rule 5 a red and full.

"Chair Shanklin"

Thank you I am the chair canceled Barbara and joining me virtually.

All right awesome. Cory author.

Counsel a woman on a purpose councilman Kevin triplet.

Are there any numerous present in chambers?

"Olivia Bennett"

Yes, ma'am we have committee member balance and chambers.

"Chair Shanklin"

Okay, um.

Let me get the names of my committee members. It's vice chair Cassie chamber Armstrong.

A councilman Angela council member.

Darcy council member Kevin triplet counsellor Parker council members too expensive to answer. Has an excuse. They upset.

Is there anyone else the headers excuse to have some color that, you know, or.

"Olivia Bennett"

No, ma'am not that I know of.

"Chair Shanklin"

Okay get middle clerk. Please let directors reflect the items wanted to remain table and.

And we will start with a written of item number 4.

"Olivia Bennett"

Item number 4 is our dash 151 dash 22 a resolution honoring Donnie burden by dedicating the corner of 2008. 01, West Chester in 2008 street as

Donnie burden's 100 pipers way in his honor read in full. burden's one hundred pipers way in his honor read in full

"Committee Member Triplett"

Motion motion notion triplet.

"Chair Shanklin"

2nd, did we get a 2nd.

4th points.

Thank goodness want this idol has been properly moved in a 2nd.

A Council on purpose, can you speak to them?

"Council Member Purvis"

Yes, Madam chair um, I am recognizing, um.

Mr.

Donald burden also known as Donny burden for this establishment it's been in the community for quite some time and it has provided a great source of community connection this outlet has

served as a purpose for people to join in and be safe. Uh, uh, so

beautiful camaraderie in the, in the establishment, uh, from the

community and, uh, the 100 papers has served the community. community

In many ways of having a community picnics and community gathering. So I

feel that is only proper, uh, to honor. Mr.

and the work that he has done through the 100 papers to get back to the community. Thank you. Um, hoping for the support of my colleagues. Thank you.

"Chair Shanklin"

Thank you. Are there any other questions.

For consignment now, this is a resolution allow for a voice vote.

All those in favor, signify by saying, aye.

Any opposed? No 1.

This item will be sent to the set calendar. It'll clerk can read item number 5 please.

"Olivia Bennett"

Item number 5 is our dash 152 dash 22 a resolution honoring Anne Wagner by dedicating the corner of West Market street and South shawny terrace as an Wagner way in her honor red and full.

"Committee Member Triplett"

Thank you motion motion and 2nd.

"Chair Shanklin"

Has been properly moved in a 2nd.

Uh, since cascolan purposes, sponsor for there.

Can you speak to it?

"Council Member Purvis"

Yes, Madam chair another tablets.

Um, so, in the community, they just given back so much through the early years of politics and been involved in every sense of the way within the race in originally.

Um, a lot of things that she's a lot of her environment has been very progressive and having the community to move forward. She's been an activist for, for everything that she's.

We've been really benefited the community, and I just think it's time that we show her how the community appreciates her and honors her with this honorary street sign.

"Chair Shanklin"

Thank you, thank you and I just want to recognize the council Armstrong in the chambers.

Okay, are there any other questions or concerns.

And also, I'm sorry, I think that will overlook.

Cancel the middle part. Okay.

Here none this is a resolution allows for a voice vote, all those in favor signify by saying.

Aye, aye, any opposed you're in. Now, this item will be sent to the consent calendar.

Minimal clerk can you read item? Number? 6?

"Olivia Bennett"

Item number 6 is far dash 153 dash 22 a resolution honoring Greg Allen by dedicating the corner of varble Avenue and southwestern Parkway as Greg Allen way in his honor red and full.

"Committee Member Triplett"

Thank you motion to move triplets.

"Committee Member Dorsey"

Sorry 4th, Darcy.

"Chair Shanklin"

Uh, since calcium endorsing you to sponsor, you have any.

Want to talk, speak on.

Yes, ma'am harvest or Darcy I'm sorry purpose. I heard your voice and when I heard your voice, it just sorry about that.

"Council Member Purvis"

They're all seeing our twins. That's all right anyway. Yes. Mr. Alan has served as, uh, Postman for 40+years, uh, delivering mail as less 3 or 5 years. Mr.

Alec can be seen delivering mail up to 10 o'clock in the evening. He is a Westover, our neighbor resident.

He's been involved in this community in this neighborhood association for years, given back, not only give him back on his job given by. given by As a member of this close knit neighborhood association, and you can see Mr Allen not only delivering, uh, mail, but happened to elderly in and out of their cars.

And so I just think it's the right thing to do to honor him is he is finally closing in on his chapter of being a mailman. Thank you.

"Chair Shanklin"

Thank you, I think what happened when that soured council endorsing in Parker head I looked at my queue and saw where they hit red. Then I've been Darcy I heard on board. So so so, sorry about that.

So, there is anyone else have anything to say about that.

Here, and this is a resolution allow for a voice vote all those in favor signify by saying, aye.

Aye, any opposed and this item will be sent to the consent calendar.

Bottom clerk for reading of item number 3 please.

"Olivia Bennett"

Item number 3 is our dash 1 to 1 dash 22 a resolution in support of better public housing management and maintenance.

"Committee Member Triplett"

Motion motion triplet. 2nd Armstrong. Okay.

"Chair Shanklin"

Uh, this item has been properly moved. The 2nd, is there any discussion we're going to turn it over to counseling?

Jj Cory. Cory.

"Council Member Arthur"

Thank you chairman the resolution in front of you today isn't supported tenants who've had issues with their property management and maintenance it request that L. M. H. A. terminate its current contract and services. With the group or associates Inc or any subsidiaries, or is currently responsible for managing and maintaining the metro housing authority properties at earliest lawful opportunity,

and to cease to further contract with this company. It also requests the attempt to limit the effect of any cancellation of services.

By offering positions to frontline staff, from the safety group that assisted to manage and maintain.

Properties that's what this resolution is during our committee we'll hear from who this resolution supports and why this resolution is necessary.

We'll also talk with the director of the housing authority.

But we'll start with residents 1st, if that's okay. Chair women.

and as the residents come up i just want to remind committee members and the public that their statements and complaints as well as letters of support are attached to the agenda with the resolution residents when you come up please state your names for the record and

the name of the property that you live or lived in managed by group and i'll also have a couple of videos of residents who couldn't be with us here today

"Chair Shanklin"

Art that we asked them since we have so many each person just to speak for 2 minutes.

"Council Member Arthur"

Thank you so much Thank you.
You have the 1st person that's going to speak there in chambers.

"Chair Shanklin"

Chambers okay so.
So, could we have the 1st person this was speak, come to the audio.

"Olivia Bennett"

Madam chair they are at the podium. They are wet. Well.

"Chair Shanklin"

Could they speak their name and tell us their complaints or their concerns? Because we can't see them.

"Yovanna Jones"

Yes, ma'am. Hi, my name is Giovanna Jones and I am a current resident of liberty green.

We are calling on Metro council to port us to cancel the contract of 1 of the most worst property managers in the city, and take these properties properties under management and union maintenance staff for 6 months. Lisa sanku has ignored us as we've told her time and time again that we don't feel safe and secure in our homes.

The campaign is to cancel the contract based on 4 problem areas.

We do not get receipts. This is also when we pay this is a clear violation of hedge generally accepted accounting principles as noted in the Hudson letter to Lisa Osaka in 2021, which you all have a copy of. have a copy of

About group, not giving receipts to tenants. We also have documented cases where a group adds late charges on our rent. If we voice concerns about management.

If Lisa Osaka knew about this in 2021, why is it still happening?

Maintenance enters our apartments without notice.

This is a clear violation of the uniform residential landlord tenant act. There is a lot of lack of proper maintenance. We have documented mode and maintenance issues that go without repair for months and sometimes years retaliation against tenants.

We've documented years of extreme retaliation against tenants who speak out about these issues. Many of us have experienced our paperwork coming up, missing in harassment and intimidation by staff.

Tenant union leader miss and received a 30 day notice to vacate after she spoke at our press conference on August 19. Our legal review can cancel the contract with the group at any time they have violated, not only their contract with and state law, but also their leases with the tenants saying that they must maintain the sites in good condition.

"Chair Shanklin"

Now, I need to stop you, but are you speaking for everybody? Because we have 10 speakers so, each person has to have only 2 minutes.

"Yovanna Jones"

I'm so sorry, man and woman that's my fault. I try to get to the Mike quick enough. We need 3 minutes per person. We don't have 1010 heads. We have fewer than 10 so it still fits within the 20 minute parameter. And if need be, we might want, like, 2 or 3 minutes of our Q and a time to use. use

"Chair Shanklin"

If need be okay, as long as, you know, we'll, we'll split right into the agenda.

"Yovanna Jones"

Well, thank you, we really appreciate your flexibility start at the top of. Per legal review can cancel the contract with group at any time they have violated, not only their contract with and state law, but also their leases with the tenants saying that they must maintain the sites in good condition. We have documented that groups maintenance staff are now walking to do repairs because the management no longer provide to them vehicles. We know that Labs and proper maintenance are really the fall of frontline staff, and more often the result of ineffective management respectfully ask the maintain all buildings with bargaining unit maintenance staff. We also asked the commit to considering all current group maintenance workers for its bargaining position. I have already submitted my statement, but I want to tell you all about what has happened to me since those incidents took place. I moved into my new apartment last month since then I have found mode in my bathroom, both of my bathrooms, and as well as my kitchen, we maintenance came out to fix the leak. They tried to cover it up. Okay. I asked for a remote inspection and regional manager. Cathy strong told me that if it came back negative, I would have to pay for the inspection myself. That was weeks ago, I still don't know the results of the mole testing. As a single mother, it's hard enough to get out of public housing without having to endure the treatment that we experience by the group. The mistreatment, the harassment, the invasion of privacy and the lack of maintenance.

These issues affect our health, our safety and the lives of our children.

"Council Member Arthur"

Thank you, thank you share a woman at this time. I'll play 2 videos from residents who could not attend today.

"Bronwyn Hudson"

Okay, thank you. My name is Bronwyn Hudson and 9 years ago I moved into liberty green to downsize and plus the property was what appeared to be well maintained here are issues about the property.

I want to address. If I'm moving in, I was promised, my apartment would be.

I received a notice from the water company about a fake rock. That was covered in a water source and wanted to know when they could maintain this source. I took the notice twice to the office. Nothing was done. When I moved in.

I loved the sprinkler system, which has not worked in years, which is why the water company wants to maintain the water source. The furnace has not been service in years and I must ask for office for filters.

Small detectors have inspired and new replacement.

Doors and windows are filthy doors, need a nice new color. Maybe a darker color and doors are writing doors and frames are riding hallways and stairways are filthy.

At 1, point of contact, then council members, Barber seconds, sex and Smith in the past and only.

A block of doors were paying it, so they would do a little to try to say something has been done, but when it then it goes right back to nothing being done.

They are now trimming bush's so don't let them fully.

All this took place before covance. So Calvin has nothing to do with this problem.

The issues have stated are not listed in our leases contracts. There is a clause in my lease on page 9 or 33 pages and I quote.

Management agrees to a, to maintain the apartment building, the common grounds, the apartment and the equipment located inherent in good condition.

In in compliance with the state sanitary code and all other ethical laws, rules and regulations of agencies of competent jurisdiction.

I would like to add management. Can I keep maintenance staff?

And the staff have left expressing and happiness with management.

We have had some good maintenance workers in the past, the management company responsible for the maintenance contracts. Janine.

This is a company from outside of our state.

Why can't we have you.

The union maintenance workers who are binded to maintain our property.

Also, tennis should not feel intimidated about a community management.

We also need a caring management that truly are concerned about bringing back and keeping the beauty of liberty grain.

That was once liberty we have some people do not want.

I need to live like this. We are community of low income senior citizens.

And residents like me who are working to paint the market, right?

Projects were torn down and my projects are coming back.

This is terribly sad. I would welcome the visit from council members to have a walk through of liberty, green and knock the given areas or unit units management wants you to see.

"Council Member Arthur"

I appreciate your time and thank you sure if we have time, I'll play the next video towards the end, but we can go back to our lives because in chambers now.

Ah, yes, I will play that at the end. Thank you.

Sure, a woman, we can't hear you. How many speakers do you hear?

Do you know, in total there are, it looks like 6.

"Chair Shanklin"

Okay, because I was told he was going to and I knew we would run out of time because we have resources. We sold Sankar to speak and questions and answers. So we can't actually take.

You know, 34 minutes each.

Okay, okay. The next speaker please.

"Dominique Harris"

Hi, my name is Dominic.

And I'm a mother before I've been reading through local metro housing authority since I was 18. I've had multiple issues with my landlord Kathy strong.

I've had issues at 3 different properties with local metro housing authority.

The 2nd property we lived in Barbie town apartments, we moved our in April 2021. my family was so excited that my daughter did quite worlds across the living room floor.

But, shortly after moving in, I was reporting mode issues to management and colleague answer city code inspectors. The problem started in the apartment assignments.

They had a leaky shortly in the city group. Didn't fix it correctly. And before I knew it, I started seeing small black spots with Mo, in my bathroom without support for maintenance. The mode got worse.

It covered the.

For the base boards and began going on in my walls I had to keep the bathroom door close.

So, contained the smell, my kids and our, we're living in Mo, I sent pictures and videos of black Mo to miss Cathy and mysocko.

But nothing happened some of my neighbors were dealing with the same thing and many of us were getting sick and still are with the no help the worst. The Mo, got the sugar we got it. So it was no longer safe for me. And my kids.

To stay there.

We, we were forced to leave our apartment in apart from each other. I couldn't believe that nothing was being done about this and about the mode.

I didn't even see a work order for the mode in the apartment until, like, June.

But still, no major moves were made.

It's still not and they still didn't fix the problem. It killed me being away from our kids when my daughter was sick.

When my daughter was sick, I like to do was talk to her on the phone. It broke my heart.

She should have been next to me, she should have been able to be at home in her bed with me her mom at that time, we were sick and we were separated. I was forced to bounce around from place to place.

Depending on the kindness of my family and my friends, because my apartment was not safe for anyone.

To be including myself, I was at my breaking point, and I still am by March, 2022. I joined the global Tony Union, and we were able to get my family emergency transfer. I've only been safe. been safe

And back with my kids for a few months.

But what happens to me, my family shouldn't have to happen to anyone.

We, we, the residents of global metro housing are coming together around the share our struggle with the management company group, and this regional manager. Ms. Kathy strong.

We are the victims of discrimination and have been forced to live in inhumane living conditions.

This has negatively affected our families, our health and our overall wellbeing we can will. And our helping 1 another.

But we can't do this alone. We need the city to take action. We will not stopped into these issues are resolved. Please help us.

"Jessica Reese"

Hello.

Thank you next week, my name is Jessica. I'm here with Mark Steiner and Nancy capital content, and we're part of the coordinating team of Louisville showing up for racial justice.

The coordinating team supports council members, Arthur, and purposes resolution. We support this resolution because we've heard from tenants who are part of the Louisville tenants Union, and who live in buildings managed by the group.

The group is falling down on its obligations to provide.

Quality service, and to respect the people, they serve.

Tenants have described the following issues to us and as you all today.

Persistent problems with cockroaches and mold consistent water leaks, leading to water damage, gas leaks, poor installation, safety, concerns, difficulties with basic issues, such as lockouts.

A squatter living in an empty apartment for weeks harassment by staff retaliation for speaking up parking for people with disabilities being blocked by maintenance vehicles and many more issues.

The concerns and stories that tenants have shared should be unacceptable to all of us in this room. Everyone deserves safe well, maintained and affordable housing today.

I'll close by saying the housing is a racial justice issue to be specific.

The vast majority of tenants are black,

including every tenant who has spoken with us black women with children and black seniors are the core of whom serves it is difficult and risky for these tenants to speak out about the people who control their homes.

We support their organizing to win the housing that they and all of us deserve.

Every day that the group continues to manage these properties. Louisville is saying that what tenants are going through is fine, and that we can't do any better. And neither of those things is true. Thank you for your time.

"Chair Shanklin"

Thank you.

Next speaker please.

"Laverne"

Hi, my name is, I've been a resident at liberty green for the past 4 years. My chief complaint is group management company does not respect their tenants as the senior woman. I don't feel safe in my home.

195 "Bennett, Olivia" (931246592)

00:29:00.894 --> 00:29:14.424

It is very stressful to live in liberty. Green. I have always requested that I be noticed notified of the date and time maintenance needs access to my apartment and for 4 years, it has fallen on deaf ears.

196 "Bennett, Olivia" (931246592)

00:29:14.669 --> 00:29:24.419

In turn, I put a chain lock on my bedroom door. So maintenance would not have access to my valuables when they entered my apartment without my acknowledgment.

197 "Bennett, Olivia" (931246592)

00:29:24.419 --> 00:29:39.354

i received a call that they were going to cut my lock off and it needed to be removed i asked why and was told it was a safety issue and then as management houses a safety issue when it's only locked when i'm not at home and it's never

198 "Bennett, Olivia" (931246592)

00:29:39.354 --> 00:29:54.174

on while i'm in my home i told them i told them that is on so i could feel that my items are safe and secure the last notice i received was october tenth this month

199 "Bennett, Olivia" (931246592)

00:29:54.419 --> 00:30:07.614

The notice was dated October, the 7th stating that they will be coming in my home from October the 10th to November. 2nd, which is 18 business days that I have to be on edge. Not knowing when they will enter.

200 "Bennett, Olivia" (931246592)

00:30:07.614 --> 00:30:22.104

I am 65 years old and don't need or want this added stress in my life. I don't sleep. Well, always worried that I have to get up early extra early, because they will come in at any given time on the days that I work.

201 "Bennett, Olivia" (931246592)

00:30:22.104 --> 00:30:24.204

I have to get up at 6, 0 PM. zero pm

202 "Bennett, Olivia" (931246592)

00:30:24.419 --> 00:30:38.394

Address just in case, they come in at 9 when I don't have to be to work until 12. 0. P. M. on the time, they tell us they're coming in without

giving us a date and time. Their famous words are you don't have to be home.

203 "Bennett, Olivia" (931246592)

00:30:38.754 --> 00:30:52.344

However, I want to be home if I had had a notice of the day and time I will make it my business to be home and I would welcome them. I can't call when something is broken and needs fixing for fear.

204 "Bennett, Olivia" (931246592)

00:30:52.344 --> 00:30:54.234

They will come into my home when I'm.

205 "Bennett, Olivia" (931246592)

00:30:54.444 --> 00:31:08.964

Not available, in addition to not fixing the said problem correctly. They mentioned they won't be responsible for false alarms. When they tell us, we have to have them off for 18 days. Are they going to be responsible when someone breaks into our apartments?

206 "Bennett, Olivia" (931246592)

00:31:08.964 --> 00:31:21.624

During the time? They want us to turn them off. The simple solution is to give us a day and time when they will enter, which I've asked on numerous occasions they shouldn't be able to dictate when they will come into my home.

207 "Bennett, Olivia" (931246592)

00:31:22.229 --> 00:31:25.229

It is my home where I pay.

208 "Bennett, Olivia" (931246592)

00:31:25.229 --> 00:31:36.929

I am the 1 that should have to say when you enter, or at least give me Apple notice. So I can plan for you to enter 18 days is too long for me to have to be in limbo.

209 "Bennett, Olivia" (931246592)

00:31:36.929 --> 00:31:50.604

I deserve 48 hour, notice at a date and time that they will enter your role to tenant law states that they need to give us 48 hour. Notice which they never do. My son has been asked me to move to Atlanta with him.

210 "Bennett, Olivia" (931246592)

00:31:50.604 --> 00:32:03.174

Because he too is concerned with my safety and wellbeing. Why should I have to leave my home that I love? Why should I to leave my job that I love all? Because group doesn't want to do the job they are paid to do. I don't have time to talk about all the maintenance issues. maintenance issues

But what I will say, the molding around my carpet came up, I notified the office, they sent the unskilled worker, who overlap the strip didn't put fillers into cement holes where the screws came out.

So it would stay put, and in a matter of 2 weeks, it came apart I now live with a pair weights on top of it and a stool over it.

So, I won't forget as dangerous and triple wheater residents that really love living in liberty. Green should no longer be disrespect.

And stressed and treat it like, we are 2nd class citizens.

We need to have group replaced with someone that will care for the residents and treat us what respect with respect. We, the residents want and need to feel safe secure at our homes.

We should be we shouldn't be inconvenienced for 18 days. Not knowing when they would come in and what time they will enter, why should I have to get fully dressed for 18 days? Are my days off when I don't feel like it. Why should I have to leave my alarm?

For 18 days.

With anyone on the council stand for that with Lisa Sankar be okay with someone coming into her home and announce that any hour of the day.

Well, if they wouldn't stand for it, then why should we in closing? I prayed the council will make the right decision and get rid of group.

And I have pictures of this maintenance problem if anybody wants to see them, thank you.

"Chair Shanklin"

Thank you thank you.

The next speaker,

"T.W. Foster"

my name is T. W Foster. I'm a resident of liberty green been there for 9 years. Never been laid on. My rent. Never had a complaint large. The gifts me, because I stay in my lane, my own business. Um.

The trash, the trash is so horrific is spilling out of the dumpsters that a couple of months ago. Robin Marshall, the landlord.

Was out on the property because of possums and stuff was.

Around the dumpsters, the parking.

coming home from work you have to go around the parking lot two or three times because the law school students park in our parking lot from seven thirty in the morning to five o'clock in the evening and the street parking is already full and they do that to keep from

paying the public parking and garage parking so we the tenants had liberty green and back and forth for seven and four hundred and five south jackson street have to go around the parking lot five and six times trying to find parking the lights

To the car port, there are 16 lights.

Out of the 16 lights only 3 work. It's been like that for 2 years. Breeze ways.

The lights and the breeze ways where you come up to my apartment, you have to come up the 3rd floor, the breeze waves, dirt, debris, lights and stuff out been like that for 2 and a half years in. My apartment had a huge hole underneath my sink.

Was growing everywhere I contacted them in 2020. thousand and twenty A month ago they just came and fixed it.

Uh, the, uh, there was a shooting that took place in the back of the parking lot bully came through. My kitchen window, went through my cabinet. Thank God that I went home because it would have injured me the way that the bullet came into my apartment.

Charlotte, the whole kitchen window, the kitchen window was not fixed for 3 and a half months.

They just fixed the the window.

There I have a week floor by my computer desk, been complaining about it since 2020.

Haven't been fixed yet in my kitchen floor been complained about since 2020 haven't been fixed yet.

There was a smell in my apartment, been calling them for the last 3 and a half months. I don't know if there's something in the event. I don't know if there's some sewage in the apartment complex that is backed up. Called them multiple times that E, mails complained down to local metro housing authority. ombudsmen sent complaints to Cathy straw. Robin Marshall.

All of them they came into my apartment turned on the air conditioner for about a minute, left out, contacted me and said, they didn't smell anything.

So, I have been stand with, like, family and friends, because I don't know what's going on in my apartment. So they did our quality report. Maybe air quality test, maybe a couple of weeks ago and so I got this from Kathy strong. They're in my apartment right now, because mode is all in the cabinets on top of the microwave, all in the walls, et cetera. So I'm asking you all. I guarantee you this.

That if we are late on rent.

About the 6 or 7 we don't get an eviction notice.

But when we filed a complaint to get something fixed, they take 2 to 3 years and I guarantee you.

That if you go to any of their houses right now, you probably won't find Mo.

I bet you, they have parking, I guarantee you that they don't have any issues going on in their house with the light bulbs out any of that stuff going on people in the breezeway homeless people in the brief ways. None of that is going on at their resident.

So I'm asking you all the metro Council, put yourself in our position right now.

And would you tolerate it? So I'm asking you all from the bottom of your heart to consider counseling this contract. So we can go in a whole new direction.

"Chair Shanklin"

Thanks, thank you. Sir. Uh. Jasmine Cory,

"Council Member Arthur"

thank you. Chair woman, and I also want to just take a minute to think all the residents for being here.

We know it can feel powerless when the people who control your housing are doing you wrong, but you do have power because you have your neighbors, you have other tenants they have your back I got your back and with this resolution,

hopefully this committee and the full metro council can show that they have your back to chairwoman. If you're okay. I'd like to open it up for any questions for the residents before we move on to the director of the housing authority.

"Chair Shanklin"

You mean, the council members open up any questions to ask me okay.

I think I have a councilman done a purpose.

Or did you want to wait to after all samples spoke Donna?

"Council Member Purvis"

Yes, ma'am. I like to, uh, as my question after missile Sankoh speaks, thank you.

"Chair Shanklin"

Okay, thank you wouldn't have any questions or concerns. You know, I guess we'll column cycle. Is she in chambers? I'm sure she's at the podium. Okay, you can go ahead and speak.

"Lisa Osanka"

All right, thank you. My name is Lisa. I'm the executive director of the global metro housing authority. Uh, thank you. Dr Shanklin for having me here today and all of the members, joining virtually, uh, as well as in chambers as well, as, of course, the representatives of the local tenants union as well as the residents here. Uh, that are live at liberty, green and shepherd square and any of our scattered site locations. So, thank you for having me here. I'm here to answer questions from the council. Okay, there any questions, uh, I think counsel in Paris. You had floor?

"Council Member Purvis"

Yes, Madam chair. Um. Lisa, thank you for being here today. I I know this is, um. Very painful to hear, uh, these comments from your tenants. What I like to know, and I hope I get an honest answer from you a sincere answer from, you. How does it make you feel to hear what you've heard today? Thank you council member purpose. Um, it it does not feel good. It does not feel good. Um, I, uh, it's it's.

"Council Member Purvis"

Hello. Or you think she finished? No, no I think the sound is off. No, no, I, I.

"Olivia Bennett"

Madam chair can you hear us in chambers?

"Chair Shanklin"

Yes, I can. Okay. That's good.

"Council Member Purvis"

It allows everyday missle Sankar was saying.

"Lisa Osanka"

okay sorry about that is that better for the virtual okay sorry about that no to answer your question mantra council member purpose it does not feel good to hear this i certainly would appreciate the opportunity for to present another point of view yes there are complaints and concerns and i believe in my review of those complaints and Concerns the ones that I've previously been aware of there were additional ones that I do not believe I was aware of that have been brought up today, but I would like the opportunity for both my staff and the leadership at the 3rd party contractor to have an opportunity to review the complaints and concerns and so that they have an opportunity to respond. I believe a number of the metro council members were emailed. Uh, earlier this morning, by a member of that management group with there were complaints posted on the metric Council, uh, committee website yesterday, and the, the management group has already looked at those and reviewed those and responded with their point of view on those this morning and, so, I would ask for that same opportunity to to present another point of view. On those on those complaints,

"Council Member Purvis"

so while given the opportunity to review and to do your investigation, these tenants will still be suffering from lack of still be suffering from deficiencies that have not been corrected. Do you think that's fair?

"Lisa Osanka"

No, no, I, what I'm trying to say is that a number of these complaints have already been brought up and responded to.

"Council Member Purvis"

but but from what i'm hearing and i know that there are two sides to every story what i'm hearing that some of these complaints have been going on for months and for years do you have an answer why they have not been responded to uh the the one lady um spoke that some of these things have been taking place since before covid so can you tell us why these complaints have gone on so long and what has taken so long to address them and and just Let me say this 1 is, uh, in my private life before I became a public servant, I'm not a politician. I had a commercial cleaning service, and we provided cleaning services for. Local metro housing authority and, uh, the time that we provided services, uh, you guys were a no nonsense entity. Um, we did our job.

We didn't have the issues that I'm hearing, but I'm sure that if we did you all would have found another contractor to provide the services. So. I've been hearing things about, uh, or, forgive me if I send their name wrong for years before I even came on the council. Um, so, I mean. Do you think it's fair to keep such a company that is not providing services? I'm sure that's outlined in the contract and from what it sounds like to me there's been a lot of contract violations. Do you think that is fair to continue to keep a relationship with with this company?

"Lisa Osanka"

All right, well, and that's why I would like to address that councilman purpose specifically with the responses from our review and from management review because there is another side to the stories. Um.

"Chair Shanklin"

That's what the purpose we have about 3 or 4 other people.

"Council Member Purvis"

"Chair Shanklin"

Okay you can come back once I'm done. I've, I've come to my conclusion, but thank you.

"Council Member Arthur"

Okay, thank you. Uh.

Thank you director Sankar. Could you just briefly share with us? The differences and training that's required for metro housing authority staff versus privately contracted property management and maintenance stuff.

"Lisa Osanka"

Yes, absolutely. And thank you for your question.

So, the, the training, uh, that the local metro housing authority staff give get is largely what you would consider an apprentice type of training where a new employee is instructed by a more experienced employee and in terms of of how we operate and how the different paperwork that's required, or the different work order. That's on the management side, on the maintenance side, on on how different work orders are handled so it really is very much an apprentice style, uh, training. Um, we also as part of the contracts with 3rd party vendors, um, if anything they have stricter requirements, in terms of the standards that they must keep, uh, because the large majority of the 3rd party contractors are, uh, have additional requirements whether that's from the low income housing.

Tax credit through the Kentucky housing Corporation, whether that's through home, whether that's through, or other entities that, that also have specific requirements that they have.

"Council Member Arthur"

Are the contractors that you use are subject to open records request?

"Lisa Osanka"

So, if the house, the housing authority, as a public agency, if we have records in our possession, then we would be subject to open records request. Unless there is some type of exclusion.

But a 3rd party vendor that works with us, if we do not have those, uh, uh.

Those documents those records in our possession that the 3rd party vendor would not be required to, to give those to us so that we could then turn around and give them to the request or no.

"Council Member Arthur"

Where can the public see a list of metro housing and the corresponding private property managers?

"Lisa Osanka"

So that's a question you gave me previously, and I've got the property management team pulling that together. Now, the director is out this week, but as soon as she gets back, we'll get that posted to our website.

"Council Member Arthur"

But currently, the public cannot see that list in its entirety anywhere right now.

"Lisa Osanka"

No,

"Council Member Arthur"

okay. Are you aware of any significant wage differences between public employees and privately contracted employees who do property maintenance management and maintenance work.

"Council Member Arthur"

So, as part of the contracts, the maintenance workers have a prevailing wage requirement.

"Lisa Osanka"

So, the prevailing wages that the housing authority pays to maintenance workers, 123 and 4, and those are different type of wage scales. wage scales

Those are set, uh, with the help of HUD, and then we pass those requirements on to those 3rd party contractors. So, as far as property maintenance workers go, they would have the same prevailing wages.

"Council Member Arthur"

okay just a few more questions chairwoman uniform residential landlord tenant act or url to says that landlords are required to give a notice you know forty eight hours before entering a residence home you've heard testimony today you've probably seen the complaints in the records i'm curious why is allowing staff to enter tenants apartments unannounced

"Lisa Osanka"

Yeah, I would love to get the specifics on that. So we could see what what is happening there as, you know, we do have thousands of tenants and so answering specifics about anyone. Tenant is what we'd like to focus on.

Certainly. Certainly, we're not perfect. And it can happen, but we understand that we are required under the landlord and tenant act to give proper notice.

"Council Member Arthur"

Heard had warned, it's like the group about not issuing receipts for payment and 2021. are you aware of of why? This is still not happening?

"Lisa Osanka"

So, I would like the opportunity to give you the documentation from review of that and review of that. Because what's been presented is 11 point of view.

"Council Member Arthur"

According to contact with the CD group from the. The direct can direct the owner to terminate the relationship with the manager if the manager engages and wilful misconduct, such as repeated violation of state and local safety laws, or simply a repeated failure to maintain the project and good repairs as required by the contract. If the manager does not rectify the situation in 30 days we heard about issues that have gone over the span of years. Could you talk to me about why has not held this group accountable for the complaints that are brought before us today?

"Lisa Osanka"

I, I would disagree that we have not held them accountable.

"Council Member Arthur"

So you're saying the residents behind you in the record.

"Lisa Osanka"

Our line, I am definitely not saying that I'm saying that we have a different point of view that we would love to be able to present to, you.

"Council Member Arthur"

Okay, and then just last question sharing a minute and I'll jump back in the queue director. You've talked about. Canceling or phasing out this private company over the next year or so when will that be officially announced? And will you work with tenants to be involved in the procurement process? For new management?

"Lisa Osanka"

Right. So thank you for that question. So I think a little background would be appropriate if that's okay. I'll try to be brief because they are complicated transactions. Um, so right now the housing authority is not in control of the units at liberty green. We are in control of the units at shepherd Square. Uh. So, at the units of liberty, green, those are in low income housing, tax credit partnerships, those partnerships are controlled by a managing general partner. That was the developer of those units 15+or, 15, starting 15 years ago. And a little less, uh, yesterday at our board meeting, we passed a resolution to acquire the 1st phase. There are 4 phases at liberty green. So, our board passed yesterday. passed yesterday To acquire that 1st, phase of units back to housing authority control. Um, and as part of that, we will be issuing a request for proposals for property management companies, uh, to bid on the work at that location. This is a similar process to what we did at. Which, as, you know, is the 1st, hope 6 program in in, in lower level. So, as those same developer, uh, different partnerships, but as those 4 partnerships came, pass their tax credit compliance, period, the housing authority subsequently required all of those units, and then also, uh, acquired the property manager that manages those units. So, in a similar way to what we've done at part of all, we will be doing that at liberty green that 1st. Days should close before the end of the year. A phase 2 we should have back in our control by the end of next year. And phases, 3, and 4, we should have back in our control by the end of 2024. Sorry for the long winded answer, but that's. That's it's just simply as I could be. Thank you. Okay.

"Chair Shanklin"

Are you dialed counseling author for now? Yes.

"Committee Member Triplett"

Constantly triplet. Please, thank you Madam chair, Lisa, thank you for being with us. Let me ask a question here where all of our speakers, and all of the testimony today were all from liberty green.

"Lisa Osanka"

I don't believe so, but

"Committee Member Triplett"

okay.

And that was my, that was my next. My next question was, is the group specifically, uh, working for liberty, green and elsewhere some of our other developments such as, uh, devolve Shepard squares. So forth.

"Lisa Osanka"

So, they are not engaged at part of all they are engaged at at liberty, green, and at Shepard Square. So, in total, it's about 730 units, um, out of the say, 3500 that the housing authority. hundred that the housing authority

"Committee Member Triplett"

Oh, okay, okay. Very good. And then, just quickly I, I like for councilman Arthur's questions. I, I think the direction that where he was going my next 1, just very quickly with.

If if we, if we terminated our our agreement with in contract with.

Do we have a list of candidates and other options? Uh, uh.

To consider,

"Lisa Osanka"

so, what we have is, you know, whether I was trying to explain with at liberty, green, we would be putting out on and I apologize. I said, RFP, but a request for proposals to property management groups.

And we do currently as part of the recruitment of property management groups to to bid on this work we have developed a list of potential property management groups that we will send the proposals out to.

Um, so that we can, we can get good, good, healthy competition and responding to that, uh, request for proposals.

"Committee Member Triplett"

Okay. And just quickly based on what we've heard and their track record. We do have legal grounds to terminate the contract. Do we not.

"Lisa Osanka"

We do not know we do not have legal grounds to terminate the contract.

"Committee Member Triplett"

Okay, well, that's all. I had Lisa Thank you.
Thank you Madam chair.

"Chair Shanklin"

Sorry?
cancel endorsing

"Committee Member Dorsey"

thank you madam chair uh lisa thank you for your time we've had quite a few conversations back when i was the counsel woman and i had a simple spheres and park duvall so a couple questions i want to start right in here have there been any confirmed cases of mold to your knowledge yes or no

"Lisa Osanka"

Are you saying mold at liberty, green and shepherd square

"Committee Member Dorsey"

period under any of the groups, or any of the facilities the group managers.

"Lisa Osanka"

so so mold in yes i think that's yeah so i'd love to take an opportunity to just explain the mold process of what we would go to look into that But that that's there have been there have been complaints with mold. Yes. Yes, but they also have been addressed they are issues that come up all the time and and moisture is something that that has to that can contribute to that. Um, but we do do regular when when complaints are made testing can be done if, if a visual inspection warrants it and that can be addressed.

"Committee Member Dorsey"

Thank you. So, how, once you have molded in an apartment, and it seems as though that is confirmed, what is the follow up in regard to the residents that have been impacted by the mold? I think I heard a young lady, say, even her family was separated as a result of that. Um, how does the or group intervene if there is a health consequence or subsequently even a family being broken apart as a result of that.

"Lisa Osanka"

All right, so thank you for that question. So I'll start from the beginning.

Just this is speaking generally, and not to any specifics that were said today and so, uh, tenant would make the property management company aware of the concern.

A work order would be placed a worker from the property management group would do a visual inspection to to see the complaint too. And if it's something that, that maintenance.

Worker could handle in terms of the clean up.

Well, and I should say the 1st, and foremost is stopping whatever the moisture is because that is again, the biggest question is, how is the mold forming and so moisture is the number 1 cause of that.

So, finding the cause of the leak, whether that is dripping, um.

Dripping pipes condensation in the H, the heating ventilation air conditioning system the fan not working on a bathroom fan.

"Committee Member Dorsey"

I don't mean to interrupt you, but I really want to get to what happens once it's confirmed and there is potential impact to that particular residents in regard to their health.

"Lisa Osanka"

Yeah, so so no.

So, if the mold can be abated, so, if the if the moisture can be abated, the mold can be abated, then those actions are taken if it is a larger job than that, then we can do an indoor air quality testing.

Uh, we do that with a 3rd party vendor that 3rd party vendor comes in, does that testing and then they.

Yeah, they do that testing and then the results of that are available to the tenant, uh, if it is something we're a temporarily relocation is is necessary then then that is, um, that is handled by the management group. Uh, it it does not.

It does not often lead to that, but it is certainly possible. And there is a process for them.

"Committee Member Dorsey"

Thank you my next question in regard to the young lady who spoke about the physical impediments in the apartment, uh, in regard to a trip or fall, uh,

potential when we look at that I guess what I'm getting at and I'm going to be very straightforward here. Um, between, I think, I see a pathway here between councilman author and councilman triplet.

We say, I heard you just say that there, we don't have legal liability, or we don't have legal grounds.

Excuse me, to break that contract does the potential liability of a, say, a class action suit in regard to health public safety issues physical impediment as us being the property owner does the liability of a potential class action or lawsuit

outweigh our culpability in regard to suffering this contract, even if it if it, even if we don't have immediate legal ground the ground in which we could potentially be sued.

As a result of the health impacts, and the public safety impacts, does that outweigh the potential for us to go ahead and set for that contract? Even if we don't have legal grounds just based on the potential legal liability.

"Lisa Osanka"

So your question has the number of parts to it I'd like to take 21 both of which I believe I've already said, but we'll restate.

We, you have been presented with 1 side the complaint only you have not been presented with the resolution. resolution

I would like again to ask for an opportunity to present with those with those resolutions that have been made.

The 2nd, is you said, as the owner of those buildings and I will say again, the local metro housing authority is not the owner of those buildings.

They are currently in low income housing, tax credit partnerships, and those partnerships are controlled by another entity. So that. I hope that's a better explanation but,

"Committee Member Dorsey"

let me ask a better question who is saying, who assumes the legal liability say if someone comes up with because it sounds like there's a bit of a process with say, for example, the mold there's an air quality test all that time a person is living in the in that resident.

Who assumes the liability if there's a long term health impact as a result of that.

"Lisa Osanka"

Yeah, I, I, you're you're asking a, a hypothetical that I'm just not able to.

"Committee Member Dorsey"

I'm asking you a direct question. If there was a class action lawsuits, found or or or drafted, who would assume or who would be listed?

I think mobile metro government will be listed as 1 of the, um.

Associates to that. So I'm asking do you know if we would actually be listed? Would we be part of the culpable parties?

That would be attributed to any potential liability as a result of a health impact, uh, as a result of the mode or the physical impediments and public safety issues.

"Lisa Osanka"

So so as you know, anyone can sue anyone for anything right?

And I don't mean to make light of that, but if we were, if the housing authority were to be sued, then then we would defend that suit with, with more information about the particulars in that hypothetical that you presented.

"Committee Member Dorsey"

And that would directly impact global metro government, correct?

"Lisa Osanka"

I'm not sure if metric are you saying that little metro government would be a party correct through.
So, is is a distinct entity from global metric government.

"Committee Member Dorsey"

I understand that, but I'm asking is their culpability as to be sued as well as local metro government. I understand your questions. I'm asking a direct 1.

"Lisa Osanka"

Yeah, so again, local metro housing authority, and maybe the assistant county attorney can help answer this. But global metro housing authority is a distinct entity from local metro government.

"Committee Member Dorsey"

And so, if you add culpability, if there was a potential lawsuit found and what I'm trying to understand is, I understand there are multiple perspectives, but I also understand we've seen this with corrections and other entities.
If we allow this to go on.
Though that we understand that there may not be legal grounds we also need to understand that there's also culpability when we allow these public safety and health issues to go unfounded that we see these come back and multi 1Million dollar lawsuits the city that cost us more money, um, metal Clark I will relinquish my time. Thank you.

"Chair Shanklin"

Thank you. I was just counsel.
Oh, Armstrong,

"Vice Chair Chambers Armstrong"

thank you Madam chair and I appreciate you being here. Mr. I'm going to keep my question short and would ask. Can we agree that you'll keep our answer short? So we can make sure we get through everyone in the queue. I will attempt to thank you. Thank you. Mississauga.
Do you take these allegations seriously that you've heard today?

"Lisa Osanka"

Yes.

"Vice Chair Chambers Armstrong"

And how long have you known that you were going to come and testify here today?

"Lisa Osanka"

Approximately 4 weeks.

"Vice Chair Chambers Armstrong"

i was going to say that's about how long it's been on my calendar too can you explain to us you keep talking about this other side of the story and wanting to show us the resolutions if you've known for four weeks that you're going to be here today to talk about this issue why did you not bring that information with you today correct

"Lisa Osanka"

no i really appreciate the question so there are privacy laws that the housing authority has got to adhere to and so we do have documentation we would like to

Provide it to the metro council some of that has already been provided. I believe metro council member James made an open records request for 2 years of complaints and we have provided those in, in that instance the, the request for vote was for both complaints and resolutions.

And so resolutions were also provided. And so I hope in the review of those, you can see that we have been responding to those complaints with resolutions.

But there there were a number of things again, put on the board yesterday.

That have been already responded to, by the management group, it should be in your email, giving another point of view.

But but again, because of the privacy laws, we would like to ask for a way to.

To present those to you, that still keeps the,

"Vice Chair Chambers Armstrong"

and I hear what you're saying and I recognize where you're coming from. If I took what I was hearing from these folks who have come here today seriously, I would have been spending the past 4 weeks, looking into every single 1 of these complaints.

And coming here today with information about if it was resolved in home. Yeah. And so it's concerning to me that I'm hearing allegations of criminal activity, illegal things happening and our 1st speaker. I believe it was MS.

Jones. 1st thing she said is I don't feel safe. And secure in my housing, and if somebody said that to me.

I would have shown up with some answers and with some information and I have a couple of just other questions. I recognize I hear what you're saying.

"Lisa Osanka"

And I know and not all the information or some new information.

"Vice Chair Chambers Armstrong"

And I would, I would be very interested in seeing that as soon as possible. Okay. Um, the other question, I have just 2 other questions you said that you don't believe that you have legal grounds to cancel the contract.

I'm assuming that's because you believe that.

Things you've heard today, don't constitute a material breach of that contract. Is that right?

"Lisa Osanka"

So, again, at, at liberty green, where those 4 phases are not owned by the housing authority, or an affiliate of the housing authority yes, that is correct.

"Vice Chair Chambers Armstrong"

Do you believe that a child living in situations with black mold such that families have to be separated from 1? Another because of potential health impacts is a material breach of contract.

"Lisa Osanka"

Um, yes, I believe that would be.

"Vice Chair Chambers Armstrong"

Okay, so if that if we found that situation that the, that we had children living in black mold situations, you believe that that would constitute a material breach of contract that would give you the legal authority to cancel it. Is that correct?

"Lisa Osanka"

Black mold? Yes. Okay.

"Vice Chair Chambers Armstrong"

If not handled timely and my very last question I have for you and then I'll yield my time because I know President James has some documents to chat with you about here. Um.

Have you ever spent the night in liberty green?

"Lisa Osanka"

No.

"Vice Chair Chambers Armstrong"

Would you?

"Lisa Osanka"

Yes.

"Vice Chair Chambers Armstrong"

How long are you willing to commit to spending at liberty? Green.

"Lisa Osanka"

As long as it takes,

"Vice Chair Chambers Armstrong"

will you commit here today to split to living there for 2 weeks?

"Lisa Osanka"

Yes.

"Vice Chair Chambers Armstrong"

Okay. Great. I look forward to following up with you about those dates.
Uh, thank you Madam chair.

"Chair Shanklin"

Thank you, uh, uh, question, James.

"Council President James"

Thank you Madam chair. Thank you for being here. Mr. I, I have.
Those complaints and responses.
About liberty, green and I, I'm listening to your replies.
To the questions, and I want to follow up on a few.
If you don't mind counseling our 3rd spoke to you about in the past HUD
had provided a response from relationship to entering apartments.
without a forty eight hour notice is that accurate

"Lisa Osanka"

So, uh, and I would hate to, I mean.
If you had a specific question, I would love to review the documentation.
I'm not sure I can answer just off the cuff of.
The volume of it's 730 units.
So, I'm not really sure how to

"Council President James"

so councilman Arthur asked you about.

Entering apartments without the 40 hour notice and he referenced that had had.

Had this conversation with you and at an earlier time.

And you said that.

That there's another point of view to that.

And so, I guess what I'm asking you is, what did he have to say about that?

What was that point of view?

"Lisa Osanka"

That's why I would love to provide you with that documentation. If it's not already in that binder.

"Council President James"

I guess then I have to follow up with councilman Armstrong, just said if, if you have that documentation, why would you not. Come with that, be prepared with that.

"Lisa Osanka"

It's in that binder you already have it.

Right so, and and and again, but the the issues that were raised yesterday have already been responded to and it should be in your email box. Right?

"Council President James"

So, I guess what I'm saying is we're looking for you to talk about those things right? And I was listening audience doesn't have this binder right? They're listening to you as the director of hut.

"Lisa Osanka"

Right not the director of HUD, you're the director of the housing authority for the city level, right? Yes. And so.

And I think the documentation can speak for for itself.

The public doesn't have that those citizens there don't have that.

"Council President James"

Yes, and and the, we can get that provided with redacted proper redacted copies. Yes. Okay. So.

I guess what you're saying is you're going to provide that resolution some form you'll put it on.

Your website, or somehow, they'll be able to see that

"Lisa Osanka"

it can be part of the public record for the metric counsel for this ordinance.

"Council President James"

So, it's okay with you if we put it on yes. On our documents.

"Lisa Osanka"

Yes. Okay. It's it's an open records request and presumably we've redacted it properly and it can be.

"Council President James"

Okay, all right then my next question is, um, have you had a town hall, or anything of that nature with the citizens of liberty green so they could directly speak to, you.

"Lisa Osanka"

So, town halls have been challenging around covid, but now that we are in the Green Zone again, it is something that I would be willing to do.

"Council President James"

Okay, thank you this year.

"Lisa Osanka"

Yes,

"Council President James"

okay. Thank you. And then I guess my other question is a follow up from councilman Arthur. When he was asking you about the prevailing wage for maintenance workers, and you responded that. Eventually you're going to be phasing out the group as the maintenance. Group for liberty green is that what I understood you to say?

"Lisa Osanka"

So, let me try again. So, as part we do not currently own liberty, green, the improvements we still own the land underneath, but we do not own the improvements those are in tax credit partnerships as those tax credit partnerships, reach the end of their tax credit compliance periods. Then we will be gaining, we will be transferring that ownership to controlled ownership. And as part of that, again, similarly, to how. We already did it parked of all as part of that the housing authority will then use our own procurement processes to issue a request for proposals. And then accept those proposals, and then the team will review those proposals and and select a property management group.

"Council President James"

Are you also saying, and I could be wrong? Are you also saying or not saying that you currently don't have the authority because of the current ownership structure to counsel the.

"Lisa Osanka"

So, at liberty green, we are not the managing general partner so the manage we do so, the contract right now is not between us. The local metro housing authority, or an affiliate at the local metro housing authority, and the management group. That is correct.

"Council President James"

Okay. And who is the management group?

"Lisa Osanka"

So, it is a, uh.
Clarksdale 1 limited partnership.

"Council President James"

And who makes up those partners.

"Lisa Osanka"

I will.
Turn to the document I did bring that with.
There we go, uh, Clarksdale rental 1, limited partnership care of the community builders ink.

"Council President James"

So, community builder Z.
Technically has the contract with liberty green with the, uh.
Citigroup

"Lisa Osanka"

yes, that's correct. Yes. And you don't have any influence on that contract at all.
So so, within the contract there, there are provisions to exercise for us to inform TCB.
We have been in communication with them and they have also been presented with the information. They also have had.
The units are inspected by HUD during covid. Those inspections were not scheduled. Because of.
Safety concerns both to the, the tenants as well as to the contractors, but they did resume those this year and the scores for all the units at liberty green, and at Shepard square uh,
scored in the average of 86 points. Points

"Council President James"

What is passing and failing in the seat

"Lisa Osanka"

60 is failing.

"Council President James"

Did any of them score below 60?

"Lisa Osanka"

None

"Council President James"

did any score between 60 and 70.

"Lisa Osanka"

now.

"Council President James"

And you score between 780?

"Lisa Osanka"

No,

"Council President James"

the score between 80 and 90.

"Lisa Osanka"

yes all eighty six average

"Council President James"

anything get to one hundred
Did everything

"Lisa Osanka"

uh, no. Okay.

"Council President James"

Then, I guess my next question is related to.
If if you're not in direct control.

But the, the management group is in control of the contract, have they ever managing general partners manager? Managing general partners? Have has the managing general partners ever received any penalty payments for any quote violations of the contract?

"Lisa Osanka"

The contract doesn't call for penalty payments.

"Council President James"

Right. Um, the.
I'm sorry, I didn't hear your question.

"Lisa Osanka"

Yeah. And I should be careful because it is a several, you know, dozens of pages, but I do not believe that the contract calls for any penalty payments.

"Council President James"

So, there's no provision if the group fails to uphold their end of the deal that there's some sort of, um.
payment for not fulfilling a part of the contract to the group

"Lisa Osanka"

Yeah, I, I, without looking at the contract, but I do not believe so.
Now.

"Council President James"

Okay, um, and Matt and share our relinquish my time at this point.

"Chair Shanklin"

Oh, I'm willing to ask author.
There are so many questions left unanswered.
Would you be willing to table and we have a special meeting, or you want to go ahead and.
Make a motion to vote are because there's a lot of unanswered questions and if you want to have a special meeting, I can do a special meeting next week and that would give missile cycle.
More time to bring some, all of her information.

"Council Member Arthur"

Thank you for asking me that I would like to vote and I want to remind committee members.
That section 1 of this resolution reads that we want to cancel the contract at earliest lawful opportunity. So, for any committee member concerned about if this is legal, our resolution tells them to cancel.

Contract when it is legal, that is what counsel would be calling on them to do you've heard directly from residents?
We did not have time to get into all of the allegations of retaliation on residents who are simply just trying to live better but I hope that you'll stand with residents today and support this resolution for them to have better housing conditions.

"Chair Shanklin"

Well, so far everyone has spoken, they wanted to except council bonds, so we're going to allow her to speak and then we're going to go on and and. Council and bones,

"Committee Member Bowens"

thank you, Michigan. I have a question. You have the communication source between the tenants and group correct?

"Lisa Osanka"

Um, I'm the communication source

"Committee Member Bowens"

as far as them, given their complaints and everything.

"Lisa Osanka"

Um, not not directly.

So so, typically, what happens in the landlord tenant relationship if a tenant has an issue with their unit, they notify their landlord in this case, the property management group, and a work order is placed. And and then that work order is is handled routinely. If the if the tenant does not feel like they have gotten resolution, we do have a public housing.

Stutzman, who can take that complaint and then make sure that the management group addresses the open issues.

And so that's the documentation that I believe we've already provided to council member James, that we would like to enter into the, uh.

To to provide to you to give that different point of view.

"Committee Member Bowens"

Okay. Cause I know. You said there's a 2nd, you know, there's a 2 part side of this.

Someone is not here to tell the whole thing, but you're hearing these concerns and what President James has is pretty much a large binder witness setup alarm to you that.

Red flag that this group is doing something that we need to pay close attention to.

"Lisa Osanka"

So, I think that the size of the binder is, is.

Again, again, the documentation is such that that there will be an email, right? And so then, um, that email is.

Forwarded, but sometimes it's just so.

In terms of the numbers, and I want to make sure I've got this right because it's it is an excellent question. We talked about the.

We haven't talked about the so just, I'll be very quick half of the compliance that have been received in there. Maybe not that binder, but half of the complaints about this management group.

Are about the scattered site component, which they no longer manage. So a 5th of the units that they managed had more than half the complaints.

So so they are no longer managing those units. The housing authorities, managing those units at liberty green. A 3rd of those complaints are at liberty green, even though liberty green is 50% of the units and.

and A 5th of the complaints are about shepherd Square, even though they're a 3rd of the units in question.

And so there is, there is absolutely a disconnect between the complaints and the locations and the number of units.

"Committee Member Bowens"

Okay, I'm going to site that they're no longer managing those complaints. Are they consistent with the complaints that you're receiving now? From the place that they are managing.

"Lisa Osanka"

No, no, no, not the scale at all. No.

"Chair Shanklin"

Okay, thank you. Thank you before I give you the last question.

Customer author, I hit 1 comment. I wanted to make.

and i want to know you know we've talked about a little bit of everything who's over it and whatever my thoughts are how long is it going to take you up to get these things fixed i know some i've heard somebody say

It's been a couple of years, some say, 3 months how long.

Just tell us the truth. How long is it gonna take.

To get all of these complaints done, that's our concern.

"Lisa Osanka"

To get you the documentation that that many documentation

"Chair Shanklin"

I want to see how long it's gonna be before they go in there and do the work the actual work.

"Lisa Osanka"

Well, that's what the documentation would show you is that the work has already been done at at the vast majority of these open issues.

So, everybody in there, all the people in there are not telling the truth. I definitely definitely would not want to say that or imply that at all, but I would like the opportunity to to review. The, the issues that were raised, because some of them are new to me and to provide the documentation. From the management group that they have been handled. Okay.

"Chair Shanklin"

You might have to call you back pretty soon a councilman author.

"Council Member Arthur"

Yeah, I just want to clarify something real quick director. You've talked about another point of view a lot during this committee and at the same time, you've also talked about a resolution that your board passed. To phase out the CD group is that correct?

"Lisa Osanka"

No, the, the resolution that the board passed yesterday was for, uh, taking, uh, transferring the ownership of Clarksdale 1, which is the 1st of 4 phases.

As part of that transfer of ownership of Clarksdale 1, we will also the housing authority. We'll put out a request for proposals for property management groups.

And then we will evaluate those responses in selecting a management group.

"Council Member Arthur"

So, you are actively looking to replace them.

"Lisa Osanka"

We, we are it it is, it is not about replacing them. It is what we have done at part of all, and what we were are going to do at liberty green.

"Council Member Arthur"

But after you get those proposals, then they would technically replace the group.

Um, so.

We, it's, it's a, it's a request for proposals, and we are required to allow free and fair competition. And so any property management group that wanted to bid could.

"Council Member Purvis"

Excuse me, I hate to cut in on your councilman author. I just want to know we'll see T group be allowed to be again.

`Lisa Osanka"

They, they will.

The procurement rules are such that we have to allow vendors to bid.

"Council Member Arthur"

Okay, I just wanted to make sure we got that on record that you are opening it up for proposals they could get replaced. I know you don't want to admit to that. Um, and that our resolution is supportive of someone else managing these sites. Thank you. So much.

"Chair Shanklin"

Sorry.

Uh, councilman, or are we ready to vote.

"Council Member Arthur"

Yes, ma'am. Thank you.

"Chair Shanklin"

This is a resolution allowed for a voice vote all those in favor signify by saying.

This item will be sent to the consent calendar.

Saying that we are adjourned Thank you.