



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Clifton Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: June 3, 2022

Case No: 22-COA-0053
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1854 Brownsboro Rd.

Applicant: Janet V. Franklin
2901 Virginia Ave.
Bardstown, KY 40004
502-296-3086
502-349-0732
jfrankly@bellsouth.net

Owner: same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to replace two front facing wood windows, with aluminum-clad wood replacement windows from Pella, for the purpose of energy efficiency and functionality. One window is a large one-over-one double-hung wood window on the front of the shotgun style home. The second one-over-one double-hung wood window is situated on a front facing, inset portion of the building, west of the front porch. The applicant also seeks approval to wrap the exterior wood window trim with aluminum.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The original application (22-COA-0053) was received on March 23, 2022. On March 28, 2022 the application was accepted and considered complete and requiring committee Review. Staff reached out to the applicant and determined that breaking the application into two parts would be the best course of action. The application for the staff approvable portions of work (22-COA-0111) was accepted on May 10, 2022 and approved on May 11, 2022.

The Clifton ARC is scheduled to hear the case on June 8, 2022 at 5:30PM, in the Metro Development Center at 444 S. 5th St., Room101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Clifton Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Window**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The property is located on the south side of Brownsboro Rd., three lots west of State St. It is zoned R5A within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The site contains a frame, one level, shotgun style residence.

22-COA-0111 was approved on May 11, 2022 at staff level and included the replacement of side and rear windows and masonry work.

Conclusions

The proposed front facing window replacement generally does not meet the Clifton design guidelines for **Window**. Specifically, the windows are not deteriorated enough to warrant replacement. The applicant only proposes to replace the windows for better energy efficiency and functionality. While the proposed replacement window would meet W2, the replacement itself does not meet W1. There are only two windows on the front façade of the shotgun style home, and the larger of the two is very prominent. It has been protected under the porch roof, and some maintenance would preserve the window. Additionally, the wrapping of the wood window trim does not meet W11.

Recommendation

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends a Certificate of Appropriateness be **denied** as the existing windows are not deteriorated to warrant replacement.

However, if the ARC determines that the proposed replacement of the two front facing windows is appropriate, staff recommends a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions**:

1. **The replacement shall be one-over-one and shall closely match the dimensions of the historic wood windows.**
2. **All glass shall be clear and non-reflective.**
3. **The applicant shall not wrap the window trim or sills with vinyl or aluminum.**
4. **The applicant shall take appropriate precautions with the handling of potential lead paint.**

Windows

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	The maintenance and repair of historic windows are essential to preserving the historic character and fabric of Clifton structures and the overall Clifton historic district. For that reason, historic windows on street-address façades and street-facing façades shall not be replaced with new windows unless the Clifton ARC determines that the condition of existing windows, safety or energy efficiency considerations, or other relevant factors support window replacement. During the planning stage for possible window replacement on any façade, and prior to submittal of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement, property owners should consult with the Landmarks staff on the application of these guidelines to their structure, options for addressing the property owner's needs, and concerns regarding their windows.	-	The windows are not deteriorated enough to warrant replacement. The applicant proposes to replace the windows based on energy efficiency and functionality.
W2	If historic windows on façades other than street-address façades or street-facing façades are replaced, or the owner is authorized to replace windows on street-address façade or street-facing façade pursuant to W1, the new windows shall convey the same visual appearance as the historic windows. The visual appearance of a window is based on details such as sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and other decorative features. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of wood, metal, or synthetic window systems for authorized window replacement is permissible. During the planning stage for possible window replacement on any façade, and prior to submittal of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement, property owners should consult with the Landmarks staff on the application of these guidelines to their structure, options for addressing the property owner's needs, and concerns regarding their windows.	+	The proposed aluminum-clad wood windows would match the historic wood windows.
W3	Replacement sash should not be used that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock-sized windows.	+	Proposed windows shall fit the historic window openings, windows openings shall not be altered to accommodate stock-sized windows.
W4	Replacement windows proposed for façades other than street-address façades or street-facing façades, and those authorized pursuant to W1 for street-address façades and street-facing façades, shall operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with	+	The proposed replacement windows will generally operate in the same way as the historic windows would.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	double hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.		
W5	Thermal glazing windows that have muntins in accordance with W2 shall have such muntins permanently applied and may also incorporate internal dividers between the glass panes.	NA	
W6	Reflective or insulating film shall not be applied to window glass on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	+	See conditions of approval
W7	Smoked, tinted, or reflective glass shall not be used on windows on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	+	See conditions of approval
W8	Transoms or sidelights shall not be blocked-in or back-painted.	NA	
W9	The number, size, location, or shape of original windows shall not be altered on street-address façades or street-facing façades by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	+	See conditions of approval
W10	Any new window openings for a new use shall not be located on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	NA	
W11	The front face of historic window trim shall not be covered with metal or siding material. Siding may butt up to the side of historic window trim.	-	The applicant requests approval to do this.
W12	New floors or dropped ceilings shall not be installed that block the glazed area of windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W13	If exterior storm windows are installed they should duplicate the shape of the original window.	NA	
W14	When installing exterior storm windows or screens do not damage or obscure historic windows or frames.	NA	
W15	Window sashes shall not be altered to accommodate window air-conditioning units.	NA	
W16	When installing security bars do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W17	Awnings shall be designed to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W18	Awnings shall be of a material and form compatible with the building's historic character. Contemporary designs may be considered if compatible with the design and character of the building.	NA	
W19	Awnings shall be installed in a way that does not harm the building. Limit hardware installation to that which is required for structural stability. Anchors shall be installed in mortar joints, not masonry units.	NA	
W20	On commercial buildings attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings shall be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
W21	Awnings shall be installed so that the valance is no lower than permissible by code (Building Code or Public Works).	NA	
W22	Replacement shutters should match the visual appearance, size, and location of the originals and may be constructed of wood, metal, or synthetic material.	NA	
W23	Shutters shall be installed only where there is historic evidence for them.	NA	