Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To:	Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee
Thru:	Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Officer
From:	Bradley Fister, Senior Planner – Urban Design
Date:	June 5, 2026

Case No: 26-COA-0021
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1379 S Brook St.

Applicant: George Dunlap
Dunlap Properties LLC
25 Andrew Pkwy
Fisherville, KY 40023

Owner: Same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:
The applicant seeks after-the-fact approval for the following alterations:

- Replacement of six front façade, 1/1 double hung wood windows with new 6/6 double hung vinyl windows;
- Replacement of two 2/2 double hung wood windows and two 1/1 double hung wood windows on the rear façade with new 6/6 double hung vinyl windows;
- Enclosure of all basement windows with vinyl siding; and,
- Replacement of all 1/1 double hung wood windows with new 6/6 double hung vinyl windows on the rear one-story addition.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application
The application was received on January 12, 2026 following an enforcement case (ENF-ZON-21-000063) for not complying with the previously approved COA 16COA1125. It was assigned to staff at that time and determined to require committee level review.

The case is scheduled to be heard by the Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on June 10, 2026 at 4:30 p.m. in Room 101, of the Metro Development Center located at 444 S 5th Street, Louisville KY.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Windows**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The TNZD zoned property in the Traditional Neighborhood form district is located on the east side of South Brook Street, two lots north of East Magnolia Avenue. The quadruplex building is two-and-a-half stories tall and of masonry construction.

There is only one previous COA (16COA1125) for the property, and it is for the after-the-fact replacement of the windows. This case went before the Old Louisville ARC on October 12, 2016. The ARC approved the COA with the following conditions of approval:

1. The window casings and sills that have been wrapped in aluminum will be unwrapped. The wood trim will be left exposed.
2. The front façade 6/6 vinyl double hung windows shall be removed.
3. New 1/1 double hung wood windows shall be installed on the second story of the front façade. They shall fit the historic window openings. The third story windows can be 1/1 double hung vinyl windows and shall fit the historic window openings.
4. The rear façade 6/6 double hung vinyl windows shall be removed.
5. New 1/1 double hung vinyl windows shall be installed and shall fit the historic window openings.
6. Should the design change, the applicant shall contact staff.
7. The applicant shall submit a new COA application if the front wood siding on the bay window is replaced with a material other than wood. Any new wood siding shall match the historic.

To date, no work has been done to follow these conditions of approval.

Conclusions

The after-the-fact window replacement does not meet many of the applicable **Window** guidelines. Guidelines **W1** and **W2** specifically state that new windows must match the historic windows as much as possible. The 6/6 muntin pattern does not match the historic windows, which were 1/1, and the 6/6 muntin pattern would have rarely been found on a Victorian era home. Guideline **W4** states that synthetic windows should not be located on the front façade of a building unless they mimic a historic wood window, specifically the mortis and tenon connections. The current vinyl windows do not properly replicate this connection or the muntin configuration.

Vinyl windows are permissible on the side and rear elevations of the building, as well as the rear addition. However, many of the replacement windows on the sides and rear do not fit the historic window openings, so those openings have been modified to hold smaller windows. Furthermore, those vinyl windows have the incorrect muntin configuration. This does not meet guideline **W2**. Furthermore, this property has remained out of compliance with the conditions of COA # 16COA1125 for almost 10 years.. For these reasons, staff recommends that this request be denied, and the applicant adhere to the conditions of approval of 16COA1125.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **denied.**

Brad Fister — 6/5/2026

Bradley Fister — Date
Senior Planner – Urban Design

Window

Standard Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W.1	Preserve the functional and decorative features of a historic window, as well as the historic window material on street-facing and street-address building features (bays, etc.) and facades as they are more character defining. For structures that were constructed with four or more stories, this applies to the first three stories. • Where a historic window is intact and in repairable condition, retain and repair it to match the existing as per location, lite configuration, detail, and material. • Preserve the historic window features including the frame, sash, muntin, mullion, glazing, sill, head, jamb, and molding. • Preserve a historic transom. A transom can be opened to let cool air in and warm air out of the structure. • Preserve the original material of a window. If this is not possible, alternative materials may be considered if they convey the character, detail, and finish of the original material. • Maintain the functionality of a historic double-hung window in a historic structure. A double-hung window functions like a transom, and allows cool and in and warm air out, facilitating air circulation. • Repair, rather than replace, a frame and sash. • Consider weather-stripping a window to reduce air flow in and out of a structure, creating a more energy-efficient building.	-	The wood windows were removed without approval or review in March 2016 and at that time were replaced with inappropriate windows that do not mimic the design, materials, or proportions of the wood windows.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W.2	Avoid alterations to a historic window that would negatively affect the historic appearance of the window and structure. • Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass on street-facing and street-address facades. • Do not use smoked, tinted, or reflective glass on street-facing and street-address facades. Neutral appearance low-E is permissible. • Do not remove, block in, or back-paint a transom or sidelight. If this has been done previously and changes are proposed, then it will be corrected to come into compliance with these guidelines. • Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of a historic window on street-facing and street-address building features and facades by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. • For a masonry structure, inset new bricks in historic window or door openings on secondary or tertiary elevations that have approval to be removed. Preserve opening details, such as lintels, to demark where the historic opening was once located. • Do not locate any new window openings that may be required for a new use on street-facing and street-address facades. • Do not remove or obscure historic window trim with metal or siding materials on street-facing and street-address building facades. If this has been done previously and changes are proposed, then it will be corrected to come into compliance with these guidelines. • Do not install new floors, dropped ceilings, or interior walls that block the glazed area of historic windows. A design should incorporate a setback that allows the full height of the historic window to be seen unobstructed if new floors, dropped ceilings, or interior walls are necessary.	-	The after-the-fact replacement windows do not mimic the historic window configurations of the building, which was 1/1 double-hung wood windows. The 6/6 configuration is historically inappropriate for this building, and rarely found on other buildings of this same general period throughout the District. Many of the windows do not fit the historic window openings, which have been modified. Furthermore, the trim was wrapped with metal.
W.3	Reconstruct a missing window element. • Use a surviving prototype to reconstruct a missing window element, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and exterior shutters or blinds. • Use a material for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if necessary.	NA	
W.4	Match a replacement window design to the historic. Replace a severely deteriorated historic window on street-facing and street-address building features (bays, etc.) and facades with a new window that conveys the same visual appearance. For structures that were constructed with four or more stories, this applies to the first three stories. For more information on what classifies a window as “severely deteriorated” and, therefore eligible to be completely replaced, see the final page of this chapter. Windows on side and rear elevations that are not character defining and do not face the street, do not have to meet the severely deteriorated threshold. For structures that were constructed with four or more stories, windows on the fourth story and higher do not have to meet the severely deteriorated threshold. • Use historical, pictorial, and physical documentation to select a new window that is	-	The after-the-fact windows do not mimic the design or proportions of the previous wood windows, and the vinyl windows do not replicate the look or proportions of wood windows specifically the mortis and tenon connections and muntin configuration.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	compatible with the historic character of the building. • Select a window that matches the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when the repair of historic windows is impossible. • Install a replacement window that operates in the same way as the original window. Double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements. Replacement windows can also appear to operate in the same way. A casement or fixed window that looks like a double-hung window could be permissible. • Do not install a replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Historic openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate a stock window. • Do not install a synthetic replacement window on street-facing and street-address building features (bays, etc.) and facades that does not appear similar in size, finish, texture, and depth to the historic window materials. For structures that were constructed with four or more stories, this applies to the first three stories. • Do not replace a multi-pane window that has true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false “snap-in” or applied muntins on street-facing and street-address building features (bays, etc.) and facades. Simulated divided lite is permissible. For structures that were constructed with four or more stories, this applies to the first three stories. • Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie window in an exterior window opening unless there is historic documentation that this occurred originally. Where basement windows are not visible from the street, are severely deteriorated, and are non-functional, glass block may be permissible. • If a window has been previously replaced that does not meet these guidelines, the next time it is replaced, it will come into compliance by following these guidelines.		
W.5	Preserve and repair an existing wood shutter when possible. • Keep historic shutters intact. The shutters serve as accents and provide security. • Use existing shutters to help cool a structure. Shutters help block solar heat gain in the summer while allowing breeze to pass through (if they are louvered), helping with cooling costs during summer months.	NA	
W.6	Repair an existing shutter with in-kind materials or with materials that replicate the original material, design, and dimensions. If the shutter was replaced previously with a material that does not meet these guidelines and work is being done, then it will be corrected to come into compliance with these guidelines.	NA	
W.7	Replace shutters where they previously existed when possible. • If damage is too extensive to repair, using replacement shutters may be considered.	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	• Choose a replacement shutter that appears similar in style, color, size, and material to the historic materials. The replacement shutter should cover one-half of the window, were it to be closed. • Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. • A replacement shutter should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically appropriate material. • Mount replacement shutters so they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. • Do not mount a shutter to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window. • Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters that do not accurately replicate the historic shutter.		
W.8	Preserve an original awning when possible.	NA	
W.9	Maintain a historic awning in operable condition when possible.	NA	
W.10	Repair an altered awning to its original design when possible.	NA	
W.11	Replace a non-repairable historic awning or add a new awning to be consistent with the historic context. • Design an awning to complement existing architectural features. It should not overwhelm the facade. • Design an awning to be of matte-finish, weather-proofed fabric of traditional form, and of a color that complements the building. Typically, an awning of a solid color and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building is the preferred pattern. • Consider the use of an operable awning where appropriate. Operable awnings can provide shade in the summer and allow solar access in the winter, increasing the energy-efficiency of a structure. • Use a material that is durable and weather resistant. • Attach an awning between the window display area and the signboard or second floor window sill. An awning should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present. • Do not damage the historic structure when installing an awning. Hardware should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints, not masonry. • Do not use plastic or back lit awnings. Metal, glass, fiberglass, and similar material awnings may be permissible if they complement the architecture of the building. • Do not install an awning where it would not be historically appropriate.	NA	
W.12	Minimize the visual impact of a modern appurtenance on a historic building. • Install a window fixture, such as air conditioning unit, in a window on a secondary elevation when possible. • Do not alter the window sash to accommodate an air-conditioning unit, if this has been done previously and changes are proposed, then it will be corrected to come into compliance with these guidelines.	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	• Install a storm window that duplicates the shape and color of the historic window. A storm window can help reduce air movement into and out of an existing window and provide a more affordable way to create a more energy efficient home. • Use a storm window that has wood or narrow metal frame. • Mount a storm window on the blind stop within the window frame. • Install security bars in a way that does not obscure the historic window. • Use retractable commercial security bars for a storefront. • Upon installation of a modern appurtenance, do not damage any part of the historic window or frame or obscure the architectural character of the historic window.		