



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer *CE*
From: Savannah Darr, Planning & Design Coordinator
Date: November 27, 2019

Case No: 19-COA-0130
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 2240 Grinstead Drive

Applicant: Walter Lee
2238 Grinstead Drive
Louisville, KY 40204
502-509-5745
waltlee47130@yahoo.com

Owner: same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to construct a residence on a vacant lot. The single-family home will be two stories tall above ground with a basement and walkout garage below ground. The building is a unique shape designed to fit the pie shaped lot. The first floor will be clad in fiber cement horizontal lap siding while the second floor will be clad in fiber cement board and batten. The windows will be vinyl casement style windows. A small, concrete front porch is proposed with a metal awning overhead. The porch will have metal railings and metal skirting. A screened porch is proposed for the rear elevation. The garage entry will be on the east side and contain one large garage door. A concrete retaining wall is proposed near the rear of the building by the garage.

Access to the property and parking will be off an existing, unpaved alley on the south and east side of the lot. The applicant proposes to pave the 13.5' alley to utilize it for garage access. The applicant also proposes to install a horizontal wood fence along the west and south portions of the property.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on November 8, 2019. It was determined to be complete and requiring a committee level review on November 11, 2019. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on December 4, 2019 at 4:30 pm, at 444 S. 5th Street, Conference Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **New Construction-Residential** and **Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The R5B zoned property in the Traditional Neighborhood Form District is located on the south side of Grinstead Drive, five lots east of Hilliard Avenue. An unpaved alley is located on the south and east sides of the vacant lot. This lot was previously side yard for 2238 Grinstead Drive. Cave Hill Cemetery is located across Grinstead Drive from the property. The surrounding buildings are predominately two-story frame homes.

Conclusions

The new construction generally meets the **New Construction-Residential** and **Site** guidelines for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District. The proposed materials are compatible with those already found nearby and in the District. The design is more modern than the neighboring houses; however, it is compatible. The neighboring houses to the west are bungalows while the houses to the east are younger Minimal Traditionals. These clusters of houses represent two different periods of development for this portion of Grinstead Drive. This vacant lot is situated between the two clusters making it a clean break between them. Thus, this lot is good for a modern, new construction because of that break between house styles and time periods. The proposed new construction is a similar above ground height to the neighboring houses. However, the front façade is a solid rectangle while the neighboring houses are more complex in their facades and rooflines. This difference in design will likely make the new construction appear larger even though it's not much larger. Because of the unique placement and shape of the lot, this difference in building mass is still compatible. Located on a tight curve of Grinstead Drive and in a visual break between house styles, this lot can accommodate this modern shape and design.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved** with the following condition:

1. As shown on the elevations, thick horizontal trim shall be installed between the first and second floors.
2. All window and door openings shall have trim.
3. A front sidewalk leading from the public sidewalk to the house shall be installed. The concrete shall be historic mix or stained to match concrete along neighboring sidewalks.
4. The new driveway shall historic concrete mix or stained to match neighboring concrete.
5. The fence shall not exceed 7' in height. The finished side shall face out away from the property.
6. All wood elements shall be clear coated, painted, or stained within 6 months of construction.
7. Storm-water management provisions shall be incorporated into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.
8. Mechanical systems shall be integrated into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered.
9. Provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles shall be included when designing new construction.
10. If the design or materials change, the applicant and/or their representative shall contact staff for review and approval.

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.


Savannah Darr
Planning & Design Coordinator

11/27/19
Date

NEW CONSTRUCTION

RESIDENTIAL DESIGN GUIDELINES

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NC1	Make sure that new designs conform to all other municipal regulations, including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations.	+	
NC2	Do not demolish contributing structures in a historic district to make way for new or large-scale construction. Non-contributing buildings are identified in each of the district or individual landmark designations or National Register nominations.	+	Vacant lot
NC3	Design new construction so that the building height, directional emphasis, scale, massing, and volume reflect the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+/-	See conclusions
NC4	Make sure that the scale of new construction does not conflict with the historic character of the neighborhood.	+	
NC5	Incorporate materials and design elements that complement the color, size, texture, and level of craftsmanship seen in surrounding buildings.	+	Fiber cement siding, which replicates wood siding, is found in this area.
NC6	Do not use materials in new construction that are visually incompatible with surrounding historic buildings within the district. Materials to be avoided include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, chain-link fencing, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unpainted wood, and asphalt siding.	+	
NC7	Design new construction to reinforce the human scale of historic districts where this is a character-defining feature.	+	
NC8	Design new construction in such a way that it does not disrupt important public views and vistas.	+	Infill in a former side yard
NC9	Reinforce existing patterns of open space and enclosure, created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, in designs for new construction.	+	
NC10	Design infill construction that reinforces the spatial organization established by surrounding buildings. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly-designed facades.	+	
NC11	Design infill construction in such a way that the façade's organization closely relates to surrounding buildings. Window and door openings should be similar in size to their historic counterparts, as should the proportion of window to wall space. Cornice lines, columns, and storefronts are other important character-defining facade elements.	+/-	The proposed design is more modern than surrounding buildings. However, it is compatible with those buildings.

NC12	Design new construction so that the building mass has a similar sense of lightness or weight as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solids (walls) to voids (window and door openings). Historic window proportions are generally two-and-one-half (height) by one (width).	+	
NC13	Develop designs for new construction using windows that are sympathetic to the window patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportions, and muntin configurations is encouraged.	+/-	The proposed design is more modern than surrounding buildings. However, it is compatible with those buildings.
NC14	Develop designs for new construction using front doors that are sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.	+/-	See comment above
NC15	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main entrance is the same as the majority of other buildings on the street	+	
NC16	Incorporate paved walks between sidewalks and the front entrances for new construction located on streets where this is a character-defining feature.	+	See conditions of approval
NC17	Retain the character-defining features of a historic building when undertaking accessibility code-required work.	NA	
NC18	Investigate removable or portable ramps as options to providing barrier-free access.	NA	
NC19	Locate handicapped access ramps on secondary elevations wherever possible. If locating a ramp on the primary façade is required, it should be installed in a manner that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible.	NA	
NC20	Design infill construction so that it is compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings.		
NC21	Design new construction to have a floor-to-floor height that is within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the floor-to-floor height is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	+/-	Due to the slope and shape of the lot, this will be similar but not exact.
NC22	Maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape. The space between new construction and existing structures should fall within 20 percent of the average spacing for the block.	+	
NC23	Maintain historic setback patterns. In order to maintain the continuity of the streetscape, setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.	+	Setback is consistent with neighboring buildings.
NC24	Ensure that the roofs of new buildings relate to those of neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+/-	A shed roof is different, but not incompatible.
NC25	Follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings when designing rooflines for infill construction. Where the predominant form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated.	+/-	A shed roof is different, but not incompatible.
NC26	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main roof form is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street, where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.	+	

NC27	Design new construction to emphasize the existing cornice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	Not character-defining on this block
NC28	Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered.	+	See conditions of approval
NC29	Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction.	+	See conditions of approval
NC30	Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings. While use of wood siding is preferred, vinyl siding may be used for new construction, but only in areas where the predominate historic construction material is wood.	+	Fiber cement siding, which replicates wood siding, is found in this area.
NC31	Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction. Red brick is the most common masonry material found throughout the city's historic districts.	NA	
NC32	Incorporate stone or cast-stone sills and lintels into new construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-defining features.	NA	
NC33	Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction.	NA	
NC34	Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance.	+	Raised concrete foundation.
NC35	Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof.	+/-	Some of the buildings have larger porches and others have stoops. This design is compatible.
NC36	Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head.	+/-	Some of the buildings have larger porches and others have stoops. This design is compatible.
NC37	Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of adjacent secondary structures.	NA	Garage is attached to main structure
NC38	Site new garages adjacent to alleys where present. Review the garage prototype insert that identifies styles appropriate to preservation districts when planning a garage construction project.	+	
NC39	Where no alleys exist, garages should be sited at the rear of the property behind the main house. Garage doors should not face the street, and access should be along the side yard. Landscape screening along the driveway is encouraged.	NA	
NC40	Use of smaller, single garage doors rather than expansive double or triple doors is preferred.	+/-	As this is total new construction, a double door is not out of character.
NC41	Orient the roofline of a new garage so that it is parallel with the main house or follow the predominant pattern of existing secondary structures where such a pattern exists.	NA	Garage is attached to main structure
NC42	Roof pitch should be no less than one in six. Where the roof form of the main house is character-defining, owners are encouraged to echo the form of the main house.	NA	Shed roof

NC43	Design new construction so that access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	+	
NC44	Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	+	See conditions of approval

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+/-	See conclusions
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	+/-	Currently platted alley is unpaved and it will be paved
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	+	
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	NA	
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+	
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	+/-	Some topography will be changed in order to construct the building.
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	+	Retaining wall will be near the rear of the house

ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	+	See conditions of approval
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	+	See conditions of approval
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NA	
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NA	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NA	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	