Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To:	Butchertown Architectural Review Committee
Thru:	Joe Haberman, Planning Manager
From:	Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date:	August 3, 2017

Case No: 17COA1167
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 929 & 931 E. Main Street

Applicant:
Mitchell Kersting
Work Architecture + Design
231 N. 19th Street
Louisville, KY 40203
502-632-3232
mitchell@wrkarc.com

Owner:
Jonathan Pauly
Hillman Pauly, LLC
415 E. Market Street
Louisville, KY 40202

Architect: same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: $350,000 +/-

Description of proposed exterior alteration:
The applicant seeks approval to renovate the existing one-story concrete block building with a new aluminum window and door storefront system as well as adding cold-rolled steel cladding around the windows and doors on the front façade. Additionally, the applicant will fill in the westernmost window opening on the front façade with new concrete block and add two new window openings-one on the west elevation and one on the east elevation. The rear elevation will have cold-rolled steel cladding to replicate the front and new entry doors. The applicant also seeks approval to add a full second story addition for one apartment turning the building into a mixed use. The new addition will have EIFS, standing seam metal, and custom wood plank cladding on the exterior. The roof

will be covered with the same standing seam metal that is proposed for the exterior walls. The front façade of the addition will contain an inset southwestern corner balcony with a glass guardrail extension from the top of the coping and a wall of windows on the eastern side. The east elevation of the addition will contain a second inset balcony area with a glass guardrail extension from the top of the coping. The rear elevation of the addition has a third balcony area that extends from the elevation with a metal guardrail/handrail system that wraps to the west elevation with stairs to the ground level. Lastly, the applicant proposes a 48" tall decorative concrete masonry wall system that will run along the eastern property line to screen the parking lot next door. The chain link fencing on the other lines will remain (This is different from the submitted site plan).

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application
The application was received on July 13, 2017 and considered complete and requiring committee level review on July 17, 2017. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Butchertown Architectural Review Committee on August 9, 2017 at 5:30 pm, at 444 South Fifth Street, Conference Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines
The following design review guidelines, approved for the Butchertown Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Addition, Storefront, and Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background
The property is located on the north side of E. Main Street, west of the intersection with N. Wenzel Street. The site is zoned CM and is within the Traditional Marketplace Corridor Form District. The circa 1959 concrete block building is considered non-contributing to the Butchertown Preservation District. It was less than 50 years of age when the District was designated in 2003, which is likely why it was considered non-contributing.

There are no previous COAs for this property.

Conclusions
The proposed project generally meets the Butchertown design guidelines for **Addition, Storefront, and Site**. The **Addition** design guidelines, specifically A2, A3, A5, A6, A9, and A11, do not encourage the full second story addition that is proposed. The **Storefront** design guidelines, specifically SF7, SF24, SF25, and SF27, also do not encourage the full second story addition or the cold-rolled steel cladding that is proposed. However, this building is unique. It is a simple concrete block commercial building with modest architectural detail and little historic significance. The proposed addition and steel cladding will improve and enhance the architecture of the building and will not negatively impact any historic significance. Furthermore, many industrial style buildings, such as Lincoln

Elementary Performing Arts School and the City Space Self Storage, surround this building and use similar cladding materials on the exterior. Thus, there is precedent within the block for a similar architectural style. The proposed 48" tall decorative concrete masonry wall system that will run along the eastern property is set back approximately 120' from S. Wenzel Street so the wall will not be very visible from the street, which meets the **Site** design guidelines.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved** with the following conditions:

1. **Outdoor lighting shall adhere to Site design guidelines ST17, ST18, and ST 20.**
2. **Fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, shall be positioned on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site.**
3. **If the design or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.**

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.

8/3/17
Date

Savannah Darr
Historic Preservation Specialist

ADDITION

Design Guideline Checklist

+ Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
NA Not Applicable
NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
A1	Ensure that the design of any new addition is in proportion with the size and scale of the historic building and district.	+	The full second story addition fits the scale of the building. There are other two-story buildings in the vicinity.
A2	Design any addition so that it is subordinate to the original building. Generally, additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.	+/-	The addition is a full second story addition, which means it covers the entire building footprint without altering it. It is appropriate for this

			building (see conclusions).
A3	Generally, additions should be attached to secondary elevations and should be set back from the front façade, so as not to damage or obscure character-defining features.	+/-	The addition is a full second story addition, but it is appropriate for this building and will not obscure any character-defining features (see conclusions).
A4	Use materials that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+	The historic portion of the building is concrete block. The new materials include metal, wood, and EIFS, which are subordinate.
A5	Respect original roof forms when designing an addition. Additions should complement existing forms, not overwhelm them.	+/-	The existing roof is flat; the new addition will sit on top creating a new roofline (see conclusions).
A6	Do not undertake any full-floor additions in residential preservation districts (adding an additional full floor on top of a building).	+/-	While this building is in the Residential Character Area of Butchertown, it is a commercial/industrial building. The addition will include balconies and other residential components that will make the building compatible with nearby residential buildings.
A7	Generally, the original orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade.	+	
A8	Design any new addition so that the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	+	
A9	Design additions to have the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion.	+/-	The addition will have more windows and doors than the historic portion of the building, which is an improvement.
A10	Design additions so that there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration. This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion.	+/-	The new addition is very modern in design, but the historic building is modest in design. It may be difficult to distinguish between the two.
A11	Set back additional stories from the historic wall plane of commercial or institutional structures when such an approach is required for a new use. The construction of additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible and not damage or destroy character-defining features.	+/-	The addition is a full second story addition, but it is appropriate for this building and will not obscure any character-defining features (see conclusions).
A12	Do not design additions to appear older than the original building.	+	The new addition is very modern in design.
A13	Comply with the Kentucky building code in such a way that a historic building's character-defining features are preserved.	+	
A14	Do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features when adding a new code-required stairway or elevator. Any such addition should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	+	On rear and side elevations

A15	Install fire escapes only on secondary elevations. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. They should preferably be painted to match the color of the wall.	+	On rear and side elevations
A16	Do not construct a deck on a front or side façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or finished with an opaque stain. Use the railing detail developed by the Landmarks Commission or other approved detail.	NA	
A17	Design rear decks so that they do not extend beyond the side walls of the house and are not visible from the street.	NA	
A18	Wood fire stairs should be painted or stained and should be kept to a minimum functional size.	NA	

STOREFRONT

Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
NA	Not Applicable
NSI	Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
SF1	Do not remove historic materials from storefronts. Such materials as wood, cast iron, terra cotta, carrara glass, ceramic tile, and brick contribute significantly to a storefront's architectural character.	+	Storefront is concrete block with replacement doors and windows
SF2	Use historic materials where historic storefronts must be replaced in part of in whole. Cast iron, limestone, or wood are appropriate materials for storefront replacement.	NA	
SF3	Retain all historic storefront elements, including later alterations that are historic in their own right. An example is a late nineteenth-century storefront with Art Deco features added during the 1930s.	+/-	The simple concrete block storefront will be enhanced with cold-rolled steel cladding.
SF4	Respect façade alterations that have attained historic or architectural significance in their own right. Work to incorporate such elements into any new storefront design or renovation. Do not attempt to recreate a conjectural historic design if there is insufficient physical or documentary evidence.	+/-	The simple concrete block storefront will be enhanced with cold-rolled steel cladding.
SF5	Do not remove later historically-significant material to restore a building to an earlier period. For example, a 1910 storefront should not be taken back to a conjectural 1850s appearance.	NA	
SF6	Maintain the original scale, proportion, and organization of architectural elements (bulkheads, display windows, transoms, door, piers, and cornices) when renovating historic storefronts.	+	

SF7	Use the original form and detailing of a storefront as a model, if extensive deterioration requires complete reconstruction. The reconstruction should convey the same visual appearance and use the same material as the original. Under no circumstances should a historic storefront be removed and not replaced.	+/-	The simple concrete block storefront will be enhanced with cold-rolled steel cladding. The storefront already contains replacement doors and windows so the new will be an improvement.
SF8	Use historic, pictorial, and physical documentation to construct a historic storefront when the original is missing. The design may be an accurate restoration, if sufficient evidence exists, or a new design that is compatible with the size, scale, material, and color of the historic building and district.	NA	
SF9	Keep storefront designs within their original openings. Transitions from one façade to another should be clean and clearly defined.	+/-	One opening on the westernmost side will be filled in with new concrete block, but this will not negatively impact the storefront.
SF10	Emphasize the transparent character of storefronts when implementing new designs or renovations. Generally, 60 percent of the wall surface at the sidewalk level should be transparent. Historically, merchandise seen in storefront displays was emphasized to a much greater extent than any ornament on the storefront itself.	+	
SF11	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	+	
SF12	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	+	
SF13	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	+	New aluminum storefront windows and doors
SF14	Select replacement doors that reflect the storefront's original character. Doors should have large glass panels and be made of wood or painted steel or aluminum. They should not be overly-decorated or possess inappropriate historic features.	+	New aluminum storefront windows and doors
SF15	Do not change or reorient the location of the main entrance of a storefront.	+	
SF16	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
SF17	Install awnings made out of matte-finish weather-proofed fabric or a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	
SF18	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	
SF19	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	
SF20	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present.	NA	

SF21	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7'-6" above the sidewalk.	NA	
SF22	Maintain the commercial character of storefronts, even if they have changed use. Blinds or insulating curtains may be added for privacy and thermal performance.	NA	
SF23	Design replacement storefronts that are compatible with and complementary to their historic neighbors, but are recognizable as being of their own era.	+	
SF24	Do not add elements to storefronts that have no historic precedent. Common examples of inappropriate alterations include the installation of coach lanterns, false mansard designs, small-paned windows, and inoperable shutters.	+/-	The simple concrete block storefront will be enhanced with cold-rolled steel cladding (see conclusions).
SF25	Do not add false fronts, false stories, or pent eaves to the roofs of commercial buildings.	+	
SF26	Do not use storefront design elements that are historically inappropriate, such as small-pane windows or colonial doors on late-nineteenth and twentieth-century buildings.	+	
SF27	Do not use materials in storefront renovations that were not available at the time of original construction, such as vinyl or aluminum siding, stainless steel, uncoated anodized aluminum, tinted glass, or artificial stone.	+/-	The simple concrete block storefront will be enhanced with cold-rolled steel cladding (see conclusions).
SF28	Use historic materials when replacement of bulkheads is required in part or in whole. Wood or stone panels are most appropriate.	NA	
SF29	Do not use rough-textured wood siding or simulated masonry, such as permastone, on storefronts.	NA	
SF30	Use historic materials when cornice replacement is required in part of in whole. Cast iron, wood, or sheet metal area appropriate materials.	NA	
SF31	Do not install inappropriately-scaled signs that obscure or damage surviving storefront features that convey a building's architectural character.	NA	
SF32	Include the following storefront elements when redesigning or renovating a historic storefront: large display windows and doors, transoms, relatively thin framing elements, a cornice element separating the storefront from the upper façade, low bulkheads, and tile entry flooring.	+/-	The materials proposed for the storefront are appropriate for this building but not many others in the Districts.
SF33	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	+	

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
NA	Not Applicable
NSI	Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+	
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	+	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	+	
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	NA	
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+	Existing drive and parking to remain
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	NA	
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	+/-	This will be set back from the street and will not be very visible.

ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	+/-	The wall that acts as fencing will be on the eastern property line to screen the parking lot.
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	+/-	This will be set back from the street and will not be very visible.
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NSI	
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NSI	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NSI	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NSI	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	