



---

## Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

### Report to the Committee

---

---

To: Clifton Architectural Review Committee  
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer *CE*  
From: Anthony Schneider, Historic Preservation Specialist  
Date: May 14, 2019

---

**Case No:** 19COA1121  
**Classification:** Committee Review

#### GENERAL INFORMATION

**Property Address:** 1836 Frankfort Avenue

**Applicant:** Mark Thomas  
1836 Frankfort Avenue  
Louisville, KY 40206  
502-939-5969  
[mthomas@luekett-farley.com](mailto:mthomas@luekett-farley.com)

**Owner:** Same as Applicant

**Estimated Project Cost:** \$30,000.00

#### Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant is requesting to removal all historic wood siding on all facades and replace it with new, cement board siding. The historic siding is 4" Dutch-lap siding and the home features decorative fish scale details in the gable and on the small roof over the front projection which the applicant will attempt to restore in addition to the cornice and decorative columns. The applicant is also proposing to reroof the structure with new asphalt shingles but that is deemed general maintenance.

#### Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on April 23, 2019 and was considered complete and requiring committee review on May 6, 2019. Staff discussed the details of the proposal with the applicant and informed him that the historic Dutch-lap siding would need to be replaced with siding that fits the historic profile rather standard lap siding. Applicant was also informed that the siding on the front façade was in repairable shape and should be retained. Applicant requested committee review to replace the siding on the street-facing front façades.

This case is scheduled to be heard by the Clifton Architectural Review Committee on Wednesday May 22, 2019 at 6:30pm in Conference Room 101, 444 S 5<sup>th</sup> Street Metro Development Center.

## **FINDINGS**

### **Guidelines**

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Clifton Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Siding and Trim**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

### **Site Context/ Background**

The R-5B zoned property within a Traditional Neighborhood Form District is located midblock on the southwest side of Frankfort Avenue between State Street and Stoll Avenue. The structure is a two-story, Victorian era home with Queen Anne details on the porch, cornice, and in the gable. The structure has a shallow hip roof with a small front gable. This home is surrounded by other Victorian era structures of varying size, scale, and materials.

Staff did not find previous COA's issued for this site.

### **Conclusions**

The proposal would meet Guidelines **SD3** and **SD6** but would not meet the Guidelines **SD8**. This structure is clad in 4" historic wood Dutch-lap siding and the north side and rear of the structure show significant signs of deterioration and rot. The south façade shows less deterioration than the north side and staff recommends that the applicant use salvageable pieces from the sides to restore the street facing façade. The street façade is largely intact, and the historic character should be restored and retained. The applicant is proposing to restore all decorative elements where possible in the gable, above the front projection, the cornice, and the decorative details on the porches. Staff finds that the removal and replacement of the sides and rear with a new 4" cement board Dutch-lap siding with a smooth face to be an appropriate replacement material. However, staff feels that the removal of the historic wood siding on the street-facing front facades would have a negative impact on the historic integrity of the district. The front façade has two primary elevations and a narrow secondary elevation connecting the two. These three elevations are the facades that staff suggests for retention.

## **RECOMMENDATION**

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends that the request for replacement of historic wood siding on the sides and rear be **approved with the following conditions:**

- 1. The applicant shall obtain any necessary building permits.**

2. All historic window trim and moldings shall be restored where possible and replaced with in-kind or other appropriate materials as determined by staff.
3. The water-table board and drip cap shall maintain historic dimensions when being repaired or replaced.
4. There shall be corner boards on all corners and trim around all openings.
5. Applicant shall work with staff to determine appropriate replacements for historic decorative details that are beyond restoration.
6. If design changes are necessary, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends that the request for the replacement of siding on the three street-facing façades be **DENIED**.



Anthony Schneider  
Historic Preservation Specialist

5 / 15 / 19  
Date

#### Attached Documents / Information

1. Staff Guideline Checklist

### Siding and Trim

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- NA Not Applicable
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- NSI Not Sufficient Information
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
SD1	Missing wood features should not be replaced with conjectural or falsely historic reconstructions or with newly designed elements that are incompatible with the building's size, scale, or materials.	+	
SD2	Architectural features that are proposed for reconstruction or replacement must be photographically documented by the property owner as part of the application submitted to Landmarks for approval of any exterior modification. Historic elements cannot be removed until after approval has been obtained.	+	
SD3	Contemporary wood siding or fiber cement board, which conveys the visual appearance of historic siding, should be used when replacing sections of deteriorated wood. Other materials which expand and contract like wood may be used when approved by staff or ARC review.	+	Cement board is proposed.
SD4	Structurally inappropriate materials such as textured plywood (e.g., T-111) or similar soft wood products that shed water poorly should not be used on primary structures.	+	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	Architecturally and historically inappropriate materials should not repair, replace, or be placed over historic wood siding.		
<b>SD5</b>	Exterior veneers shall not be installed over wood siding or as a replacement for exterior siding. Some examples of historically inappropriate exterior veneers not to be used are artificial stone or other masonry, EIFS (synthetic stucco), asbestos shingles, or asphalt shingles.	+	Rotten wood siding will be removed.
<b>SD6</b>	Replace or repair damaged or deteriorated wood siding with wood or wood-like materials. Undamaged, intact historic wood siding should be preserved and not removed and/or replaced.	+/-	Historic wood siding that is intact on the sides and rear should be used to restore the front. Replacement of the siding on the front façade is strongly discouraged.
<b>SD7</b>	Replacement siding should be installed horizontally unless there is valid historic documentation for a different original orientation.	+	
<b>SD8</b>	Retaining and preserving the original wood siding and trim with paint is encouraged, especially on the street-address façade. The application of fiber cement board matching the original existing exposure is preferred over vinyl or aluminum siding and may be approved by staff without ARC review. Vinyl or aluminum siding may be applied to street address façades, side, and rear elevations with ARC approval. The installation of any type of siding should not obscure or damage historic ornamental details such as fish-scale shingles, moldings, window casings, sills, hoods, brackets, and corner boards. Do not install siding of any type over rotten wood. Do not wrap windows and trim with metal. If applied, remove insul-brick material and apply house wrap before applying siding.	-	Siding materials on the front façade are in need of scraping and painting with minor repairs as necessary.
<b>SD9</b>	Fiber cement, vinyl or aluminum siding should match the profile and dimensions of the original wood siding. A smooth-faced, narrow profile siding (3" or 4" reveal) is acceptable for installation. Historic fabric, trim, or corner boards should project slightly beyond the vinyl siding, wherever possible without causing damage.	+	New siding will be smooth-face, cement-board Dutch-lap siding.
<b>SD10</b>	Paints and coatings manufactured before 1978 contained lead. Historic structures often contain hazardous substances, such as lead paint and asbestos. Since June, 2010, the EPA regulations require contractors to be certified and follow specific work practices to prevent lead contamination. For additional lead paint information, contact the Metro Health Department. For asbestos removal and disposal methods, contact Metro Air Pollution Control.	+	
<b>SD11</b>	Installation of insulation with a proper vapor barrier should be done from the interior. Do not remove exterior siding to install insulation within the exterior walls of historic wood frame construction. This can result in damage to historic fabric by locking in mold and moisture and will rot wood from within. Houses need to be breathable.	+	