



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Priscilla Bowman, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: March 2, 2023

Case No: 22-COA-0207
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1253 Cherokee Rd

Applicant: Stephen S. Wood
Picture Perfect Landscaping, LLC
(502) 376-0732
stephen@pictureperfectlandscaping.com

Owner: Gary Crump
1253 Cherokee Rd
Louisville, KY 40204
(502) 386-6546
gcrump@ralouisville.com

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant is seeking approval to:

- Replace the existing concrete walkway in the front yard with new concrete that will be clad with a cut limestone;
- Replace the poured concrete edging on either side of the front walkway with new limestone/cobblestone edging;
- Replace the existing concrete front porch stairs with new concrete that will be clad with a cut limestone;
- Clad the existing concrete stairs that are located off the public sidewalk, closer to the road, with cut limestone;
- Clad the existing concrete front porch with a cut limestone overlay in a French pattern; and,
- Construct a retaining wall at the front, south side of the property. The wall will begin at approximately 12-in high on the east side and be graded to a height of approximately 28-in high on the west side.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was submitted on August 19, 2022. Staff emailed the applicant to let them know that the application had been received and would require Committee level review on August 30, 2022. The applicant emailed staff confirming they would like to move forward with their initial request on November 28, 2022. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on January 11, 2023, at 4:30 pm, in person, at 444 S. 5th Street, Room 101.

On January 11, 2023, the Cherokee Triangle ARC met at 4:30 pm, in person, at 444 S. 5th Street, Room 101. Members present were Gail Morris, Peter Kirven, Lori Stahlgren, and Ashlyn Ackerman. The applicant, Stephen Wood, and Landmarks staff, Priscilla Bowman and Savannah Darr, were also present. The applicant's rendering for the project showed a stone retaining wall, which was not part of the original application. The ARC members felt they needed to staff to review the wall as part of the whole project. Ms. Stahlgren made a motion to continue the meeting to allow staff time to conduct a site visit and review the proposal. Ms. Ackerman seconded the motion. It passed unanimously.

The continued case is scheduled to be heard by the Cherokee Triangle ARC on March 8, 2023, at 4:30 pm, in person, at the Old Jail Auditorium (514 W. Liberty St.).

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Porch** and **Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The site is located on the north side of Cherokee Road, eleven lots west of Longest Avenue. The property is zoned R5B within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The house is a 2½-3 story Eclectic Style masonry home with a limestone foundation, a front porch with Doric columns, a second story bay window, and an upper half story decorative dormer. The house is surrounded by masonry homes of a similar scale with differentiating architectural details.

Conclusions

The proposed alterations to the front porch and walkway generally do not meet the Cherokee Triangle Design Guidelines for **Porch**. Guidelines **PO1** and **PO11** state that reconstructed porch features shall be replaced with in-kind materials. Adding the limestone veneer to the concrete porch stairs and the porch itself is not an in-kind change. These materials were concrete historically and remain so today. Guideline **PO6** says, "Do not add conjectural porch ornament; often its style conflicts with the style of the house." The addition of limestone on these porch elements is conjectural and not appropriate for the house.

The proposed alterations to the front porch and walkway generally do not meet the Cherokee Triangle Design Guidelines for **Site**. Guideline **ST3** states that paving materials be compatible with adjacent sites. None of the adjacent houses have porches or walkways with limestone veneer. They are concrete. Guideline **ST5** requires steps to be replaced with in-kind materials. The limestone veneer does not do

that. The design of these concrete walks and stairs are character defining for this portion of Cherokee Road.

Guideline **ST10** states that retaining walls must not be installed in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists. There is no historic precedence for the proposed retaining wall as poured concrete curbing still exists and matches those properties immediately adjacent to this one. Additionally, guideline **ST12** states to use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. The existing curbing is poured concrete. The proposed retaining wall will begin at 12-inches in height, which is considered “curbing” and permitted by previous ARC rulings on retaining walls. However, due to the existing slope, the wall will increase at grade to a height of 28-inches, which is considered a “retaining wall.”

There are modern limestone retaining walls across Cherokee Road and four lots to the east (1268-1274 Cherokee Road). There is a brick retaining wall four houses to the east (1267 Cherokee Road) as well as across the street at a modern apartment complex (1242 Cherokee Road). However, none of these are historic in age. The historic pattern and precedent on this portion of Cherokee Road is a concrete walkway and stairs with a concrete curbing that wraps around the front of the property. This pattern is character defining for this block. Adding a stone retaining wall in front of this house alone would disrupt that pattern and change the topography of the lot. For these reasons, staff recommends denial.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, Staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **denied**.


 Priscilla Bowman
 Historic Preservation Specialist

02/07/2023
 Date

PORCH

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
PO1	Replace reconstructed entrance or porch features with in-kind materials. If that is not economically or technically feasible, a compatible substitute material may be considered. Composition and plastic moldings, however, should not be used due to their unproven longevity.	-	The existing concrete walkway, steps, and front porch are proposed to be replaced with a limestone veneer.

PO2	Photographically document architectural porch features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	+	
PO3	Design replacement porch railings and balusters to match the originals as closely as possible. If it is technically or economically unfeasible to accomplish this, a simplified porch rail and baluster design may be used of 2" x 4" rails and 2" x 2" pickets, set between top and bottom rails, and nailed to the inside face of the rail. Railings should be finished with paint or an opaque stain. Plans are available from the Landmarks Commission.	NA	
PO4	Do not use cast- or wrought-iron columns, railings, or balusters as a replacement for brick or wood porch elements. Columns should match the proportion, detailing, and size of the original.	NA	
PO5	When installing a new code-required handrail or railing, select a design that is simple and stylistically appropriate. Generally, metal is appropriate for masonry buildings and wood for frame buildings.	NA	
PO6	Do not add conjectural porch ornament; often its style conflicts with the style of the house.	-	Adding the limestone to the porch is adding ornamentation, which did not exist historically.
PO7	Do not use over-sized boards (2" thick) for porch floors. 3/4" to 1" tongue-and-groove boards are generally appropriate.	NA	
PO8	Install replacement porch flooring that closely matches the original tongue-and-groove flooring dimensions. A maximum gap of 1/16" should be left between boards to allow for expansion. Wood edging should be applied to the exposed ends of floorboards to prevent moisture infiltration into the grain.	NA	
PO9	Do not cover porch or cornice elements with vinyl or aluminum siding.	NA	
PO10	Do not install porch ceilings or close in exposed eaves where none existed previously. Exposed rafters and roof decks are character-defining features for certain architectural styles.	NA	
PO11	Replace deteriorated porch steps with in-kind materials. Replacement steps should be of the same scale and dimensions as the original. Stone steps may be patched with concrete that is tinted a visually-compatible color.	-	The new steps will be of the same scale and dimensions as the original. However, the existing steps are concrete. The applicant is proposing to clad them with cut limestone veneer.
PO12	Do not replace historic stone steps unless the stone itself is no longer useable. Resetting stones on a firm foundation and repointing or applying sealant can address most problems.	NA	
PO13	Do not enclose front porches. Screen panels that can be removed seasonally, are set behind porch elements, and do not damage historic fabric may be permitted.	NA	
PO14	Do not obscure the design or detailing of original porch elements when undertaking a side or rear porch enclosure project. Large sheets of glass recessed behind original porch features should be used rather than solid materials such as wood, stucco, or masonry.	NA	
PO15	Do not add porches to the primary façades of structures that never had porches.	NA	

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines

+/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
 NA Not Applicable
 NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	-	The proposed limestone veneer will have an effect on the property. Furthermore, adding a stone retaining wall in front of this house alone would disrupt the walkway and curbing pattern along this block of Cherokee Road and change the topography of the lot.
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	NA	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	-	None of the adjacent houses have porches or walkways with limestone veneer. They are all concrete.
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	NA	
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	-	The existing concrete walkway, steps, and front porch are concrete and are proposed to be clad with limestone veneer.
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	NA	
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	NA	
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	-	The existing curbing is poured concrete. The proposed retaining wall will begin at 12in in height, which is considered "curbing". However, it will increase at grade to a height of 28in, making it a "retaining wall". There is no historic precedence for the proposed retaining wall as poured concrete curbing still exists and matches those properties immediately adjacent to this one.

ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	-	The existing curbing is poured concrete. The proposed limestone retaining wall/curbing does not match the character of the existing curbing.
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NA	
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NA	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NA	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	