



---

## Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

---

# Report to the Committee

---

---

To: Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee  
Thru: Robert Keesaer, AIA, NCARB- Urban Design Supervisor  
From: Burcum Keeton, Architectural Projects Coordinator  
Date: May 24, 2016

---

**Case No:** 16COA1108  
**Classification:** Committee Review

### GENERAL INFORMATION

**Property Address:** 2213 Dearing Court  
Louisville, KY 40204

**Applicant:** Emily Fisher  
Rock Paper Hammer  
135 Blackburn Avenue  
Louisville KY 40206  
502-235-8086  
Emily@rockpaperhammer.com

**Owner:** Douglas and Marcella Kragel  
2213 Dearing Court  
Louisville, KY 40204  
502-741-7870  
dkragel@mktg.com

**Architect:** same as applicant

**Estimated Project Cost:** \$50,000

#### **Description of proposed exterior alteration:**

The applicant requests approval for a modern style two-story rear addition. The addition contains a new family room on the first floor and a master bedroom with bath and closet on the second floor. The proposed two-story addition includes a new 13'6" patio to the east of the structure. The existing first floor square footage is 900 square feet and the existing second floor square footage is 908 square feet; total existing square footage is 1,808sf. The proposed first floor addition will add 465 square foot and the proposed second floor addition will add another 465 square feet to the structure, for a total of 2,738sf.

Proposed materials include Hardie Panel smooth siding with 1x3 Windsor one batten boards. 1x6 Cumaru wood siding with flush corner boards will also be used. The base of the addition will have a band of 8"x8" architectural concrete block.

The roof of the addition will be of a flat roof with aluminum gutters. A new cornice and box gutter will align with the existing elements. The total height of addition will be 23'-11 ¼" from grade.

Integrity wood/Ultrex casement windows are proposed as well as an Integrity wood/Ultrex sliding door with transom for side patio access.

Elevations are further described below:

#### **East Side Elevation**

This elevation is the primary façade of the structure, and is minimally altered. The addition will be set back 65'-11" from the property line along Dearing Court. The addition will extend approximately 3'-8 1/2" to the east of the original structure. The homeowner will retain the existing tree and add landscaping in front of the addition to keep it hidden from view.

#### **North Side Elevation**

The addition will extend 19'7" from the original structure to the rear of the property along the north side of the structure.

#### **West Side Elevation**

The roof of the original structure and the new exposed chimney pipe will be visible from this elevation. The side elevation will project 3'-8 ½" from the original structure in width.

#### **South Side Elevation**

The proposed south elevation is void of fenestration due to its fire rated wall construction. The addition extends 19'-7" from the original structure and is inset an additional 3" to provide for 10" clearance from the property line.

A new downspout at the addition will route water to the rear of the structure.

#### **Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application**

The application was received on May 13, 2016. The application was determined to be complete and classified as requiring Staff Review on May 23, 2016.

The case is scheduled to be heard by the Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee on June 15, 2016 at 4:30pm, at 444 South Fifth Street, Conference Room 302.

### **FINDINGS**

#### **Guidelines**

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation/ National Register District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Addition, Site, and New Construction - Residential**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

#### **Site Context**

The home is situated mid-block on Dearing Court, a dead-end street with limited alley access on the northeast side of Everett Avenue. The property is zoned R5B and is within

the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The 2 ½” story frame house is surrounded by similar structures in massing and style.

The existing structure is currently 8” off of the adjacent property line shared with neighboring 2211 Dearing Court. The existing main façade is set back from Dearing Court approximately 26’. The addition is proposed to have a 2” inset from the original structure so that the addition will be 10” off the property line. The applicant will request a variance to meet the side yard setback requirements as a 10” set back does not comply with the Land Development requirements. A large side yard is located to the east of the structure, approximately 13’9” wide and runs the length of the property.

## **Background**

Previously approved COAs for the property are as follows:

**15COA1190** approved on 09/18/2015

- Request to replace existing siding with Fypon and Hardie board siding materials

**15COA1230** approved on 10/28/15

- Request to replace deteriorated windows with Sherwood Vinylmax wood clad windows

**14COA1240** approved on 11/15/2014

- Request to relocate existing fence

## **Conclusions**

Staff has reviewed the project as proposed against the design guidelines for **Addition, Site, and New Construction**.

The addition is located at the rear of the property and will be minimally visible from Dearing Court due to its distance from the street and the screening provided by the landscaping on the property. The applicant has proposed materials that are subordinate to the primary material of the original building and has designed the addition so that there are distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration.

The addition does not comply with **Addition Guideline A2:**

**‘Design any addition so that it is subordinate to the original building. Generally, additions should not exceed half of the original building’s total floor area or building footprint.’** In this case, the existing square footage of the house is 1,808sf (half would be 904sf), the addition will add 930sf; exceeding half of the original structure’s square footage by 26sf.

A (+/-) was issued for **Site Guideline ST1:**

**‘Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.’**

A (-) was issued for **New Construction Guideline NC23:**

**‘Maintain historic setback patterns. In order to maintain the continuity of the streetscape, setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.’**

The addition and is too close in proximity per Land Development Code to the neighboring property at 2211 Dearing Court and does not meet side yard setback requirements.

To remain within the 20% setback pattern of neighboring structures as stated in **NC23**, a side yard setback between 2.77' to 22.8' would be recommended.

### **Recommendation**

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends that the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions:**

- 1. Applicant to make sure that new designs conform to all other municipal regulations, including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations. A variance is required to meet the side yard setback requirements.**
- 2. Applicant to consider shifting the addition approximately 2'-2" to the east to provide for a greater setback distance than the proposed 10" from the property line located between 2213 and 2211 Dearing Court. To remain within the 20% setback pattern of neighboring structures as stated in NC23, a side yard setback between 2.77' to 22.8' would be recommended.**
- 3. The addition currently exceeds half of the original building's total floor area by approximately 26sf. Applicant to consider reducing the addition by 52sf or more in order to comply with Addition Guideline A2.**
- 4. All construction to be executed according to drawings submitted by Emily Fisher, and receipt date stamped May 13, 2016. Any changes to be submitted to Staff for review and approval.**

*The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.*



---

Burcum Keeton  
Architectural Projects Coordinator



---

Date

# ADDITION

## Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
<b>A1</b>	Ensure that the design of any new addition is in proportion with the size and scale of the historic building and district.	+	
<b>A2</b>	Design any addition so that it is subordinate to the original building. Generally, additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.	-	Existing sf is 1808sf, new sf is 930sf; exceeding by 26sf
<b>A3</b>	Generally, additions should be attached to secondary elevations and should be set back from the front façade, so as not to damage or obscure character-defining features.	+	Addition will be at the rear of the structure
<b>A4</b>	Use materials that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+	Subordinate materials being used
<b>A5</b>	Respect original roof forms when designing an addition. Additions should complement existing forms, not overwhelm them.	+	Shed roof on addition
<b>A6</b>	Do not undertake any full-floor additions in residential preservation districts (adding an additional full floor on top of a building).	NA	
<b>A7</b>	Generally, the original orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade.	NA	
<b>A8</b>	Design any new addition so that the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	+	
<b>A9</b>	Design additions to have the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion.	+	
<b>A10</b>	Design additions so that there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration. This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion.	+	Differences in details, materials, and proportions between existing and new
<b>A11</b>	Set back additional stories from the historic wall plane of commercial or institutional structures when such an approach is required for a new use. The construction of additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible and not damage or destroy character-defining features.	NA	Residential structure
<b>A12</b>	Do not design additions to appear older than the original building.	+	

<b>A13</b>	Comply with the Kentucky building code in such a way that a historic building's character-defining features are preserved.	NA	
<b>A14</b>	Do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features when adding a new code-required stairway or elevator. Any such addition should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	NA	
<b>A15</b>	Install fire escapes only on secondary elevations. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. They should preferably be painted to match the color of the wall.	NA	
<b>A16</b>	Do not construct a deck on a front or side façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or finished with an opaque stain. Use the railing detail developed by the Landmarks Commission or other approved detail.	NA	
<b>A17</b>	Design rear decks so that they do not extend beyond the side walls of the house and are not visible from the street.	NA	
<b>A18</b>	Wood fire stairs should be painted or stained and should be kept to a minimum functional size.	NA	

# SITE

## Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+/-	Private rear yard requirements are being met but addition is large and too close in proximity to 2211 Dearing Court
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	NA	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	NA	
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	NA	
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	NA	
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	+	
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	NA	
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	

<b>ST14</b>	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
<b>ST15</b>	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	Existing fence to remain
<b>ST16</b>	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
<b>ST17</b>	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	+	
<b>ST18</b>	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NA	
<b>ST19</b>	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
<b>ST20</b>	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
<b>ST21</b>	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	+	
<b>ST22</b>	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	+	Existing trees to be preserved, new trees proposed to screen view of addition from street
<b>ST23</b>	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
<b>ST24</b>	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	

# NEW CONSTRUCTION

## RESIDENTIAL DESIGN GUIDELINES

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
<b>NC1</b>	Make sure that new designs conform to all other municipal regulations, including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations.	-	Applicant to request variance for side yard setback
<b>NC2</b>	Do not demolish contributing structures in a historic district to make way for new or large-scale construction. Non-contributing buildings are identified in each of the district or individual landmark designations or National Register nominations.	NA	
<b>NC3</b>	Design new construction so that the building height, directional emphasis, scale, massing, and volume reflect the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+/-	Although located at the rear of the property and not visible from the street, the addition as proposed is large and not in scale with the context of the surrounding structures
<b>NC4</b>	Make sure that the scale of new construction does not conflict with the historic character of the neighborhood.	+	
<b>NC5</b>	Incorporate materials and design elements that complement the color, size, texture, and level of craftsmanship seen in surrounding buildings.	+	
<b>NC6</b>	Do not use materials in new construction that are visually incompatible with surrounding historic buildings within the district. Materials to be avoided include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, chain-link fencing, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unpainted wood, and asphalt siding.	+	
<b>NC7</b>	Design new construction to reinforce the human scale of historic districts where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	
<b>NC8</b>	Design new construction in such a way that it does not disrupt important public views and vistas.	+	
<b>NC9</b>	Reinforce existing patterns of open space and enclosure, created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, in designs for new construction.	+	
<b>NC10</b>	Design infill construction that reinforces the spatial organization established by surrounding buildings. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly-designed facades.	NA	
<b>NC11</b>	Design infill construction in such a way that the façade's organization closely relates to surrounding buildings. Window and door openings should be similar in size to their historic counterparts, as should the proportion of window to wall space. Cornice lines, columns, and storefronts are other important character-defining facade elements.	NA	

<b>NC12</b>	Design new construction so that the building mass has a similar sense of lightness or weight as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solids (walls) to voids (window and door openings). Historic window proportions are generally two-and-one-half (height) by one (width).	+	
<b>NC13</b>	Develop designs for new construction using windows that are sympathetic to the window patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportions, and muntin configurations is encouraged.	+	Casement style windows proposed at addition with compatible frame dimensions to existing windows
<b>NC14</b>	Develop designs for new construction using front doors that are sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.	NA	
<b>NC15</b>	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main entrance is the same as the majority of other buildings on the street	NA	
<b>NC16</b>	Incorporate paved walks between sidewalks and the front entrances for new construction located on streets where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	
<b>NC17</b>	Retain the character-defining features of a historic building when undertaking accessibility code-required work.	NA	
<b>NC18</b>	Investigate removable or portable ramps as options to providing barrier-free access.	NA	
<b>NC19</b>	Locate handicapped access ramps on secondary elevations wherever possible. If locating a ramp on the primary façade is required, it should be installed in a manner that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible.	NA	
<b>NC20</b>	Design infill construction so that it is compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings.	NA	
<b>NC21</b>	Design new construction to have a floor-to-floor height that is within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the floor-to-floor height is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	+	
<b>NC22</b>	Maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape. The space between new construction and existing structures should fall within 20 percent of the average spacing for the block.	+	
<b>NC23</b>	Maintain historic setback patterns. In order to maintain the continuity of the streetscape, setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.		To remain within the 20% setback pattern of neighboring structures, a side yard set back between 2.77' to 22.8' would be recommended
<b>NC24</b>	Ensure that the roofs of new buildings relate to those of neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+/-	
<b>NC25</b>	Follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings when designing rooflines for infill construction. Where the predominant form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated.	NA	
<b>NC26</b>	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main roof form is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street, where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.	+/-	
<b>NC27</b>	Design new construction to emphasize the existing cornice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	Rear addition
<b>NC28</b>	Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered.	NA	
<b>NC29</b>	Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction.	NA	

<b>NC30</b>	Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings. While use of wood siding is preferred, vinyl siding may be used for new construction, but only in areas where the predominate historic construction material is wood.	+	
<b>NC31</b>	Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction. Red brick is the most common masonry material found throughout the city's historic districts.	+	
<b>NC32</b>	Incorporate stone or cast-stone sills and lintels into new construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-defining features.	NA	
<b>NC33</b>	Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction.	+	
<b>NC34</b>	Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance.	+	
<b>NC35</b>	Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof.	NA	
<b>NC36</b>	Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head.	NA	
<b>NC37</b>	Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of adjacent secondary structures.	NA	
<b>NC38</b>	Site new garages adjacent to alleys where present. Review the garage prototype insert that identifies styles appropriate to preservation districts when planning a garage construction project.	NA	
<b>NC39</b>	Where no alleys exist, garages should be sited at the rear of the property behind the main house. Garage doors should not face the street, and access should be along the side yard. Landscape screening along the driveway is encouraged.	NA	
<b>NC40</b>	Use of smaller, single garage doors rather than expansive double or triple doors is preferred.	NA	
<b>NC41</b>	Orient the roofline of a new garage so that it is parallel with the main house or follow the predominant pattern of existing secondary structures where such a pattern exists.	NA	
<b>NC42</b>	Roof pitch should be no less than one in six. Where the roof form of the main house is character-defining, owners are encouraged to echo the form of the main house.	+/-	Shed roof at addition
<b>NC43</b>	Design new construction so that access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	NA	
<b>NC44</b>	Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	+	

