

Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Clifton Architectural Review Committee Thru:

Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer

Katherine Groskreutz, Historic Preservation Specialist From:

Date: January 6, 2022

Case No: 21-COA-0268 Classification: Staff Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 155 N. Keats Ave.

Applicant: Chris Crawford

Solid Rock Property Solutions

14805 State Road 60 Borden, IN 47106 (502) 817-4108

chris@onsolidrock.net

Owner: Michael Dooley

Redefining Homes LLC

246 Spring Street

Jeffersonville, IN 47130

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval for the following:

- After-the-fact rebuild of the front roof and porch gable structures with large gable on left instead of right after the entire roof structure, second floor, and all gables were destroyed by fire, and to address previous water drainage issues caused by the original design.
- 2. Trim detailing, a small window, or a gable vent (ARC's preference) on the new gable are now proposed to echo the previous gable detailing that was lost in the fire:
- 3. Install a new treated wood front porch floor maintaining the same footprint as the previous porch, with post supports of a size of the ARC's choosing;

Case #: 21-COA-0268-CL Page 1 of 14

- 4. Replace two original, wood, 1/1, double-hung front windows with new vinyl clad wood 1/1, double hung windows. Any damaged wood trim repairs or replacements will be recreated in wood to match the original.
- 5. Alteration of one recessed front entry door to be a window to accommodate kitchen cabinets.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The applicant reached out to Landmarks Staff on November 15, 2021 after applying for building permits. Staff conducted a site visit on November 17th to assess the building and advise the applicant on next steps. Staff provided an email summary of the meeting the same day. Staff helped to clarify COA application questions on November 30, 2021 and received additional project details on December 3 and 6, 2021.

The application was submitted to PDS Customer Service on December 1, 2021 and was considered complete and requiring committee level review on December 2, 2021.

The applicant submitted a second, staff level application (21-COA-0269) for side and rear renovations, including siding, window replacement, and a rear deck. The application also allowed damaged front siding to be replaced with Hardie board and for the upper half story addition to be rebuilt to meet current building code. The front façade siding request was originally included in this application, but staff determined it was a staff level review item and removed it from this request. The applicant also added the front window replacement request to this application after a discussion with staff on December 3, 2021. Please refer to additional staff pictures of the property in this application package, and the approved COA staff report for 21-COA-0269 for complete details of all property alterations. This current request before the ARC only covers the items listed above under "Description of proposed exterior alteration." All other changes have already been approved by staff based on previous case histories within the district.

The case was heard by the Clifton Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on Wednesday, December 15, 2021 at 5:30 pm via WebEx web conference and was continued. The ARC requested the applicant provide drawings of the proposal. However, all the drafts people the applicant contacted were booked 4 to 6 weeks out. As the structure is already in the general configuration as is being proposed and shown in the pictures and onsite, the applicant provided a sketch showing some possible detailing to the gable and what a window in place of the side kitchen door may look like. The applicant is very open to talking through gable detailing, the side window/door configuration, and post sizes with the ARC to reach a solution.

The case is scheduled to be heard by the Clifton Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on Wednesday, January 12, 2021 at 5:30 pm via WebEx web conference.

Case #: 21-COA-0268-CL Page 2 of 14

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Clifton Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Door and Entrance**, **Porch**, **Roofing**, **Siding and Trim**, and **Windows**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The property is located on the east side of N. Keats Avenue, five parcels north from the intersection with Sycamore Avenue. The property is zoned R6 within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District and was a multi-unit residential structure. A fire recently destroyed the entirety of the half story and roof and caused significant damage to other historic elements such as doors, windows, and siding. Prior to the fire, the structure was a one-and-a-half story, wood siding clad, Victorian era T-plan home with multiple gabled roofs and a wraparound front porch. It is surrounded by a mix of homes of similar age, style, and massing and larger historic apartment buildings.

Conclusions

The entire roof structure, the second floor, and all gables were lost in a recent fire, so no historic fabric to that portion of the house exists any longer and had to be completely rebuilt to secure the rest of the building and to meet currently building codes.

The work already done to the front gable generally meets the Clifton design guidelines for **Porch** and **Roofing**. The previous porch and gables were destroyed by the fire. The previous multi-gable configuration was causing significant drainage issues where the roofs intersected, leading to deteriorated historic fabric on the front façade and to the large front window and trim. The new gable design is a nod to the previous roof structure but simplifies the design to fix the previous drainage problem. The new design is compatible and in proportion with the historic building and does not overwhelm the façade. The altered design also helps delineate the new reconstruction from the remaining historic sections of the home, rather than duplicating the original form. The applicant is proposing the addition of a gable trim, a gable-end vent, or a small window similar to what was on the gables prior to the fire to echo the historic design, and is open to ARC suggestions for treatment to this new gable. Any of these proposed design elements will help to break up the larger gable façade and more closely mimic the previously existing design details found on this home and others along the street.

The proposed door-to-window change generally meets the Clifton design guidelines for **Door and Entrance** and **Windows**. The door to be altered is not the primary entrance and is deeply recessed from the front façade. The door itself was severely damaged during firefighting efforts and cannot be repaired. The proposed

Case #: 21-COA-0268-CL Page 3 of 14 new window will be clad wood, double hung, with a 1/1 muntin pattern to match the other front façade windows. The door opening width and the transom window will be retained, with the new window being at a height to accommodate a kitchen countertop on the interior. Staff feels given the specific location, setback, and condition of this entry that the new window proposal is appropriate for this site. However, the applicant is willing to discuss this change and other potential solutions with the ARC.

The proposed new porch design generally meets the Clifton design guidelines for **Porch** and **Siding and Trim**. The porch floor deck has been completely removed due to damage from the fire, and exact type of wood or measurements of the previous floor is unknown. The applicant proposes to maintain the original floor footprint and use treated wood for the deck floor. While the original porch columns had been round with simple pilaster detailing, they were also destroyed in the fire. The applicant proposes simplified, square, 6x6 wooden posts to delineate the new construction from the remaining historic sections of the home. They will be located in the same general locations as the originals, and will be compatible in design and scale with the rest of the home and the district.

The proposed window replacements generally meet the Clifton design guidelines for **Windows**. Staff found the two front façade windows to be severely deteriorated due to fire and water damage. The replacement windows are proposed to be clad wood with the same double-hung operation and 1/1 muntin pattern as the existing. The transom over the large front façade window will be retained.

Overall this project meets the applicable Clifton design guidelines and is a thoughtful design to revive the property after a catastrophic fire, and is an attempt to retain what can be saved of the structure rather than completely demolishing the home and building new. While it is not a reconstruction of all historic detailing, it is a proportional, compatible, and appropriate design for the remainder of the historic building and the surrounding district.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, Staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions:**

- 1. All wood elements shall be opaque painted or stained within 12 months of construction.
- 2. Porch floor boards shall be under 2" thick. 3/4" to 1" tongue-and-groove boards are generally appropriate.
- 3. The new porch steps shall be reconstructed with in-kind materials (wood). They shall be of the same general scale and dimensions as the original. 5/4" deck boards shall not be used for front porch stair treads.
- 4. All wood trim shall be retained and repaired/replaced where necessary to match the same dimensions as existing.
- 5. Any exposed wooden trim shall not be wrapped in vinyl, metal, or siding material and shall remain exposed.

Case #: 21-COA-0268-CL Page 4 of 14

- 6. The replacement sashes shall fit the historic window openings. Original openings shall not be blocked-in to accommodate stock-sized windows.
- 7. All transom windows on the front façade shall be retained.
- 8. The replacement windows shall be double-hung with a 1/1 muntin pattern.
- 9. If the glass is to be Low-E, the coating shall be clear with no tinting.
- 10. All other required permits and approvals shall be obtained prior to any work taking place.
- 11. If the design or materials changes, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.

Katherine Groskreutz

Historic Preservation Specialist

1/6/2022

Date



Previous Front Facade - PVA Photo 2011



Current Front Facade - Staff Photo 2021



Possible gable treatment to mimic historic gable elements but not be falsely historic

Case #: 21-COA-0268-CL Page 6 of 14

Door and Entrance

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

Meets Guidelines

Does Not Meet Guidelines

+/-Meets Guidelines with Conditions NA

Not Applicable Not Sufficient Information NSI

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
D1	Front-facing (i.e., street-address façade) doors proposed for		
	replacement should be replaced with the same or in-kind		
	materials. Many options exist for repairing or restoring		
	historic doors and producing historically compatible and		A new window is proposed in
	durable results. Some of these options may be more		place of an existing recessed
	economical, in the long run, than replacement. All options		front entry door to accommodate
	should be reviewed with Landmarks staff before replacing		kitchen cabinets; the opening is
	historic doors. If replacement is necessary, there are many		deeply set back, and will retain
	new products to choose from for economical, compatible		the same opening width and
	replacement doors and building materials.	+/-	transom window
D2	Replacing non-original, non-historic doors is recommended		
	when the replacement doors are more appropriate to the		
	period and style of the building, and match the size of the		
	original opening.	NA	
D3	Replacement doors should – whenever possible – duplicate		
	the design, proportion, and arrangement of paneling and		
	glazing of the original door or period of architectural		
	significance. Replacing a missing historic door with one that		
	matches the historic door is preferable if physical, pictorial,		
	or photographic evidence exists to document its		
	appearance. Absent that, the door may be replaced with a		
	new door that is compatible with the style and character of	NA	
D4	the historic building. The character of doors and entrances should be maintained	INA	
D4	by keeping decorative features and historic elements. Avoid		The transom window is being
	the addition of elements for which there is no historic		retained; see conditions of
	precedent.	+	approval
D5	Creating new entrances on street-address or street-facing	•	αρρισναι
53	facades should be avoided.	NA	
D6	Historically clear-finished (i.e., stained then lacquered or		
	top-coated) doors should be refinished in the same manner		
	and should not be painted. Leave historically clear-finished		
	doors unpainted.	NA	
D7	Replacing historic double-entry (leaf) doors with a single		
	door should be avoided.	NA	
D8	Original entrance or door openings should not be altered to		A new window is proposed in
	accommodate stock doors. The historic entrance including		place of an existing recessed
	the door, transom or fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and		front entry door to accommodate
	entablature should be retained and repaired.		kitchen cabinets; the opening is
			deeply set back, and will retain
			the same opening width and
		,	transom window; See conditions
		+/-	of approval
D9	Architectural features that are proposed for reconstruction or		
	replacement must be photographically documented by the		
	property owner as part of the application submitted to		
	Landmarks for approval of any exterior modification. Historic		Otaff has a hales of his
	elements cannot be removed until after approval has been		Staff has photos of how the
	obtained.	+	home appeared prior to the fire

Case #: 21-COA-0268-CL Page 7 of 14

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
D10	When undertaking the reconstruction of a missing entrance or porch feature, historical, pictorial, and physical		
	documentation should be used. If there is not sufficient		
	information to determine the original design, a new design		
	should be prepared that is compatible with the architectural		
	character of the building and the district. Conjectural or falsely historical designs are not appropriate.	NA	
D11	Screen doors, storm doors and security doors should be	INA	
"	simple with a narrow-frame design that enables the inner		
	door to be seen and does not obscure the architectural		
	character of original doors or damage historic fabric.	NA	
D12	Commercial security grilles should retract out of sight during		
	business hours and preferably be mounted inside the glass.		
	Security bars should be painted an unobtrusive color.	NA	
D13	Vestibules should not be added to the street-address or		
	street-facing facade on commercial use or leased buildings		
	unless there is a historic precedent. Such additions alter the character, proportion, and massing of the façade.	NA	
D14	Character-defining features of an historic building should be	14/1	
5.4	retained when undertaking work required for ADA		
	accessibility and code compliance.	NA	
D15	ADA-accessibility ramps should be located on secondary		
	elevations wherever possible. If locating a ramp on the		
	primary façade is required, it should be installed in a way		
	that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive	NIA	
	as possible.	NA	

Porch

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

Meets Guidelines

Not Applicable Not Sufficient Information NA Does Not Meet Guidelines Meets Guidelines with Conditions NSI

+/-

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
PO1	Reconstructed entrance or porch features should be replaced with in-kind materials. If not economically or technically feasible, a compatible substitute material may be used including composite or other synthetic materials, columns, or trim designed to reflect the appropriate style of the house. Design elements should match the proportion, detailing, and size of the original style.	+/-	Many porch details were destroyed in the fire; reconstruction materials are similar to previous; the proposed elements are in similar proportion and size to the original elements with slightly less detailing; the altered designs are to reflect new construction and not be falsely historical
PO2	Architectural features that are proposed for reconstruction or replacement must be photographically documented by the property owner as part of the application submitted to Landmarks for approval of any exterior modification. Historic elements cannot be removed until after approval has been obtained.	+	Staff has photos of how the home appeared prior to the fire
PO3	Replacement porch railings and balusters should match the originals as closely as possible. If it is technically or economically unfeasible to accomplish this, then pre-fab wood or synthetic materials may be purchased that are similar to the originals. Wood railings should be finished with paint or an opaque stain.	NA	Porch and stairs had no railings
PO4	Cast or wrought iron columns, railings, or balusters should not be used as a replacement for brick or wood porch elements.	NA	- y -

Case #: 21-COA-0268-CL Page 8 of 14

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
PO5	When installing a new code-required handrail or railing to		
	porch steps or from the street where not originally installed,		
	select a design that is simple and stylistically appropriate or		
	artistic.	NA	
PO6	Conjectural porch ornament should not be added; often its		
	style conflicts with the style of the house. For example, do		
	not add gingerbread spindles or Corinthian columns to a	l	
	Craftsman-style house.	NA	
PO7	Over-sized boards (2" thick) should not be used for porch		
	floors. 3/4" to 1" tongue-and-groove boards are generally		
	appropriate. Deck boards are not appropriate for street	NO	
	façade porch floors.	NSI	See conditions of approval
PO8	Replacement porch flooring should be installed that closely		
	matches the original tongue-and groove flooring		
	dimensions. The proper installation of tongue and groove for outdoor flooring provides for a maximum gap of 1/16"		Previous flooring destroyed
	between boards to allow for expansion. Wood edging		during fire; unknow n style and
	should be applied to the exposed ends of floorboards to		sizing; new treated wood floor is
	prevent moisture infiltration into the grain.	+/-	proposed
PO9	Porch or cornice elements or any architectural-defining	.,	_ p. opocou
. ••	feature on the street façade should not be covered with		
	vinyl or aluminum siding.	+	See conditions of approval
PO10	Porch ceilings should not be installed, nor exposed eaves		
	enclosed, where no such covering existed previously.		
	Exposed rafters and roof decks are character-defining		
	features for certain architectural styles, such as the		
	Craftsman style.	NA	
PO11	Deteriorated porch steps should be replaced with in-kind		
	materials. Replacement steps should be of the same scale		
	and dimensions as the original. 5/4" deck boards should		
	not be used for stair treads. Stone steps may be patched		Con conditions of approval
PO12	with concrete that is tinted a visually compatible color.	+	See conditions of approval
P012	Historic stone steps should not be replaced unless the stone itself is unsafe or no longer useable. Resetting		
	stones on a firm foundation and re-pointing or applying		
	appropriate sealant can address most problems (contact		
	Landmarks for advice on sealant product choices).	NA	
PO13	Front porches can be enclosed with screen panels (not		
	glass panels) provided the construction is reversible and no		
	alterations are made to the original façade. Screen panels		
	that can be removed seasonally when they are set behind		
	porch elements are preferred. The porch enclosure shall		
	not be made into a conditioned living space.	NA	
PO14	When undertaking a non-street front-facing or rear porch		
	enclosure project, do not obscure the design or detailing of		
	original porch elements. The enclosure shall not become a		
	room addition. See the Addition guidelines if a room	NIA.	
D015	addition is desired.	NA	
PO15	A porch may be added to a structure's primary façade only	NΙΛ	
	if the porch design is appropriate to the style of the house.	NA	

Case #: 21-COA-0268-CL Page 9 of 14

RoofingClifton Design Guideline Checklist

Meets Guidelines +

Does Not Meet Guidelines

Meets Guidelines with Conditions +/-

NA

Not Applicable Not Sufficient Information NSI

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
R1	Replacement roofing materials should closely match the		
	original roofing material in texture and profile. Some		
	substitute materials including asphalt shingles, dimensional		
	shingles, or cement tiles may be considered. Contact the		
	Landmarks staff for any new emerging roof technologies.	+	Asphalt shingle
R2	Metal roofing materials like lead-coated copper, terne-		
	coated steel, and aluminum/zinc-coated steel can		
	successfully replace tin, terne plate, zinc, or lead. Copper-		
	coated steel is a less expensive (and less durable)		
	substitute for sheet copper. While copper roofs may be left unpainted, terne-metal roofs should be painted a traditional		
	roof color. Repair and replacement with in-kind materials is		
	recommended in order to preserve the visual appearance of		
	the original. Contact the Landmarks staff for any new		
	emerging metal roof technologies.	NA	
R3	When replacing metal roofing on residential roofs, the		
	proportion and spacing of the seams and trim should match		
	the original. Commercial-grade architectural metal roofing		
	systems should not be used on residential architecture		
	because the scale is inappropriate.	NA	
R4	On historic terra cotta clay tile roofs, ridge and hip tiles		
	should be retained. Field tiles may be replaced with a		
	compatible substitute material, such as a dimensional shingle in a color approximating the original. Ridge and hip		
	tiles should be reinstalled to maintain the roof's historic		
	profile. Reinstallation of sound roof tiles and slates on		
	smaller, secondary roof forms (porches, bay windows, etc.)		
	is encouraged wherever possible.	NA	
R5	On slate roofs, historic roof details, such as decorative		
	cresting and finials and metal ridge caps, should be		
	replaced with in-kind materials or materials that are visually		
	compatible.	NA	
R6	The reconstruction of any missing roof feature should be		The entire roof and all gables
	based on historical, pictorial, and physical evidence. If the		w ere destroyed in its entirety
	evidence is insufficient, the roof feature should be of a compatible new design rather than a falsely historical or		due to fire; the new roof and gable design is compatible, of
	conjectural reconstruction.		similar proportion to the original,
	Conjectural reconstruction.		and not falsely historic or
			conjectural; the new design will
			also correct an ongoing drainage
			issue that was damaging historic
		+/-	fabric on the front façade
R7	On additions or new construction, new roof designs should		
	be similar or compatible with the shape, size, scale, and		The new roof is compatible with
	materials of the historic building and other buildings within	<u>_</u>	the historic building and other
R8	the district. For major decaying or deteriorated roof features – like	+	buildings within the district
1/0	cupolas, dormers, or chimneys – the form and detailing of		
	the features should be used to create appropriate replicas.		
	Smaller irreparable historic roof details – such as decorative		
	cresting, finials, or metal roof caps for slate roofs – should		Twochimneys collapsed in the
	be replaced with in-kind or visually compatible materials.	NA	fire and will not be reconstructed
R9	Extensive areas of flashing should not be visible and should		
	be avoided. Portions of metal flashing may be covered by		
	1	NA	

Case #: 21-COA-0268-CL Page 10 of 14

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
R10	When installing replacement gutters, do not destroy the historic roof detail.	NA	
R11	When replacing gutters, use half-round replacement gutters		
	or ogee profile gutters that have a simple design and do not alter the character of the trim. When it is not possible to		
	repair or replace the original box gutters, the box gutters		
	should be roofed over and the replacement gutters attached.	+	
R12	Unpainted galvanized steel gutters or downspouts are not		
	preferred as they will rust and stain adjacent materials.		
	Galvanized gutters should be appropriately primed and painted after a period of weathering. Vinyl gutters and		
	downspouts should be avoided due to their short life		
	expectancy.	NA	
R13	Historically exposed rafter ends and eaves should remain	N I A	
D4.4	and be preserved.	NA	
R14	New roof-top additions should not compromise the structural integrity of the building.	NA	
R15	Any new roof-top mechanical or service equipment should		
	be installed in a manner as to not damage the historic		
	elements or fabric; examples include: cupola, w eathervane,	NA	
R16	and chimney. Mechanical equipment or systems (examples: HVAC or	INA	
1110	water) should not be installed on roofs where they may		
	overload and compromise a historic building's existing		
	structural system. Additional support systems may need to	NIA	
R17	be constructed to support the additional weight load.	NA	
KI7	Antennae, satellite dishes, skylights, vents, roof-top mechanical units, decks, terraces, dormers, or high-profile		
	solar panels should not be installed where they can be seen		
	from a building's street address façade or primary elevation.		
	Skylights should be flush (not the "bubble" type) with curbs		
	painted to match the color of the roof material. Consolidate antennae wherever possible.	NA	
	l antennae wherever possible.	INA	

Siding and Trim Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

Meets Guidelines NA

Not Applicable Not Sufficient Information Does Not Meet Guidelines NSI

+/-Meets Guidelines with Conditions

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
SD1	Missing wood features should not be replaced with conjectural or falsely historic reconstructions or with newly designed elements that are incompatible with the building's size, scale, or materials.	+	The porch columns were damaged in the fire and will be rebuilt in a simple design that is compatible with the buildings size, scale, and material
SD2	Architectural features that are proposed for reconstruction or replacement must be photographically documented by the property owner as part of the application submitted to Landmarks for approval of any exterior modification. Historic elements cannot be removed until after approval has been obtained.	+	Staff has photos of how the home appeared prior to the fire
SD3	Contemporary wood siding or fiber cement board, which conveys the visual appearance of historic siding, should be used when replacing sections of deteriorated wood. Other materials which expand and contract like wood may be used when approved by staff or ARC review.	NA	

Case #: 21-COA-0268-CL Page 11 of 14

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
SD4	Structurally inappropriate materials such as textured	- manig	Commone
	plyw ood (e.g., T-111) or similar soft w ood products that		
	shed water poorly should not be used on primary structures.		
	Architecturally and historically inappropriate materials		
	should not repair, replace, or be placed over historic wood		
	siding.	NA	
SD5	Exterior veneers shall not be installed over wood siding or		
	as a replacement for exterior siding. Some examples of		
	historically inappropriate exterior veneers not to be used are		
	artificial stone or other masonry, EIFS (synthetic stucco),	NA	
SD6	asbestos shingles, or asphalt shingles. Replace or repair damaged or deteriorated wood siding with	INA	
300	w ood or w ood-like materials. Undamaged, intact historic		
	wood siding should be preserved and not removed and/or		
	replaced.	NA	
SD7	Replacement siding should be installed horizontally unless	10.	
	there is valid historic documentation for a different original		
	orientation.	NA	
SD8	Retaining and preserving the original wood siding and trim		
	with paint is encouraged, especially on the street-address		
	façade. The application of fiber cement board matching the		
	original existing exposure is preferred over vinyl or		
	aluminum siding and may be approved by staff without ARC		
	review. Vinyl or aluminum siding may be applied to street		
	address façades, side, and rear elevations with ARC		
	approval. The installation of any type of siding should not		
	obscure or damage historic ornamental details such as fish- scale shingles, moldings, window casings, sills, hoods,		
	brackets, and corner boards. Do not install siding of any		
	type over rotten wood. Do not wrap windows and trim with		
	metal. If applied, remove insul-brick material and apply		
	house wrap before applying siding.	+	See conditions of approval
SD9	Fiber cement, vinyl or aluminum siding should match the		
	profile and dimensions of the original wood siding. A		
	smooth-faced, narrow profile siding (3" or 4" reveal) is		
	acceptable for installation. Historic fabric, trim, or corner		
	boards should project slightly beyond the vinyl siding,	NIA	
0040	wherever possible without causing damage.	NA	
SD10	Paints and coatings manufactured before 1978 contained		
	lead. Historic structures often contain hazardous substances, such as lead paint and asbestos. Since June,		
	2010, the EPA regulations require contractors to be certified		
	and follow specific work practices to prevent lead		
	contamination. For additional lead paint information, contact		
	the Metro Health Department. For asbestos removal and		
	disposal methods, contact Metro Air Pollution Control.	NA	
SD11	Installation of insulation with a proper vapor barrier should		
	be done from the interior. Do not remove exterior siding to		
	install insulation within the exterior walls of historic wood		
	frame construction. This can result in damage to historic		
	fabric by locking in mold and moisture and will rot wood from	NIA.	
	within. Houses need to be breathable.	NA	

Case #: 21-COA-0268-CL Page 12 of 14

Windows

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

Meets Guidelines +

Does Not Meet Guidelines

Meets Guidelines with Conditions +/-

NA

Not Applicable Not Sufficient Information NSI

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	The maintenance and repair of historic windows are		
	essential to preserving the historic character and fabric of		
	Clifton structures and the overall Clifton historic district. For		
	that reason, historic windows on street-address façades and		
	street-facing façades shall not be replaced with new		
	windows unless the Clifton ARC determines that the		
	condition of existing windows, safety or energy efficiency		
	considerations, or other relevant factors support window		
	replacement. During the planning stage for possible window		
	replacement on any façade, and prior to submittal of an		Staff found the two front façade
	application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window		w indows to be severely
	replacement, property owners should consult with the		deteriorated and damaged from
	Landmarks staff on the application of these guidelines to		the fire and ongoing drainage
	their structure, options for addressing the property owner's		issues caused by the previous
14/0	needs, and concerns regarding their windows.	+	gables
W2	If historic windows on façades other than street-address		
	façades or street-facing façades are replaced, or the owner is authorized to replace windows on street-address façade		
	or street-facing façade pursuant to W1, the new windows		
	shall convey the same visual appearance as the historic		
	windows. The visual appearance of a window is based on		
	details such as sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal		
	depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame		
	dimensions, trim profiles, and other decorative features.		
	Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions		
	using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be		
	a new design that is compatible with the historic character of		
	the building and the district. Use of wood, metal, or synthetic		
	window systems for authorized window replacement is		
	permissible. During the planning stage for possible window		
	replacement on any façade, and prior to submittal of an		
	application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window		
	replacement, property owners should consult with the		
	Landmarks staff on the application of these guidelines to		Wood clad, double-hung, 1/1
	their structure, options for addressing the property owner's		muntin pattern; see conditions of
	needs, and concerns regarding their windows.	+	approval
W3	Replacement sash should not be used that does not fit		
	historic window openings. Original openings should never		0 150
1074	be blocked-in to accommodate stock-sized windows.	+	See conditions of approval
W4	Replacement windows proposed for façades other than		
	street-address façades or street-facing façades, and those authorized pursuant to W1 for street-address façades and		
	street-facing façades, shall operate in the same way as the		
	original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with		
	double hung, and casement windows are replaced with		
	casements.	+	Double-hung
W5	Thermal glazing windows that have muntins in accordance		, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
	with W2 shall have such muntins permanently applied and		
	may also incorporate internal dividers between the glass		
<u></u>	panes.	NA	
W6	Reflective or insulating film shall not be applied to window		
	glass on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	NSI	See conditions of approval
W7	Smoked, tinted, or reflective glass shall not be used on		
	w indows on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	NSI	See conditions of approval

Case #: 21-COA-0268-CL Page 13 of 14

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W8	Transoms or sidelights shall not be blocked-in or back-		
	painted.	NA	
W9	The number, size, location, or shape of original windows shall not be altered on street-address façades or street-facing façades by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be		
	prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	NA	
W10	Any new window openings for a new use shall not be located on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	+/-	A new window is proposed in place of an existing recessed front entry door to accommodate kitchen cabinets; the opening is deeply set back, and will retain the same opening width and transom window
W11	The front face of historic window trim shall not be covered	.,	Walledill William
	with metal or siding material. Siding may butt up to the side		
	of historic window trim.	NSI	See conditions of approval
W12	New floors or dropped ceilings shall not be installed that block the glazed area of windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W13	If exterior storm windows are installed they should duplicate		
	the shape of the original window.	NA	
W14	When installing exterior storm windows or screens do not damage or obscure historic windows or frames.	NA	
W15	Window sashes shall not be altered to accommodate window air-conditioning units.	NA	
W16	When installing security bars do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W17	Aw nings shall be designed to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W18	Aw nings shall be of a material and form compatible with the building's historic character. Contemporary designs may be considered if compatible with the design and character of the building.	NA	
W19	Aw nings shall be installed in a way that does not harm the building. Limit hardware installation to that which is required for structural stability. Anchors shall be installed in mortar joints, not masonry units.	NA	
W20	On commercial buildings attach aw nings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Aw nings shall be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA NA	
W21	Aw nings shall be installed so that the valance is no low er than permissible by code (Building Code or Public Works).	NA NA	
W22	Replacement shutters should match the visual appearance, size, and location of the originals and may be constructed of w ood, metal, or synthetic material.	NA	
W23	Shutters shall be installed only where there is historic		
	evidence for them.	NA	

Case #: 21-COA-0268-CL Page 14 of 14