



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: July 22, 2020

Case No: 20-COA-0105
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1312 Floyd St.

Applicant: Joanna Peguero
Alltrade Property Management
710 Barret Ave.
Louisville, KY 40203
(502) 562-1985 ext. 226
jpeguero@alltradeproperties.com

Owner: Glenmary Investment Group
Alltrade Property Management
710 Barret Ave.
Louisville, KY 40203
(502) 562-1985

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant is seeking approval to remove the existing character defining wood siding with ogee edge detail from the home and replace it with Hardie board siding.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on June 17th, 2020 and considered complete and requiring committee level review on June 22nd, 2020. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on July 29th, 2020 at 4:30 pm, online.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Siding & Trim**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The site is located six lots south from the intersection of E. Ormsby Ave. and S. Floyd St. The property is zoned TNZD in a Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The turn-of-the-century Victorian structure constructed circa 1900 is a two-story, wood framed construction clad with ogee edge lap siding.

Conclusions

The proposed changes generally do not meet the Old Louisville Design Guidelines for **Siding & Trim** based on the condition of the existing historic siding, and with the character defining material to both the home and the district. The ogee detail on the existing siding would not be able to be replicated with the Hardie board replacement siding. Design Guideline **SD3** recommends replacing historic wood siding with contemporary wood siding that could replicated the ogee detail.

Replacing the historic siding on the sides and rear of the structure could be considered per **SD7**, though retention of historic wood siding is preferred. If replacement of existing siding from the sides and rear of the property is approved the applicant shall first follow **SD2** in regard to photographing and documenting the existing siding as well as **SD1**, they shall replace the existing side and rear siding with siding that has the same reveal. Per **SD6** and **SD7** the applicant shall install replacement siding horizontally, be the same depth, and scale and shall not damage or obscure historic elements including window casing and cornerboards. The applicant shall also adhere to **SD9**, in terms of removal and demolition of the existing siding.

Recommendation

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, Staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved with the following conditions.

1. The historic siding on the front elevation shall be retained and the applicant shall use salvaged pieces of the existing siding on the sides and rear of the home to replace any damaged pieces on the front façade.
2. The sides and rear of the home shall be clad in Hardie board siding with the same reveal as the existing siding on the front of the home.
3. The existing fish scale siding in the front gable shall be retained and repaired, if necessary. If replacement is required it shall be with a like material and the applicant shall present it to staff prior to installation.
4. If the design or material changes, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.

Bradley Fister
Bradley Fister
Historic Preservation Specialist

07-22-2020
Date

SIDING & TRIM

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
SD1	Do not replace missing wood features with conjectural or falsely-historic reconstructions or with newly-designed elements that are incompatible with the building's size, scale, material, or color.	+/-	The replacement of the siding on the sides and rear with Hardie board shall have the same reveal as existing. The ogee detail would not be able to be replicated.
SD2	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	+	Applicant shall document the existing material prior to change.

SD3	Consider using contemporary wood siding, which conveys the visual appearance of historic siding, when replacement of such materials is required.	+/-	The proposal to install Hardie board does not convey the ogee detail on the historic siding.
SD4	Do not use textured plywood (T-111) vertical siding. It is not an appropriate substitute material.	NA	
SD5	Do not install artificial stone, asbestos shingles, or asphalt shingles over or as a replacement for exterior siding.	NA	
SD6	Orient all replacement siding horizontally, unless there is sound, historic documentation for a different original orientation.	+	Replacement siding shall be horizontal.
SD7	Do not install vinyl or aluminum siding on primary elevations on historic buildings. Retention of exposed original wood siding is always preferred; however, if a decision is made to apply siding to side and rear elevations, it should be done in a way that does not obscure or damage historic ornament, such as fishscale shingles, window casings, sills, hoods, brackets, and cornerboards.	+	Replacement siding on the sides and rear, shall be the same reveal, depth, and scale and shall not damage or obscure historic elements.
SD8	Use only vinyl or aluminum siding that matches the dimensions of the original siding. Generally, smooth-faced, narrow-profile siding (3" or 4" depending on the character of the existing siding) is acceptable for installation on secondary elevations. Wherever possible without causing damage to historic fabric, trim, such as cornerboards, should project slightly beyond the vinyl siding.	NSI	Installation of synthetic siding not detailed in the application.
SD9	Make sure that removal, handling, and disposal of lead-containing paint complies with all local, state, and federal standards.	+	Applicant shall follow all standards for removal and disposal of all existing materials.
SD10	Do not remove exterior siding to install insulation within the exterior walls of historic wood frame construction. This can result in damage to historic fabric. Installation of insulation with a proper vapor barrier should be done from the interior.	+	Any insulation installed shall be done from inside the home.