



---

## Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

### Report to the Committee

---

To: Butchertown Architectural Review Committee  
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer *CE*  
From: Savannah Darr, Planning & Design Coordinator  
Date: January 17, 2020

---

**Case No:** 19-COA-0153  
**Classification:** Committee Review

#### GENERAL INFORMATION

**Property Address:** 120 N. Clay Street

**Applicant:** Brian Lundberg  
C3 Studio, LLC  
133 W. Jackson  
Knoxville, TN 37902  
865-309-4461  
[brian.lundberg@c3studiollc.com](mailto:brian.lundberg@c3studiollc.com)

**Owner:** North Clay Properties, LLC  
4507 Abbott Grove Place  
Crestwood, KY 40014

**Estimated Project Cost:** \$137,000

#### Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant requests approval to demolish the noncontributing concrete block addition on the rear of the lot. The applicant also seeks approval to construct a three-story, residential addition in the same footprint. The rear addition will be slightly taller than the main building; however, it will be setback from this building.

The south elevation of the addition (Washington Street side) will have a glass and Corten steel portion on the east side with an entry door on the first story and a picture window on the second story. This glass and steel portion of the addition bumps up to three stories tall with a front gabled portion facing south. The first two stories of the west portion of the proposed addition will be clad in brick with 6/6 double hung clad wood windows on the first floor and three doors and Juliet balconies on the second floor. Most of the third story will be open to outside as it contains deck area with a fireplace.

The west elevation of the addition (alley side) will have two stories of brick with a series of 6/6 double hung clad wood windows. The third story has a front gabled portion that faces the alley. An inset portion of this is enclosed and will contain sliding glass doors and 6/6 double hung clad wood windows.

The north elevation of the addition will contain a one-story, brick clad section on the east side with three casement windows and metal roofing. The west portion of the addition will have two stories of brick cladding with a series of casement windows and 6/6 double hung clad wood windows. The third floor will have four casement windows and a brick chimney.

### **Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application**

The application was received on December 9, 2019. The application was determined to be complete and was classified as requiring Committee Review on December 9, 2019. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Butchertown Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on January 22, 2020 at 6:30 pm, at 444 S. 5<sup>th</sup> Street, Conference Room 302.

## **FINDINGS**

### **Guidelines**

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Butchertown Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Demolition** and **Addition**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

### **Site Context/ Background**

The property, zoned EZ1, is located within the Downtown Form District at the northwest corner of N. Clay and E. Washington Streets. The site contains a three-story brick, Italianate style commercial building with a two-story brick portion (not an addition) on the rear and a one-story concrete block addition behind that. The concrete block addition was likely built between 1965 and 1971 per aerial photographs.

### **Conclusions**

The proposed work generally meets the Butchertown Design Guidelines for **Demolition** and **Addition**. The existing rear addition is a noncontributing addition to the Italianate style commercial building. The demolition of the addition will not affect the historic integrity of the building. Furthermore, the proposed rear addition is in keeping with the scale of the building and overall block. While it will be slightly taller than the front façade, it is stepped back, and should not be that noticeable. Furthermore, the design of the addition is of its time and does not create a false historicism.

## RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions:**

1. **The windows and doors shall not have reflective or insulating film, or smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass that can be seen from a public way.**
2. **If the design or materials change, the applicant and/or their representative shall contact staff for review and approval.**
3. **The owner and/or their representative shall obtain all necessary building permits.**

*The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.*

1/14/2020  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Savannah Darr  
Planning & Design Coordinator

# DEMOLITION

## Design Guideline Checklist From Economic Hardship Exemption

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

### Introduction

Unless the city has determined that it poses an imminent threat to life or property, do not demolish any historic structure or part of a historic structure that contributes to the integrity of any historic district, or any individual landmark or part of an individual landmark.

### Demolition by Neglect

*The deteriorated condition of a historic building attributable to the owner's failure to provide proper maintenance over an extended period of time will not be considered a mitigating circumstance in evaluations of economic hardship. Hardship that is attributable to a building's being allowed to deteriorate will be considered self-imposed; restoration costs incurred to remediate such neglect will not be considered.*

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
DE1	Do not demolish existing non-contributing buildings and additions in a manner that will threaten the integrity of existing contributing structures.	+	Demolition of the CMU addition in order to construct a new addition.
DE2	Do take steps to assure the integrity of a wall exposed to the elements by the removal of a non-historic addition.	+	
DE3	Do remove non-historic interior finishes such as plaster, drywall, or paneling that may be exposed as a result of the removal of non-historic additions.	NA	
DE4	Do infill non-historic openings in historic walls, exposed as a result of the removal of the non-historic finishes.	+/-	New addition will be constructed.
DE5	Do landscape areas that are left vacant as the result of removals of non-contributing buildings and additions. Topography should be made consistent with that of adjacent properties. The slope and grades of land left vacant after demolition should continue and be consistent with those features on adjacent properties.	NA	
DE6	Do take measures to reestablish the street wall after demolition through the use of low fences, walls, and/or vegetation.	NA	

# ADDITION

## Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
<b>A1</b>	Ensure that the design of any new addition is in proportion with the size and scale of the historic building and district.	+	The new addition is proportional to the building.
<b>A2</b>	Design any addition so that it is subordinate to the original building. Generally, additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.	+	
<b>A3</b>	Generally, additions should be attached to secondary elevations and should be set back from the front façade, so as not to damage or obscure character-defining features.	+	Attached to the rear elevation.
<b>A4</b>	Use materials that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+/-	Additions will be brick like the main building with Corten steel and glass as well.
<b>A5</b>	Respect original roof forms when designing an addition. Additions should complement existing forms, not overwhelm them.	+	
<b>A6</b>	Do not undertake any full-floor additions in residential preservation districts (adding an additional full floor on top of a building).	NA	
<b>A7</b>	Generally, the original orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade.	+	
<b>A8</b>	Design any new addition so that the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	+	
<b>A9</b>	Design additions to have the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion.	+	
<b>A10</b>	Design additions so that there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration. This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion.	+/-	A portion of the addition will mimic the historic building, but a large portion of it will have a modern design with modern materials.
<b>A11</b>	Set back additional stories from the historic wall plane of commercial or institutional structures when such an approach is required for a new use. The construction of additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible and not damage or destroy character-defining features.	+/-	While not technically an additional story, the rear addition will be slightly taller than the main building; however, it will be setback from this building.
<b>A12</b>	Do not design additions to appear older than the original building.	+	
<b>A13</b>	Comply with the Kentucky building code in such a way that a historic building's character-defining features are preserved.	+	

<b>A14</b>	Do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features when adding a new code-required stairway or elevator. Any such addition should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	NA	
<b>A15</b>	Install fire escapes only on secondary elevations. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. They should preferably be painted to match the color of the wall.	NA	
<b>A16</b>	Do not construct a deck on a front or side façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or finished with an opaque stain. Use the railing detail developed by the Landmarks Commission or other approved detail.	NA	
<b>A17</b>	Design rear decks so that they do not extend beyond the side walls of the house and are not visible from the street.	NA	
<b>A18</b>	Wood fire stairs should be painted or stained and should be kept to a minimum functional size.	NA	