



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Butchertown Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Planning & Design Coordinator
Date: September 6, 2022 *S.Darr*

Case No: 22-COA-0212
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1535 E. Washington Street/1530 Quincy Street

Applicant: Bob Rueff
Rueff Sign Company
1530 E. Washington St.
Louisville, KY 40206
502-582-1714
502-594-1979
bob@rueffsigns.com

Owner: same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: \$36,000.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to remove an existing shed roof, carport addition located on the west elevation of a metal building and construct a new 40' deep x 36' wide addition. The proposed addition will have a shed style metal roof that matches the pitch of the existing building of approximately 21' tall in the front (south elevation) facing E. Washington Street, and approximately 15' tall in the rear (north elevation) facing Quincy Street. The south elevation will have two overhead metal garage doors approximately 13' wide x 13' tall. All materials for the addition are proposed to match those of the existing building in color and style.

The applicant also proposes to construct a wood privacy fence across the rear of the building, along Quincy Street, per the Butchertown Architectural Review Committee (ARC) conditions of approval for the demolition of the building previously on the site.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on August 23, 2022 and was determined to be complete and classified as requiring Committee Review on August 23, 2020. Staff performed a site visit with the applicant prior to submittal

Staff scheduled a Butchertown ARC meeting for Wednesday, September 14, 2022 at 4:30pm in 444 S. 5th Street, Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Butchertown Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Addition** and **Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is included in this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The site is located between the south side of Quincy Street and the north side of Washington Street, five lots east of the corner of Quincy and Adams Streets. There was previously a one-story shotgun-style house set back slightly between the modern commercial buildings that was approved to be demolished on December 12, 2020 by the Butchertown ARC (case # 20-COA-0229). As conditions of approval the applicant was required to construct a wood privacy fence and bring any new construction back before the ARC for review.

Conclusions

The proposed addition generally meets the Butchertown Preservation District **Addition** Design Guidelines. The proposed materials, scale, and massing will match those of the existing commercial building on which it will be attached. The south side of this section of Quincy Street is now commercial buildings, and the proposed addition, its materials, and its design are in keeping with that. The proposed privacy fencing and landscaping generally meet the Butchertown Preservation District **Site** Design Guidelines. These will help to soften the exiting commercial feel and provide a visual buffer between the residential houses on the north side of Quincy Street.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved** with the following conditions:

- 1. The applicant shall provide a detailed landscaping plan to staff for review prior to construction.**
- 2. The applicant shall provide staff with an exterior lighting plan, as well as cut sheets for exterior lighting fixtures for approval prior to construction.**

3. The applicant shall construct the wood privacy fence in line with the existing chain link fence along Quincy Street within 3 months of construction of the addition. The finished side of the fence shall face out toward Quincy Street and it shall not exceed 7' in height (measured from grade). It shall be stained or painted within 12 months of construction.
4. If the scope of the project should change, the applicant shall contact staff for review prior to construction.

Bradley Fister

09-05-2020

Bradley Fister
Planning & Design Coordinator

Date

ADDITION

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
A1	Ensure that the design of any new addition is in proportion with the size and scale of the historic building and district.	+	The proposed addition is located on an existing metal commercial building and is in proportion to the scale and mass of it and the neighboring commercial building.
A2	Design any addition so that it is subordinate to the original building. Generally, additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.	+	The addition is subordinate in size, as it will have two bays, and the existing building has four.
A3	Generally, additions should be attached to secondary elevations and should be set back from the front façade, so as not to damage or obscure character-defining features.	+	The addition is located on the side elevation.
A4	Use materials that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+	The proposed materials are the same as the existing metal building.
A5	Respect original roof forms when designing an addition. Additions should complement existing forms, not overwhelm them.	+	The proposed addition will match the pitch of the existing shed roof.
A6	Do not undertake any full-floor additions in residential preservation districts (adding an additional full floor on top of a building).	NA	

A7	Generally, the original orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade.	+	The proposed addition will not change the orientation of the existing building.
A8	Design any new addition so that the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	+	Floor height matches that of the primary structure.
A9	Design additions to have the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion.	+	The proposed addition generally has the same relationship of solids to voids as seen with the original structure.
A10	Design additions so that there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration. This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion.	+	The proposed addition is off set slightly from the existing building.
A11	Set back additional stories from the historic wall plane of commercial or institutional structures when such an approach is required for a new use. The construction of additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible and not damage or destroy character-defining features.	NA	
A12	Do not design additions to appear older than the original building.	+	The proposed addition does not visually appear to be older than the existing building.
A13	Comply with the Kentucky building code in such a way that a historic building's character-defining features are preserved.	+	Applicant shall comply with all relevant codes.
A14	Do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features when adding a new code-required stairway or elevator. Any such addition should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	NA	
A15	Install fire escapes only on secondary elevations. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. They should preferably be painted to match the color of the wall.	NA	
A16	Do not construct a deck on a front or side façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or finished with an opaque stain. Use the railing detail developed by the Landmarks Commission or other approved detail.	NA	
A17	Design rear decks so that they do not extend beyond the side walls of the house and are not visible from the street.	NA	
A18	Wood fire stairs should be painted or stained and should be kept to a minimum functional size.	NA	

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+	Proposed addition and fencing are generally complimentary to the site.
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	NA	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	+	The applicant shall use historic concrete mix for all concrete visible from a public way.
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	NA	
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	NA	
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	+	Grade of the property is not proposed to be changed.
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	+	Applicant shall be cautions during excavating for new construction.
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	NA	

ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	+	The applicant shall face the finished side of the privacy fence facing outward, and the fence shall be no taller than 7' in height (measured from grade).
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	+	The proposed fencing shall be painted or stained within 12 months of construction.
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	+	See conditions of approval
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	+	Applicant shall face any lighting away from neighboring properties.
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	+	See conditions of approval
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NA	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	