



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Butchertown Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer *CE*
From: Savannah Darr, Planning & Design Coordinator
Date: September 7, 2018

Case No: 18COA1196
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1023 Franklin Street

Applicant: Amanda Huff
9802 Kenmont Lane
Louisville, KY 40241
502-599-8305
amanda.r.huff@efleets.com

Owner: Dwayne Huff
9802 Kenmont Lane
Louisville, KY 40241
502-724-3809
Dwayne.d.huff@ehi.com

Estimated Project Cost: \$2,500

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to move the entry door, sidelights, and vestibule 1'-6" toward Franklin Street. Currently, the vestibule is 3'-0" deep, and there is approximately 0'-1" clearance between the front door and interior stairway.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on August 10, 2018. The application was determined to be complete and classified as requiring Committee Review on August 13, 2018. Staff met with the applicant on site prior to submittal to discuss the scope of work and assess the condition of the windows. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Butchertown Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on September 12, 2018 at 5:30 pm, at 444 S. 5th Street, Conference Room 302.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines approved for the Butchertown Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Door**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The property is located on the northwest of the intersection of Franklin and N. Johnson Streets. The building is zoned R6 and located within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The two-story Italianate style masonry structure is surrounded by other one- to two-story structures of varying architectural styles.

Staff approved application 18COA1195 for the following work: replace the existing rear deck with a larger one that will have storage below; replace the walkway that leads from the front of the building to the rear; replace the deck boards on the side sleeping porch with new Trex decking; screen-in the second story of the side sleeping porch; install the historic iron fencing back in the front yard; replace the front facade windows with new clad wood windows; and replace the side and rear windows with new vinyl windows. There are no other previous COAs on file for this property.

Conclusions

The proposed changes to the entry vestibule do not meet the Butchertown design guidelines for Door. While not all Italianate style buildings have entry vestibules, this building was designed to have a deep entry vestibule. By removing half of the depth of the entry vestibule, the character and proportion of the facade are also altered. This would be a significant, unsympathetic alteration to the structure.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **denied**.

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.

9/1/18
Date


Savannah Darr
Planning & Design Coordinator

DOOR

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
D1	Do not alter the character of entrances by either removing historic elements or through the addition of elements for which there is no historic precedent.	-	By removing half of the entry vestibule, the character, proportion, and massing of the façade are also altered. This style of architecture was designed to have a deep entry vestibule.
D2	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric	+	Photographs provided in the COA application
D3	Use historical, pictorial, and physical documentation when undertaking the reconstruction of a missing entrance or porch feature. If there is not sufficient information to determine the original design, a new design should be prepared that is compatible with the architectural character of the building and the district. Conjectural or falsely-historical designs are not appropriate.	NA	
D4	Use only those replacement doors that duplicate the design, proportion, and arrangement of paneling and glazing of the original.	NA	
D5	Do not replace historic double leaf doors with a single door.	NA	
D6	Do not alter original openings to accommodate stock doors.	NA	
D7	Install only screen doors or storm doors that are simple with a narrow-frame design that enables the inner door to be seen. Metal screen and storm doors should be painted or finished to match the inner door.	NA	
D8	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original doors or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grilles should retract out of sight during business hours and preferably be mounted inside the glass. Painting security bars an unobtrusive color is recommended.	NA	
D9	Differentiate between primary and secondary doors, using the detailing of the doors or the articulation of the frame.	NA	
D10	Do not add vestibules to primary facades unless there is a historic precedent. Such additions alter the character, proportion, and massing of the façade.	NA	
D11	Do not create new entrances on facades that can be seen from a public way.	NA	
D12	Replacement of non-original, non-historic doors with new doors that are appropriate to the period and style of the building and are the size of the original opening is recommended.	NA	