



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Staff Report to the Committee

To: Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Bob Keesaer, AIA, NCARB Planning and Design Supervisor
From: Becky P. Gorman, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: April 8, 2016

Case No: 16COA1046
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1383 S. 2nd Street

Applicant: Thomas Woodcock
Harris Properties of Louisville, LLC
1366 S. 1st Street
Louisville, KY 40208

Owner: Same as Applicant

Contractor: TBD

Estimated Project Cost: \$25,000

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant requests approval for the removal of an existing non-contributing garage and construction of a new 2-car garage 24'-8" wide by 24'-0" deep with a front gabled roof, Hardie lap siding with 6" exposure and two separate garage doors. The garage will be located 5'-0" off the rear property line and 3'-6" off the north property line and 3'-0" off the south property line. The yard side façade of the structure will feature a person door and window.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application packet was received on March 8, 2016. It was determined to be complete and requiring Committee review on March 14, 2016.

The case is scheduled to be heard by the Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee on April 13, 2016 at 5:30 pm, at 444 South Fifth Street, conference room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Garage, New Construction – Residential, and Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context

The property is located on the east side of S. 2nd Street, six lots north of the intersection of W. Magnolia Ave. It is located in a Traditional Neighborhood Zoning District (TNZD) and a Traditional Form District.

The house dates from the late-nineteenth century. It is a 3-story masonry structure with Richardsonian Romanesque architectural style elements. It is surrounded by structures of the same period, style, and height. The alley contains both garages and carriage houses featuring front and side gables.

Background

16COA1034 was approved February 23, 2016 for removal of one of the two existing first floor doors on the rear elevation and replaced with a new double hung wood window with masonry infill below window. The project also included the removal of one first floor south side window to be infilled with masonry to match existing brick as much as possible, and the removal of a north side second floor wood fire escape and door to be replaced with a new double hung wood window to match existing windows and masonry infill below the window to match existing brick as much as possible. The project also included the installation of new metal handrails which were proposed to be installed on each side of the existing front stairs.

The house had approved case # 1008-OL on November 14, 2007 for installing period-style fence and gates along the sidewalk with two adjacent properties located at 1385 and 1387 S. 2nd Street.

Conclusions

Demolition of existing garage: The existing garage is a non-contributing accessory structure. Staff recommends approval of the demolition of the existing garage for the construction of a new garage that meets the current guidelines and aligns more properly with other garages on the alley.

New Construction: The alleyscape features both garages and carriage houses. The proposed garage will be aligned with the other garages in the alley. The

proposed new garage meets the applicable guidelines for the Old Louisville Preservation District including Garage, New Construction, and Site.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, the Staff recommends that the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved for the request of demolition of the existing garage.

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, the Staff recommends that the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed design of the new garage be approved with following conditions:

1. Hardie siding shall be smooth face.
2. Where exposed, block foundation shall be stuccoed.
3. Historic concrete mix shall be used for garage drive apron.
4. Retain limestone alley curb.

Becky P. Gorman
Historic Preservation Specialist

Date

Attached Documents / Information

1. Staff Guideline Checklist
2. Applicant submitted Information Including Plans and Photographs

GARAGE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted

NA Not Applicable
 NSI Not Sufficient Information

Design Element	Building Feature		Approved	Comments
Location		+	Rear-yard location	
		+	Align with adjacent secondary structures	
		+	Use to define and enclose rear yard	
		+	Minimize paving	Drive apron only
Materials	Walls	+	Horizontal wood siding (3" or 4" exposure)	Hardie lap siding See conditions.
		NA	Board and batten siding	
		NA	Brick	
		NSI	Stucco over frame or concrete block	See conditions
		NA	Cast stone, molded concrete block	
		NA	Aluminum and vinyl siding (3" or 4" exposure)	
		NA	No painted concrete block.	
		NA	No un-painted concrete block.	
		NA	No T-111 plywood.	
	Roof	+	Asphalt, fiberglass, wood, vinyl, or slate shingles.	Asphalt shingles with coloration to match house
		NA	Metal roofing	
		+	Half-round or Ogee gutters	Ogee
		+	Approved Gable-end element	Attic vent
		NA	No membrane roofing on sloped roofs.	
Building Forms	Main Block	+	Simple, rectangular, prismatic volumes	
		NA	Ell-shaped buildings	
		NA	Slightly-projecting bays	
		NA	Cantilevered, second floors	
		+	No overly-elaborate volumes	
	Roof	+	Simple gable roofs (6-in-12 minimum slope)	
		NA	Hipped, shed, and flat roofs with parapets	
		NA	Intersecting gables	
		+	Overhanging eaves	
		NA	Half-round gutters	Ogee
		+	No low-pitched gable roofs (less than 6-in-12 slope)	
		+	No flush eaves	
		+	No roofs without gutters	
Openings	Garage	+	Single-car openings	
	Doors	+	Surface area of door broken up by articulated panels or stiles and rails to reduce scale	
		+	No double and triple doors	Two single openings
		NA	No flush garage doors (they accentuate the large size of the openings)	
	Windows	+	Use window openings to break up wall surface	

		NA	Security grills installed on the inside face of the windows	
--	--	----	---	--

NEW CONSTRUCTION

RESIDENTIAL DESIGN GUIDELINES

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NC1	Make sure that new designs conform to all other municipal regulations, including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations.	+	
NC3	Design new construction so that the building height, directional emphasis, scale, massing, and volume reflect the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+	
NC4	Make sure that the scale of new construction does not conflict with the historic character of the neighborhood.	+	
NC5	Incorporate materials and design elements that complement the color, size, texture, and level of craftsmanship seen in surrounding buildings.	+	
NC9	Reinforce existing patterns of open space and enclosure, created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, in designs for new construction.	+	
NC24	Ensure that the roofs of new buildings relate to those of neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+	
NC29	Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction.	NSI	
NC30	Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings. While use of wood siding is preferred, vinyl siding may be used for new construction, but only in areas where the predominate historic construction material is wood.	+	
NC37	Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of adjacent secondary structures.	+	
NC38	Site new garages adjacent to alleys where present. Review the garage prototype insert that identifies styles appropriate to preservation districts when planning a garage construction project.	+	
NC39	Where no alleys exist, garages should be sited at the rear of the property behind the main house. Garage doors should not face the street, and access should be along the side yard. Landscape screening along the driveway is encouraged.	NA	
NC40	Use of smaller, single garage doors rather than expansive double or triple doors is preferred.	+	

NC41	Orient the roofline of a new garage so that it is parallel with the main house or follow the predominant pattern of existing secondary structures where such a pattern exists.	+	
NC42	Roof pitch should be no less than one in six. Where the roof form of the main house is character-defining, owners are encouraged to echo the form of the main house.	+	
NC43	Design new construction so that access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	+	
NC44	Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	+	

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	+	See conditions
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+	



