



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: September 14, 2021

Case No: 21-COA-0152
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1201-05 S. 3rd St.

Applicant: Charles Cash, AIA
Urban 1, LLC
500 Upland Rd.
Louisville KY, 40206
(502) 744-0656
charlescash@urban1.us

Owner: Joseph Impellizzeri
239 S. 5th St. Ste. 1021
Louisville, KY 40202
(502) 996-2272
josephimpellizzeri@gmail.com

Estimated Project Cost: \$200,000.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant requests approval to adaptively reuse a previous mid-century dry cleaning building to become a restaurant/coffee shop. The exterior renovation seeks to maintain and enhance the mid-century character, eliminating curb cuts to provide usable outdoor dining space, and engaging the street wall on all sides of the property. The typical 3rd St. front yard curbing will be continued along the 3rd and Oak St. property lines and backed by a continuous low hedge. Entry points will be clearly defined and sidewalks align with the main building entrances. A dining porch and pergola are proposed to be added to the building along with new paving and landscaping in the outdoor areas. A small water feature is proposed to define the entry courtyard. At the point where the pergola is proposed to adjoin the Oak St. sidewalk, the curb is proposed to end, and become a low, articulated wall for sound

attenuation and privacy as well as providing a seat wall on the dining area side. Plantings are proposed to be added to vine over the pergola. At the west end of the pergola, is proposed to be an approximately 400 sf addition to the building, to provide a space for deliveries and enclosed trash storage. This proposed addition would have access doors onto the public sidewalk. The applicant plans to install a water cascade wall to mask traffic noise. Proposed materials for the addition are to be concrete block and stucco similar to the original building. Along the street edges the grass verge is proposed to be restored along 3rd St., and trees are proposed to be planted at regular intervals along Oak St.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was submitted on July 29, 2021. Staff emailed the applicant to let them know that the application had been received, and to learn more about the project. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on September 22, 2021 at 4:30 pm, online via WebEx.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Site**, and **Addition** The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The site is located at the corner of the intersection of W. Oak St. and S. 3rd St. The property is zoned TNZD in a Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The Mid-Century-style structure appears to be constructed circa 1950 and is a one-story, concrete block commercial building with large expanses of glass, that appears to have gone relatively unaltered in terms of the materials on the exterior facade as well as openings over the years.

Conclusions

The proposed location of the approximately 42" seating wall along the side of the building that faces W. Oak St. generally does not meet the Old Louisville Design Guidelines for **Site**. The primary conflict with the Design Guidelines relates to **ST10** which states not to install masonry walls in street visible locations unless they are used to retain earth or there is an historic precedent, and **ST16** that states not to install concrete block walls in street visible locations. This particular site is located along a commercial corridor, however, which has a different context than residential areas. The proposed plan will eliminate curb cuts along the Oak St. Corridor, as well. The location of the proposed walks connect the sidewalk to the front façade and generally does meet the Old Louisville Design Guidelines for **Site**. **ST3** states to use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.

The proposed addition generally does meet the Old Louisville Design Guidelines for **Additon**. In terms of **A1** the proposed addition is generally in proportion with the historic building and district. The proposed addition is generally subordinate to the original building which complies with **A2**. In applying **A3**, the proposed addition is attached to a secondary elevation and does not damage or obscure any character-defining features. The proposed materials are in keeping with the existing materials, and the proposed new roofline generally compliments the existing form of the building which complies with **A4** and **A5**. The original orientation of the building is generally not altered by the proposed addition and complies with **A7**. The proposed addition is generally distinguishable which meets the intent of **A10**. The proposed addition is in contradiction to **A9**, the proposed addition due to its use does not have any voids.

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, Staff recommends the application for a certificate of appropriateness be approved with the following conditions.

- 1. The proposed wall along the Oak St. site side shall be deleted from the plan.**
- 2. The applicant shall use historic concrete mix, for any and all concrete visible from the street**
- 3. The applicant shall provide staff with material cut sheets for all products proposed to be used prior to construction.**
- 4. The applicant shall obtain any and all necessary work permits.**

Bradley Fister
Bradley Fister
Historic Preservation Specialist

09-14-2021
Date

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	NA	
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	NA	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	NA	
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	NA	
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	NA	
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	-	Proposal of project regrades existing site
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	+/-	The applicant shall be cautious of any Excavation near the site
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	-	The masonry wall is street visible
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	

ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	-	The proposed wall along Oak St. is visible from a public way.
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	+	Exterior lighting shall be approved by staff once selected.
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	+	Exterior lighting shall generally be at or below 1.5-2 foot candles.
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NA	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	+	Proposed street trees along Oak St. side.
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	

ADDITION

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
A1	Ensure that the design of any new addition is in proportion with the size and scale of the historic building and district.	+	The proposed addition is generally in proportion with the historic building and district.
A2	Design any addition so that it is subordinate to the original building. Generally, additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.	+	The proposed addition is generally subordinate to the original building.
A3	Generally, additions should be attached to secondary elevations and should be set back from the front façade, so as not to damage or obscure character-defining features.	+	The proposed addition is attached to a secondary elevation and does not damage or obscure any character-defining features.
A4	Use materials that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+	Proposed materials are in keeping with the existing materials.
A5	Respect original roof forms when designing an addition. Additions should complement existing forms, not overwhelm them.	+	The proposed new roofline generally compliments the existing form of the building.
A6	Do not undertake any full-floor additions in residential preservation districts (adding an additional full floor on top of a building).	NA	
A7	Generally, the original orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade.	+	The original orientation of the building is generally not altered by the proposed addition.
A8	Design any new addition so that the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	+	
A9	Design additions to have the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion.	-/+	The proposed addition due to its use does not have any voids.
A10	Design additions so that there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration. This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion.	+	Proposed addition is generally distinguishable.

A11	Set back additional stories from the historic wall plane of commercial or institutional structures when such an approach is required for a new use. The construction of additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible and not damage or destroy character-defining features.	NA	
A12	Do not design additions to appear older than the original building.	+	Addition generally is distinguishable.
A13	Comply with the Kentucky building code in such a way that a historic building's character-defining features are preserved.	+	Applicant shall comply with all codes
A14	Do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features when adding a new code-required stairway or elevator. Any such addition should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	NA	
A15	Install fire escapes only on secondary elevations. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. They should preferably be painted to match the color of the wall.	NA	
A16	Do not construct a deck on a front or side façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or finished with an opaque stain. Use the railing detail developed by the Landmarks Commission or other approved detail.	NA	
A17	Design rear decks so that they do not extend beyond the side walls of the house and are not visible from the street.	NA	
A18	Wood fire stairs should be painted or stained and should be kept to a minimum functional size.	NA	