Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Certificate of Appropriateness

To:	Shane Karini
Thru:	Bob Keesaer, AIA, NCARB, Landmarks Supervisor
From:	Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date:	October 29, 2015

Case No: 15COA1225
Classification: Staff Review

FILE

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 2025 Baringer Avenue

Applicant:
Shane Karini
Purofirst Disaster Services
2251 Stanley Gault Parkway
Louisville, KY 40223
502-777-0690
shkari01@gmail.com

Owner:
Dennis Hesthaven
2025 Baringer Avenue
Louisville, KY 40204
502-494-6074
hesthavend@stifel.com

Architect/Design: Shane Karini

Contractor: TBD

Estimated Project Cost: $30,000

Description of proposed exterior alteration:
The applicant requests approval to construct a 22' by 30' frame garage on the alley behind the main house. The previous garage was demolished by past homeowners. The remaining concrete pad will be removed and repoured for the garage, which will be aligned with the neighbor's garage. The proposed garage will be covered with vinyl siding. The north elevation, which will face the alley, will contain two single garage doors (7' x 10'). Both doors will be C.H.I. doors (model no. 2250) that have articulated panels. A 2' apron will be poured from the garage

to the alley. The east and west elevations will not contain any windows or doors. The south elevation will contain a Steel Man pedestrian door (model no. 3068). The hipped roof will be clad in asphalt shingles and contain ogee gutters to match the main house. The applicant will also construct a 1' tall retaining wall, which will run along the back side of the garage. The wall will be built from a Belgard Diamond Pro wall block. The year yard is slightly higher in elevation than the garage area and runoff is an issue. The wall will not visible from the alley.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application
The application was received on October 23, 2015. The application was considered complete and needing staff review on October 26, 2015.

FINDINGS

Guidelines
The following design review guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Garage, New Construction, and Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background
The R5B zoned property in the Traditional Neighborhood Form District is located on the north side of Baringer Avenue four lots west of Willow Avenue. The single-family home is a two-and-a-half-story masonry Craftsman. The surrounding homes are also two and three-story Craftsman style masonry homes.

Conclusions
The project generally meets the design guidelines for **Garage, New Construction, and Site**. The 22' by 30' frame garage will be similar to others that are in the alley. The hipped roof matches the Craftsman style of the houses and garages, and the vinyl siding will complement that style. The retaining wall will not be visible from the alley and will help with erosion issues in the rear yard. **Staff recommends that the applicant use windows to break up the wall surface, but this is not a requirement.**

DECISION
On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness is **approved** with the following conditions.

1. Vinyl siding shall be smooth face clapboard style not dutchlap.
2. Vinyl siding shall have a 3 or 4" exposure.
3. Historic concrete mix shall be used for garage apron (see attached).
4. Should the design change, the applicant shall contact staff.

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.

Savannah Darr — 10/29/15

Savannah Darr
Historic Preservation Specialist

Date

Attached Documents / Information

1. Staff Guideline Checklist
2. Application

GARAGE

Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
NA	Not Applicable
NSI	Not Sufficient Information

Design Element	Building Feature		Approved	Comments
Location		+	Rear-yard location	
		+	Align with adjacent secondary structures	Aligning with neighboring garage
		+	Use to define and enclose rear yard	
		+	Minimize paving	
Materials	Walls	NA	Horizontal wood siding (3" or 4" exposure)	
		NA	Board and batten siding	
		NA	Brick	
		NA	Stucco over frame or concrete block	
		NA	Cast stone, molded concrete block	
		+	Aluminum and vinyl siding (3" or 4" exposure)	
		NA	No painted concrete block.	
		NA	No un-painted concrete block.	
		NA	No T-111 plywood.	
	Roof	+	Asphalt, fiberglass, wood, vinyl, or slate shingles.	Asphalt shingles

		NA	Metal roofing	
		+	Half-round or Ogee gutters	Ogee gutters
		NA	Approved Gable-end element	
		+	No membrane roofing on sloped roofs.	
Building Forms	Main Block	+	Simple, rectangular, prismatic volumes	
		NA	Ell-shaped buildings	
		NA	Slightly-projecting bays	
		NA	Cantilevered, second floors	
		+	No overly-elaborate volumes	
	Roof	NA	Simple gable roofs (6-in-12 minimum slope)	
		+	Hipped, shed, and flat roofs with parapets	Hipped roof to match main house
		NA	Intersecting gables	
		+	Overhanging eaves	
		+/-	Half-round gutters	+ Ogee gutters are acceptable
		+	No low-pitched gable roofs (less than 6-in-12 slope)	6-in-12 slope
		+	No flush eaves	
		+	No roofs without gutters	Ogee gutters
Openings	Garage	+	Single-car openings	2 single car openings
	Doors	+	Surface area of door broken up by articulated panels or stiles and rails to reduce scale	
		+	No double and triple doors	Single doors
		+	No flush garage doors (they accentuate the large size of the openings)	
	Windows	NA	Use window openings to break up wall surface	No windows on structure
		NA	Security grills installed on the inside face of the windows	

NEW CONSTRUCTION

RESIDENTIAL DESIGN GUIDELINES

+	Meets Guidelines
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
NA	Not Applicable
NSI	Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NC1	Make sure that new designs conform to all other municipal regulations, including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations.	+	
NC2	Do not demolish contributing structures in a historic district to make way for new or large-scale construction. Non-contributing buildings are identified in each of the district or individual landmark designations or National Register nominations.	+	
NC3	Design new construction so that the building height, directional emphasis, scale, massing, and volume reflect the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+	Matches other garages in alley

NC4	Make sure that the scale of new construction does not conflict with the historic character of the neighborhood.	+	
NC5	Incorporate materials and design elements that complement the color, size, texture, and level of craftsmanship seen in surrounding buildings.	+	Hipped roof like main house
NC6	Do not use materials in new construction that are visually incompatible with surrounding historic buildings within the district. Materials to be avoided include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, chain-link fencing, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unpainted wood, and asphalt siding.	+	
NC7	Design new construction to reinforce the human scale of historic districts where this is a character-defining feature.	+	
NC8	Design new construction in such a way that it does not disrupt important public views and vistas.	NA	Rear alley
NC9	Reinforce existing patterns of open space and enclosure, created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, in designs for new construction.	+	
NC10	Design infill construction that reinforces the spatial organization established by surrounding buildings. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly-designed facades.	+	
NC11	Design infill construction in such a way that the façade's organization closely relates to surrounding buildings. Window and door openings should be similar in size to their historic counterparts, as should the proportion of window to wall space. Cornice lines, columns, and storefronts are other important character-defining facade elements.	+	Similar to other garages
NC12	Design new construction so that the building mass has a similar sense of lightness or weight as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solids (walls) to voids (window and door openings). Historic window proportions are generally two-and-one-half (height) by one (width).	+	Similar to other garages
NC13	Develop designs for new construction using windows that are sympathetic to the window patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportions, and muntin configurations is encouraged.	NA	No windows
NC14	Develop designs for new construction using front doors that are sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.	NA	Garage
NC15	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main entrance is the same as the majority of other buildings on the street	+	Similar to other garages
NC16	Incorporate paved walks between sidewalks and the front entrances for new construction located on streets where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	Garage
NC17	Retain the character-defining features of a historic building when undertaking accessibility code-required work.	NA	
NC18	Investigate removable or portable ramps as options to providing barrier-free access.	NA	
NC19	Locate handicapped access ramps on secondary elevations wherever possible. If locating a ramp on the primary façade is required, it should be installed in a manner that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible.	NA	
NC20	Design infill construction so that it is compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings.	+	Similar to other garages
NC21	Design new construction to have a floor-to-floor height that is within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the floor-to-floor height is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	NA	Garage

NC22	Maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape. The space between new construction and existing structures should fall within 20 percent of the average spacing for the block.	NA	Garage
NC23	Maintain historic setback patterns. In order to maintain the continuity of the streetscape, setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.	NA	Garage
NC24	Ensure that the roofs of new buildings relate to those of neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+	Similar to other garages
NC25	Follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings when designing rooflines for infill construction. Where the predominant form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated.	+	Hipped to match main house
NC26	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main roof form is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street, where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.	+	Similar to other garages
NC27	Design new construction to emphasize the existing cornice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	Garage
NC28	Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered.	NA	Garage
NC29	Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction.	+	
NC30	Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings. While use of wood siding is preferred, vinyl siding may be used for new construction, but only in areas where the predominate historic construction material is wood.	+	Vinyl siding—similar to other garages
NC31	Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction. Red brick is the most common masonry material found throughout the city's historic districts.	NA	
NC32	Incorporate stone or cast-stone sills and lintels into new construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-defining features.	NA	
NC33	Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction.	NA	
NC34	Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance.	NA	
NC35	Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof.	NA	
NC36	Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head.	NA	
NC37	Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of adjacent secondary structures.	+	
NC38	Site new garages adjacent to alleys where present. Review the garage prototype insert that identifies styles appropriate to preservation districts when planning a garage construction project.	+	

NC39	Where no alleys exist, garages should be sited at the rear of the property behind the main house. Garage doors should not face the street, and access should be along the side yard. Landscape screening along the driveway is encouraged.	NA	
NC40	Use of smaller, single garage doors rather than expansive double or triple doors is preferred.	+	
NC41	Orient the roofline of a new garage so that it is parallel with the main house or follow the predominant pattern of existing secondary structures where such a pattern exists.	+	
NC42	Roof pitch should be no less than one in six. Where the roof form of the main house is character-defining, owners are encouraged to echo the form of the main house.	+	
NC43	Design new construction so that access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	+	
NC44	Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	NA	

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
NA	Not Applicable
NSI	Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+	
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	+	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	+	Historic concrete mix for apron
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	NA	
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+	

ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	NA	
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	+	
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NA	
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NA	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NA	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	