



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Staff Report to the Committee

To:	Old Louisville ARC
Thru:	Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer 
From:	Becky Gorman, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date:	August 17, 2018

Case No: 18COA1121
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 950, 964, 966, 968 S First Street

Applicant: Patrick Blackburn, AIA
VBNA, Inc.
640 S. 4th Street
Louisville, KY 40202
502.589.5674

Owner: Ramona Johnson
Bridgehaven, Inc.
950 S. 1st Street
Louisville, KY 40202
502.585.9444
rjohnson@bridgehaven.org

Estimated Project Cost: \$5,000,000

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to construct a 5,730 sq. ft. addition to the south elevation of the existing building at 950 S. 1st Street. It is a proposed two story stucco-clad structure that will match the massing, materials and window configurations of the existing building. A new pedway is proposed over the alley that will connect the new addition to the proposed new building on the vacant lots at 964, 966 and 968 S. 1st Street. The new multipurpose structure will be two stories, 13,200 sq.ft., and approximately 40'-0" feet tall. It will have a masonry base, the exterior sheathing will be stucco to match the existing buildings; and large storefront glazing is proposed, as well as, one-over-one double hung

windows. A new parking lot is proposed at the rear of the building where there are 18 spaces provided.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on May 31, 2018. The application was determined requiring Committee Review on June 4, 2018. Staff met with the applicant to discuss the project. Additional information was submitted on July 6, 2018.

The case is scheduled for a hearing at the regular meeting of the Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee on August 22, 2018 at 4:30 p.m. in Conference Room 101 of Metro Development Center at 444 S. 5th Street.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Addition, New Construction-Commercial and Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report. The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

In 1999, Case No. C-99-89-OL approved the new construction of a two story stucco-clad structure. The property is zoned TNZD in the Traditional Neighborhood Form District and surrounded by 2 to 3 story residences and an institutional structure across the street. An alley separates 950 S. 1st from the vacant lots at 964, 966 and 968 S. 1st Street. The vacant lots are adjacent to a historic apartment building that faces Kentucky Street

Conclusions

The project meets the Landmarks Design Guidelines for Addition, New Construction-Commercial and Site.

The addition to 950 S. 1st Street becomes an extension of the existing building keeping the same building and roof forms, window fenestration and materials.

The proposed pedway will connect the new addition at 950 S. 1st Street with the new building across the alley. There are no design guidelines that address a proposed pedway. The pedway is a physical walkway between buildings separated by an alley but also serves as a visual connector for the campus.

The proposed new building meets the building height, scale, massing, volume, directional emphasis and setback of the surrounding architectural context taking cues from the corner building facing Kentucky Street. The structure is in line the with the Kentucky Street structure keeping the rhythm of the streetscape. The main entrance is centered on the front façade and the window placement is appropriate for the new structure and reflective of the surrounding new and

historic structures. The materials are sympathetic to the historic buildings and match the other buildings on the Bridgehaven campus.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends that the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved with the following conditions:

1. Make sure that new designs conform to all other municipal regulations, including the Metro Louisville Development Code and Zoning District Regulations.
2. The applicant shall work with staff on the final detail of the masonry base and storefront systems.
3. Exterior lighting shall be submitted to staff for approval.
4. Any changes to the approved proposal shall be submitted to staff for review and approval prior to installation.



Becky Gorman
Historic Preservation Specialist

8/14/18
Date

Attached Documents / Information

1. Staff guideline checklist

ADDITION

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
A1	Ensure that the design of any new addition is in proportion with the size and scale of the historic building and district.	+	The addition mimics the existing building which was approved in 1999.
A2	Design any addition so that it is subordinate to the original building. Generally, additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.	+	The addition extends the existing building where there currently is some parking.
A3	Generally, additions should be attached to secondary elevations and should be set back from the front façade, so as not to damage or obscure character-defining features.	+	This is an appropriate place for this addition because it continues the building along the street front.

A4	Use materials that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+	The materials will match the existing.
A5	Respect original roof forms when designing an addition. Additions should complement existing forms, not overwhelm them.	+	The roof form will match the existing.
A6	Do not undertake any full-floor additions in residential preservation districts (adding an additional full floor on top of a building).	NA	
A7	Generally, the original orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade.	+	
A8	Design any new addition so that the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	+	
A9	Design additions to have the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion.	+	
A10	Design additions so that there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration. This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion.	+	The addition mimics the existing building which was approved in 1999.
A11	Set back additional stories from the historic wall plane of commercial or institutional structures when such an approach is required for a new use. The construction of additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible and not damage or destroy character-defining features.	NA	
A12	Do not design additions to appear older than the original building.	+	
A13	Comply with the Kentucky building code in such a way that a historic building's character-defining features are preserved.	NA	
A14	Do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features when adding a new code-required stairway or elevator. Any such addition should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	NA	
A15	Install fire escapes only on secondary elevations. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. They should preferably be painted to match the color of the wall.	NA	
A16	Do not construct a deck on a front or side façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or finished with an opaque stain. Use the railing detail developed by the Landmarks Commission or other approved detail.	NA	
A17	Design rear decks so that they do not extend beyond the side walls of the house and are not visible from the street.	NA	
A18	Wood fire stairs should be painted or stained and should be kept to a minimum functional size.	NA	

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+	
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	NA	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	NSI	
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	NA	
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+	Parking is proposed at the rear of the lots and accessed from the alley.
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	NA	
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	NA	
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	

ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NSI	Exterior lighting shall be submitted to staff for approval.
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NA	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NSI	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NSI	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NSI	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NSI	

NEW CONSTRUCTION

COMMERCIAL AND INSTITUTIONAL DESIGN GUIDELINES

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted

NA Not Applicable

NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NC1	Make sure that new designs conform to all other applicable regulations including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations.	NSI	See conditions of approval.
NC2	Do not demolish contributing structures in a historic district to make way for new or large-scale construction. Non-contributing buildings are identified in each of the district or individual landmark designations or National Register nominations.	+	The lots for proposed construction are vacant.
NC3	Design new construction so that the building height, scale, massing, volume, directional emphasis, and setback reflects the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+	
NC4	Make sure that the scale of new construction does not conflict with the historic character of the district.	+	
NC5	Select materials and design elements for new construction that are sympathetic with surrounding historic buildings in the district. Materials should be of a complementary color, size, texture, scale, and level of craftsmanship.	+/-	
NC6	Do not use materials in new construction that are visually incompatible with surrounding historic buildings within the district. Materials to be avoided include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, chain-link fencing, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unpainted wood, and asphalt siding.	+	
NC7	Have new construction reinforce the human scale of historic districts by emphasizing the base of the building where this is a character-defining feature.	+	
NC8	Design infill construction that enhances the pedestrian-oriented character of historic commercial districts. Commercial buildings should have a well-defined base at the pedestrian level with details conveying a sense of horizontality and progression along the sidewalk.	+	
NC9	Design new construction in such a way that it does not disrupt important public views and vistas.	NA	
NC10	Plant canopy trees in front of any large-scale new construction to provide a visual sense of consistency along a streetscape.	NSI	
NC11	Reinforce existing patterns of open space and enclosure, created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, in designs for new construction.	+	
NC12	Design infill construction that reinforces the spatial organization established by surrounding buildings. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly-designed facades.	+	
NC13	Design infill construction in such a way that the façade's organization closely relates to surrounding buildings. Window and door openings should be similar in size to their historic counterparts, as should the proportion of window to wall space. Cornice lines, columns, and storefronts are other important character-defining facade elements.	+	
NC14	Design new construction so that the building mass has a similar sense of lightness or weightiness as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solid surfaces (walls) to voids (window and door openings).	+	

NC15	Maintain historic patterns of window and door proportion and placement in designs for new construction.	+	
NC16	Develop designs for new construction using windows that are sympathetic to the window patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportions, and muntin configurations is encouraged.	+	
NC17	Develop designs for new construction using front doors that are sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.	+	
NC18	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main entrance is the same as the majority of other buildings on the street.	+	
NC19	Retain the character-defining features of a historic building when undertaking accessibility code-required work.	NA	
NC20	Investigate removable or portable ramps as options to providing barrier-free access.	NA	
NC21	Locate handicapped access ramps on secondary elevations wherever possible. If locating a ramp on the primary façade is required, it should be installed in a way that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible.	NA	
NC22	Design infill construction so that it is compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings. The rhythm of the façade should also reflect the characteristic rhythm of existing buildings on the street. Vertical elements (doors, columns, and storefronts) should be spaced approximately every 20 to 40 feet at the pedestrian level.	+	
NC23	Design new construction to have a floor-to-floor height that is within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the floor-to-floor height is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	+	
NC24	Incorporate set-back upper stories into designs for new construction that exceed the established cornice line.		
NC25	Maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape. The space between new construction and existing structures should fall within 20 percent of the average spacing for the block. New construction should be built out to the property lines where this is a character-defining feature.	+	
NC26	Historic commercial properties have long been anchors in Louisville's preservation districts. Construction of commercial properties on vacant corner lots should preferably be built to the corner with an entrance oriented to the corner.	NA	
NC27	Maintain historic setback patterns. In order to maintain the continuity of the streetscape, setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.	+	
NC28	Ensure that the roofs of new buildings relate to those of neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+	
NC29	Follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings when designing rooflines for infill construction. Where the predominate form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominate form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated.	+	
NC30	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main roof form is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.	+	

NC31	Design new construction to emphasize the existing cornice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature.	+	
NC32	Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered.	NSI	
NC33	Make provisions for screening and storage of trash receptacles when designing new construction.	+	Dumpster enclosure located on the 950 S 1 st St.
NC34	Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings.	-	The exterior sheathing will match that of the other building approved in 1999.
NC35	Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction.	NA	
NC36	Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction.	NA	
NC37	Design parking garages so that they relate closely to adjacent structures. Their facades should reflect the hierarchical organization and design elements seen on surrounding buildings.	NA	
NC38	Design new construction so that access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	+	
NC39	Generally, leave at least 20 percent of a parking lot's surface area unpaved and planted. All parking lots must meet the minimum requirements of the city's Development Code. Perimeter landscaping, fencing, colonnades, or other construction that visually continues the building line along open sidewalks is encouraged.		
NC40	Generally speaking, parking should be located in the rear.	+	
NC41	Design required new parking in such a way that it is as unobtrusive as possible and minimizes the impact on the historic setting. Shared parking areas among groups of businesses is encouraged.	+	
NC42	Do not build additional surface parking lots within the West Main Preservation District.	NA	
NC43	Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	NSI	
NC44	Do not create additional open space within the West Main Historic District.	NA	