



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: June 7, 2022

Case No: 22-COA-0101
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1236 S. Floyd St.

Applicant: Jessica Slaughter
SMJ Rental Properties LLC
3214 Liberty Way
Jeffersonville, IN 47130
(502) 439-5929
(502) 419-4238
Smjrental3214@gmail.com

Owner: same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks after-the-fact approval for the replacement of four front facing, two-over-two, double-hung historic wood windows with one-over-one, single-hung, vinyl windows. Three of the windows are on the second story of the front gable portion of the building, while one of the windows is on the second story of an inset portion to the north.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application:

A zoning enforcement case (ENF-ZON-21-000122) was opened February 25, 2021 after receiving a complaint about front window replacement without a COA. The Notice of Violation was mailed to the property owner, David and Kathryn Tegge, on February 26, 2021. However, the owner sold the property to the current owner on April 27, 2021. The Notice of Violation was mailed to the current property owner on May 4, 2021.

The COA application was received on May 21, 2021. The application was classified as requiring Committee Review on May 24, 2021 and staff emailed applicant to advise them their application had been assigned to a case manager. Staff contacted the applicant via phone and email to request additional information with no response. Staff spoke to the applicant via phone on June 7, 2022 and learned there had been extenuating circumstances preventing the applicant from contacting staff. The ARC case is scheduled to be heard on June 15, 2022 at 5:30 PM in the Metro Development Center located at 444 S. 5th St. Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Window**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is included in this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The two-story frame building at 1236 S. Floyd St. was constructed in a Victorian vernacular style in the late 19th century. The multi-residential building is located 13 lots north of the intersection of S. Floyd St. and E. Ormsby Ave. The property is zoned TNZD and located within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District.

In 2008, staff approved a COA (10321-OL) for the replacement of the center window on the second story of the front gable portion of the building. This window had been missing. While the applicant proposed to replace all of the second story windows at the time, they did not all meet the design guidelines, so only the one window was approved.

Conclusions

While the applicant purchased the property without knowing the windows had been changed without a COA, the proposed changes do not to meet the **Window** Design Guidelines for the Old Louisville Preservation District. Staff cannot comment on the condition of the previous historic windows since they were removed without any documentation. Thus, it is unclear if they met the threshold for replacement in **W1**. Furthermore, the replacement windows do not replicate the configuration of the previous historic windows, which had a two-over-two muntin pattern. This does not meet **W2**. Furthermore, the vinyl replacement windows do not match the dimensions of the historic wood windows, which also does not meet **W2**. Lastly, **W6**, does not permit synthetic replacement windows on front facades. Thus, staff recommends that the applicant replace the vinyl windows with a wood or clad wood window that fits the historic window openings and matches the original window configuration of two-over-two.

Recommendation

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends a Certificate of Appropriateness be **denied** as the vinyl replacement windows do not meet the design guidelines.

However, if the ARC determines that the proposed vinyl is an appropriate material, or if the applicant changes replacement window material, then staff recommends that the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions**:

1. The front replacement windows shall be replaced with a wood or clad wood window that fits the historic window openings and matches the original window configuration of two-over-two.
2. The glass shall not be smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective. Clear low-E glass is permissible.
3. The applicant shall not wrap the window trim or sills with vinyl or aluminum.
4. The applicant shall take precautions to preserve any wood window trim and decoration and shall submit photographs of all elements proposed to be reconstructed.
5. If the design or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.

Bradley Fister

Bradley Fister
Historic Preservation Specialist

6-7-2022

Date

WINDOW

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of vinyl- and aluminum-clad wood window systems on primary elevations may be permissible if the proportion and detail closely match the original.	-	Staff cannot comment on the condition of the previous historic windows since they were removed without any documentation, but the replacement windows are not the same two-over-two configuration as the originals and are not wood or clad wood.
W2	Select windows that match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when repair of original windows is impossible.	-	Replacement windows do not match at all.
W3	Evaluate the option of using appropriate salvage materials when replacing windows that are deteriorated beyond repair.	NSI	
W4	Do not use replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock windows	+	Replacement windows do fit the historic window openings.
W5	Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie windows in exterior window openings.	NA	
W6	Do not install synthetic replacement windows (vinyl, etc.) on primary facades.	-	The windows on the front façade were previously wood and are now vinyl.
W7	Install replacement windows that operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	+/-	Replacement windows are single-hung, which is somewhat common when replacing a historic double-hung window.
W8	Do not replace multi-pane windows that have true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on primary façade elevations.	NA	The muntin configuration was not recreated with the replacement windows.
W9	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	+	The current replacement windows do not have this.
W10	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	+	The current replacement windows do not have this.
W11	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	NA	
W12	Do not block-in or back-paint transoms or sidelights.	NA	

W13	Use surviving prototypes to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds. The reconstructed element should be constructed of materials for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if that is not possible.	NA	
W14	Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	NA	
W15	Locate any new windows openings that may be required for a new use on a façade that cannot be seen from a public way. Newly-installed windows should be compatible with the overall design of the building.	NA	
W16	Do not obscure historic window trim with metal or siding material.	+	The window trim was not wrapped.
W17	Do not install new floors or dropped ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W18	Install exterior storm windows that duplicate the shape of the original window. Storm windows should be painted to match the color of the window frame.	NA	
W19	Do not install exterior storm windows or screens that damage or obscure historic windows or frames. Mount storm windows on the blind stop within the window frame. Storm window or screen rails should always match the rails of the windows behind. They should have either wood or narrow, metal frames that are painted to match the color of the building trim.	NA	
W20	Do not install window air conditioning units on a primary façade if installation on a secondary façade can address the same need. If this is not an option, do not alter the window sash to accommodate the air-conditioning unit.	NA	
W21	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W22	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W23	Install awnings made of weather-proofed canvas of a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	
W24	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	
W25	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	
W26	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	

W27	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7' above the sidewalk.	NA	
W28	Repair shutters with in-kind materials. If damage is so extensive that they cannot be repaired, replacement shutters should match the visual appearance of the originals.	NA	
W29	Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. Replacement shutters should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically-appropriate material. Solid shutters are appropriate for the ground floor, and solid or louvered shutters are appropriate for upper floors.	NA	
W30	Mount replacement shutters so that they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. This gives shutters the appearance that they are indeed operable, even if in truth they are not. Shutters should not be applied to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window.	NA	
W31	Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters.	NA	
W32	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	+	Applicant shall document changes