



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To:	Limerick Architectural Review Committee
Thru:	Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Officer
From:	Bradley Fister, Planning & Design Coordinator
Date:	September 7, 2022 <i>BF</i>

Case No: 22-COA-0152
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1015 S. 7th Street

Applicant: William S. Swisher
1015 S. 7th St.
Louisville, KY 40203
812-989-6921
slamswisher83@gmail.com

Owner: same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: \$4,900.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant requests after-the-fact approval for the replacement of two front façade windows with one-over-one single hung vinyl windows that fit the historic openings. The applicant also seeks after-the-fact approval for the replacement of the side entry door with a 5-panel steel door.

The applicant requests approval to replace the non-historic front entry door with a full lite craftsman style glass door. The applicant also proposes reconstruction of the front and side door trim and casings.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on June 23, 2022 following a zoning enforcement case (ENF-ZON-22-000339) opened on March 28, 2022. A notice of violation was issued March 31, 2022. Staff spoke to the applicant on July 7, 2022 and performed a site visit with the applicant on August 31, 2022.

The case is scheduled to be heard by the Limerick Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on Wednesday, September 14, 2022 at 5:30 PM in Room 101 of the Metro Development Building located at 444 S. 5th Street.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Limerick Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Window, Door, and Siding & Trim**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report. The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The site, zoned TNZD, is located on the east side of S. 7th Street in the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The site is situated on the southeast corner of S. 7th St. and an unnamed alley that runs east-west between S. 7th and S. 6th Streets. This block has at least five almost identical shotgun style houses including this one. The single-family house is a Victorian era, brick, camelback shotgun style. There used to be a front porch as seen in the designation photo below; however, it was not original to the home but a later addition. The two front façade windows were previously replaced with wood windows that did not fit the historic opening previously as evident in PVA photographs. This work was done without a COA.

Previous COAs include:

A-85-5-Li (2-25-1985) for the reconstruction of the cornice, painting of the previously painted masonry and trim, construction of a door hood, and replacement of the front and side door.

S-85-17-Li (3-8-1985) for the infill of two rear window openings, infill of a rear door, and construction of a new rear door opening.

S-03-37-Li (4-25-2003) for the previously painted masonry, and deck at rear of house.

Conclusions

This project generally does not meet the Limerick Design Guidelines for **Window**. While the front windows were previously replaced, the after-the-fact window replacement does not meet W1, W2, and W6. These specific guidelines do not allow synthetic windows on the front façade and also say that replacement windows should match the dimensions of historic windows. Vinyl windows generally do not match the dimensions of historic wood windows and they are full synthetic. Thus, the installed replacement windows do not meet these guidelines.

The after-the-fact door replacement on the side generally meets the Limerick Design Guidelines for **Door**. The previous door was not historic and had been previously replaced with a COA. The 5-panel solid door generally fits the architectural style of the house and fits the historic door opening.

However, the propose front door replacement generally does not meet the Limerick Design Guidelines for **Door**, specifically D1, D4, and D12. The proposed full lite

door with decorative craftsman style glass does not fit the architectural style of the house. A full lite door is rarely permitted on the front façade of a historic building in the District. These doors were not found historically and are inappropriate because of their modern design. This modern door would greatly alter the appearance of the historic entrance to the house. A $\frac{3}{4}$ lite door or solid panel door like what exists currently would be more appropriate.

The proposed reconstruction of the door trim and casing generally meets the design guidelines for **Siding & Trim**. The applicant shall use materials that will convey the same look and design as the existing trim and casing on the front façade.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant and the design guidelines, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the front window replacement and front door replacement be **denied**.

However, the side door replacement and trim work do meet the design guidelines. Thus, staff recommends their **approval** with the following conditions:

1. **The applicant shall restore the front door trim and casing using materials that will replicate the existing historic design with in-kind materials.**
2. **If the proposed scope of the project or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval prior to work taking place.**

Should the applicant agree to replacing the front windows with new clad wood windows and selecting a more appropriate front door, then staff would recommend the entire application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved** with the following conditions:

1. **The applicant shall replace the two front vinyl windows with 1/1 wood or clad wood windows that fit the historic window openings within 6 months of approval.**
2. **The applicant shall submit cut sheets for the new windows to staff for approval prior to ordering and installation.**
3. **The applicant shall submit a new front door design that meets the design guidelines to staff for approval prior to ordering and installation.**
4. **The applicant shall restore the front door trim and casing using materials that will replicate the existing historic design with in-kind materials.**
5. **If the proposed scope of the project or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval prior to work taking place.**

09-07-22
Date

Bradley Fister
Bradley Fister
Planning & Design Coordinator

WINDOW

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of vinyl- and aluminum-clad wood window systems on primary elevations may be permissible if the proportion and detail closely match the original.	-	The front windows were replaced previously without a COA with windows that did not fit the historic window openings. The windows have now been replaced with vinyl windows that do fit the historic openings; however, vinyl is not an appropriate material for front windows.
W2	Select windows that match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when repair of original windows is impossible.	+/-	The replacement windows do have the same configuration; however, being vinyl they do not have the same sash or frame dimensions as seen in wood windows.
W3	Evaluate the option of using appropriate salvage materials when replacing windows that are deteriorated beyond repair.	NSI	The front façade windows were already replacement windows and had been removed prior to the COA being submitted.
W4	Do not use replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock windows	+	The replacement windows do fit the historic openings.
W5	Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie windows in exterior window openings.	NA	
W6	Do not install synthetic replacement windows (vinyl, etc.) on primary facades.	-	The windows are vinyl and are on the front façade.
W7	Install replacement windows that operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	+/-	The windows were double hung and are now single hung
W8	Do not replace multi-pane windows that have true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on primary façade elevations.	NA	
W9	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	+	Windows appear not to have a reflective or insulating film.
W10	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	+	Windows appear to be clear glass
W11	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	NA	
W12	Do not block-in or back-paint transoms or sidelights.	NA	

W13	Use surviving prototypes to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds. The reconstructed element should be constructed of materials for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if that is not possible.	NA	
W14	Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	+	The number, size, and shape of the original front façade windows are the same.
W15	Locate any new windows openings that may be required for a new use on a façade that cannot be seen from a public way. Newly-installed windows should be compatible with the overall design of the building.	NA	
W16	Do not obscure historic window trim with metal or siding material.	NA	Historic wood trim was removed previously when windows were replaced years ago
W17	Do not install new floors or dropped ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W18	Install exterior storm windows that duplicate the shape of the original window. Storm windows should be painted to match the color of the window frame.	NA	
W19	Do not install exterior storm windows or screens that damage or obscure historic windows or frames. Mount storm windows on the blind stop within the window frame. Storm window or screen rails should always match the rails of the windows behind. They should have either wood or narrow, metal frames that are painted to match the color of the building trim.	NA	
W20	Do not install window air conditioning units on a primary façade if installation on a secondary façade can address the same need. If this is not an option, do not alter the window sash to accommodate the air-conditioning unit.	NA	
W21	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W22	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W23	Install awnings made of weather-proofed canvas of a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	
W24	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	
W25	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	

W26	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
W27	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7' above the sidewalk.	NA	
W28	Repair shutters with in-kind materials. If damage is so extensive that they cannot be repaired, replacement shutters should match the visual appearance of the originals.	NA	
W29	Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. Replacement shutters should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically-appropriate material. Solid shutters are appropriate for the ground floor, and solid or louvered shutters are appropriate for upper floors.	NA	
W30	Mount replacement shutters so that they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. This gives shutters the appearance that they are indeed operable, even if in truth they are not. Shutters should not be applied to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window.	NA	
W31	Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters.	NA	
W32	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	-	Images of previous windows were not submitted as the windows were not supposed to be replaced. There are no images on file of the original historic windows.

DOOR

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
D1	Do not alter the character of entrances by either removing historic elements or through the addition of elements for which there is no historic precedent.	+ -	The side replacement door does not alter the character of that entrance. It is in keeping with a side entry. The proposed front door would alter the character of the building as a whole. A full lite door would not have been here and the art glass within does not match the architecture of the house.
D2	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric	NA	Both doors have been replaced previously
D3	Use historical, pictorial, and physical documentation when undertaking the reconstruction of a missing entrance or porch feature. If there is not sufficient information to determine the original design, a new design should be prepared that is compatible with the architectural character of the building and the district. Conjectural or falsely-historical designs are not appropriate.	+/-	There an historic image of the front door casing and surround, which the applicant will use to do the trim work.
D4	Use only those replacement doors that duplicate the design, proportion, and arrangement of paneling and glazing of the original.	+ -	The side replacement door is appropriate to the architecture of the house. The original door design is unknown. The proposed replacement front door does not duplicate a door that would have been seen here historically. The original door design is unknown.
D5	Do not replace historic double leaf doors with a single door.	NA	
D6	Do not alter original openings to accommodate stock doors.	+	Both replacement doors will fit the existing openings
D7	Install only screen doors or storm doors that are simple with a narrow-frame design that enables the inner door to be seen. Metal screen and storm doors should be painted or finished to match the inner door.	NA	
D8	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original doors or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grilles should retract out of sight during business hours and preferably be mounted inside the glass. Painting security bars an unobtrusive color is recommended.	NA	
D9	Differentiate between primary and secondary doors, using the detailing of the doors or the articulation of the frame.	+	The existing front door trim and casing sets it apart from the side façade.
D10	Do not add vestibules to primary facades unless there is a historic precedent. Such additions alter the character, proportion, and massing of the façade.	NA	

D11	Do not create new entrances on facades that can be seen from a public way.	NA	
D12	Replacement of non-original, non-historic doors with new doors that are appropriate to the period and style of the building and are the size of the original opening is recommended.	+	The side replacement door is appropriate to the architecture of the house.
		-	The proposed replacement front door is not appropriate to the style of the house.

SIDING & TRIM

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
SD1	Do not replace missing wood features with conjectural or falsely-historic reconstructions or with newly-designed elements that are incompatible with the building's size, scale, material, or color.	+	The applicant proposes to reconstruct the door trim and casing as historically documented
SD2	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	+	Photographs existing both historically and currently of the existing trim.
SD3	Consider using contemporary wood siding, which conveys the visual appearance of historic siding, when replacement of such materials is required.	NA	
SD4	Do not use textured plywood (T-111) vertical siding. It is not an appropriate substitute material.	NA	
SD5	Do not install artificial stone, asbestos shingles, or asphalt shingles over or as a replacement for exterior siding.	NA	
SD6	Orient all replacement siding horizontally, unless there is sound, historic documentation for a different original orientation.	NA	
SD7	Do not install vinyl or aluminum siding on primary elevations on historic buildings. Retention of exposed original wood siding is always preferred; however, if a decision is made to apply siding to side and rear elevations, it should be done in a way that does not obscure or damage historic ornament, such as fishscale shingles, window casings, sills, hoods, brackets, and cornerboards.	NA	
SD8	Use only vinyl or aluminum siding that matches the dimensions of the original siding. Generally, smooth-faced, narrow-profile siding (3" or 4" depending on the character of the existing siding) is acceptable for installation on secondary elevations. Wherever possible without causing damage to historic fabric, trim, such as cornerboards, should project slightly beyond the vinyl siding.	NA	
SD9	Make sure that removal, handling, and disposal of lead-containing paint complies with all local, state, and federal standards.	+	Applicant shall take appropriate precautions
SD10	Do not remove exterior siding to install insulation within the exterior walls of historic wood frame construction. This can result in damage to historic fabric. Installation of insulation with a proper vapor barrier should be done from the interior.	NA	



Designation Photo of 1015 S. 7th St., taken circa 1973



PVA Photo of 1015 S. 7th St., taken circa 1999